Online ISSN : 2249-460X
Print ISSN : 0975-587X
DOI : 10.17406/GJHSS

Global Journal

of Human Social Sciences: C

Sociology & Culture



The Polygenesis of Capitalism

A Case Study of Deported Meskhetians

Highlights

Earth Care in Gauteng Township

Survivors of Intimate Partner Violence

Discovering Thoughts, Inventing Future

VOLUME 24 ISSUE 5 VERSION 1.0

© 2001-2024 by Global Journal of Human Social Sciences, USA

Volume 24 Issue 21 was originally issued as C5

Global Journal of Human-Social Science: C
Sociology & Culture

Global Journal of Human-Social Science: C
Sociology & Culture

Volume 24 Issue 5 (Ver. 1.0)

Open Association of Research Society

© Global Journal of Human Social Sciences. 2024.

All rights reserved.

This is a special issue published in version 1.0 of "Global Journal of Human Social Sciences." By Global Journals Inc.

All articles are open access articles distributed under "Global Journal of Human Social Sciences"

Reading License, which permits restricted use. Entire contents are copyright by of "Global Journal of Human Social Sciences" unless otherwise noted on specific articles.

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission.

The opinions and statements made in this book are those of the authors concerned. Ultraculture has not verified and neither confirms nor denies any of the foregoing and no warranty or fitness is implied.

Engage with the contents herein at your own risk.

The use of this journal, and the terms and conditions for our providing information, is governed by our Disclaimer, Terms and Conditions and Privacy Policy given on our website http://globaljournals.us/terms-and-condition/menu-id-1463/

By referring / using / reading / any type of association / referencing this journal, this signifies and you acknowledge that you have read them and that you accept and will be bound by the terms thereof.

All information, journals, this journal, activities undertaken, materials, services and our website, terms and conditions, privacy policy, and this journal is subject to change anytime without any prior notice.

Incorporation No.: 0423089
License No.: 42125/022010/1186
Registration No.: 430374
Import-Export Code: 1109007027
Employer Identification Number (EIN):
USA Tax ID: 98-0673427

Global Journals Inc.

*(A Delaware USA Incorporation with "Good Standing"; **Reg. Number: 0423089**)*

Sponsors: Open Association of Research Society
Open Scientific Standards

Publisher's Headquarters office

Global Journals® Headquarters
945th Concord Streets,
Framingham Massachusetts Pin: 01701,
United States of America
USA Toll Free: +001-888-839-7392
USA Toll Free Fax: +001-888-839-7392

Offset Typesetting

Global Journals Incorporated
2nd, Lansdowne, Lansdowne Rd., Croydon-Surrey,
Pin: CR9 2ER, United Kingdom

Packaging & Continental Dispatching

Global Journals Pvt Ltd
E-3130 Sudama Nagar, Near Gopur Square,
Indore, M.P., Pin:452009, India

Find a correspondence nodal officer near you

To find nodal officer of your country, please email us at *local@globaljournals.org*

eContacts

Press Inquiries: *press@globaljournals.org*
Investor Inquiries: *investors@globaljournals.org*
Technical Support: *technology@globaljournals.org*
Media & Releases: *media@globaljournals.org*

Pricing (Excluding Air Parcel Charges):

Yearly Subscription (Personal & Institutional)
250 USD (B/W) & 350 USD (Color)

Editorial Board

Global Journal of Human-Social Science

Dr. Arturo Diaz Suarez

Ed.D., Ph.D. in Physical Education Professor at University of Murcia, Spain

Dr. Prasad V Bidarkota

Ph.D., Department of Economics Florida International University United States

Dr. Alis Puteh

Ph.D. (Edu.Policy) UUM Sintok, Kedah, Malaysia M.Ed (Curr. & Inst.) University of Houston, United States

Dr. André Luiz Pinto

Doctorate in Geology, PhD in Geosciences and Environment, Universidade Estadual Paulista Julio de Mesuita Filho, UNESP, Sao Paulo, Brazil

Dr. Hamada Hassanein

Ph.D, MA in Linguistics, BA & Education in English, Department of English, Faculty of Education, Mansoura University, Mansoura, Egypt

Dr. Asuncin Lpez-Varela

BA, MA (Hons), Ph.D. (Hons) Facultad de Filolog?a. Universidad Complutense Madrid 29040 Madrid Spain

Dr. Faisal G. Khamis

Ph.D in Statistics, Faculty of Economics & Administrative Sciences / AL-Zaytoonah University of Jordan, Jordan

Dr. Adrian Armstrong

BSc Geography, LSE, 1970 Ph.D. Geography (Geomorphology) Kings College London 1980 Ordained Priest, Church of England 1988 Taunton, Somerset, United Kingdom

Dr. Gisela Steins

Ph.D. Psychology, University of Bielefeld, Germany Professor, General and Social Psychology, University of Duisburg-Essen, Germany

Dr. Stephen E. Haggerty

Ph.D. Geology & Geophysics, University of London Associate Professor University of Massachusetts, United States

Dr. Helmut Digel

Ph.D. University of Tbingen, Germany Honorary President of German Athletic Federation (DLV), Germany

Dr. Tanyawat Khampa

Ph.d in Candidate (Social Development), MA. in Social Development, BS. in Sociology and Anthropology, Naresuan University, Thailand

Dr. Gomez-Piqueras, Pedro

Ph.D in Sport Sciences, University Castilla La Mancha, Spain

Dr. Mohammed Nasser Al-Suqri

Ph.D., M.S., B.A in Library and Information Management, Sultan Qaboos University, Oman

Dr. Giaime Berti

Ph.D. School of Economics and Management University of Florence, Italy

Dr. Valerie Zawilski

Associate Professor, Ph.D., University of Toronto MA - Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, Canada

Dr. Edward C. Hoang

Ph.D., Department of Economics, University of Colorado United States

Dr. Intakhab Alam Khan

Ph.D. in Doctorate of Philosophy in Education, King Abdul Aziz University, Saudi Arabia

Dr. Kaneko Mamoru

Ph.D., Tokyo Institute of Technology Structural Engineering Faculty of Political Science and Economics, Waseda University, Tokyo, Japan

Dr. Joaquin Linne

Ph. D in Social Sciences, University of Buenos Aires, Argentina

Dr. Hugo Nami

Ph.D.in Anthropological Sciences, Universidad of Buenos Aires, Argentina, University of Buenos Aires, Argentina

Dr. Luisa dall'Acqua

Ph.D. in Sociology (Decisional Risk sector), Master MU2, College Teacher, in Philosophy (Italy), Edu-Research Group, Zrich/Lugano

Dr. Vesna Stankovic Pejnovic

Ph. D. Philosophy Zagreb, Croatia Rusveltova, Skopje Macedonia

Dr. Raymond K. H. Chan

Ph.D., Sociology, University of Essex, UK Associate Professor City University of Hong Kong, China

Dr. Tao Yang

Ohio State University M.S. Kansas State University B.E. Zhejiang University, China

Mr. Rahul Bhanubhai Chauhan

B.com., M.com., MBA, PhD (Pursuing), Assistant Professor, Parul Institute of Business Administration,
Parul University, Baroda, India

Dr. Rita Mano

Ph.D. Rand Corporation and University of California, Los Angeles, USA Dep. of Human Services, University of Haifa Israel

Dr. Cosimo Magazzino

Aggregate Professor, Roma Tre University Rome, 00145, Italy

Dr. S.R. Adlin Asha Johnson

Ph.D, M. Phil., M. A., B. A in English Literature, Bharathiar University, Coimbatore, India

Dr. Thierry Feuillet

Ph.D in Geomorphology, Master's Degree in Geomorphology, University of Nantes, France

Contents of the Issue

i. Copyright Notice
ii. Editorial Board Members
iii. Chief Author and Dean
iv. Contents of the Issue

1. The Polygenesis of Capitalism: A Religious Perspective. *1-21*
2. A Bosadi-Pentecostal Approach to Earth Care in Gauteng Township Contexts. *23-31*
3. The Need for Affirming Health Care among LGBTQ+ Survivors of Intimate Partner Violence. *33-44*
4. Autoritarismo, Direitos Humanos e Tolerância. *45-51*
5. Memory's Significance in the Formation of Ethnic Identity: A Case Study of Deported Meskhetians Residing in the Samtskhe–Javakheti Region. *53-60*
6. Cultural Echoes: Navigating the Legacy and Evolution of Bangla Musical Instruments or, Resonance through Time: A Journey into the History and Future of Bangla Musical Instruments. *61-74*

v. Fellows
vi. Auxiliary Memberships
vii. Preferred Author Guidelines
viii. Index

Volume 24 Issue 21
Originally issued as C5



Global Journal of human-social science: C
Sociology & Culture
Volume 24 Issue 5 Version 1.0 Year 2024
Type: Double Blind Peer Reviewed International Research Journal
Publisher: Global Journals
Online ISSN: 2249-460X & Print ISSN: 0975-587X

The Polygenesis of Capitalism: A Religious Perspective

By Stephen Strehle

Introduction- This article explores some of the religious influences behind the development of capitalism in the modern world. It questions any conception of life that limits its objects or ideas to a singular causal series of actions. It forwards a view of life as a confluence of many forces in a constant state of interaction that come together in creating the world. It rejects any notion that might think capitalism or any system of nature and thought develops in an orderly sequence from a simple linear direction of cause and effect outside a multitude of influences that constitute a network of relations sharing reciprocal information.[1] What the article hopes to display is a few of the religious influences that served in the mix of a multitude of forces in developing the economic system called capitalism. It repudiates those who live in the binary and think it is possible to separate religion from society and the government.

Keywords: *capitalism, religion, catholics, puritans, jews, jansenists, and william ockham.*

GJHSS-C Classification: *LCC: HB501*



Strictly as per the compliance and regulations of:



© 2024. Stephen Strehle. This research/review article is distributed under the terms of the Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0). You must give appropriate credit to authors and reference this article if parts of the article are reproduced in any manner. Applicable licensing terms are at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/.

The Polygenesis of Capitalism: A Religious Perspective

Stephen Strehle

Keywords: *capitalism, religion, catholics, puritans, jews, jansenists, and william ockham.*

I. Introduction

This article explores some of the religious influences behind the development of capitalism in the modern world. It questions any conception of life that limits its objects or ideas to a singular causal series of actions. It forwards a view of life as a confluence of many forces in a constant state of interaction that come together in creating the world. It rejects any notion that might think capitalism or any system of nature and thought develops in an orderly sequence from a simple linear direction of cause and effect outside a multitude of influences that constitute a network of relations sharing reciprocal information.[1] What the article hopes to display is a few of the religious influences that served in the mix of a multitude of forces in developing the economic system called capitalism. It repudiates those who live in the binary and think it is possible to separate religion from society and the government. It repudiates any attempt to separate the forces of life into secular and sacred categories as if existing in a separate space and time or asking wrongheaded questions like what came first in a process that ever remains mixed together within the reciprocal interactions of the real world. The notion the one religious community or material condition has priority in a temporal sequence displays little more than an unscientific way of thinking and often represents the prejudice of those who isolate what they wish to forward in studying a complex system like capitalism and advance as an ideology.

The term capitalism is subject to much interpretation as it slips and slides within the varied perspectives of an evolving culture. No Platonic form exists to provide it with universal definition or a singular meaning for all times and places, leaving the wayfarer with the difficult task of grappling with a range of meaning that supplies some vague sense of direction. This means the study must remain content with analyzing certain recurring themes that people associate with the term and leave the pursuit of a more exacting definition and settling the ambiguity to the debate of others. For our purposes, the study choses to concentrate on some important concepts that readily appear in the discussion of capitalism—concepts like property rights, monetary profit, credit, capital investment, market value, self-interest, consumerism, and progress—just to name a few.[2] These and other concepts are readily recognized by most scholars as significant aspects of capitalism and are used by this study to show the significance of various religious sources as proximate and prominent forces in developing the concepts and the economic system associated with them.

II. Catholicism

Many identify capitalism with a belief in property rights as a sacred concept. Karl Marx and Friedrich Engels thought of this notion as the product of the bourgeoisie's material concern to protect their financial position and exploit or alienate the lives of working-class people in industrial Europe; but the concept is more ancient than this modern class struggle. It is as old as the ancient Middle Eastern law codes and the Decalogue's prohibition against stealing or simply coveting a neighbor's possessions (Ex. 20:15, 17).[3] What makes the modern era different from the ancient world is not the concept of property rights but the exalted place it came to occupy within it. The capitalists were able to exploit the concept because it was placed at the center of western civilization as one of the few and most sacred "inalienable rights" that commanded the devotion of the people and the protection of the state.

The story of its evolution as an inalienable right has strong religious roots in the philosophical schools of the Graeco-Roman world and their mystical speculations about a natural law. Philosophers like Plato

Author: *e-mail: sstrehle@cnu.edu*

[1] This is how quantum physicists tend to see the world these days. E.g., Carlo Rovelli, *REALITY IS NOT WHAT IT SEEMS: A Journey to Quantum Gravity*, Simon Carnell and Erica Segre (trans.) (New York: Riverhead Books, 2014), 254; *Seven Brief Lessons of Physics*, Simon Carnell and Erica Segre (Trans.) (UK: Penguin Books, 2014), 17; *Helgoland: Making Sense of the Quantum Revolution*, Erica Segre and Simon Carnell (trans.) (New York: Riverhead Books, 2021), 75–76, 140ff.; *The Order of Time*, Simon Carnell and Erica Segre (trans.) (New York: Riverhead Books, 2018), 956–97.

[2] Fredrik Albritton Jonsson and Carl Wennerlind, *Scarcity: A History form the Origins of Capitalism to the Climate Crisis* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2023), 6; Jeffrey Lau and John Smithin, "The Role of Money in Capitalism," *Int'l Journal of Political Economy* 32/3 (Fall 2002): 5; Richard Lachmann, "Origins of Capitalism in Western Europe: Economic and Political Aspects," *Review of Sociology Annual* 15 (1989), 48.

[3] Joseph Isaac Lifshitz, "Jewish Economic Theology," in *The Routledge Handbook of Economic Theology*, Stefan Schwarzkopf (ed.) (London: Routledge, 2020), 266–67.

© 2024 Global Journals

spoke of an ideal Good or universal standard of justice that transcended its specific manifestations in Greek city-states and provided a blueprint for an ideal social order here on earth. Philosophers like Cicero followed this concept of a natural law in Plato, Aristotle, and Zeno during later Roman times and spoke of a divine truth (*recta ratio*) indwelling all human beings and providing them with a moral existence that lifts them above the beasts of the field and brings judgment to bear on specific legal codes in society.[4] Christians also followed the same basic idea: Paul spoke of a natural law that resonates in the hearts of all Gentiles throughout the world as a means of knowing the divine will within the conscience (Rom. 1:19-20; 14-15); Justin Martyr spoke of Gentiles knowing God through the seeds of divine reason (*logos spermatikos*) within each and every one;[5] Thomas Aquinas and the Medieval Scholastics spoke about the natural law as a universal standard and witness to the truth, representing the presence of divine reason within humankind and judging the conduct of all nations.[6] The concept of the natural law permeated all Christian teaching throughout the Reformation and much of modern times.

In the Middle Ages, the concept took on another nuance that became essential to its modern interpretation. The natural law (*ius naturale*) started referring to more than just the obligations that a creature has to serve the divine will; it also referred to positive rights that all people receive from their Creator. This new deconstruction of the *ius naturale* had some antecedent in the ancient world but came to the forefront in the Middle Ages through the work of the Decretalists or interpreters of canon law.[7] The most significant proponent of natural rights was William Ockham (ca. 1285–1347), the brilliant Franciscan theologian and Nominalist philosopher. He used the concept of the *ius naturale* to question the papacy and its claim to possess a "fullness of power" (*plenitudo potestatis*) in temporal and spiritual matters. He found the present pope using his authority to despoil the kings of Europe and plunder the riches of their subjects, as if no one had a right to their property except the pope. Ockham said no one has a right to deprive the people of their life, liberty, or possessions without some evidence of fault or reasonable cause. God has given these good things to all people in nature as their legal right.[8]

> Therefore, a pope should appreciate the kind of power he has over others and be ready to render an account to all who demand one, just as he would provide for his faith. He must not disturb the rights (*iura*) of others . . . but conserve them. . . . Therefore, it is important that the subjects of the pope know their common rights.[9]
>
> The pope cannot deprive people of their rights. These rights do not come from him, but come from God, nature, or another man. For the same reason he cannot deprive the people of their liberties. They are granted to them by God and nature.[10]
>
> The prelates ought to strive for the affection of their subjects by securing their interest, rather than promote fear by depriving them of their rights, liberties and possessions (*iura, libertates et res*), unless the prelates back certain necessities.[11]
>
> As long as the faithful remain ignorant [of the extent of papal power] and the pope strives to secure his own ends, whether from the will to power, the love of material possessions, or simple ignorance, unending conflict will not cease between them, since the people have some understanding of their possessions, rights, and liberties

[4] Cicero, *De legibus*, in *The Loeb Classic Library*, C. W. Keyes (trans.) (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1928), 1.18–43; 2.8–10.

[5] Justin Martyr, *Apologia prima pro Christianis*, 46 (PG 6.397, 398); *Apologia secunda*, 8, 10 (PG 6.457-62); Jean Daniélou, *Gospel Message and Hellenistic Culture*, John Austen Baker (ed. and trans.) (London and Philadelphia: Darton, Longman & Todd/Westminster Press, 1973), 40–43; Carl Andresen, "Justin und der mittlere Platonismus," *Zeitschrift fur Neutestamentliche Wissenschaft* 44 (1952/53), 170. The exact source of Paul's words in the book of Romans is difficult to identify but probably received some inspiration from his upbringing in Tarsus, a center of Stoic philosophy in the Mediterranean world. Justin clearly borrows the expression *logos spermatikos* from Stoic philosophy, although his interpretation is colored by Platonic and Christian ideas. His overall philosophy reflects the middle Platonism of the day more than any other school of thought. David Ulansey, *The Origins of Mithraic Mysteries* (Oxford: University Press, 1983), 68–69; Calvin Roetzel, *The Letters of Paul: Conversations in Context* (Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1998), 28–29; Reinhold Seeburg, *Text-Book of the History of Doctrines*, Charles E. Hay (trans.) (Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1977), 3.13.9 (1.118).

[6] Thomas Aquinas, *Summa Theologiae*, I-II, q. 91, a. 1, 2; q. 93, a. 2, 3; q. 95, a. 2; q. 96, a. 6; Paul Sigmund, *Natural Law in Political Thought* (Lanham, New York, and London: University Press of America, 1971), 36–39, 43–45; H. McCoubrey, *The Development of Naturalist Legal Theory* (London, New York, and Sydney: Croom Helm, 1987), 49–52; Brian Tierney, *The Idea of Natural Rights: Studies on Natural Rights, Natural Law, and Church Law, 1150–1625* (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1997), 59, 62, 73–76.

[7] Gratian, *Decretum*, in *Incipit concordia discordantium canonum* (Basel: Michael Wenssler, 1482), part 1, dist. 1, 5, 8, 9; Marsilius von Padua, *Defensor Pacis*, Richard Scholz (hrsg.) (Hannover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 1932), 12.12.6; 13.5, 10 (268, 279, 282); Conrad Summenhart, *De contractibus licitis atque illicitis* (Venice, 1580) 1.1; Sigmund, *Natural Law in Political Thought*, 36-39; Tierney, *The Idea of Natural Rights*, 59, 62, 73–76. In the hand of the Decretalists, the term *ius* became polysemous, slipping and sliding within contexts and sometimes implying "law" or "right" or both, depending on the context. Many scholars point to the Decretalists, but Richard Tuck and Brian Tierney are most significant in this new direction among academics.

[8] *Breviloquium de Principatu Tyrannio*, 2.3.59–64; 3.1–6, 12; *An Princeps*, 2.84–86, 7; *Opus Nonaginta Dierum*, 61.55–64; *De Imperatorum et Pontificum Potestate*, 4.7; Tierney, *The Idea of Natural Rights*, 184–85, 190–91. In *An Princeps*, the specific controversy is whether the church is bound to contribute to Edward's just war. The Pope is trying to deny royal levies on the church. Ockham sides with Edward and lists many other instances of dire need where the church is required to support the government. *An Princeps*, 1.8–13; 7.1–7; 11.1–24. Ockham's works are found in *Opera Politica*, H. S. Offler (ed.) (Manchester: University Press, 1963).

[9] *Breviloquium*, 1.3. 26–28; 4.10, 11.

[10] *De Imperatorum et Pontificum Potestate*, 4.8–11.

[11] Ibid., 7.157–60.

© 2024 Global Journals

(whether through a reason that offers itself in time of trouble or without reason they strive to preserve what is customary).[12]

The corruption of the papacy led to a schism in the church when two candidates staked a claim to the papal throne in 1378. The Conciliar Movement and the Council of Constance settled the dispute and reconciled the papal office in 1415 but insisted the pope must exercise his power through the hierarchy of the church and not usurp the rights of his subjects to their property.[13] Jean Gerson said God had given those rights to all people in nature as an "equal and inalienable" possession (*pluribus competens ex aequo et inabdicabile*).[14]

The natural rights tradition continued to make its way throughout Western Europe and became a significant doctrine in the systems of governance. It received special treatment and gained considerable notoriety through the works of scholars like Francisco de Vitoria, Francisco Suarez, Hugo Grotius, Samuel Pufendorf, and so many others, but it was John Locke who deserves special mention for exalting the natural law to the primary place it serves today in constructing the social order and laying the foundation of the government.[15] Locke specifically rejected the other possibilities of the day that would base social action on a utilitarian calculus or promote the will of the people, as if the *vox populi vox Dei*. He thought no community or government had the right to construct the law outside the will of God. The law of nature must serve as the supreme rule of all people.[16]

> It is a power that hath no other end but preservation, and therefore can never have a right to destroy, enslave, or designedly to impoverish the subjects; the obligations of the law of Nature cease not in society, but only in many cases are drawn closer, and have, by human laws, known penalties annexed to them to enforce their observation. Thus the law of Nature stands as an eternal rule to all men, legislators as well as others. The rules that they make for other men's actions must, as well as their own and other man's actions, be conformable to the law of Nature—i.e., to the will of God, of which that is a declaration, and the fundamental law of Nature being the preservation of mankind, no human sanction can be good or valid against it.[17]

The law of nature included his famous trilogy of life, liberty, and property, which helped inspire the same basic rhetoric and statement of the doctrine in the Declaration of Independence and the Bill of Rights. Both Locke and the Founding Fathers considered these rights "inalienable," meaning they are nonnegotiable or not subject to any social contract or democratic polity.[18] The government has a sacred responsibility to serve the laws of God as found in nature, and the people have a duty to depose the government if it fails to fulfill its fundamental obligation—at least after a "long train of abuses."[19]

Locke's analysis came into some difficulty when trying to establish what the government was to protect or how people acquire the boundaries of their property in the first place. He decided to emphasize the labor of one's hand as a means of taking what was common and making it an individual possession. So, the initial gathering of nuts or catching a fish takes whatever is harvested out of the common pool of things and makes it one's own; the initial labor over a field "improves," "cultivates," "enclose(s)," and annexes the soil making it a part of one's own legal domain. Locke thought labor produced value, and the raw material of the earth was worth very little without it. He cited the commission of Genesis 1:28 to "subdue" and "improve" the planet, although he was not so triumphant as some Puritans and clearly recognized a problem with granting humankind a license to "carve out" more than it can use to meet its needs and acquire too much.[20] Most

[12] Ibid., 26.36–41.

[13] Jean Gerson, *De Potestate Ecclesiastica* [in *Oeuvres Completès*, intro., texte et notes par Palémon Glorieux (Paris: Desclee & Cie, 1965)], 6.211–42. The general council can question the actions of a pope and remove him from office under certain conditions. If the pope refuses to summon a council, the church can convoke its own and remove him. Ibid., 223, 233.

[14] Ibid., 246. Gerson was the leader of the movement and council.

[15] Pufendorf is similar to Locke in this regard. He believes the sovereign has an obligation to insure the proper observance of the natural law by force when it is necessary. *De Officio Hominis et Civis juxta Legem Naturalem Libri Duo* (Vol. 1, a reproduction of the Latin edition of 1682, and Vol. 2, a translation by F. G. Moore), in *The Classics of International Law*, James Brown Scott (ed.) (New York: Oxford University Press, 1927), II, 1.9, 10; 5.7; 6.7, 14; 12. 3, 6–7 (1.101, 102, 117, 120, 122, 140–42; 2.91–92, 104, 107, 109, 125–26). Locke displays evidence of Pufendorf's ideas in his writing and praises the latter's work on the subject of natural law in society as the quintessential textbook. Richard Tuck, *Natural rights theories*: *their origin and development* (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1981), 433. Cf. Sigmund, *Natural Law in Political Thought*, 81–82; *John Locke: Two Treatises of Government*, Peter Laslett (ed.) (Cambridge: University Press, 1967), 22, 74–75. Sigmund points to sections 58, 65, 74, and 105, and other sections could be listed. One should also note the pervasive influence of Grotius at the time. Tuck, *National rights theories*, 176; Stephen Buckle, *Natural Law and the Theory of Property*: *Grotius to Hume* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991), 139. Locke's *Essays* were written before Pufendorf's but after Grotius' work on the subject.

[16] John Locke, *Essays on the Law of Nature*, W. von Leyden (ed.) (Oxford: At the Clarendon Press, 1958), 161, 213; Buckle, *Natural Law and the Theory of Politics*, 146; James O. Hancey, "John Locke and the Law of Nature," *Political Theory* 4/4 (Nov. 1976): 449.

[17] John Locke, *Concerning Civil Government, Second Essay*, in *Great Books of the Western World*, Robert Maynard Hutchins (ed.) (Chicago: Encyclopaedia Britannica, Inc., 1978), 135 (56).

[18] Ibid., 26 (30), 221–22 (75–76).

[19] Ibid., 4 (25–26), 155, 209 (60– 61, 73); 225 (77).

[20] Ibid., 30–32 (24–34), 34 (43), 35–36 (51); Richard Boer and Christina Petterson, *Idols of Nations: Biblical Myths at the Origin of Capitalism* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2014), 72–77, 80–82. Locke blames

© 2024 Global Journals

acquisitive capitalism saw no special problem with exceeding one's "needs," believing the lusts of the consumer produces a more luxurious lifestyle for the next generation, where the concept of what is essential or needed constantly changes or moves into a higher standard of living.[21] What became a more significant problem for the capitalists was the limited nature of resources on the planet, which had difficulty keeping up with the insatiable demands and exploitation of the new consumer economy.

The new economic system had its problems but possessed some solid roots within a universal religious vision. It had roots in the ancient belief concerning an ideal world that supplied life with a transcendent commentary or moral perspective. Its laws and rights could not develop from a rational or secular analysis of this material world—an analysis that contains no ability to transcend the world and offer a commentary on what happens to transpire in it.[22] The concept of property rights came from a longstanding religious tradition that connected the rights to the will of God in ancient texts like the Hammurabi and Mosaic law codes, the ideal Good in philosophers like Plato and Cicero, and the revelation of the divine *Logos* to all humankind in Christian theology. These rights came to the forefront in the modern world and demanded special protection from the government as its sacred duty. The exalted place helped lay the foundation for an economic system like capitalism to make property a centerpiece of devotion and to prosper under the new civic policies.

III. Puritans

Max Weber brought the question of the relationship between Protestantism and capitalism to the forefront of academic interest with the publication of two articles on the "Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism" in 1904 and 1905. R. H. Tawney defended the basic theory that was presented in these articles in his book *Religion and the Rise of Capitalism*, helping to promote its popularity in the English-speaking world and elevate its status to one of the most celebrated theses in all of social studies.[23] The thesis starts out at the beginning of the Reformation contending that Martin Luther provided an early impetus for the new economic order through his radical belief in the spirituality of the laity and their life in society. This teaching was meant to challenge the concept of spirituality in the Middle Ages, which found a higher ideal within a life cloistered in a monastery or walls of the church, separate from the secular world of business and the material temptations to cheat and profit at the expense of others.[24] Luther changed all this with his concept of the priesthood of the believers. He considered the worldly "professions" (*Berufe*) of the laity a genuine spiritual "calling" before God.[25] The Puritans provided the most radical expression of this teaching and laid the "seedbed" for the ultimate triumph of a new economic order that emphasized participation in the world and building the community. William Perkins wrote *A Treatise of the Vocations or Callings of Men* (1605), where he exhorted the members of his Puritan community to fulfill their individual callings in the family and society, not just the

the invention of money as a durable good that led people to possess more than they really needed. Ibid., 35 (46–50).

[21] Bernard Mandeville thinks that wealth is increasing. What was once called luxury is now "enjoy'd by the meanest and most humble Wretches." *Fable of the Bees: Or, Private Vices, Publick Benefits*, F. B. Kaye (intro.) (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1924), 1.169. What was criticized by moralists/philosophers in the past tends to gain acceptance later on. Many thought the concept of luxury was relative to culture, even one's station in life according to sumptuary laws. *The Works of Voltaire* (Paris: E. R. DuMont, 1901), 37.216–18; Ferdinando Galiani, *Della Moneta Libri Cinque* (Napoli: Nella Stamperia, 1780) 12.29–30; Saint-Lambert, "Luxe," in *Encyclopédie*, L, 84; Fredrik Albritton Jonsson and Carl Wennerlind, *Scarcity: A History from the Origins of Capitalism to the Climate Crisis* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2023), 38. Jacob Viner talks about an oft-repeated tradition in western civilization that he first discovers in Clement of Alexandria and continues on into modern times with scholars like Locke, Pufendorf, Defoe, Wolf, and Amyraut. It sees God supplying necessities in abundance like water and air, while hiding from us what is not so necessary like gold and pearls. Jacob Viner, *The Role of Providence in the Social Order: An Essay in Intellectual History* (Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1972), 28.

[22] Ludwig Wittgenstein, *Tractatus Logic-Philosophicus*, D. F. Pears and B. F. McGuinness (trans.) (London and Henley: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1977), 3, 5 (1, 2, 2.01), 19 (4.003), 25–26 (4.112–4.1212), 56–57 (5–5.61, 5.632–5.633), 67–74; *Philosophical Investigations*, G. E. M. Anscombe (trans.) (New York, Macmillan Publishing Co., 1968), 103ff. (308ff.).

[23] Robert W. Green (ed.), *Protestantism and Capitalism: The Weber Thesis and Its Critics* (Boston: C. Heath and Co., 1959.), vii; Manfred Bergler, "Max Webers Thesen über die Entstehung des modernen westlichen Kapitalismus," *Zeitschrift für Religions-und Geistesgeschichte* 39/1 (1987): 27, 28; Hartmut Lehmann, "The Rise of Capitalism: Weber versus Sombart," in *Weber's Protestant Ethic: Origins, Ethics, and Context*, Hatrmut Lehmann and Guenther Roth (ed.) (Cambridge: University Press, 1993), 197–198; M. J. Kitch, *Capitalism and the Reformation* (New York: Barnes & Noble, Inc., 1968) xvii–xviii.

[24] Max Weber, *The Sociology of Religion*, Ephraim Fischoff (trans.) (Boston: Beacon Press, 1963), 220; Manfred Brocker, "Max Webers Erklärungsansatz für die Entstehung des Kapitalismus," *Zeitschrift für Geschichtswissenschaft* 43/6 (1995): 501; Jacob Viner, *Religious Thought and Economic Society* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1978), 17, 61; Lanfranc, *Elucidarium*, in *Opera quae supersunt omnia*, John Allen Giles (ed.) (Oxonii: Parker, 1844) 2.18; Kitch, *Capitalism and the Reformation*, 95–96; Edmund Schreiber, *Die volkswirtschaftlichen Anschauungen der Scolastik seit Thomas v. Aquin* (Jena: G. Fischer, 1913), 154; Gratian, *Decretum*, in *Incipit Concordia discordatium canonum* (Basel: Michael Wenssler, 1482) part 1, dist. 88, cap. 11.

[25] WA 6.407–410, 413 (LW 44.127–32, 136–37). Cf. WA 7.56-58 (LW 31.354-56); Max Weber, *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*, T. Parsons (trans.) (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1958), 79–81; Brocker, "Max Webers Erklärungsansatz," 504–505. Luther translates *klēsis* (calling) in the NT as *Berufung* or *berufen.*

© 2024 Global Journals

church, based on Paul's admonition in 1 Corinthians 7:20 to "remain in the situation (*klēsis*) that God has called" each and every one.[26] Richard Steele wrote *The Trademan's Calling* (1684), in which he provided a special "case of the conscience" for those who serve God through "some peculiar Imployment in this world."[27]

> A pious Tradesman may act Grace, as much as the greatest Rabbi. Famous is the story of Primitive Saint in Egypt, Who having for many Years retired himself from the World and chiefly imployed himself in the Acts of Mortification and Devotion; and being thereupon tempted to think himself among the holiest Men on Earth, and long'd to know who should sit next him in Heaven, was warned to inquire for a Man in Alexandria who was holier than himself; and who should that be but, when he had found him, but a poor Cobler, that work'd hard most of the day, but was so circumspect in his Life, so just in his Dealings, so thankful with 'his Wife for his mean fare, and then so truly devout in the Worship of God, that the poor Hermite return'd crest-faln to his Cell, and found that the honest Tradesman was like to sit above him in Heaven. So that the Exercise of Grace should be no uncouth Business to a Christian Tradesman.[28]

Weber thinks the Calvinists were driven to fulfill this calling or "worldly asceticism" more than other Protestants because of their difficulty in obtaining assurance before God. The Calvinists (and particularly the Puritans) worked hard in building the community because of the enormous onus their divines placed on the shoulders of each and every one to make their calling sure through a lifetime of hard work and struggle. They had no sacramental means of assuaging anxieties, no simple answer to afford the laity and provide final certainty of their standing before God.[29] Their divines wrote tomes and tomes of works on the "cases of the conscience" exhorting the wayfarers to examine their inward motives and outward deeds and discern whether they were exhibiting the true fruits of divine election—probably producing even more anxiety and doubt in the constituency as the people proceeded to look inwardly at their own depravity or shortcomings before God and became obsessed with an issue that had no clear answer. Few found much solace in the process, but all were challenged to exhibit a life of service and devotion to secure their place in the kingdom of God. The divines had no answers to afford the faithful but set them off in pursuit of one, spurring them onward and helping produce a work ethic that was vital to the foundation of capitalism—a work ethic that was zealous to invest its time and resources into the community, not just the church, as a religious calling.[30]

Weber's thesis is right to underscore the relation between the work ethic and the doctrine of assurance in the Puritan community, but he makes several historical/theological mistakes along the way that are worth correcting in understanding the precise nature of the problem. He blames much of the problem on the community's obsession with the dark mysteries of predestination but fails to recognize the importance of synergistic elements in their theology that offset this doctrine and exerted a decided impact upon the problem at hand. Calvin's doctrine of predestination did not cause a problem in the community. In fact, Calvin speaks of Christ as the "mirror of predestination" or the one who reveals the Father's elective purposes to the believer, uniting the will of the Father and the words of Christ together and making the decree of the Father and the faith of the regenerate in the promises of Christ one and the same. In this doctrine of eternal security, Calvin rejects any reason to search some secret intendment or dark mystery outside the revelation of God in Christ to find the elective purpose or hidden will of the Father. Those who accept the call of the gospel can rest assured that no secret or hidden decree lies behind what is revealed to overturn the free gift of salvation for those who have faith in Christ.[31] If anything, Calvin (along with Martin Butzer) eliminated much of the mystery in the doctrine of predestination that plagued the church, rejecting the traditional dichotomy in its teaching between the saved and the elect, overturning its historical position that many who receive salvation are not destined for ultimate perseverance, that many lose their salvation and fail to receive the crown of eternal life, that those who believe have no certainty of their election, their final perseverance, or the ultimate will of God concerning them.

It was not Calvin's teaching or emphasis upon predestination that caused a problem in the doctrine of

[26] *The Work of William Perkins*, Ian Breward (ed.) (Appleford, Abingdon, and Berkshire: The Sutton Courtenay Press, 1970) 446–49, 456.
[27] Richard Steele, *The Trades-man's Calling* (London: J. D., 1684), 1–2.
[28] Ibid., 214–15.
[29] Weber, *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*, 110–14, 117, 157–60, 166–69, 230-31; Brocker, "Max Webers Erklärungsansatz," 505–506; Kemper Fullerton, "Calvinism and Capitalism: An Explanation of the Weber Thesis," in *Protestantism and Capitalism*, 13–14; Charles L. Cohen, "The Saint Zealous in Love and Labor: The Puritan Psychology of Work," *Harvard Theological Review* 76/4 (1983): 458.
[30] Ibid., 40; Robert M. Mitchell, "The Weber Thesis …," *Fides et Historia* 4/2 (1972): 57; Gianfranco Poggi, *Calvinism and the Capitalist Spirit: Max Weber's Protestant Ethic* (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1983), 60.
[31] *Inst.* III, xxiv, 3–5; CO 1.74 [*Inst.* (1536)]. Calvin probably developed this teaching in conjunction with Martin Butzer, his confidant. Butzer speaks definitively about uniting the will of Christ and the will of the Father together and so providing security for believers concerning their ultimate perseverance and election. Martin Bucer, *Metaphrases et narrationes perpetuae epistolarum D. Pauli Apostoli, . . .* (S.1.1536), 359bff., 402–405; *Opera Latina* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 188), 2.240, 347; *Calvinus Theologus* (Hrsg. Wilhelm Neusner; Neukirchen-Vluyn: Nekirchener Verlag, 1976), 89.

© 2024 Global Journals

assurance but two other doctrines that went in the opposite direction and brought a human element into the process of securing salvation. The first was the so-called "practical syllogism" of Theodore Beza and Jerome Zanchi that became popular among the Puritans as a method to deduce one's standing before God. The syllogism required an introspective analysis of the "marks" and "signs" of election in oneself, an examination of the conscience about the sincerity of one's faith, or a "reflexive act" to ascertain how one "feels and believes."[32] The purpose of the syllogism was to deduce a person's election in an Aristotelian manner by examining inward and outward manifestations and see if the fruits matched the biblical exhortation to believe as the condition or genuine sign of election. The problem was the tendency to take one's eyes off Christ in the process and look upon the deficiencies of the human response to divine grace. The problem was the object of faith had turned away from the Christ who justifies the believer toward an inward examination that puts faith in one's faith. Calvin warned against the move in the *Institutes*, believing our conscience derives more fear than comfort when inspecting the motivations and deeds of the flesh. He recognized some place for self-examination but exhorts his followers to remain Christocentric or fixated on the good things of Christ and the work of the Spirit and turn away from an analysis of human frailty as an uncertain means of consolation.[33]

Along with the practical syllogism, the Reformed added another doctrine that had similar results in emphasizing the human component—the doctrine of covenant. Heinrich Bullinger was most responsible for turning the covenant into a bilateral arrangement and disseminating this synergistic interpretation to all Reformed Europe through a widely circulated treatise on the subject, *The One and Eternal Testament or Covenant of God* (1534). Bullinger had turned away from Luther, Zwingli, and the strong emphasis upon grace in his early career and moved toward a more moderate or synergistic understanding of salvation that incorporated a human component like "free will" into the process of salvation.[34] He incorporated the synergism into his interpretation of the covenant, believing humans had certain "conditions" to fulfill if they "expect" to receive what God has promised and lost their salvation if they fail to continue in their federal responsibilities.[35] Many of the Reformed theologians adopted this concept of a bilateral covenant with "mutual obligations" from Bullinger, with or without recognizing a tension in their overall theology.[36]

Other Reformed theologians were more astute and saw a real conflict between its teaching and the fundamental emphasis upon *sola gratia* in Luther and Calvin. They were particularly concerned about its application to the doctrine of assurance. John Eaton founded an English antinomian movement that complained about the many false prophets appearing in "these latter days" with a "legal zeal for works" and turning the focus of the church away from the "wedding garments of Christ" to meditate on the "menstruous cloth" of human righteousness.[37] He found much of his inspiration in the writings of Luther and maintained the same type of Christocentric vision that looked beyond all "reason, sight, sense, and feeling" to the "bare and naked word of God."[38] The controversy reached its most fervid pitch in the Massachusetts Bay Colony between October 1636 and March 1638.[39] John Cotton was the most eminent theologian of the movement and disparaged both the practical syllogism and any talk of conditions in the covenant of grace. He felt Puritanism was losing the original focus of Calvin upon Christ and

[32] Theodore Bèze, *Tractationes Theologicae* (Genevae, 1582), 1.10, 15–16, 687–90; *Quaestionum & Responsionum Christianum libellus* (Londini,1571); Joel Beeke, *Assurance of Faith: Calvin, English Puritanism, and the Dutch Second Reformation* (New York: Peter Lang, 1991), 82ff.; R. T. Kendall, *Calvin and English Calvinism to 1649* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1981), 32ff.; Girolamo Zanchi, *Opera Theologica* (Genevae, 1613), 2.506 (*De Natura Dei*, 1577); 7.230; 8.716–17 (*Miscellanae*, 1566). Perkins translates parts of Zanchi's *De Natura Dei* on assurance into English, and two important treatises of Beza on the subject are also translated in 1570 and 1574. The two have a particular impact on the Puritans, but the practical syllogism became a part of the discussion and treatment of theologians in all Reformed Europe.

[33] *Inst.* III, ii, 18, 38; xiv, 18–20; *Commentarius in Iohannis Apostolis Epistolam*, 3:14 (CO 27.339); Timothy Miller, "Comparing Calvin and Barth on the Doctrine of Assurance," *PRJ* 12/2 (2020): 133–34; CD II/2.335; Wilhelm Niesel, *The Theology of Calvin*, Harold Knight (trans.) (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Baker Book House, 1980), 173–75.

[34] For details, see Stephen Strehle, *The Catholic Roots of the Protestant Gospel: Encounter between the Middle Ages and the Reformation* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1995), 51–58.

[35] Heinrich Bullinger, *De Testamento seu Foedere Dei unico et aeterno* (Tiguri, 1534), 5b, 8a–9a, 11b, 14b; *Sermonum Decades quinque* (Tiguri, 1567), 121b.

[36] Johannes Heidegger, *Corpus Theologiae Christianae* (Tiguri, 1666), 1.9.10; Francis Turrettini, *Institutio Theologica elenctiae* (Genevae, 1688), 8.3.3, 12.1.8; Georg Sohnius, *Opera* (Herbornae Nassoviorum, 1609), 1.74, 234; Zacharias Ursinus, *Explicationum Catecheticarum* (Heidelbergae, 1607), 128–29.

[37] *The Honey-Combe of Free Justification by Christ alone* (Lancaster, 1642), 206–207, 372, 386, 468; *The Discovery of the Most Dangerous Dead Faith* (London, 1642), preface, 47, 135, 149, 172ff.

[38] *The Honey-Combe of Free Justification*, 25–26, 115, 178–83, 241, 395; *Discovery* [*Abrahams Stepps by Faith*], 176–77, 185. Eaton particularly found Luther's commentary on Galatians (1535) inspiring, citing it no less than 106 times. Norman Graebner, "Protestants and Dissenters: An Examination of the Seventeenth-Century Eatonists and New England Controversies in Reformation Perspective" (Durham, NC: Ph.D. dissertation, Duke University, 1991), vi, 154, 167, 182. See J. Wayne Baker, "Sola Fide, Sola Gratia: The Battle for Luther in Seventeenth-Century England," *SCJ* 16/1 (1985), 118, 120–21, 125. Eaton did not proceed as far as Johann Agricola and disparaged the place of the law in our conversion. Graebner, "Protestants and Dissenters," 4. 144. 184–87, 193.

[39] David Hall, *The Antinomian Controversy, 1636–1638: a documentary history, edited, with introduction and notes* (Middleton, Conn.: Wesleyan Press, 1968), 146, 178–79, 182–83, 186, 232, 240–41; John Cotton, *A Treatise of the Covenant of Grace* (London, 1671), 10, 14, 19–21, 28–29, 35–37, 66, 129–30, 213–14, 220; *The New Covenant* (London, 1654), 14–15, 52–57.

© 2024 Global Journals

the witness of the Spirit and producing despair among its people through the overemphasis upon self-examination.[40] The controversy only subsided when Cotton and other antinomians were accused of causing a schism and put under duress through the authority of Winthrop to reconcile their point of view with the rest of the community, meaning the emphasis upon covenant conditions was here to stay. The bilateral covenant continued to cause a tension with the Reformed doctrine of grace and unconditional election but provided a positive social force and strong incentive to work hard in building the community and secure one's place in the kingdom of God.

Whatever the reason, no one doubts the Puritans earned their reputation as an industrious and practical people. The focus of their sermons and writings centered upon the pursuit of a practical piety, rather than scholastic theological disputes or metaphysical speculations. Their education shunned literary flourishes and theoretical abstractions for more concrete subjects like science and history, more practical and utilitarian approaches like vocational training, especially in America.[41] The purpose of life was to make a concrete difference in building the community, not fritter away the time on philosophical musings or idle meditation in a cloistered cell. Idleness was considered the root of all evil; and diligence inculcated among the rich and poor alike.[42] Perkins chides the rich for spending "a greater part of their increase upon hawks, bulls, bears, dogs, or riotously misspend[ing] the same in sporting or gaming."[43] Steele chastens immoderate "Gaming," "Frequenting Taverns, Ale-houses, and Coffee-Houses," and "all bewitching Pleasures and Recreations" as wasting time and squandering sources on what should be spent on the productive affairs of business.[44] The purpose of life was found in building or investing one's time, energy, and resources in the community, not pursuing a life of luxury, pomp, and excess, not accumulating wealth to squander it on frivolous entertainment.[45] The Puritan form of capitalism hated the corpulent life-style of aristocrats and demanded the rich invest their capital in the community, rather than waste it on eating French pastries and going on fox hunts.

The Puritans proceeded to bolster the work ethic with a strong incentive that envisaged the community making real progress in creating a better world for their children and so energizing the people with an optimistic view of life. The Puritans started this vision within the church, working to reform the institution into a more faithful image of its divine calling but soon ended up expanding the program to include all of society.

> Reformation must be Universal, . . . reform all places, all persons and callings; reform the Benches of Judgment, the inferior Magistrates, ... Reform the Church, . . . , Reform the Universities, ... Reform the Cities, reform the Countries, reform inferiour Schools of Learning; reform the Sabbath, reform the Ordinances, the worship of God, &c.[46]

The "Reformed" wanted to ameliorate all social ills and dreamed of a "Great Instauration" or renewal that was destined to encircle and encompass the entire globe with the truth of the gospel in all areas of life. The Puritans who came to America thought of their community as the "New Israel" or epicenter of God's activity in the world, as a "City on a Hill," shining its light to the nations, leading the march of history toward a brighter tomorrow and the dawning of the kingdom of God.[47] Jonathan Edwards, the greatest of all American-born theologians, echoed the basic Puritan spirit of progress in his writings. He understood the gospel and all human endeavors in the arts and sciences as following the path of the sun and circumambulating the planet from east to west, starting in Jerusalem, proceeding to Asia Minor and then Europe, and finally coming to England and now America. He pointed to real concrete progress taking place in navigation, agriculture, astronomy, physics, and all the rest of human endeavors.[48] He saw the Puritans at the forefront

[40] Hall, *Antinomian Controversy*, 57–58, 119, 189; Cotton, *A Treatise*, 39, 43–44, 53, 84, 139, 149–50, 218–20; *New Covenant*, 130–31.

[41] Alexis de Tocqueville, *Democracy in America* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1963), 1.52, 297, 315; 2.3; Richard Baxter, *A Christian Dictionary: Or, A Summ of Practical Theologie* (London: Robert White, 1673), 1.13; Francis Bacon, *Advancement of Learning and Novum Organum* (New York: P. F. Collier & Son, 1900), 14–18; Robert Nisbet, *History of the Idea of Progress* (New York: Basic Books, 1980), 17–19; Charles Webster, *The Great Instauration: Science, Medicine and Reform* (New York: Holmes & Meier Publishers, 1976), 189–90, 199–200; Perry Miller, *The New England Mind: The Seventeenth Century*, 270, 271, 299ff., 332–33, 327–28, 349.

[42] Martin Butzer, *De Regno Christi* [*Buceri Opera Latina* (Paris, 1955) vol. 15], 2.48–52; Steele, *The Trades-man's Calling*, 19, 22, 77–95; Michael Walzer, *The Revolution of the Saints*: *A Study in the Origins of Radical Politics* (New York: Atheneum, 1973), 208–209. Butzer's work was written in England and addressed to Edward VI, his royal pupil. In the year 1551 (the year of Butzer's death), Edward enacted many of the measures Butzer proposed in his work, whether under his direct influence or not. *Melanchthon and Bucer*, Wilhelm Pauck (ed.), in *The Library of Christian Classics* (Philadelphia: The Westminister Press, 1969), 171; Christopher Hill, *Society & Puritanism in pre-Revolutionary England* (New York: Schocken Boos, 1964), 272; *The World Turned Upside Down* (New York: Penguin, 1975), 264.

[43] Perkins, *The Workes* (Cambridge, 1608), 1.754.

[44] Steele, *The Trades-man's Calling*, 70, 84–85.

[45] Butzer, *De Regno Christi*, 2.50; Christopher Hill, *The English Bible and the Seventeenth-Century Revolution* (London: Allen Lane/Penguin Press, 1993), 159–60; Perkins, *The Workes*, 2.128 (D).

[46] Thomas Case, *Two Sermons Lately Preached at Westminster* (London: I. Raworth, 1642), 2.13, 16.

[47] Webster, *The Great Instauration*, 2, 29–30; Nisbet, *History of the Idea of Progress*, 129; Ernest Lee Tuveson, *Redeemer Nation: The Idea of America's Millennial Role* (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1968), 97–98.

[48] Jonathan Edwards, *Polypoikilos Sophia. A Compleat History Or Survey Of all the Dispensations and Methods of Religion* (London, 1699), 610–15, 621, 634, 637, 642, 689–91, 741. Christopher Hill finds this westward movement in Herbert, Sibbes, Ward, Vaughan, Trapp, Winstanley, and Twisse. According to Twisse, "many divines

© 2024 Global Journals

of society leading the advancement of humankind and creating the conditions for a future millennial kingdom, which no longer required a cataclysm from the heavens or a personal return of Christ to redeem all of humankind and transform this fallen world into a more Christ-like image.[49] This instauration was the present existential mission of the people of God.

The paradigm of progress was the undeniable advance that was taking place in science and technology. Puritans led the way toward the emergence of modern science according to the famous and well-received thesis of Robert Merton.[50] The Puritans certainly dominated the Royal Society of London in the seventeenth century and made sure its scientific agenda encouraged "useful arts" and worked for the "advancement of the human race."[51] They wanted a science that served the practical needs of the community in "devising inventions for the betterment of humankind," in turning stones into metal, idle lands into productive farming, and ameliorating the lot of the community in the here and now.[52] All of this worked in accordance with their favorite verse of Scripture that said "knowledge shall increase" in the latter days (Dan. 12:4—KJV).[53] All of this fulfilled the original commission of humankind to take dominion and rule over the "beasts of the field," the "fish of the sea," and the "birds of the air" (Gen. 1:28–30).[54] The people were inspired through these and other verses to build a better world but never really understood the downside of the commission to change the world into their image as a temptation toward arrogance or a license to run roughshod over nature and its inhabitants. The commission worked as long as the bounty was plentiful and resources endless, as long as capitalism and technology had no limits. The Puritans who came to the American wilderness followed the western march of the gospel and its manifest destiny to tame the savages, cultivate the land, and consume or exploit the resources but had little thought of preserving what existed before their arrival.[55] The new technological science demonstrated the superiority of their culture in the advancement of humankind and their ability to consume or re-create all things without recognizing serious limits to the paradigm.[56]

Among the names associated with the new paradigm are Francis Bacon, Richard Baxter, and Benjamin Franklin. Francis Bacon is celebrated as the great apostle of the new scientific method, although he was not a speculative pacemaker offering a different approach to the subject outside the typical adages of his day in the Puritan and scientific community. His writings came to the forefront during the times of Puritan Revolution and served as a guiding light of the new philosophical approach to nature in the Royal Society of London and the community at large.[57] Much like the Puritans, he cites the prophetic words of Daniel 12:4 in his writings several times believing that knowledge will

saw a westward movement, and he himself wondered whether New England might not become the New Jerusalem." *The English Bible*, 139–40. In *A History of the Work of Redemption*, Edwards divides world history into four great periods, which are marked by the work of Christ (and the destruction of Jerusalem in 70), the rise of the Holy Roman Empire with Constantine, the destruction of the Antichrist, and the second coming of Christ. *The Works of Jonathan Edwards*, Perry Miller (ed.) (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1957—2008), 9.351; George Marsden, *Jonathan Edwards: A Life* (New Haven & London: Yale University Press, 2003), 196, 198. Apparently in his notebooks on the "History of Redemption" he planned on creating a seven-fold rhythm of history. *Works*, 9.61–72, 546–47; Marsden, *Jonathan Edwards*, 483, 485. For progress in all areas of life, see also Robert Boyle, *The Works of the Honourable Robert Boyle* [London, 1772] (Bristol, England: Thoemmes Press, 1999), 4.16–18; Wilhelm Whiston, *A New Theory of the Earth* [1696] (London, 1725), 62, 81.

[49] Ibid., 665–725, 731–35.

[50] For details, see Stephen Strehle, *The Egalitarian Spirit of Christianity: The Sacred Roots of American and British Government* (New Brunswick, NJ and London: Transaction Publishers, 2009), 223–28. Cf. Jacob Viner, *The Role of Providence in the Social Order: An Essay in Intellectual History* (Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1972), 26.

[51] *The Record of the Royal Society of London for the Promotion of Natural Knowledge* (London: Morrison & Gibb LTD., 1940), 237 (251). Cf. Webster, *The Great Instauration*, 54–56, 88.

[52] Baxter, *A Christian Dictionary*, 1.13; Francis Bacon, *Valerius Terminus*, in *Works*, 3.221–22; Joseph Glanvill, "The Usefulness of Real Philosophy to Religion," in *Essays on Several Important Subjects in Philosophy and Religion* [London, 1676] (New York and London: Johnson Reprint Corporation, 1970), 5–6, 20, 25; Webster, *The Great Instauration*, 50, 328; Peter Harrison, *The Territories of Science and Religion* (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 2015), 133–34; Michael S. Burdett, "The Religion of Technology: Transhumanism and the Myth of Progress," in *Religion and Transhumanism*, Calvin Mercer and Tracy J. Trothen (eds.) (Santa Barbara, CA: Praeger, 2015), 135.

[53] Webster, *The Great Instauration*, 9ff.

[54] Thomas Sprat, *The History of the Royal Society of London* (London, 1722), 62; Joseph Glanvill, *Plus Ultra* [London, 1668] (Gainesville, FL: Scholars' Facsimiles & Reprints, 1958), 86-88; *Scepsis Scientifica* 1665[London] (New York and London: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1978), "An Address to the Royal Society," b3ff.

[55] Thomas P. Hughes, *Human-Built World: How to Think about Technology and Culture* (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 2004), 31. Cotton Mather speaks of whaling as a good gift of God, designed to "suck the abundance of the sea." He paints a dark picture of the natives as brutal "savages," who worship many gods or demons, practice black magic, and possibly descended from the wicked Canaanites. *Magnalia Christi Americana* (London, 1702), 1.62; 2.426, 440, 446.

[56] Andrea Finkelstein, "Nicholas Barbon and the Quality of Infinity," *History of Political Economy* 32/1 (2000): 83ff., 100; Francis Bacon, *The New Organon*, 4.81–82 (lxxxiv); Gabriel Plattes, *The profitable Intelligencer: Communicating his Knowledge for the Generall good of the Common-wealth and all Posterity* (London, 1644); Frederick Albritton Jonsson and Carl Wennerlind, *Scarcity: A History from the Origins of Capitalism to the Climate Crisis* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard university Press, 2023), 8, 17, 49, 57, 63.

[57] Christopher Hill, *The Intellectual Origins of the English Revolution Revisited* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997), 85ff., 111, 115–18; T. K. Rabb, "Puritanism and the Rise of Experimental Science," in *Puritanism and the Rise of Modern Science: The Merton Thesis*, I. Bernard Cohen (ed.) (New Brunswick and London: Rutgers University Press, 1990), 211; R. F. Jones, "The Advancement of Learning and Piety," in *Puritanism and the Rise of Modern Science*, 164ff.; Webster, *The Great Instauration*, 24, 514.

© 2024 Global Journals

increase in the future and make real progress toward building and shaping a better society.[58] Much like the Puritans, he rejects speculative flights of fancy and thinks "knowledge is to be valued according to its usefulness."[59] It is better to limit the study of nature to mundane questions of secondary causality or practical value than engage in too much metaphysical speculation about ultimate questions or divine mysteries like the Scholastics of old. Let Scripture address issues of ultimate concern and let science recognize the limits of human reason and address what it does best in studying matters of secondary concern through its experimental method.[60]

Richard Baxter provided the quintessential defense of Puritan ethics in his *Christian Directory* (1673)—a large tome with 1172 pages of very tiny print. The work contains all the basic themes and practical exhortations associated with the spirit of capitalism in its Puritan form. It speaks of life as short and exhorts the wayfarer to redeem the time and work hard to enter the kingdom of God.[61] There is no time to waste on frivolous entertainment, extravagant living, or unprofitable ventures.[62] The purpose of life consists of "service to God and public good"—the investment of one's time, talent, and capital in the community for the sake of future generations.[63] The goal remains rooted in the utilitarian, altruistic, and teleological values of the Puritan community that wanted to lead a useful life of service to others and help improve the lot of those who come afterwards. Baxter provides the most important and complete witness to the type of ethics and theology that provided the Puritan form of capitalism with its spiritual matrix.[64]

Benjamin Franklin embodied the Puritan spirit of capitalism and technological science, perhaps more than anyone else during the era. He did not share all the theological convictions of the community, but he represented much of the ethical and spiritual commitments of his Puritan upbringing. He provides testimony to these values in his autobiography, pointing to the example of his parents' "Labour and Industry," referring to his reading of Puritan classics like *Pilgram's Progress* and *Essays to Do Good*, which "gave me a Turn of Thinking that had an influence on the principal future Events of My Life," with its exhortations to avoid extravagant living and work hard in serving the community.[65] His *Poor Richard's Almanack* filled its pages with Puritan-like exhortations, "with Proverbial Sentences, chiefly such as inculcated Industry and Frugality, as the Means of procuring Wealth and thereby securing virtue"[66]: "Time is money," "Diligence is the mother of good luck," "Leisure is time for doing something useful," "Early to bed, early to rise, makes a man healthy, wealthy, and wise."[67] He speaks of following this advice for much of his life, refusing to waste his time in "Taverns, Games, or Frolicks," his

[58] Francis Bacon, *Advancement of Learning and Novum Organum* (New York: P. F. Collier & Son, 1900), passim; Webster, *The Great Instauration*, 22–24.

[59] Baxter, *A Christian Directory*, 1.13.

[60] Bacon, *Advancement of Learning*, 5, 97, 137; Jones, "The Advancement of Learning and Piety," 164–65; Joseph Glanvill, *Philosophia Pia (1671)*, in *Collected Works of Joseph Glanvill*, B. Fabian (ed.) (Hildesheim and New York: George Olms Verlag, 1970), 5.119. See Sprat, *The History of the Royal Society*, 353–59.

[61] Baxter, *A Christian Directory*, 1.58, 128, 274–93, 448; *Dying-Thoughts*, in *The Practical Works of the Rev. Richard Baxter* (London: James Duncan, 1830), 18. 408–409; *Poetical Fragments* (London: T. Snowden, 1681), 40

[62] Ibid., *A Christian Directory*, 1.65, 108ff., 134, 143, 147, 288, 451–65, 632; K. Fullerton, "Calvinism and Capitalism: An Explanation of the Weber Thesis," in *Protestantism and Capitalism*, 16–17.

[63] Ibid., 1.131–33, 447–50; 4.147; W. Hudson, "Puritanism and the Spirit of Capitalism," in *Protestantism and Capitalism*, 59–60.

[64] Weber points to Baxter as providing the "most complete compendium of Puritan ethics" but fails to note his rejection of the doctrine of predestination in the text, leaving only an implicit reference to his position in the footnotes. If anything, Baxter is an "Anti-Antinomian." He tries to destroy this "heresy" for encouraging spiritual laziness. He rejects its Christocentric point of view that depicts Christ as the "mirror of predestination" and wants assurance to reside in hard work, struggle, and self-examination. He emphasizes conditions of mutual responsibility in the New Covenant and even broaches the Catholic doctrine of justification by works at times, preferring the charge of synergism to destroying the human element of the covenant and the call to discipleship. Of course, Weber fails to underscore this synergism because it undermines his view of the relationship between predestination and the work ethic. See Weber, *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*, 156; Richard Baxter, *The Saints' Everlasting Rest*, J. T. Wilkinson (ed.) (London: The Epworth Press, 1962), 2, 12, 30, 35, 37, 54, 86, 108, 113, 118; *Aphorismes of Justification* (Hague: Abraham Brown, 1655), 4, 8, 59–60, 70, 82–83, 208; *The Right Method for a Settled Peace of Conscience and Spiritual Comfort*, in *The Practical Worksof the Rev. Richard Baxter* (London: James Duncan, 1830), 9: 57–58, 151; *The Right Method for a Settled Conscience*, passim; *The Mischiefs of Self-Ignorance, and Benefits of Self-Acquaintance*, in *The Practical Work*, 16.124–125; *Universal Redemption of Mankind* (London, 1694), 31–32; Tim Cooper, *Fear and Polemic in the Seventeenth-Century: Richard Baxter and Antinomianism* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001), 2, 66–67, 71, 75–76, 115, 135, 154, 165, 195, 203; David Hall, The Antinomian Controversy, 1636-38: a documentary history (Durham: Duke University Press, 1990), 280ff.; N.H. Keeble, Richard Baxter, *Puritan Man of Letters* (Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1982), 133, 139, 138–43; Hans Boersma, *A Hot Pepper Corn: Richard Baxter's Doctrine of Justification in Its Seventeenth-Century Context of Controversy* (Uitgeverij Boekencentrum, Zoetermeer, 1993), 164, 196, 197. Baxter denies he's an Arminian. He never makes a definite leap or creates sufficiently explicit statements to warrant the label, but his sympathies appear to gravitate in that direction. *Reliquiae Baxterianae*, Matthew Sylvester (ed.) (London, 1696), 1.107; *Confutation of a Disseration for the Justification of Infidels* (London: R. W., 1654), 201; *Penitent Confession and his Necessary Vindication* (London, 1691), 24; Margaret L. Wiley, *The Subtle Knot: Creative Scepticism in the Seventeenth-Century England* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1952), 162–63.

[65] *The Autobiography of Benjamin Franklin with Related Documents*, Louis P. Masur (ed. and intro.) (Boston and New York: Bedford/St. Martin's, 2003), 29–32, 80–81, 120–21, 136–37, 140–41; Mitchell Robert Breitwieser, *Cotton Mather and Benjamin Franklin* (Cambridge: University Press, 1984) 12.

[66] Ibid., 4, 106.

[67] *The Works of Benjamin Franklin*, Jared Sparks (ed.) (Boston: Tappen and Dennet, 1844), 2.87, 95–97.

© 2024 Global Journals

money on "Superfluities" or "expensive follies" like Chinaware and Indian silks.[68] His life is devoted to improving the quality of life in his community through establishing schools, public libraries, fire departments, and postal services, refusing to take out patents on his many inventions, and finding more pleasure in serving the public good than acquiring excessive wealth and living a luxurious lifestyle.[69] His science finds its purpose in creating "little advantages" that might add up one day to eliminating disease and extending the span of human life "beyond the antediluvian standard."[70] His ethics and vision came right out of his background in Boston and came to fruition during his adult life in Philadelphia.[71] He represented the supreme example of early capitalism and technological science, the relationship between Weber's and Merton's theses, and the fundamental validity of their work that points to the significance of Puritanism in shaping the modern world.

Along with the religious elements, Weber saw capitalism as a "rational economic technique" and Puritanism as a part of this rationalism or demystification (*Entzauberung*) of the world.[72] He saw capitalism becoming a purely rational enterprise in the course of time as it sought to make a profit through its various utilitarian techniques like efficient production, technological innovation, division of labor, large turnover, consumer prices, balance sheets, double-entry accounting, bookkeeping, and so forth.[73] Many scholars disagreed with Weber's assessment at this point and found the techniques of capitalism and the process of secularization developing long before the Protestant Reformation. They particularly pointed to the Italian city-states during the times of the Renaissance as developing an incipient form of capitalism and its various utilitarian techniques.[74] Weber accepted the criticism to some degree but remained firm in finding a significant acceleration of the process or qualitative difference in the impact of Calvinism, paving the way to a more sinister outcome. He believed capitalism became an "iron cage" of rational mechanisms in the modern world that ended up reifying the original and creative impulse of Calvinism producing in its place a totalitarian regime of these steering mechanisms.[75] The present system lost its religious moorings, or all contact with the original *Geist* that provided it with so much meaning and purpose.

This part of his analysis discusses some interesting techniques of capitalism and is correct as far as it goes, but it fails to provide a sufficient account of the origin and place of interest in the rationalization of the monetary system—a most essential feature of modern capitalism. Credit money serves as the most dynamic force of stimulation or investment in the capitalist scheme of things. Deficit financing, cultivating debt, and increasing the money supply provide the necessary condition for future expectation and expansion.[76] This new vision developed for a multitude of reasons but received an important stimulus from the church and its change of heart about usury. The Church

[68] *The Autobiography*, 82, 92– 93; *The Works*, 2.90; *Benjamin Franklin Writings* (New York: The Library of America, 1987), 1082; *Benjamin Franklin's The Art of Virtue: His Formula for Successful Living*, George L Rogers (ed.) (Eden Prairie, Minn.: Acorn Publishing, 1986), 159. The austerity began to wane as he and his wife grew older.

[69] Karl J. Weintraub, "The Puritan Ethic and Benjamin Franklin," *The Journal of Religion* 56/3 (1976): 236; *The Autobiography*, 124.

[70] *The Autobiography*, 94–95, 101–103, 164; *Writings*, 1017, 1167.

[71] Quakers grow out of Puritanism and emphasize the work ethic as much, if not more than the Puritans.

[72] Max Weber, *Die protestantische Ethik und der Geist des Kapitalismus*, in *Gesammelte Aufsätze zur Religionssoziologie* (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 1922), 94–95; Richard Roberts, "Introduction: Religion and Capitalism— a new convergence?," in *Religion and the Transformations of Capitalism*, Richard Roberts (ed.) (New York and London: Routledge, 1995), 1; Richard Lachmann, "Origins of Capitalism in Western Europe," *Annu. Rev. Sociol*. 15 (1989): 49; Hava Tirosh-Samuelson, "Religion, Science, and Technology in the Post-Secular Age: The Case of Trans/Posthumanism," *Philosophy, Theology and the Sciences* 4/1 (2017): 27.

[73] Max Weber, "The Author defines his purpose," in *Protestantism and Capitalism*, 2; *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*, 25, 64, 67; *General Economic History*, Frank H. Knight (trans.) (Glencoe, Ill.: The Free Press, 1950), 275–78, 354; Milan Zafirovski, "Any Proof of the Calvinism-Capitalism Thesis? The Exemplars of the 'Rule' Reexamined," *Politics, Religion & Ideology* 16/4 (2015): 339; Jefferey Y. F. Lau and John Smithin, "The Role of Money in Capitalism," *Int'l. Journal of Political Economy* 32/3 (Fall 2002): 12; Brocker, "Max Webers Erklärungsansatz," 495.

[74] Jere Cohen, "Rational Capitalism in Renaissance Italy," *American Journal of Sociology* 85/6 (May 1980): 1342, 1349–52; Alan Macfarlane, *The Origins of English Individualism: The Family, Property and Social Transition* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1979), 194–96; Georg Simmel, *Conflict and The Web of Group-Affiliation*, Reinhard Bendix (trans.) (Glencoe, Ill.: The Free Press, 1955), 137; Lau and Smithin, "The Role of Money," 51; Zafirovski, "Any Proof of the Calvinism-Capitalism Thesis?," 346–47, 354–56, 363–64.

[75] Jürgen Habermas, *The Theory of Communicative Action*, 2 vols., Thomas McCarthy (tras.) (Boston: Beacon Press, 1984–87), 2.166–68, 183, 196, 254, 302, 312; Alan Milchman, "Weber on Capitalism, Socialism and Democracy," *Socialism and Democracy* 7 (1988): 99, 103–106, 110; Volker Heins, "Weber's Ethic and the Spirit of Anti-Capitalism," *Political Studies* 41 (1993): 273, 274; Brocker, "Max Webers Erklärungsansatz," 498. In his great work, *The Technological Society* (1954), Jacques Ellul affords the most excoriating analysis of *la technique* taking over our lives, replacing the religious foundation of society with material efficiency and dead scientific analysis.

[76] Maurizio Lazzarato, *The Making of the Indebted Man: An Essay on the Neoliberal Condition*, Joshua David Jordan (trans.) (Amsterdam: Semiotext(e), 2012), 77–81; Philip Goodchild, "Credit and Debt," in *Routledge Handbook of Economic Theology*, 102; Viner, *The Role of Providence*, 9; Lau and Smithin, "The Role of Money in Capitalism," 11–15. The national debt is driven by this same spirit. Deficit spending is considered a way of growing the economy. Carlo Salzani, "False and True Politics: Countering Capitalism as Religion," *Journal for Cultural and Religious Theory* 19/3 (Fall 2020): 456–57. Nietzsche and many others find the origin of guilt *(Schuld)* in debt *(Schuld)* or money *(Geld)*. If a person fails to pay a debt, the creditor has a right to punish the debtor as guilty. The relationship between debt and guilt illustrates a link between religion and "profane" realms like money. Friedrich Nietzsche, *On the Genealogy of Morals and Ecce Homo*, Walter Kaufmann and R. J. Hollingdale (Trans.) (New York: Vintage Books, 1989), 62–65; Goeffrey Ingram, *The Nature of Money* (Cambridge, UK: Polity, 2004), 90; Camilla Sløk, "Guilt," in *Routledge Handbook*, 73–74; Goodchild, "Credit and Debt," 101.

© 2024 Global Journals

Fathers and Medieval Scholastics all considered the lending of money and the charging of interest an unseemly business, if not an outright form of exploitation.[77] The clergy were forbidden to engage in the practice at the Council of Nicea (325) and subsequent councils extended the prohibition to include the laity—most notably at Aix-la-Chappelle (789) during the reign of Charlemagne.[78] Of course, the policy did not prevent the nobility and merchant houses like the Medici from concealing the sources of their income and violating the spirit of canon law. In fact, some Italian clerics like Cardinal Hostiensis and Antonius of Florence began to question the strict prohibition of the practice later on. They recognized that lending money meant the forestalling of an expected profit for the lender (*lucrum cessans*) and deserved remuneration, and so advocated a more tolerant policy on the issue toward the end of the Middle Ages and beginning of the Renaissance in their region of influence.[79] Protestant countries soon followed and began to ease restrictions on the purse strings at the beginning of the Reformation.[80] Robert Filmer lists some of the leading theologians who favored the new policy: "Bishop Babington, Mr. Perkins, Dr. Willet, Dr. Mayer, Mr. Brinsley, and others here at home: and abroad, Calvin, Martyr, Bucer, Billinger, Danaeus, Hemingius, Zanchius, Ursinus, Bucanus, Junius, Polanus, Malineus, Scultetus, Alstedius, Amesius, Grotius, Salmasius."[81] Robert Fenton depicted the Swiss theologians as responsible for leading the church away from the restrictions and particularly blamed Calvin as the "chief patron" of the new heresy that was condemned "for the space of fifteen hundred yeeres after Christ."[82]

Calvin's analysis of usury illustrates Weber's thesis concerning rationalism and secularism to some degree. Calvin condemned the exploitation of the poor and remained uneasy about the overall practice from a religious viewpoint but refused to bind the conscience of those who had sufficient means to engage in what the Bible does not strictly condemn. He and the Reformed had a tendency to follow the admonitions of the OT and its law more strictly than other Christian groups, but he made an exception in this case and provided a dispensational analysis of the Mosaic economy and its admonitions against usury, recognizing the difference between the situation in ancient Israel and the demands of a modern economy to emancipate capital, finance trade and commerce, and fund its complex and wide-scale operations.[83] It is possible to see Calvin's exegesis at this point following his constituency or trying to accommodate them with some form of biblical justification for the practice, skewing his analysis accordingly. He certainly felt the onus of the business community in this regard. His blessing was necessary to end the restrictions and sanction a practice that was crucial to the new economic order. It seems probable his exegesis of Scripture was influenced by the needs of the community, but it is hard to say for sure what had priority in his mind in a complex world, where secularism gives rise to religion and religion to secularism. It is safer to say that religion was a part of the mix in promoting the good of the community and sanctioning the means of investment in its future growth. It certainly provided a similar impetus among his disciples to move toward capitalism with their emphasis upon the priesthood of the believers, their rejection of cheap grace, and their postmillennial eschatology—all promoting a mission to improve the community and make a better world for humankind.

IV. Jews

The Jews also appear to provide a significant impetus within their ideology and activity toward the development of capitalism. The evidence might proceed in opposing political and economic directions but equivocations in the Jewish position does not preclude the evidence of their participation in advancing one side of the equation. Many of their detractors proceeded to criticize the Jews in modern times for displaying a dual nature in these matters, but this display of "hypocrisy" does not negate the decisive impact of their overall concepts upon one side of the variables; it only shows that influence proceeds in many different directions and never follows one simple path.[84] No one doubts the influence of Georg Hegel upon Marx, Engels, and other "Young Hegelians" just because of the many right-wing

[77] Thomas Aquinas, *Summa Theologiae*, II/2, q.78, a.1, 2; T. P. McLaughlin, "The Teaching of the Canonists on Usury," *Medieval Studies I* (1939): 105ff.; Viner, *Religious Thought and Economic Society*, 89, 90, 96; Christian Deutschmann, "Profit and Interest," in *Routledge Handbook*, 85–86

[78] Sidney Homer and Richard Sylla, *A History of Interest Rates* (New Brunswick, NJ and London: Rutgers University Press, 1991), 70; Roman Ohrenstein and Barry Gordon, *Economic Analysis in Talmudic Literature: Rabbinic Thought in the Light of Modern Economics* (Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2009), 204–205.

[79] Hostensius, *Commentaria super quinque libros decretalium* (Venice, 1581), 5.16 (*De usuries*); John T. Noonan, *The Scholastic Analysis of Usury* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1957), 118; S. Antonio, *Summa Moralis* (Verona, 1740), 2.1.7, xviii (101); Bede Jarrett, *S. Antonio* and *Mediaeval Economics* (London: Manresa Press, 1914), 65; ; M. J. Kitch, *Capitalism and the Reformation* (New York: Barnes & Noble, Inc., 1968), 118; Philipp Robinson Rössner, "Martin Luther as Economist," in *Routledge Handbook*, 299.

[80] Kitch, *Capitalism and the Reformation*, 123.

[81] Robert Filmer, *Quaestio Quodlibetica; or a Discourse, whether it may be lawfull to take Use for Money (1653)*, in *The Usury Debate in the Seventeenth Century: Three Arguments* (New York: Arno Press, 1972), 111.

[82] Ibid., 10–11, 58–66.

[83] CO 10.245–49; 24.680–83; 31.147–48; 40.430–32 (CC 5.126–32; 8.121–14; 23.226–28). CC stands for Calvin's *Commentaries* (Edinburgh: Calvin Translation Society). Kitch, *Capitalism and the Reformation*, 70; Tawney, *Religion and the Rise of Capitalism*, 106.

[84] Paul Morris, "Judaism and Capitalism," in *Religion and the Transformations of Capitalism*, Richard H. Roberts (ed.) (New York and London: Routledge, 1995), 95–97, 110–11.

© 2024 Global Journals

moments in his work.[85] The Jews display the same sort of tensions as Hegel in their thinking and provide influence in competing directions through their complex way of approaching issues.

Many have suggested a decisive role of the Jews in the development of capitalism. Most (in)famously, Marx thought that the Jews leavened the entire Christian world with the *Geist* of capitalism, with their faith in "commercial and industrial practice," selling "usury" and "huckstering," turning citizens into "atomistic individuals who inimically oppose one another," venerating the "jealous god of Israel" who serves their "self-interest," corrupting society through their money system and "egoistic need and trading," and so forth. He decried the "materialistic egoism" of the Jews for overcoming the Christian world with this system of narcissism and greed. Capitalism is depicted as nothing more than the Jews and their religion writ large.[86]

There is a paucity of academic literature on the subject to dispute or defend the accusation of Marx one way or another. The most famous and thorough treatment of the subject is Werner Sombart's *The Jews and Capitalism* (1911). It represents the Jews as largely responsible for capitalism but has a more positive view of the system and the Jews than Marx's account. It particularly spends its time and focus on Weber's thesis, maintaining that the Jews played a much more essential role in the development of the economic system than the Protestants or the Puritans. The book proved to be more controversial than Weber's work and received mixed reviews. It was justly criticized for some defective research and historical inaccuracy in certain areas, but much of the disdain came from the specter of the Nazis and anti-Semites using the book for their nefarious purposes, not from its scholarship.[87] Weber responded to Sombart's work with some harsh criticism of his own and claimed the Jews only had a primitive or limited role in developing a "pariah" form of capitalism that is not so much an integral part of its modern expression in the industrial world. Weber was probably right to reject the idea that Puritans developed the sum and substance of their ideas from the Jews, but he went too far in rejecting some clear evidence in the work of Jewish influence and chose instead to deprecate and depreciate the Jewish contribution. If Sombart overstated his case, Weber "understated the role of Jews in the rise of the new economic order."[88]

In his book, Sombart provides statistics and first-hand testimony to demonstrate the presence and power of the Jewish community in financial brokering,

[85] Denis R. Janz, *World Christianity and Marxism* (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press), 7–8; Richard P. Appelbaum, *Karl Marx* (Newbury Park, London, and New Dehli: Sage Publications, 1988), 21–22; Leszek Kolakowski, *Main Currents of Marxism*, P. S. Falla (trans.) (New York and London: W. W. Norton & Company, 2005), 80, 83; Julius I. Loewenstein, *Marx and Marxism* (London, Boston, and Henley: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1980), 9. Hegel recognizes right-wing political concerns like the self-interest of capitalism, property rights, inequality, penal justice (*lex talionis*), et al. G. W. F. Hegel *Phenomenology of the Spirit*, A, V. Miller (trans.) (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 1977), 229 (382), 233–34 (390); *The Philosophy of Right*, in *Great Books of the Western World*, 23–28 (44–46), 37–39 (99–101), 67 (200), 23–28, 37–38, 67. Jews have some left-wing tendencies. They are more into law than the NT concept of the freedom of the Spirit; they identify more with those who suffer due to their trials and tribulations of living in diaspora. Above all, they view themselves as a collective people who are not afraid to proclaim their piety or identity as Jews. They do not fear hypocrisy as much as Christians and do not go into the closet and shut the door while praying (Mt. 6:5–6). They wear a distinctive garb and pray together as a people.

[86] "On the Jewish Question," MECW 3.171–72 (1.174–75); *Holy Family*, MECW 4.109–110 (2.116); Delos B. McKown, *The Classical Marxist Critique of Religion: Marx, Engels, Lenin, Kautsky* (The Hague: Martinus Nijoff, 1975), 38; Morris, "Judaism and Capitalism," 88–95. The English translation of Marx and Engel's work is abbreviated MECW [*Collected Works* (New York: International Publishers, 1975)], and the German translation is given in parentheses [*Werke* (Berlin: Dietz, 1964)].

[87] Jack Barbalet, "Max Weber and Judaism: An Insight into the Methodology of the 'Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism," *Max Weber Studies* 5.2/6.1 (July 2005): 52; Morris, "Judaism and Capitalism," 102, 106–107; Werner Sombart, *The Jews and Modern Capitalism*, M. Epstein, Bert Hoselitz (intro.) (Glencoe, ILL: The Free Press, 1951), xix, xxviii, xxx, 191–92, 248–49. Some like Milton Friedman provide the book with favourable reviews. Even Hoselitz diatribe against the book admits there are some accurate chapters on the Jewish role in the trade of certain goods, markets, stock exchange, et al. Otherwise, Hoselitz finds the social theory "defective," the historical facts "faulty," the analysis "speculative," and the interpretation of the Jewish religion "biased and incomplete." Many associate the book with Nazi propaganda and find the image difficult to overcome and remain objective about it. Even Sombart recognizes the political danger of providing support to "coarser spirits" (252). He proceeds anyway and includes a discussion on "Jewish character" that might give fodder to the enemy. He thinks Jews possess a distinct anthropology or physiognomy, although he hesitates to call them a separate race (289–92). He thinks their religious system grew in concert with their "Intellectuality, Rationalism, Teleology," and other characteristics (300). He is less certain whether their intellectual ability is purely genetic (320–21), but he certainly admires the Jews and their "genius" for the development of capitalism, regardless of its precise origin in nurture or nature. He exalts the Jews for valuing education; using their intellect, not their brawn; their cleverness, resourcefulness, and thriftiness; their practicality, mobility, and adaptability; and their organizing skills—all of which equipped them to become good capitalists (258ff., 268, 274–75, 278, 320–21). He certainly takes notice of the many complaints about Jews monopolizing business and their dishonest practices to gain the upper hand and reap a profit, but he only cites the pejorative comments to prove his point about their relationship to capitalism and clearly does not share the animosity (116–19). Mostly, he expresses a deep admiration for the Jews. He might not appreciate the breadth of the Jewish experience, overemphasize their rationalism (much like Weber's treatment of Puritanism), and ignore other important aspects of the religion like the mysticism of the Kabbalah and Hassidism (xx–xxi); but the work is suggestive as far as it goes. Outside the work, his overall sentiment about capitalism as an economic system and the Jews as a people is a much more complicated story. Morris, "Judaism and Capitalism," 100–103.

[88] Ohrenstein and Gordon, *Economic Analysis*, 211; Gerhard Lenski, *The Religious Factor: A Sociological Study of Religion's Impact on Politics, Economics, and Family Life* (Garden City, New York: Anchor Books, 1963), 113–14; Morris, "Judaism and Capitalism," 105; Barbalet, "Max Weber and Judaism," 53.

© 2024 Global Journals

commercial branches of business, the banking industry, and the stock market that is difficult to deny.[89] He finds the Jews contributing to capitalism by inventing a "good many details" of "commercial machinery," providing a framework for international economic relations and the participation of the modern state in the process and supplying the new economic system with its fundamental spirit.[90] He notes an increase in capitalist enterprise and economic prosperity following the Jews wherever they happened to migrate in the diaspora.[91] One might question the exact numbers and speculative nature of his analysis in some of its parts, but the overall identification of the Jews with commercial and financial business is much more solid; it is based on the testimony of so many sources, making it difficult to deny the collective impression of the witnesses and discount a modicum of truth in the thesis.

A more controversial question is what role religion played in the formation of the Jewish economic activity and mentality. Some believe that capitalism made the Jews and not vice versa. Others point to their *Sitz im Leben*, living in diaspora, excluded from the land, the guilds, and industry, needing to find an alternative source of income, and so forth.[92] These "secular" points of view present a plausible part of the story but do not exclude the possibility of a religious element providing the Jews with a significant impetus to proceed forward in this direction. Sombart suggests some of the religious possibilities in his work: their aversion to mystical divine union or preference for a practical/rational faith; their emphasis upon covenant or contract with God and others; their keeping account of good and evil deeds; their austerities when it comes to the family and sexual promiscuity; and their general distaste for ascetic practices—some of which are more compelling than others.[93]

Certainly, the list must begin with the status of money and wealth in the Jewish community. In this regard, Judaism is much different than Christianity; it does not include the ascetic demands of Christianity when it comes to the accumulation of wealth. Christians often thought of Jewish wealth as unseemly and denounced their materialism and lust for gain, many times questioning their methods as dishonest and sometimes using the accusation as a pretext for anti-Semitism.[94] The earliest writings of the church present Jesus as choosing the poor and telling the rich young ruler to renounce his riches and give them to the poor as a precondition for entering the kingdom of God (Lk 6:20; 18:18–20).[95] The early church followed the teaching with literal obedience, renouncing all their possessions and sharing all things in common (Acts 4:32). This high call is simply unknown in the Hebrew Bible or Old Testament. Wealth is viewed in the Jewish scripture more as a reward from God or a sign of divine blessing in this life than a stumbling block to true religious devotion. The book of Proverbs particularly resonates with this viewpoint:[96]

> The wealth of the rich is their fortified city,
> but poverty is the ruin of the poor (Prov. 10:15).
>
> The wealth of the wise is their crown,
> but the folly of fools yields folly (Prov. 14:24).
>
> Humility and the fear of the Lord
> bring wealth and honor and life (Prov. 22:4).

The matrix of this mentality comes from the bilateral nature of the Mosaic covenant, which pronounces material blessings and curses upon the chosen people in accordance with their faithfulness to the law (Dt. 28). Even a book like Job that questions a simple equation between the conduct of people and their material status ends up rewarding the hero of the story with "twice as much as he had before" his troubles (Job 42:10). Jews simply do not have the same ascetic qualms toward seeking material gain and profiting off their endeavors as Christians and often find their riches a sign of divine favor.

In addition, the Jewish interpretation of the Torah allowed for more flexibility than historic Christian

[89] Sombart, *The Jews and Modern Capitalism*, 21, 26–27, 41, 50ff., 84, 90–91, 98–99, 105; Albert Hyamson, *A History of the Jews in England* (London: Chatto & Wndus, 1908), 174–78; Richard Markgraf, *Zur Geschichte der Juden auf den Messen in Leipzig vom 1664–1839: Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte Leipzig* (Bischofswerda: Friedrich May, 1894), 93; Max Grunwald, *Hamburgs deutsche Juden bis zur Auflösung der Dreigemeinden, 1811* (Hamburg: Alfred Janssen, 1904), 21–22.

[90] Ibid., 21.

[91] For example, Sombart thinks Spain and Portugal prospered during the times of cultural exchange between Jews, Christians, and Muslims but declined after the expulsion of the Jews at the end of the fifteenth century. Antwerp, Holland, and other places of refuge greatly benefitted from their policies of toleration toward the Jews. *The Jews and Modern Capitalism*, 13–17, 212–17; H. J. Koenen, *Geschiedenis der Joden in Nederland* (1843), passim; Johann Jacob Schudt, *Jüdische Merkwürdigkeiten* (Frankfurt and Leipzig, 1714), 4.271, 277; Émile Ouverleaux, "Notes et documents sur les juifs de Belgique l'ancien régime" (Paris: Libraire A. Durlacher, 1885), 72, 78–79. Sombart along with many others reject the popular notion that Jews only took up trade, finance, and banking because of their position in the Middle Ages. These scholars say that exclusion from land and local crafts was nothing new for the Jews; it was part and parcel of their life in the diaspora from the very beginning and led them to seek other sources of income associated with a form of capitalism. Ibid., 301, 306, 310–12; Christian Deutschmann, "Profit and Interest," in *The Routledge Handbook of Economic Theology*, Stefan Schwarzkopf (ed.) (London: Routledge, 2020), 84.

[92] Barbalet, "Max Weber and Judaism," 65; Sombart, *The Jews and Modern Capitalism*, xxx.

[93] Sombart, *The Jews and Modern Capitalism*, 202–51.

[94] Ibid., 120–24, 131, 136–54, 183ff.; Daniel Defoe, *The Compleat English Tradesman* [1727] (New York: Augustus M. Kelley Publishers, 1969), 2/1.128ff.; Morris, "Judaism and Capitalism," 91–93.

[95] The Gospel of Luke particularly emphasizes this message. See also Lk 12:13–21; 16:19–31.

[96] William McKane, *Proverbs: A New Approach* (Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1970), 466; Ohrenstein and Gordon, *Economic Analysis*, 28–30; Sombart, *The Jews and Modern Capitalism*, 215–21.

© 2024 Global Journals

sensibilities when it came to questionable business practices like selling usury or interest on loans. The Torah might reject the exploitation of the poor or its own people, but it provided some latitude when dealing with foreigners in commercial matters (Ex. 22:25–26, Lev. 25:35–37, Dt. 23:20–21).[97] The Mosaic law made distinctions between the treatment of Hebrews and non-Hebrews in this and other regards that Jewish merchants might exploit and use to their purposes (e.g., Lev. 25:45–46). In fact, they might proceed even farther and entertain a more liberal interpretation to tear down the distinction between Jew and Gentile altogether, allowing for some commercial loans among fellow Israelis and limiting the prohibition to the exploitation of those living on the edges as the basic spirit of the law.[98] In fact, this type of rational interpretation became a part of the later Rabbinic community and justified the expanded practice.

Roman Ohrenstein has done a masterful job of expanding the discussion beyond the Hebrew Bible to include the discussions of the Rabbinic community in the Talmud and some later sources of Judaica. Ohrenstein finds central concepts of an incipient capitalism in certain passages of this literature, although the exact relationship between these Rabbinic discussions and the development of the modern economic system remains difficult to ascertain at this preliminary state of scholarship.[99] Of course, there are problems using the Talmud to prove much of anything: it contains two and a half million words on 5,894 folio pages, in which one might find some parallel or proof for almost any position; it contains the discussion of different and sometimes opposing points of view, rarely arriving at a concrete decision for the faithful to follow and often leaving the result up to the community to figure out on its own.[100] In the case of capitalism, there is no direct advocacy or systematic presentation of its various concepts, just parallels here and there that one might deduce from the discussions and compare with the later aspects of the economic system in a favorable way.

With all these limitations, Ohrenstein produces some interesting passages that show some analogy with the basic spirit of capitalism and are worth noting:

One, Ohrenstein sees the Talmud overturning the early Rabbinic position that usury "bites" the borrower and "enriches" the lender.[101] In the later period, beginning with R. Nahman (d. 320), the Talmud expresses more sympathy toward the lender than before as it begins to recognize that charging interest represents a just compensation for the person's "waiting" or foregoing the opportunity to use the money during a certain period of time.[102]

> Said R. Nahman: The general principle is: Any payment made for waiting is interest . . . .[103]

The Talmud finds it possible for the poor to benefit from a loan without the lender taking a loss, directly circumventing the strict biblical mandate against charging them interest.[104] This type of rationalization had a long history in Judaism, particularly when it came to monetary policies. Hillel the Elder once was willing to modify the law in Deuteronomy 15:2 that canceled all debts on loans every seventh year when he noticed people were "unwilling to lend money to one another" because of the policy, causing unnecessary downturns in the economy.[105]

Two, there is some recognition that entrepreneurs risk their capital with the prospect of receiving a reasonable profit. This risk-profit motif is found in the *Kethubah*, which deals with the specifics of the marriage contract. Here the husband is obligated to augment the sum of his wife's dowry that she receives in the case of divorce or death since he was able to invest the dowry during the marriage as a liquid asset and turn a profit.

> If a woman undertook to bring to her husband on thousand *denarii*, he must assign to her a corresponding sum of fifteen *Maneh* [fifteen hundred *denarii*].
>
> If a women undertook to bring to her husband ready money, every *Sela* [or four denarii] of hers counts as six *denarii*.[106]

Three, there is some recognition of market forces or the place of supply and demand in determining prices. Here Ohrenstein points to one episode involving R. Gamaliel, the grandson of Hillel.

[97] Dt. appears to extend the prohibition to Israelis, while Ex. and Lev. just focus on the needy.

[98] Deutschmann, "Profit and Interest," 84; Ohrenstein and Gordon, *Economic Analysis*, 37–39, 205–206; Sombart, *The Jews and Capitalism*, 242–43.

[99] Morris, "Judaism and Capitalism," 109; Roman Ohrenstein, "Economic Self-Interest and Social Progress in Talmudic Literature: A Further Study of Ancient Economic Thought and Its Modern Significance," *The American Journal of Economics and Sociology* 29/1 (Jan. 1970): 69; *Economic Analysis*, ix, xiii.

[100] Ohrenstein and Gordon, *Economic Analysis*, 3–4, 8.

[101] Mishnah, Baba Metzia, IV, 1; Baba Metzia, 60b; Ohrenstein and Gordon, *Economic Analysis*, 87–90.

[102] Roman Ohrenstein, "Economic Thought in Talmudic Literature in the Light of Modern Economics," *The American Journal of Economics and Sociology* 27/2 (April 1968): 189; *Economic Analysis*, 90–91. Along with this, there is some understanding of inflation and deflation, prosperity and depression. R. Johanan (middle of the third century) distinguishes between "a situation where money is cheap and commodities dear" and one where "money is dear and commodities cheap." The latter he considers a state of emergency. Babylonian Talmud, Tractate Taanit, 19b; Ohrenstein, "Economic Thought," 194–95. References, citations, and translations in this section are taken from Ohrenstein.

[103] Baba Metzia, 63b.

[104] Babylonian Talmud Baba Kama, 20b; Ohrenstein and Gordon, *Economic Analysis*, 92, 161–62.

[105] Ohrenstein and Gordon, *Economic Analysis*, 11, 15–16.

[106] Babylonian Talmud, Kethuboth, chap. 6, 66a–b; Ohrenstein and Gordon, *Economic Analysis*, 126–29.

© 2024 Global Journals

> It came to pass that the price of a couple of birds [for sacrifice] rose to one gold dinar [twenty-five silver dinarim]. As a result of this prohibitive price few people could afford such luxury. So R. Gamaliel vowed not to rest until the price of a pair will be reduced to one silver dinar, that is 1/25 of a gold dinar. In order that this come to pass he decided to reduce the *demand* for that product. This was facilitated by the Talmudic Academy which ruled that one sacrifice may take the place of the usually required five. The ratio was then 5:1. As a result of this ruling the *demand actually fell and was followed by a spectacular dip in the prices*. The very same evening "a pair" could be obtained for a quarter of a silver dinar, that is 1/100 of a gold dinar, by far exceeding R. Gamaliel's expectations.[107]

Ohrenstein says the majority of the Rabbis understood this principle, even if one might also glean anti-market comments from other passages in the Talmud.[108]

Four, there is recognition in Rabbinic literature that the evil impulse (*Yetzer-Ha-Rah*) in human beings might have a societal benefit.[109]

> "But can the evil passion be very good?" they wondered. Yes! Because, were it not for the evil passion, no one would marry, neither build nor engage in business, and the world could not exist.[110]

> For three days the "Evil Yetzer" was imprisoned;
> Temptation vanished, greed and pride ceased.
> Hurrah! The battle over the sex-impulse has won—
> Alas . . . a fresh egg is needed, there is none.
> What shall we do?—they now intensely thought,
> Shall we kill him? The world couldn't survive,
> No one would build, nothing be sold or bought
> Neither shall one marry, no children, no drive.
> At last it dawned—a truth profound
> In scheme divine—a principle sound:
> Vicious forces as passion, avarice and greed
> Are vehicles of progress the world doth need.[111]

These references provide a striking parallel to the later emphasis of Jansenists and capitalists on self-interest working for the benefit of society and driving the economy, but there is no systematic presentation of the idea that might insure its place in the Jewish community or the society at large. A more cautious conclusion might attribute to the Torah, the Talmud, and the rest of Jewish literature a general spiritual matrix for the Jewish businessman to justify his activity and leave it at that. Perhaps, the basic influence of the writings is found in shaping the Jewish businessman and granting him permission to proceed in his endeavors, providing the Gentiles with an indirect testimony to the values of the religion through his practices, more than a direct inspiration from the writings on analogous ideas in later capitalism.

V. Jansenists

The new economic order received a clearer impetus from the Jansenists and their recognition that self-interest had a social or economic benefit. This type of acquisitive capitalism found its earliest major expression within the works of Pierre Nicole, Jean Domat, Pierre de Boisguilbert, and other Jansenist scholars of northern France and southern Netherlands in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. They followed the Augustinian doctrine of total depravity in their works and thought that humans are motivated by desire (*cupidité*) or self-interest (*amour-propre*), more than the Christian virtue of love (*charité*).[112] Through this dark view of human nature, they came to recognize that society did not necessarily function on simple Christian principles, that inward motives made little practical difference in society, that charity and self-interest gave rise to the same type of acts and effects. It did not seem to matter whether the poor receive their sustenance from the merciful sacrifice of a devout Christian or the hypocritical desire for recognition among one's peers as a great philanthropist. In either case, the poor were fed.[113]

> If charity extends its benefits to those of whom it expects nothing, even to enemies alike, but it only regards their good, and not its own interest, self-interest does the same, because it knows that the more the benefits appear disinterested and exempt from all need for investigation, the more they attract a general affection, by the hope they give everyone in order to receive in like manner.[114]

The Jansenists will end up expanding the concept to explain the way society functions in general. They thought the principle of reciprocal recognition is what stimulates or circulates goods in society, allowing it to meet the needs of all people involved. Self-interest is able to serve as the basis of all human commerce, circulating and exchanging goods to all, without resorting to specific acts of charity.[115] The law of supply and demand is able to free society from moral considerations in determining a just price or wage. The government has no need to meddle into the economy

[107] Babylonian Talmud, Tractate Keritut, 1:7.
[108] Ohrenstein and Gordon, *Economic Analysis*, 101–107.
[109] Ohrenstein, "Economic Thought," 62–67; *Economic Analysis*, 49–50.
[110] Midrash Kohelet Rabba, 4:4.
[111] Rashi, Sanhedrin, 64a; *Midrash Rabba* (Jerusalem: Wahrman Books, 1965), chap. 16; *Midrash Tehilim*, Salomon Buber (ed.) (Jerusalem: Brothers Rom, 1967), chap. 37, 272.
[112] Pierre Nicole, *Essais de Morale*, Laurent Thirouin (ed.) (Paris: Presses Universitaires de Frances, 1999), 213; David W. Smith, *Helvétius: A Study of Persecution* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1965), 123.
[113] Ibid., 381, 395, 401–403; Jacob Viner, *Religious Thought and Economic Society*, Jacques Melitz and Donald Winch (eds.) (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1978), 136.
[114] Ibid., 403–404.
[115] Ibid., 384; *Essai de Morale* (Geneve: Slatkine, 1971), 1.139–40; "Of Grandeur," in *Moral Essays* (London, 1696), 2.97–98; Viner, *Religious Thought and Economic Society*, 135–36; Gilbert Faccarello, *The Foundations of Laissez-faire: The Economics of Pierre de Boisguilbert* (London and New York: Routledge, 1999), 27–28.

© 2024 Global Journals

through heavy-handed regulations and excessive taxation to create a prosperous state of affairs for everyone; the economy has a "natural state" of equlibrium running like a perfect machine in giving to those who lack and taking from those who have a surplus of goods.[116] As long as nature is "left alone" to its own self-sustaining principles, divine providence will maintain the equilibrium and ensure that every one receives the necessities of life through a policy of free trade and competition.[117]

This revelation about self-interest and its social efficacy was greatly disturbing to the Jansenists' concept of Christian virtue. The Jansenists were known for their emphasis upon altruism. They were known for annihilating the ego or any reference to their own person, substituting instead the indefinite French pronoun *on* and preferring to make reference to the group as a whole.[118] Pasquier Quesnel said that love "labours to forget her-self," while "self-love, always intent on her own interests" forgets the things of God and her neighbor.[119] The decided emphasis upon altruism or self-sacrifice conflicted with the way the real world of economic and social relations seemed to work in their understanding of things and helped increase a fissure between faith and reason to explain the dichotomy that had already found some justification in their writings. In fact, Jansenists theology thought of the grace and revelation of God as living above and beyond human reason and its finite and fallible capacity to probe ultimate metaphysical truth.[120] Their theology so emphasized grace in the process of salvation that it undermined the medieval dictim of "faith seeking understanding" (*fides quaerens intellectum*) and allowed reason to have its own autonomous avenue of seeking truth wherever it might lead, no longer considering it a servant of the faith or threat to its existence—just the fallible and finite musings of humankind that can never penetrate divne mysteries. This concept of faith and reason proved consequential in the modern world, where humans began to live under two desks that were not so united in its study as before when life was a simple system. It was the Jansenists' strong emphasis upon divine grace that gave people permission to think on their own and not worry about the outcome. It allowed them to accept the verdict of reason regarding the economic benefits of self-interest as an honest result of their analysis, and yet remain secure in their faith, believing an ultimate reconciliation of all things existed only within the depths of God.

This same fissure of faith and reason finds its way into the writings of more famous exponents of early captitalism like Pierre Bayle and Bernard Mandeville. Bayle promoted the dichotomy in his *Dictionaire historique et critique* (1696), perhaps the most popular work of the eighteenth century. He agreed with the Jansenists that people are often motivated by the "love of praise" or "fear of disgrace," but these and other "glorious sins" accomplish great things in this world beyond their simple intendment. Self-interest and other devices of human depravity are sometimes more useful in promoting the welfare of society than strict fidelity to Christian virtue.[121] Bayle provides an infamous article on "David" in his dictionary to illustrate the point, showing how the king of Israel exhibited unscrupulous methods and "exceedingly wicked" deeds to establish his kingdom and thereby giving implicit permission to the monarchs of the present day to question the advice of "strict moralists" and follow a more realistic or Machiavellian path.[122] He also employs his critical acumen to question the rigor of standard philosophical proofs for the existence of God, but none of his skepticism or critical analysis ends up disturbng his

[116] "Factum de la France, contre les demandeurs en delay," in *Pierre de Boisguilbert ou La Naissance de L'Économie Politique* [NEP] (Paris: Institut National d'Études Démographiques, 1966), 2.748–49, 891, 919; "Dissertation: De la nature des richesses, …," in NEP, 2.991; Du Pont de Nemours, *Ephemerides du Citoyen* (Paris: LaCombe, 1769) 9.10–12; Faccarello, *Foundations of Laissez-Faire*, 17–20, 28, 58, 72, 96, 130, 146–47. The later physiocrats also wanted to let "nature rule" (*physiocratie*). They merged the laws of nature and society together, thinking the "regular course of every physical event of the natural order" was "most advantageous to mankind." François Quesnay, *A Treatise on Natural Right*, Francis Walker Gilmer (trans.) (Baltimore, MD : Fielding Lucas, Jun., 1828), 187, 197–201; Le Mercier de La Rivière, *L'ordre naturel et essential des sociétés politiques* (A Londres: Jean Nourse, Libraire, 1767), 1.120–21; Elizabeth Fox-Genovese, *The Origin of Physiocracy: Economic Revolution and Social Order in Eighteenth-Century France* (Ithaca, NY and London: Cornell University Press, 1976), 9, 12, 47, 91; Thomas P. Neill, "The Physiocrats' Concept of Economics," *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* 63/4 (Nov. 1949): 538–42, 546, 549–53; Guy Routh, *The Origin of Economics Ideas* (Dobbs Ferry, NY: Sheridan House, 1989), 70.

[117] "Factum de la France," 2.891–92; Faccarello, *Foundations of Laissez-faire*, 41–42, 99–100, 108, 138. Of course, he recognizes the need for some government regulation to "provide protection and prevent violence," but this serves as an exception, not the rule.

[118] Nicole, *Essai de Morale*, 389; *The Dictionary Historical and Critical of Mr Peter Bayle*, Reprinted from the second edition (London, 1734–38) (New York and London: Garland Publishing, 1984), 4.491–92; *Pascal's Pensées*, T. S. Eliot (intro.) (New York: E. P. Dutton and Co, 1958), 131–36 (470–94).

[119] Pasquier Quesnay, *The New Testament with Moral Reflections, . . .* (London: R. Bonwicke et al., 1719), 4/2.559–64 (1 Cor 13:4, 5, 8). In other passages, he speaks of a "well-regulated love of ourselves" as a "Perfect Modal" for loving others "if not as much as ourselves, at least in the same rank, wherein we ought to love ourselves." Ibid., 1/1.254, 587 (Mt 19:19, Mk 12:31).

[120] For example, Pascal emphasizes grace in his work and thinks of faith as a gift of intuition that God gives to the heart above and beyond reason. Faith is not contrary to reason, but reason has its limits and is unable to prove the existence of God. *Pascal's Pensées*, 52, 66, 72–73, 78–81 (187, 233, 245–48, 277–87).

[121] Bayle, *Dictionary*, 4.441; 5.811–13; Thomas Horne, *The Social Thought of Bernard Mandeville* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1978), 30.

[122] Pierre Bayle, *Political Writings*, Sally L. Jenkinson (ed.) (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 36, 39–40, 46. In the article, he condemns David's cruelty and marrying for power, much like William of Orange. He speaks of David deceiving the king of Gath, stealing Nabal's property, annihilating populations, et al.; yet he calls David a "good and great king." Ibid., 36, 39–43, 49–50.

© 2024 Global Journals

faith. Like the Jansenists, he resorts to his strong view of divine grace and the inability of human beings to traverse the heavens and unveil the secrets and mysteries of the divine plan. He refuses to take his philosophical musings too seriously and prefers the solace of a child-like faith that places an ultimate trust in the grace and revelation of God or the vidication of divine truth in the end.[123] As a member of the Reformed Church, he emphasizes the dependence of human beings upon God and confesses *sola fides*, *sola gratia*, and *sola scriptura*, above and beyond most Jansenists and Protestant fellowships.

Bernard Mandeville also helped bring these ideas to the forefront of England and other countries in Europe through his controversial work *The Fable of the Bees: or, Private Vices, Publick Benefits* (1714). Mandeville was influenced by Bayle and other proto-capitalists to question the wisdom of imposing the ascetic or altruistic demands of strict Christian piety upon society when the vitality of the economy seemed to depend upon the private vices or self-interest of the citizens to make it grow and prosper.[124] He was a part of Reformed circles like Bayle and developed his teaching from the same dark Augustinian view of the human condition as other acquisitive capitalists believing that humans find "real Pleasure" within the "Mundane and Corruptible things" of this world, with the rare exception of a very "few Devout Christians."[125] In society, humans are driven by the pride of "self-liking" or the desire to obtain honor from their fellow citizens.[126] They are driven by many vices that withstand basic ideas of Chrisian virtue and vex the souls of true believers, but Mandeville finds it unwise to impose a strict moral code on society. He thinks that many of these vices seem to play a necessary role in the proper function of society—however disconcerting that might be for him and other members of the Christian community. He thinks it is wrong to try and cleanse the world of sin and establish an ideal Christian society. In fact, he finds the vices beneficial to society or "necessary" in the public arena to create a "wealthy and powerful Nation," "an opulent and flourishing people."[127] "No society can be rais'd into a rich and mighty kingdom, or so rais'd, subsist in their Wealth and Power for any considerable time, without the Vices of Man."[128] While this discovery bothered his sense of Christianity as an ascetic religion that demanded the denial of oneself and shunned the passions of this world, he was unable to deny the veracity of his conclusion. He finds refuge only by forging the same theological contrivance as Bayle that divides faith and reason into separate compartments. He relates the same dim view of human sagacity and its inability to obtain ultimate metaphysical knowledge and challenge the authority of Scripture. He denigrates human reason and refuses to let it judge the divine word.[129] Mandeville believes that divine providence works in mysterious ways, somehow able to use the vices of humankind to serve a greater purpose and finds no need for the government or human wisdom to intervene in the process and try to resolve what appears to be chaotic, nonsensical, and beyond its capacity.[130]

Some exponents of acquisitive capitalism tried to eliminate the paradox between divine providence and the questionable means of self-interest in reaching its goal. Claude Adrien Helvétius tried to liberate self-love from the disparaging analysis of Christian orthodoxy and make it the "only basis on which we can place the foundations of a useful morality."[131] As a radical *philosophe*, he spends much of his time attacking the church and its moral view of life and wishes to substitute self-interest (*amour-propre*) as the principal motive behind the formation of legal, civic, and social institutions.[132] He rejects the calls for self-sacrifice and

[123] Bayle, *Dictionary*, 4.363; 5.831; Elisabeth Labrousse, *Bayle*, Denys Potts (trans.) (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 1983), 41, 43, 46, 55, 60.

[124] Bayle came to Rotterdam when Mandeville was eleven years of age and living there. Mandeville follows the same basic outline and understanding of the relation and separation of faith and reason. In his *Free Thoughts*, he draws on many of Bayle's "concrete illustrations and documentary evidence," without bothering to provide credit in the main text. *Free Thoughts on Religion, The Church, & National Happiness*, Irwin Primer (ed.) (New Brunswick, NJ and London: Transaction Publishers, 2001), ii–iii, xviii–xix; Mandeville, *Fable of the Bees*, 1.ciii–cv; Horne, *Social Thought of Bernard Mandeville*, 28.

[125] Mandeville, *Fable of the Bees*, 1.146, 166; 2.63, 91, 122.

[126] Mandeville, *An Enquiry into the Origin of Honour and the Usefulness of Christianity in War*, M. M. Goldsmith (intro.) (London: Frank Cass and Co., 1971), xiii, 3, 6, 18, 29–30, 39, 42–43, 64, 79–80; *Fable of the Bees*, 1.42, 51, 68, 221–222, 245–47, 264–65; 2.133; Henry Monro, *The Ambivalence of Bernard Mandeville* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1975), 7–8, 140; E. J. Hundert, "Bernard Mandeville and the Enlightenment's Maxims of Modernity," *Journal of the History of Ideas* 56/4 (Oct. 1995): 589–93.

[127] Mandeville, *Fable of the Bees*, 1.6–7, 24–26, 36, 48–49, 103–106, 250–51, 344.

[128] Ibid., 1.228–29.

[129] Ibid., 2.220–21, 310–11; *An Inquiry into the Origin of Honour*, l, 26–27, 30–31, 38; *Free Thoughts on Religion*, 23; Monroe, *Ambivalence of Bernard Mandeville*, 151, 166.

[130] Ibid., 1.xcviiiff., cxxxix–cxl, 109–16, 299–300; *An Enquiry into the Origin of Honour*, ix; *A Letter to Dion (1732)*, in *The Augustan Reprint Society* (vol. 41), Jacob Viner (intro.) (Los Angeles: University of California, 1953), 11–14 (intro.). He allows for some government interference in matters of trade and taxation through the "dexterous management of a skilful politician," but his overall direction proceeds toward laissez-faire government policy. Ibid., 1.115–16, 204, 249; *An Enquiry into the Origin of Honour*, xix; Nathan Rosenberg, "Mandeville and Laissez-Faire," *Journal of the History of Ideas* 24/2 (Apr.–June 1963): 184–89.

[131] Helvétius, *De l'Esprit or Essays on the Mind and its Several Faculties* (New York: Burt Franklin, 1970), 179. For the influence of Mandeville on Helvétius, see Kaye's discussion in the *Fable of the Bees*, cxliv–clv. Kaye and other scholars think of him as a religious subversive, but such an interpretation practices a hermeneutics of suspicion and contravenes his clear and continuous testimony in his works. For details, see Stephen Strehle's *Forces of Secularity in the Modern World* (New York: Peter Lang, 2018), 59–60.

[132] Helvétius, *Mandement de Monseigneur l'archevêque de Paris, …* (Paris, 1758) 27; "Archiepiscopo Farsaliae, Generali in Hispaniarum Regnis Inquisitori gratulatur, …," in *Bullari Romani continuatio*

© 2024 Global Journals

believes society should be based on the "supreme law" of public utility.[133] His new "science of morals" eliminates all metaphysical speculation by finding an empirical basis within our corporeal sensibilities or desires and developing a calculating sum of mathematical certainty to meet those needs, rather than continuing in the same old religious mumbo jumbo about the will of God. In this way, he represents an early form of social utilitarianism that became so popular during the times of the French Enlightenment with its vitriol against the church and its attempt to anchor ideology in reason or science rather than religion. Helvétius and so many other *philosophes* thought it no longer necessary to seek a metaphysical, ontological, or platonic foundation for moral judgment in the heavens above and preferred to substitute a simple calculating sum centered around the greatest happiness principle or the wants and desires of the people and grounded in this material world.[134]

Adam Smith also tried to eliminate the paradox in the most celebrated treatment of acquisitive capitalism, *An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations* (1776). Smith follows the tradition's accent upon self-interest or self-love as a fundamental impetus of human activity, but he does not consider its passions particularly evil as Mandeville and so eliminates the tension between private vice and public virtue in this sense. He tries to explain how self-interest works for the benefit of all involved in purely secular terms, without making it an impenetrable mystery.[135]

> It is not from the benevolence of the butcher, the brewer, or the baker, that we expect our dinner, but from their regard for their own interest. We address ourselves, not to their humanity but to their self-love, and never talk to them of our own necessities but of their advantages.[136]

This example seems to explain how life works on its own terms, yet he does not consider it totally satisfying and continues to see some mystery about its inner workings and life in general.[137] He never becomes a complete secularist or abandons the old religious categories that speak of God's providential care and adds a transcendent/metaphysical commentary when life does not live up to an ideal standard or what God expects to transpire. He still ascribes to the "Invisible Hand" or divine "wisdom and goodness" an ability to transform the "weakness and folly of men" into the greater good beyond human comprehension, following the traditional accent upon the providence of God among early acquisitive capitalists.[138] He also admits some problems with his basic laissez-faire economic policies that might require a sense of the old religious and moral principles to check the system. Here he finds some need for the government or some "impartial spectator" to intervene on occasion in society and the economy to correct the abuses of self-interest with a sense of "fair play" and "laws of justice."[139] He might

summorum pontificum Clementis XIII, … (Romae, 1835) 1.209–10; *De l'Esprit*, 42–43, 56–57; *A Treatise on Man: His Intellectual Faculties and His Education*, W. Hooper (trans.) (London: Albion Press, 1810), 1.279, 289; Smith, *Helvétius*, 39–40, 44; Jean Bloch, "Rousseau and Helvétius on Innate and Acquired Traits," *Journal of the History of Ideas* 40/1 (Jan.–March 1979): 32–33.

[133] Helvétius, *A Treatise on Man*, 2.144–48, 428, 433, 446. He particularly hates the celibacy and the sexual taboos of the church that deny the supreme pleasure of sexual gratification. "Correspondence d'Helvetius avec sa femme" (Nov. 1900), in *Le Carnet historique et littéraire* (Paris, 1900), 437–38; Smith, *Helvétius*, 135.

[134] Ibid., 1.124, 133, 138; 2.5. 144–45, 148, 213, 308, 428, 432–33; *De l'Esprit*, 103, 108, 135, 179–81; Smith, *Helvétius*, 14, 116.

[135] Adam Smith, *The Theory of Moral Sentiments* (Indianapolis, IND: Liberty Classics, 1976), 481–82, 493–95, 501–502; Boer and Petterson, *Idols of Nation*, 94; R. H. Coase, "Adam Smith's View of Man," *Journal of Law and Economics* 19/3 (Oct. 1976): 537, 541–42; Pierre Force, "Self-Love, Identification, and the Origin of Political Economy," *Yale French Studies* (1997): 54–55, 60–61; August Oncken, "The Consistency of Adam Smith," *The Economic Journal*, 7/27 (Sept. 1897): 447–48; A. L. Macfie, "Adam Smith's Moral Sentiments as Foundation for His Wealth of Nations," *Oxford Economic Papers* 11/3 (Oct. 1959): 227–28. Both the *Wealth of Nations* and *Theory of Moral Sentiments* stress the importance of self-interest, but the latter has a stronger emphasis upon the sympathetic side of humans that is not simply derived from self-interest; i.e, it involves your pain, not mine (altruism). The former is less optimistic about self-interest providing for the general happiness and welfare of society, even if it works in "most cases."

[136] Adam Smith, *An Inquiry into the Nature and Cause of the Wealth of Nations* (New York: The Modern Library, 1937), 14.

[137] Ibid., 14, 249, 423; Samuel Hollander, "Adam Smith and the Self-Interest Axiom," *Journal of Law and Economics* 20/1 (Apr. 1977): 134; Harvey C. Mansfield, "Self-Interest Rightly Understood," *Political Theory* 23/1 (Feb. 1995): 53; Jacob Viner, "Adam Smith and Laissez Faire," *Journal of Political Philosophy* 35/2 (Apr. 1927): 209–13. Smith recognizes that self-interest does not always relate to the general welfare. For example, the institution of slavery promotes the indolence of aristocratic landowners who lead a frivolous lifestyle and slaves who have little incentive to work. Hollander, "Adam Smith and the Self-Interest Axiom," 147.

[138] Smith, *Theory of Moral Sentiments*, 152, 168–69, 195; Coase, "Adam Smith's View of Man," 538; Viner, "Adam Smith and Laissez Faire," 202, 206; Peter Gay, *The Enlightenment: An Interpretation* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1969), 2.361. Modern secular scholars who live under the binary of church/state separation often put on mental blinders at this point and discount the clear religious import of the phrase "Invisible Hand" to rescue Smith and capitalism from the taint of religion. The phrase came to the forefront as a reference to divine intervention and care in the seventeenth century, and Smith uses it three times in this sense. A belief in providential care or supervision was a typical aspect of the acquisitive capitalist tradition. Smith might be proceeding away from this perspective toward a more deist or secular framework, but he has not totally abandoned the old religious perspective of divine involvement in our lives. Viner, *The Role of Providence*, 81–82; Lisa Hill, "Invisible Hand," in *The Routledge Handbook of Economic Theory* [RHET], Stefan Schwartzkopf (ed.) (London: Routledge, 2020), 314–16; Boer and Petterson, *Idols of Nations*, 97–99. It is clear the moral perspective of earlier times is giving way in Smith to the impersonal and secular forces like supply and demand. Raymond Benton, "The Economic Theology of the High Middle Ages," in RHET, 293; Peter Berger, "Capitalism and the Disorders of Modernity," *First Things* (Jan. 1991): 15; Michael Novak, *The Spirit of Democratic Capitalism* (New York: Touchstone Book, 1982), 65, 85, 351. Cf. Michael Novak, "The Future of Democratic Capitalism," *First Things* (June/July 2015): 34.

[139] Ibid., 227–28, 651; *Theory of Moral Sentiments*, 263–64; Macfie, "Adam Smith's Moral Sentiments," 215; Patricia H. Werhane, "The Role of Self-Interest in Adam Smith's Wealth of Nations," *The Journal*

© 2024 Global Journals

reduce the paradox by making self-interest less maniacal and explaining its relationship to the benefit of all in a more intelligible way than others before him, but he still is unable to abandon the need for God and the old religious categories that seem necessary to intervene and fix the problems with the new economic system.

Capitalism provided a greater challenge to traditional religious and moral beliefs as it gave way to Social Darwinism and its pitiless view of the real world and how it operated. This new deconstruction of capitalism received an early impetus from the work of Thomas Malthus, a disciple of Smith's economic theory. In his *Essay of the Principle of Population* (1798), he finds self-interest the fundamental motivating factor of human life and rejects the need for the government or rich people to interfere in the lives of the poor through acts of benevolence.[140] Suffering and struggle are necessary components of checking a population that has overgrown its own subsistence.[141] It is best for government to let nature take its course, practice a laissez-faire economic policy, and withstand any temptation to create poor-laws or hand out money, which only drives up prices, spreads the misery among the general population, and makes the situation worse for all others.[142] Malthus recognizes the disconcerting nature of his thesis, but he prefers to follow the traditional spirit of acquisitive capitalism and face the facts of life no matter how disturbing it might be to traditional moral sensibilities; he prefers to deal with the brute realities of everyday existence than live in an ideal world of illusory or optimistic expectations, like the writings of William Godwin, the Marquis de Condorcet, and his other delusional opponents.[143]

Charles Darwin developed an even darker view of life when he took the ideas of Malthus and the acquisitive capitalists a step farther and translated them into an explanation for the origin of life. His writings provide a clear testimony to this influence, particularly mentioning the work of Malthus several times as a major inspiration in arriving at his theory of evolution.[144]

> In October 1838, that is, fifteen months after I had begun my systematic inquiry, I happened to read for amusement Malthus on *Population*, and being well prepared to appreciate the struggle for existence which everywhere goes on from long-continued observation of the habits of animals and plants, it at once struck me under these circumstances favourable variations would tend to be preserved, and unfavourable ones to be destroyed. The result of this would be the formation of a new species. Here, then, I had last got a theory by which to work; but I was so anxious to avoid prejudice, that I determined not for some time to write even the briefest sketch of it.[145]

Darwin displays in this and other testimonies a fundamental agreement with Malthus about the difficulty of supporting a large population and the need for a natural check upon geometric expansion, making starvation inevitable and the survival or selection of the strong over the weak the mechanism for evolving the species.[146] Darwin even talks in favor of Malthus' program that would reject poor-laws or any interference in life to prop up the weak as "highly injurious to the race of man" and impeding natural selection or the ultimate triumph of the strong.[147]

of Philosophy 86/11 (Nov. 1989): 677–78; Viner, "Adam Smith and Laissez Faire," 231. He supports improving the lot of the poor through public education, a "level playing field," and an equitable distribution of the "produce of labor," but he never proposes any specific system of insuring equitable distribution. Viner, "Adam Smith and Laissez Faire," 228; Werhane, "The Role of Self-Interest," 678; Donal Winch, "Adam Smith: Scottish Moral Philosopher," in *Adam Smith: International Perspectives*, Hiroshi Mizuta and Chuhei Sugiyama (eds.) (New York and London: Palgrave Macmillan, 1993), 111.

[140] Thomas Malthus, *An Essay on the Principle of Population*, Philip Appleman (ed.) (New York and London: W. W. Norton and Co., 1976), 44–47, 97–101. For his relation to Smith, see Strehle, *Forces of Secularity*, 67–68. He shares many of the basic themes of Smith and acquisitive capitalism, but he is not a simple disciple. For example, he thinks a nation might grow in prosperity without benefiting the poor or increasing their supply of food. Ibid., 102–11.

[141] Ibid., xiv–xv, 52–54, 118–22, 129; Barry Gale, "Darwin and the Concept of a Struggle for Existence," *ISIS* 63/3 (Sept. 1972): 338; James Allen Rogers, "Darwinism and Social Darwinism," *Journal of the History of Ideas* 33/2 (June 1972): 269–70. He has a dark view of human nature and particularly identifies it like Augustine with the lust to copulate. He thinks it is wise to educate people about nature and tell them to marry later in life, when they are able to support children. Poor-laws just make them more promiscuous and exacerbate the problem of overpopulation. Malthus, *An Essay on the Principle of Population*, xviii, 132, 136–39; Boer and Petterson, *Idols of Nations*, 138–39; Jonsson and Wennerlind, *Scarcity*, 133.

[142] Ibid., 20–23, 37–39, 54–55, 134–35. Distinguished politicians like Edmund Burke agreed with Malthus' point of view. In the nineteenth century, the British government denied countries like India and Ireland humanitarian aid to relieve the starving populace for these and other reasons. Jonsson and Wennerlind, *Scarcity*, 126–30.

[143] Ibid., 11–18, 92; Boer and Petterson, *Idols of Nations*, 140; Robert M. Young, "Malthus and the Evolutionists: The Common Context of Biological and Social Theory," *Past & Present* 43 (May 1969): 112–13; Rogers, "Darwinism and Social Darwinism," 269–70.

[144] Charles Darwin, *The Variation of Animals and Plants under Domestication* (London: John Murray, 1885), 1.10; "To A. R. Wallace" (April 6, 1859), in *More Letters of Charles Darwin*, Francis Darwin (ed.) (New York and London: Johnson Reprint Corporation, 1972), 1.118; *On the Origin of Species*, Ernst Mayr (ed.) (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1964), *Origin of Species*, 3.63; *The Foundation of the Origin of Species: Two Essays Written in 1842–44*, Francis Darwin (ed.) (Cambridge, 1909), 88. Alfred Russel Wallace provides a similar testimony to Malthus. *My Life: A Record of Events and Opinions* (London: Chapman and Hall, 1905), 1.232.

[145] *The Autobiography of Charles Darwin and Selected Letters*, Francis Darwin (ed.) (New York: Dover Publication, 1958), 1.42–43.

[146] Darwin, *Origin of Species*, 3.62–79; *The Descent of Man and Selection in Relation to Sex* (Akron, OH: The Werner Co., ca. 1910), 145 (I, v), 621 (II, xxi); Peter J. Bowler, "Malthus, Darwin, and the Concept of Struggle," *Journal of the History of Ideas* 37/4 (Oct.–Dec. 1976): 635, 647–48; Rogers, "Darwinism and Social Darwinism," 270–71.

[147] Darwin, T*he Descent of Man*, 136 (I, v); 139 (I, v); *The Life and Letters of Darwin*, Francis Darwin (ed.) (London: John Murray, 1887), 1.316.

© 2024 Global Journals

> We civilized men, on the other hand, do our utmost to check the process of elimination; we build asylums for the imbecile, the maimed, and the sick; we institute poor-laws; and our medical men exert their utmost skill to save the life of every one to the last moment. There is reason to believe that vaccination has preserved thousands, who from weak constitution would formerly have succumbed to small-pox. Thus the weak members of civilized societies propagate their own kind. No one who has attended to the breeding of domestic animals will doubt that this must be highly injurious to the race of man.[148]

Darwin applies the principles of acquisitive capitalism in such a way that the very existence of God becomes threatened as an unnecessary postulate. Like Mandeville, he compares life to a ship that evolves in a piecemeal manner from numerous trials and errors of many civilizations, making small changes along the way over a long period of time to reach its present form. The process does not come from an antecedent mathematical design with a specific end in view.[149] Life is not so much like a watch that needs a watchmaker or an intelligent design.

> When we no longer look at organic being as a savage looks at a ship, as at something wholly beyond his comprehension; when we regard every production of nature as one which has had a history; when we contemplate every complex structure and instinct as the summing up of many contrivances, each useful to the processor, nearly in the same way as when we look at any great mechanical invention as the summing up of the labour, the experience, the reason, and even the blunders of numerous workmen; when we thus view each organic being, how far more interesting, I speak from experience, will the study of natural history become.[150]

Just like the economy, life evolves on its own terms without any need for a transcendent power to meddle into its affairs or correct the course. Mandeville and the acquisitive capitalists set the precedent for this dangerous idea through developing laissez-faire economic policies: considering it best not to meddle through the "short-sighted wisdom" of "well-meaning people" in what "flow[s] spontaneously" on its own "from the Nature of Society"; and finding the order of life evolving on its own in slow incremental changes through the "joynt Labour of Many Ages," making "morals, mores, reason and speech the product of an evolution that has taken" place over a long period of time.[151] Darwin simply takes this notion and applies it to life in general. He eliminates the need for God by explaining the origin of life without a prime mover, creating another dichotomy between faith and reason, and making it more difficult to ignore the verdict of reason and continue to believe in the Almighty than it was before his alternative explanation to what seemed like a mystery.

VI. Conclusion

This article shows a cross-pollination of religious and secular forces arising from each other and working together to form an economic system. The confluence of forces provides a reciprocal recognition that is difficult to separate into a temporal sequence and assign priority to one thing over another. Conditions on the ground provide a pretext for religious leaders to alter the interpretation of sacred texts and justify the ongoing practices of their community in the secular world but hardly eliminate the spiritual principles that helped create the situation to begin with and remain latent in its expression. Capitalism might appear as a nonreligious secular force to those who live in the binary world of church/state separation, but this modern attitude maintains its position of "secular" superiority through an *argumentum ex ignorantia* that is unwilling to grapple with the historical, philosophical, and theological matrix of its own ideas.[152]

[148] Ibid., 136 (I, v).

[149] Mandeville, *Fable of the Bees*, 2.141–44; Stephen G. Alter, "Mandeville's Ship: Theistic Design and Philosophical History in Charles Darwin's Vision of Natural Selection," *Journal of the History of Ideas* 69/3 (July 2008): 457; Louis Schneider, *Paradox and Society: The Work of Bernard Mandeville*, Jay Weinstein (Forward) (New Brunswick, NJ and Oxford: Transaction Publishers, 1987), 176–77. Hume also uses the analogy of a ship. David Hume, *Dialogues Concerning Natural Religion*, J. C. A. Gaskin (ed.) (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 69 [Part V]. He read Hume's *Dialogue* in September of 1838 and Mandeville's *Fable* (vol. 2) in April of 1840. Here is Mandeville's account:

> *Cleomenes:* The Chevalier Reneau has wrote a Book, in which he shews the Mechanism of sailing, and accounts mathematically for every thing that belongs to the working and steering of a Ship. I am persuaded, that neither the first inventors of Ships and sailing, of those, who have Improvements since any Part of them, ever dream'd of those Reasons [or technological improvements], any more than now the rudest and most illiterate of the vulgar do when they are made Sailors, which Time and Practice will do in Spight of their Teeth. . . . I verily believe, not only that the raw beginners, who made the first Essays in either Art, good manners as well as Sailing, were ignorant of the true Cause, the real Foundation those Arts are built upon in Nature; but likewise that, even now both Arts are brought to great Perfection, the greatest Part of those that are most expert, and daily making Improvements in them, know as little of the Rationale of them, as their Predecessors did at first.
>
> *Horatio:* If, as you said, and which I now believe to be true, the people, who first invented, and afterwards improved upon ships and sailing, never dreamed of those reasons of Monsieur Reneau, it is impossible that they should have acted upon them, as motives that induced them a priori to put their inventions and improvements in practice, with knowledge and design; which, I suppose, is what you intended to prove. *Fable of the Bees*, 1.143–44.

[150] Darwin, *On the Origin of Species*, 485–86.

[151] Mandeville, *Fable of the Bees*, 2.141–42, 353; M. M. Goldsmith, *Private Vices, Public Benefits: The Work of Bernard Mandeville's Social and Political Thought* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), 64, 71–73.

[152] The US Supreme Court is notoriuos for declaring concepts like democracy, liberty, equality, or whatever is sacred to its political agenda as "secular" (or "nonreligious" in its sense of the word), without any serious discussion of these concepts. Stephen Strehle, "The Separation of Church and State: The Court's 'Secular Purpose' and the *Argumentum ex Ignorantia*," in *The Palgrave Handbook of*

© 2024 Global Journals

This article illustrated this point through displaying the influence of certain religious forces on the development of a few leading ideas in capitalism. The discussion started with property rights and showed how this concept came to play a leading role in modern society and its economic system. The story began with the religious mysticism of the Graeco-Roman world and showed Decretalists and medieval theologians deconstructing the ancient concept of a divine law in nature and developing the concept of property rights against the temporal powers of the pope. John Locke and other modern philosophers ended up following the tradition and thought the government found its basic role in protecting these inalienable rights that God has given to us in nature.

Next, the Puritans found a place in the study with their admonition to work hard and invest their time, talent, and money in the community. Their work ethic had religious roots in a concept of assurance that rejected any notion of "cheap grace" and found it necessary to display true fruits of election and secure one's place in the kingdom of God. The spirit of capitalism was exhibited in their utilitarian, altruistic, and teleological religious affections, as it exhorted the people to make a concrete difference in society and help create a better world for their children, following the progression of the gospel around the globe in all areas of life. This idealistic form of capitalism exhibited a "worldly asceticism" in its call for self-sacrifice in the service of others and provided at least one motive for proceeding toward the new economic order.

Then the study turned to the Jews, mainly because of the repeated testimony throughout history concerning their leading role in commerce and finance. Their religion probably contributed to the story and provided some justification for their business dealings, beyond whatever influence came from their position in life as a separate and oppressed people. In some ways, Judaism provided a better pretext for an economy like capitalism to germinate and prosper than Christianity and its rejection of materialistic concerns. Judaism never told the people to forsake this material world and its riches for a spiritual kingdom, and even considered wealth a sign of divine favor in some of its sacred texts. The Rabbis had few ascetic demands and sometimes expressed their own sympathy for the way the real world works in certain Talmudic discussions that recognize the need to rationalize the practices of the religion and loosen the strictures of the Torah in the world of business. These Rabbis exercised little influence outside their community, but they allowed the Jewish businessman to practice his craft and exert some indirect influence from his religious background upon the outside world.

Finally, the article concluded the discussion with the discovery of the Jansenists and early acquisitive capitalists that self-interest had a societal benefit. The revelation certainly brought some tension with the Puritan conception of capitalism and its appeal to altruistic motives in helping the community and serving future generations. It greatly disturbed those who conceived of society working this way, as it challenged the Christian conception of morality or how people should act in an ideal world. Its brutal honesty came from a spiritual matrix that emphasized the depravity of human motives, the grace of God as the basis of faith, and the limits of philosophical reasoning to probe the mysteries of divine providence. In time, this type of reasoning only deepened the fissure between faith and reason as atheists like Helvétius wanted to extend the analysis and replace the will of God altogether with a utilitarian calculus based on self-interest; as scientists like Darwin thought individual struggle was sufficient to explain the origin of the species all by itself, without any need to posit the existence of a Creator or appeal to the miracle of divine providence. Most people hesitated at this point and continued to find some room for the old theism and its categories to explain some problems with a consistent application of the theory. Adam Smith found it necessary to protect the moral order from the excesses of self-interest and explain how the chaos of individual struggle brought about such a sublime ending in society through invoking the Almighty. His equivocations represented the typical sort of inconsistencies that remained a part of most people's way of thinking, although the general trend was moving away from the need for theistic explanations toward a secular worldview. The process of secularization was growing and consigning religion more and more to the margins of society and its general way of thinking. Religion was fading or losing its place as Western civilization began to display little appreciation for the spiritual origin of its ideas and resigned the existence of God to the ever-closing gaps in its secular way of approaching and understanding the world. Religion was now kept underneath the surface as an inconsistent remnant of a former age, even if it was impossible to dispense with many of its ideas.

Religion and State: Theoretical Perspectives (Cham, Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan, 2023), 492–94, 511–12.

© 2024 Global Journals

This page is intentionally left blank

© 2024 Global Journals

Global Journal of human-social science: C
Sociology & Culture
Volume 24 Issue 5 Version 1.0 Year 2024
Type: Double Blind Peer Reviewed International Research Journal
Publisher: Global Journals
Online ISSN: 2249-460X & Print ISSN: 0975-587X

A Bosadi-Pentecostal Approach to Earth Care in Gauteng Township Contexts

By Abraham Modisa Mkhondo Mzondi

Abstract- This article contends that addressing environmental concerns in the South African context requires acknowledgment of the intertwined issues of land grabbing, littering, illegal dumping, and inadequate service delivery. It suggests that Pentecostals, as members of diverse communities, should shift their focus from spiritual matters to initiatives aimed at caring for the earth. Therefore, the article delves into Mogale City and Rand West City Local Municipality in South Africa as a case study, illustrating their contribution to the ongoing environmental degradation. The increasing incidence of land grabbing in these areas poses a threat to the pollution of the Wonderfontein spruit/stream, which flows from Kagiso through the townships of Swanieville 1, extensions 2 and 3, and continues east of Mohlakeng township to the west of Bekkersdal township. Inadequate service delivery has resulted in a backlog of waste removal, leading to concerning levels of littering and illegal dumping in both municipalities.

Terms: earth care, earth degradation, stewardship, illegal dumping, littering.

GJHSS-C Classification: LCC: BT695.5



Strictly as per the compliance and regulations of:

© 2024. Abraham Modisa Mkhondo Mzondi. This research/review article is distributed under the terms of the Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0). You must give appropriate credit to authors and reference this article if parts of the article are reproduced in any manner. Applicable licensing terms are at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/.

A Bosadi-Pentecostal Approach to Earth Care in Gauteng Township Contexts

Abraham Modisa Mkhondo Mzondi

Abstract- This article contends that addressing environmental concerns in the South African context requires acknowledgment of the intertwined issues of land grabbing, littering, illegal dumping, and inadequate service delivery. It suggests that Pentecostals, as members of diverse communities, should shift their focus from spiritual matters to initiatives aimed at caring for the earth. Therefore, the article delves into Mogale City and Rand West City Local Municipality in South Africa as a case study, illustrating their contribution to the ongoing environmental degradation. The increasing incidence of land grabbing in these areas poses a threat to the pollution of the Wonderfontein spruit/stream, which flows from Kagiso through the townships of Swanieville 1, extensions 2 and 3, and continues east of Mohlakeng township to the west of Bekkersdal township. Inadequate service delivery has resulted in a backlog of waste removal, leading to concerning levels of littering and illegal dumping in both municipalities. Consequently, the article proposes a Bosadi-Pentecostal approach to tackle the persistent environmental degradation among Pentecostals and members of the identified communities. Taking an insider perspective within the Pentecostal community, the proposed approach aims to raise awareness of biblical teachings and advocate for a biblical strategy to promote earth care among Pentecostals and community members in these municipalities.

Terms: earth care, earth degradation, stewardship, illegal dumping, littering.

I. Introduction

Discussions surrounding earth care began to gain prominence after the mid-twentieth century, as noted by Mckibben (1997), Walsh (1977), and White (1967). Lynn White argued that the interpretation of Genesis 1:26-28 has contributed to an environmental crisis by promoting the idea of human superiority (White 1967). He stressed that this crisis would persist until the notion from Christianity, that nature exists solely to serve humanity, is rejected, stating, "we shall continue to have a worsening ecologic crisis until we reject the Christian axiom that nature has no reason for existence save to serve man" (White 1996, 1207). Van Dyk (2011, 524) further suggests that Genesis 2:28 reinforces human dominion over the earth and is anthropocentric, contending that the Bible offers little guidance on ecological and conservation matters (Van Dyk 2017, 835).

However, Hitzhusen (2019 § 2.2) offers a critique of White's argument, advocating instead for a contextual approach to the pericope. Loader (1987, 9) concurs, stating that it is inaccurate to attribute the ecological crisis solely to biblical faith. Rather, Loader argues, it is the interpretations and emphases within modern Christianity that are at fault.

From this defense, Conradie (2003, 127) outlines key areas that South African theological discussions should address, including (a) the looming threat of global warming, (b) the dangers posed by ozone depletion, (c) the issues surrounding acid rain and air pollution, (d) the challenge of disposing of nuclear waste, (e) the management of highly toxic waste, (f) the urgent need to address the destruction of rainforests and other ecosystems, (g) the rapid loss of biodiversity, (h) soil salination, and (i) the collapse of fishing industries due to over-fishing. His stance advocates for environmental stewardship (Sherkat & Ellison, 2007), a concept further elaborated by Southgate (2006, 185), which entails:

> human beings are called to be stewards of creation tends to be the default position within ordinary Christian groups. The concept of stewardship is affirmed in recent major documents in both the evangelical and Catholic traditions.

Sadly, some of the residents in Mogale City and Rand West City Local Municipality in South Africa have created an environmental crisis by neglecting the responsibility to care for the earth and degrading it as they litter and pollute the environment and stream. This crisis stems from the trend of land-grabbing in the two areas. Hence the author argues that earth care in these two areas should take cognizance of the triple challenges of land grabbing, littering and poor service delivery. The article follows Sherkat and Ellison's (2007) environmental stewardship and uphold the view that, "in many contexts Christians (Pentecostals included) are not environmental activists and environmental activists are not Christians" (Conradie 2011, 158) and the plea that the "current South African context would clearly have to address issues of access to land, housing, urban planning and sustainability." Conradie's (2009, 15). It submit to Conradie's (2010, 301) view of "doctrinal constructs" since the scriptures do not address modern ecological concerns. It also points to the argument that the Spirit participated in creation (Gen 1:2) to promote the involvement of Pentecostals in earth care.

Accordingly, the article applies a Bosadi-Pentecostal approach to address the ongoing earth degradation to raise biblical awareness and propose a

Author: e-mail: modisa@sats.ac.za

© 2024 Global Journals

biblical strategy that will encourage earth care among Pentecostals members of the identified communities.in the two municipalities. This approach underscore the involvement of Pentecostal who emphasizes the role of the Holy Spirit in their tradition and allows for arguing that the Holy Spirit has a role in earth care as in Genesis 1:2.

Masenya (2001,110) applies Bosadi to address the challenges of earth care in Psalm 127:3-5, and alongside it addresses the challenges of women from a Bosadi perspective, thus called eco-bosadi. This approach is earth-centered and argues that African women and the earth are usually treated as objects. Her approach shifts from dominating the earth to preserving it as part of women identity (Masenya 2001, 222). Her approach hinges on a hermeneutic of suspicion to address earth care as the biblical texts have an anthropocentric bias.

A Pentecostal approach takes cognizance (a) of the South African, African Pentecostal context, considering emerging mega-churches and mostly small independent churches in the townships (Anderson 2004, 12-18) and (b) that these Pentecostals have a passion to preach repentance to humans (Anderson 2004, 2-27, Resane 2021, 3).

The article opt to combine the above approaches to provide a balanced response that considers the retrieval of biblical text and the critiquing the anthropocentric and androcentric reading of the text. This then introduces a Bosadi-Pentecostal question: How can Pentecostals minister effectively in the context of the triple challenges of land grabbing, littering and poor service delivery and promote earth care and a relevant biblical strategy in Mogale City and Rand West City Local Municipality in South Africa?

II. Context of Mogale City and Rand West City Local Municipality in South Africa

Mogale City (former Krugersdorp Municipality) and Rand West City Local Municipality (A merger of Randfontein Municipality and Westonaria Municipality) are part of the West Rand District Municipality of Gauteng Province in South Africa. The two were established after the discovery of gold in the late nineteen century. Three townships of Swanieville, Mohlakeng and Bekkersdal form part of the two municipalities. The former were established as the previous government implemented the Group Areas Act of 1966, while Swanieville was an informal settlement established after people rented pieces of land at farm later the dwellers called Swanieville (earlier called Mshenguville) (Mabin 1993e,12). Section 17(1) of the Group Areas Act of 1966 states:

> no person who is a member of any group shall occupy and no person shall allow any such person to occupy any land or premises in a specified area which was not lawfully occupied ... except under the authority of a permit.

Consequently, Africans in the townships lived in structural and socio-economic conditions the apartheid government designed. The newly elected democratic government in 1994 later converted these to be three informal townships of Swanieville 1, extension 2 and 3. A stream Wonderfontein spruit/stream that runs from Kagiso, south of Swanieville, east of Mohlakeng and west of Bekkersdal to the Donaldson Dam, west of Bekkersdal.

In 2022, backyard tenants from around Mogale, Mohlakeng, Roodepoort and Soweto began to erect shacks on the south-west of Swanieville 1, east of extension 2 and 3. Others occupied the land west of extension 2 and 3. All these flow from inadequate provision of proper housing in Mogale City, Johannesburg Metro, and Rand West City Local Municipality and some of the surrounding townships and informal settlements caused by over-population due urban migration as people look for better opportunities in the cities. Turok & Borel-Saladin (2016) adds that many poor people in Gauteng Province live in shacks. It is not surprising that the two pieces of land were occupied in 2023. The pieces of land are on a hill and slopes from south-west of Swanieville 1, east of extension 2 and 3 to the stream running in the valley between the areas (see formal settlement at the back and illegal settlements near the stream and reeds at foreground of picture 1). Mogale City does not provide refuse collection on these pieces of land. This lack of service results in littering and illegal dumping.

III. Littering and Illegal dumping in the Townships and Informal Settlements

The Group Areas Act of 1966 allowed for the provision of substandard services (water, sanitation, roads, waste management) to townships and quality services in suburbs. Waste management in suburbs. Substandard service contributed to the lowering of self-esteem and dignity of the African masses living in townships (Ngeleka 2010). These perpetuated what Pityana (1970, 9) called a story of "The history of black and white people from the days of colonialism displays a concerted attempt by white people at repudiating the humanity of the black man." Hence, littering, and illegal dumping in every open space became common in townships leading to historic waste management challenges.

On the contrary, littering and illegal dumping was upsent in suburbs. African accepted to live double standards, namely, keeping suburbs clean and tidy and townships dirty and filthy. They were employed to clean the yards and streets of their masters. Consequently, the African masses did no place value in caring for the

© 2024 Global Journals

earth. Earth care was only associated with their masters. This development created an unconscious binary between faith and environmental care, where there was no regard dumping rubbish next to schools, homes, health facilities, shops, and churches in the townships. To date, is not surprising to see littering and illegal dumping next to the above-mentioned spots. Illegal dumping now form part of the informal settlements, townships and elsewhere in the country. Poor service delivery in many townships as municipalities are no longer able to provide minimum services exacerbate this trend, thus affecting the poor living in these areas (Masiya, Davids & Manga 2019, 34-36). As such, illegal dumping in townships and informal settlements is uncontrollable in the post-1994 South Africa (Grangxabe, Maphanga, Madonsela 2023). The land south-west of Swanieville 1, east of extension 2 and 3 is no exception as former backyard residents settle. The result is that the informal settlement south of Swanieville 1, west of extension 2 and 3 (see picture 1) is going to add to the ongoing problem of uncollected refuse in Mogale City, thus threatening to pollute the stream that run along the settlement as it is not easy to stop people dumping on a spot once they a few individuals begun dumping (see picture 3). Uncollected refuse in these spots pile up. During rainy seasons water will naturally drag all forms of waste to the stream and speed up the pollution process (see part of the stream in picture 2).



Picture 1: The pictures were taken on Sunday afternoon, 12 November 2023.

© 2024 Global Journals



Picture 2



Picture 3

© 2024 Global Journals

IV. A Strategy to Create Awareness and Promote Earth care among Pentecostals in the Two Townships

The article holds that Pentecostals, who profess to love God, should accept three facts, namely, they are (a) part of the community that has occupied the vacant land, (b) home and away from home, that is they need to address the tension of being present on earth and awaiting the cosmic redemption of creation, and (c) accountable to God and should embrace spiritualities that reflect earth care initiatives. Hence, this section provides a five-step strategy on earth care to create awareness and promote earth care among Pentecostals and community members in the area mentioned above. First, is discussing the UN resolution on environmental crisis and responses of the World Council of Churches and All Africa Conference of Churches. Second, is discussing the Genesis 2:15 as a theological basis to engage in earth care initiatives. Third, is discussing Pentecostal, eco-*bosadi* and *Ubuntu* perspectives of earth care. Fourth, is promoting Missional-Pentecostal earth care Bible study lesson. Fifth, is encouraging collaboration in the earth care initiative.

a) *The United Nations World Council of Churches, All Africa Conference of Churches, and Earth Care*

In 1972, the United Nations established the United Nation Environmental Program addressing global environmental issues caused by human actions. One of the streams is faith and earth to engage faith communities in earth preservation through (https://www.unep.org/about-un-environment/faith-earth-initiative, United Nations 2012).

1) Strengthening partnership with faith-based organization's leadership for policy impact.
2) Greening faith-based organization's investments, operations, and assets; and
3) Establishing an accessible knowledge-based support system using faith scripts and scientific evidence.

The World Council of Churches responded to the UN's call by crafting the document, namely, *Summit, Earth. "Challenges for the Churches"*, a *Letter to the Churches. Redeeming the Creation, the Rio Earth Summit* (1992) and *Climate Change and the Quest for Sustainable Societies* (1998).

The All-Africa Conference of Churches (AACC 1992, 23) document use stewardship to promote earth care initiative. The document further states that: "Bad stewardship is comparable to 'stealing' from others, especially our children and grandchildren, by the destruction of resources which is also theirs from God" (AACC 1992, 23). The AACC also adopted the African Union's Agenda 2063 to promote a hazard free environment.

b) *Earth Care in Genesis 2:15*

The section looks at the following text that infer to earth care. Genesis 2:15. The ESV reads: "The LORD God took the man and put him in the garden of Eden to work it and keep it." Two verbs helped understand the text, to "work/till" (עבד) (*abad)* and "to guard" (שמר) (*shamar*) it. *Abad* refers, in the context of the pericope, to serve, to tend, or to dress or to care; and *shamar*, meaning to keep, watch, or preserve. The ESV uses work and keep it, thus communicating that the first two humans were given the responsibility to be stewards of God's perfect garden (Skerka & Ellison 2007).

The aspect of interrelatedness features in this text. God relied on humans to care and preserve the Garden. Humans relied on the Garden for survival and the Garden relied on humans to care and preserve it. We, accordingly, could say that the text reflects a holistic view instead of a dichotomized relationship between humankind and the earth with the Triune God as the creator of humankind and the earth.

On the contrary, it must be noted that Van Dyk (2011, 524, 529, 533) holds that the garden story is not historical and posits that the Bible does not provide texts addressing earth care (ecological) issues (Van Dyk 2017, 835) and discourages using it for promoting stewardship (Van Dyk 2011, 533). The article holds that although the Bible was not written to address ecological matters, it is possible to use the same Bible to each teach earth care and preservation by using "Constructs" (Conradie 2010, 310). It also argue that the Garden of Eden was complete and did not need humans to be to till and cultivate it but needed them to care (*abad)* and preserve (*shamar)* it. This view and use is noticed in ancient cultures of Egypt and Mesopotamia and intrinsic in the role and title of Joseph who was made to oversee a household (Layton 1990, 633-355). Accordingly, the article follows Conradie (2006, 306) arguement that:

> Doctrinal constructs are not only employed to find similarities but to construct similarities, to make things similar, if necessary. The scope of such doctrinal constructs is often quite comprehensive: they purport to provide a clue to the core meaning of the contemporary context as a whole and the Biblical text.

c) *Pentecostal, Eco-Bosadi and Ubuntu Perspectives of Earth Care*

Genesis 2:6 describes the creation of the first human being (male) and uses Adam as '*adamaíh*' which means earth's surface. Adam was created from the soil of the earth, thus creating a relationship between God the creator, the first human being (male) and the earth (soil). God touched soil particles and formed the first human being before breathing into his nostrils to be a living being. This story echo a harmonious relationship between God, the human being, and the soil-earth. The story also promotes the interrelatedness between earth and humans.

© 2024 Global Journals

Naturally, all Pentecostals do not struggle with the view that God created the first human being out of soil of the earth. This action introduces the human-soil relationship that shows the biblical soil origin of humans and later point to the end of humans mentioned in Genesis 3:19 and Ecclesiastes 12:7. Pentecostals also accept the presence of the Triune God in the creation story by pointing to Genesis 1:2, John 1:1-4 and Colossians 1:15-17. Thus, placing the first human being at the center and as the crown of creation (Gnanakan 2014, 71–72), with the responsibility of caring and preserving the Garden, God created. Unfortunately, this anthropocentric view has contributed to the abuse and destruction of the earth because "[c]reation can be spoiled by wicked, disobedient or ignorant lesser beings." (Turaki 1997, 56)

Human activities in the past centuries have caused some theologians to question the anthropocentric view. As such, Masenya (2001) critiques placing the first human being at the center and argues for an ethnocentric interpretation of the creation story she calls eco-bosadi. This view emphasizes that humankind arrived last on earth; contents that since creation existed before the first human being, the creation story should be earth-centered, thus promoting that humankind, specifically males, should not destroy, exploit, and abuse the earth as they do with women (Masenya 2001, 222).

The article posits that eco bosadi, conceptualized from Bosadi, where Masenya (1997, 440-441, 448) argues for an Ubuntu approach of interpreting Scripture since, in the past, Black theology did not address the situation of Black women in South Africa. This approach flows from an Ubuntu worldview that promotes a close relationship between humankind and nature. Ultimately encouraging the worldview that the land is sacred and possess a mother role (life giving ability) (Maathai 2010, 95). Understandably, the land that holds some sacred places should be treated with respect and reverence (Odey et al., 2013, 9) and humans should seek to maintain harmony between the earth, God, and themselves. Maintaining harmony promotes the interrelatedness between the earth and humans and an integrated approach to earth care.

Such relationship is captured in the maxim "*umuntu ngumuntu ngabantu"* (isiNguni languages) or "*motho ke motho ka batho*" (Setswana/Sesotho languages). (I am because we are), promoting the values of solidarity, care, and respect for the earth. It also echo the view that African women play a critical role in food security and related activities as many rural African women depend on the land, as Chirinda (2021, 80) explains that:

> African women are the primary land tillers. Their stories are connected to the land where they live and where they produce food, fetch firewood, dig wells and, where they sleep after death. For women, the land is their sacred home.

The above views displays that these African women, who are also the majority in all [South] African churches (Chisale 2018,1), need the earth to survive and cannot afford to have humans degrade it. Thus, eco-bosadi is well positioned to address the denigration and abuse of the land.

Additionally, Africans believe that the Supreme Bing supply and withhold rain (see Mbiti 2012) needed to sustain plant, animal, and human life. Hence the practice of offering some sacrifices or appeasing the ancestors, led by either a king/queen or indigenous healer in times of drought (Mbiti 2012,22–26). Thus, accentuating that there is no separation between the material and spiritual.

The eco-bosadi and Ubuntu approach emphasizes upholding harmony between the Triune God (as the creator and owner), the earth and humans (as stewards of God`s creation). Such harmony includes partnering with males in the quest to be ethnocentric; and is a step closer to creating earth-care awareness among Pentecostals in the informal settlements near the townships mentioned in the article.

d) Missional-Pentecostal Bible Study Lesson

As mentioned above, poor people live in informal settlements and do not get basic municipal service. This condition perpetuate a feeling of despair and loss of human dignity. Hence, the section promotes a holistic missional approach of using the Bible to develop a Pentecostal Bible study lesson as means to address the mindset of people, Pentecostals included, residing in townships and informal settlements. It first posits that: "[m]ission is a multifaceted ministry, in respect of witness, service, justice, healing, reconciliation, liberation, peace, evangelism, fellowship, church planting, contextualization, and much more" (Bosch 1991,512). Second, is that mission involves the Triune God (Bosch 1991, 390, Mashau 2012,3). Third is recognizing the mission of Christ stated in Matthew 28: 16-20 and fourth the mission of the church flowing from Christ`s mission. The mission of the church should always point the Triune God, the initiator of missions (Mashau 2012,7).

A missiology approach embraces that missions is God the Father's initiative (*mission Dei*) to have humans restored. He sent the Son to accomplish this mission and the Son sent the Holy Spirit to continue the mission. The Son is also commissioned to redeeming the earth (Romans 8:18-23, Colossians 1:15-20 and Revelation 21-22). This approach uses the hermeneutics of trust to engage earth care.

Providing accurate and simple information is an intrinsic component that should be used to curb earth degradation. This information enabled us to first use Genesis 2:15 to teach that, in the beginning, humans are created to be good stewards of the earth and to care for it. Placed alongside this text is Gensis 1:26 that

© 2024 Global Journals

teaches that humans are created in the image of God. Teaching these beliefs will enable Pentecostals and residents living in these areas to embrace caring as a virtue and an ethic as observed in the Ubuntu worldview discussed above. It will also promote human-soil/earth interconnection.

This teaching also resonate with the Ubuntu worldview of seeking harmony between humans and creation, as creation and humans will experience the goal of redemption. (Rom 8:18-23). This teaching further resonate with eco-bosadi as it elevates the earth and reject the abuse and degrading the earth. Hence the third teaching that, humans need a clean and health hazard free environment. And to teach that humans need a clean stream as it provide necessary conditions for various species living in and around the stream.

Second, is to emphasize that Christ's mission is cosmic that is, Christ death on the cross is not limited to redeeming humans but also redeeming creation as Paul teaches in Romans 8:18-23 and Colossians 1:19-20. Accordingly, each person of the Trinity participates in the plan of redemption (Van Gemeren 1990, 243). The two texts echo that this mission involves the Triune God with the Father sending the Son and the Son sending the Holy Spirit; the Son has also sent the church to proclaim the message of redemption to different nations (Bosch 1991,114, 206).

e) Collaboration of Different Stakeholders in the Earth Care Initiatives

Since Ubuntu encourages community and eco-bosadi aims to transform a community. It is insufficient for Pentecostals in the area to disregard forging close relationship with other stakeholders championing earth care initiatives in Gauteng Province. Forging close relationships with other stakeholders will enable the Pentecostals to look beyond the walls of the church but look at the community so that the interest of the community not a section of the community is protected. Protecting the interest of the community should include involving the administrative and political divisions of the two local municipalities. These includes the waste management departments of Mogale City and Rand West City local municipality, the Speaker of each municipality, Members of Mayoral Committees responsible for human settlement and for environmental management from the two municipalities and local ward councilors. Other important formal stakeholders that provides valuable scientific information are organizations promoting earth care and the academic institutions in Gauteng Province.

Finally, Pentecostals in the area should also reach out to other Christian organizations and churches, other faith organizations, the business sector, education sector, taxi associations, sports and cultural organizations, and the leaders of the ward committees, burial societies/stockvels, youth organizations, and the South African Congress of Civic organizations.

V. Summary

Land grabbing in Mogale City and Rand West City Local Municipality in South Africa is created by insufficient houses in Gauteng Province and is accompanied by a backlog of refuse removal that results in worrying littering and illegal dumping in the two municipalities. The current spate of land grabbing in the two areas will lead to the pollution of the Wonderfontein spruit/stream that run from Kagiso past the townships of Swanieville 1, extension 2 and 3, run on the east of Mohlakeng township to the west of Bekkersdal township.

The objective of this article is to create an awareness campaign and propose a four-step strategy based on Bosadi and Pentecostalism to mobilize Pentecostals in the two municipalities to consider themselves as part of these communities residing in the invaded land because of lack of housing, and embrace earth care initiatives, in collaboration with members of these communities and other stakeholder in Mogale City and Rand West City Local Municipality in South Africa.

References

1. All Africa Conference of Churches, 1992. "*Reconciliation process in social development*." Christian education and development in Africa. Nairobi: AACC.
2. Anderson A 2004. "New African initiated Pentecostalism and charismatics in South Africa.", *Journal of Religion in Africa*, 35(4):1-27.
3. Chirinda, Felecidade N.2021. "Christian and African concepts of God for liberation.' In Mother Earth, Mother Africa and Theology', HTS *Religion & Society Series*, edited by S.S. Chisale & R R Bosch,10:75-84, AOSIS, Cape Town https://library.oapen.org/bitstream/handle/20.500.12657/53922/9781776341726.pdf?sequence=1
4. Bosch, David.J. 1991. *Transforming mission: paradigm shifts in theology of mission*. Maryknoll, New York: Orbis.
5. Chisale, Sinenhlanhla.S., 2018. "Domestic abuse in marriage and self-silencing: Pastoral care in a context of self-silencing.', *HTS Teologiese Studies/ Theological Studies* 74(2), 1–8. https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v74i2.4784
6. Conradie, Ernst. 2003. "How can we help to raise an environmental awareness in the South African context?", *Scriptura: Journal for Contextual Hermeneutics in Southern Africa* 82 (1): 122–138. https://journals.co.za/doi/pdf/10.10520/EJC100614.
7. Conradie, Ernst. M. 2006. "The road towards an ecological biblical and theological hermeneutics.", *Scriptura*, 93:305–314.

© 2024 Global Journals

8. Conradie, Ernst. 2009. "Towards a theology of place in the South African context: Some reflections from the perspective of ecotheology.", *Religion and Theology* 16 (1–2): 3–18. https://doi.org/10.1163/156973109X449967.
9. Conradie, Ernst. M. 2010. What on earth is an ecological hermeneutics? Some broad parameters. In *Eecological hermeneutics: Biblical, historical and theological perspectives*, edited by D. G. Horrell, C. Hunt, & C. Southgate, 295–313. New York: T & T Clark.
10. Conradie, Ernst. M. 2011. The church and the environment: Seven stations towards the sanctification of the whole earth. *Scriptura*, 107(0): 156–170. doi.org/10.7833/107-0-133
11. Gnanakan, Ken, 2014, Responsible stewardship of God's creation, The WEA Global Issues Series Volume 11, Culture and Science Publications, Bonn. Group Areas Act 36 of 1966
12. Grangxabe, X.S.; Maphanga, T.; Madonsela, B.S. 2023. Public participation on waste management between nature reserves and surrounding informal settlement: A review. *J. Air Waste Manag. Assoc. 73*, 589–599.
13. Hitzhusen, G. 2019. *Religion and Environmental Values in America*. Columbus: Ohio State University Press.
14. Layton, Scott C. 1990. "The steward in Ancient Israel: A study of Hebrew ('ăšer) 'al-habbayit in Its near Eastern Setting.", *Journal of Biblical Literature*, 109 (4), 633-649.
15. Loader, JA. 1987. Image and order: Old Testament perspectives on ecological crisis. In *Are we killing God's earth? Ecology and theology*, edited by V.S. Vorster, 6–28. Pretoria: Unisa Press.
16. Mabin Alan 1993. Between Zevenfontein and Hillbrow: alternatives for South African urban planning. https://journals.co.za/doi/pdf/10.10520/AJA1012280X_458
17. Maathai, Wangari. 2010. *Replenishing the earth. The challenge for Africa. spiritual values for healing and the world*. Doubleday, NY.
18. Masenya, Madipoane. 1997. "Redefining ourselves: A bosadi (womanhood) approach.", *Old Testament Essays* 10 (3): 439-448.
19. Masenya, Madipoane J. 2001 "An ecobosadi reading of Psalm 127:3-5." in The earth story in the Psalms and the prophets, edited by N. C. Habel109-122. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press.
20. Mashau, Thinandavha. D. 2012. "A reformed perspective on taking mission and missiology to the heart of theological training.", *In die Skriflig / In Luce Verbi*, 46(2):8. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ids.v46i2.64
21. Masiya Tyanai., Davids Yul. D., Mangai Mary. S. 2019. Assessing service delivery: Public perception of municipal service delivery in South Africa. https://repository.up.ac.za/bitstream/handle/2263/69212/Masiya_Assessing_2019.pdf?sequence=1
22. Mbiti, J.S., 2012, Concepts of God in Africa, Action Publishers, Nairobi.
23. McKibben, Bill. 1997. *The greening of faith: God, the environment, and the good life*. Durham: University of New Hampshire Press.
24. Ngeleka, Precious 2010. An investigation into solid waste management in townships: The case study of Clermont, KwaZulu-Natal. Ph.D. Thesis, University of Kwazulu Natal, Durban, South Africa.
25. Odey, Elizabeth. A., Bebia, B. E. & Okpachui, A. 2013. "African Traditional Religion and environmental sustainability.", *Obudu Journal of Arts and Social Sciences*, 3(1): 131-145.
26. Pityana, N. B 1970. "The politics of powerlessness." *SASO Newsletter*, September. 8–10.
27. Resane, Kelebogile. T. (2021). "Pentecostal ecumenism: The legacy of David Du Plessis.", *Pharos Journal of Theology*, 102(1), 6-8
28. Southgate, C 2006. Stewardship and its competitors: A spectrum of relationships between humans and the non-human creation. *In environmental stewardship: Critical perspectives past and present,* edited by R. J. Berry,185 – 195. London: T&T Clark.
29. Sherkat, Darren E. and Ellison, Christopher. G. 2007. Structuring the religion-environment connection: identifying religious influences on environmental concern and activism, *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion,* 46: 71–85.
30. Turaki, Y., 1997, Tribal Gods of Africa: Ethnicity, racism, tribalism and the gospel of Christ. *Ethics, peace and justice commission of the Association of Evangelicals in Africa*. Nairobi.
31. Turok, Ivan.; Borel-Saladin, Jackie. 2016. "Backyard shacks, informality, and the urban housing crisis in South Africa: Stopgap or prototype solution?", *Hous. Stud*. 31: 384–409.
32. United Nations. 2012. Global environmental outlook. http//www.unep.org/geo/pdfs.
33. Walsh, Jerome. T. 1977. "Genesis 2:4b-3:24: A synchronic approach.", *Journal of Biblical Literature,* 96(2): 161-177
34. Watson, Rajula. A.2004. *Development and justice: A Christian understanding of land ethics*. Cashmere Gate, Delhi: ISPCK.
35. White, Lynn 1967. "The historical roots of our ecological crisis.", *Science* 155 (3767), 1203-1207. http://home.sandiego.edu/~kaufmann/hnrs379/White_1967.pdf
36. World Council of Churches 1992. Summit, Earth. "Challenges for the Churches." 70-73
37. The WCC Conference, 1992. Letter to the Churches. Redeeming creation, the Rio Earth Summit. WCC Publications. Geneva

© 2024 Global Journals

38. World Council of Churches, 1998. Climate change and the quest for sustainable societies. WCC. Geneva.
39. Van Gemeren, Willem. A., 1990. *Interpreting the prophetic word: An introduction to the prophetic literature of the Old Testament*. Zondervan Publishing House, Grand Rapids, MI.
40. Van Dyk, Peet. J. 2015. "'Responsible Stewardship' – The Root of All Evil in Eco-Theology?" OTE 28(2): 523-535. http://dx.doi.org/10.17159/2312-3621/2015/V28N2A16
41. Van Dyk, Peet. J 2017. "Eco-theology: In and out of the wilderness.", *Old Testament Essays*, 30(3):835–851. http://dx.doi.org/10.17159/2312-3621/2017/v30n3a17

© 2024 Global Journals

This page is intentionally left blank

© 2024 Global Journals

Global Journal of human-social science: C
Sociology & Culture
Volume 24 Issue 5 Version 1.0 Year 2024
Type: Double Blind Peer Reviewed International Research Journal
Publisher: Global Journals
Online ISSN: 2249-460X & Print ISSN: 0975-587X

The Need for Affirming Health Care among LGBTQ+ Survivors of Intimate Partner Violence

By Autumn M. Bermea & Tammy L. Henderson

Ohio State University

Abstract- Lesbian, gay, bisexual, trans, queer, and others who are not heterosexual and cisgender (LGBTQ+) are a growing population in the United States and globally; however, they are more likely to report health conditions while are simultaneously more likely to struggle attaining patient centered or affirming health care. Struggles to receive care are amplified by the lack of formal policy that views health care as a human right. This population is also more vulnerable to several risk factors, including intimate partner violence (IPV) than cisgender and heterosexual people. Therefore, they are more likely to necessitate medical care due to injuries (e.g., broken bones, vaginal trauma, lost teeth). In the absence of macro-level policy protections, we make the case for patient-centered and affirming health care that addresses health inequities and the negative health outcomes for IPV survivors. We provide recommendations for providers in primary care, emergency rooms, obstetrics and gynecology, and dentistry.

Keywords: abuse, bisexual, constitutional rights, domestic violence, fourteenth amendment, gay, lesbian, medicine, sexual minority, transgender.

GJHSS-C Classification: LCC: HV6626.2, RA790.5, RA1001

THENEEDFORAFFIRMINGHEALTHCAREAMONGLGBTQSURVIVORSOFINTIMATEPARTNERVIOLENCE

Strictly as per the compliance and regulations of:

© 2024. Autumn M. Bermea & Tammy L. Henderson. This research/review article is distributed under the terms of the Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0). You must give appropriate credit to authors and reference this article if parts of the article are reproduced in any manner. Applicable licensing terms are at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/.

The Need for Affirming Health Care among LGBTQ+ Survivors of Intimate Partner Violence

Autumn M. Bermea [α] & Tammy L. Henderson [σ]

Abstract- **Lesbian, gay, bisexual, trans, queer, and others who are not heterosexual and cisgender (LGBTQ+) are a growing population in the United States and globally; however, they are more likely to report health conditions while are simultaneously more likely to struggle attaining patient centered or affirming health care. Struggles to receive care are amplified by the lack of formal policy that views health care as a human right. This population is also more vulnerable to several risk factors, including intimate partner violence (IPV) than cisgender and heterosexual people. Therefore, they are more likely to necessitate medical care due to injuries (e.g., broken bones, vaginal trauma, lost teeth). In the absence of macro-level policy protections, we make the case for patient-centered and affirming health care that addresses health inequities and the negative health outcomes for IPV survivors. We provide recommendations for providers in primary care, emergency rooms, obstetrics and gynecology, and dentistry.**

Keywords: abuse, bisexual, constitutional rights, domestic violence, fourteenth amendment, gay, lesbian, medicine, sexual minority, transgender.

I. Introduction

Lesbian, gay, bisexual, trans, queer, and others who are not heterosexual and cisgender (LGBTQ+) comprise a growing population globally (Conron, 2020; Ipsos, 2023). However, they face health disparities wherein LGBTQ+ people report more health conditions than their cisgender (i.e., one whose physiological sex characteristics matches their gender identity) and heterosexual counterparts (Committee on Community-Based Solutions to Promote Health Equity in the United States, 2017). Health equity refers to the nondiscriminatory and just ability to obtain quality health care that counters historical and current injustices, dismantles economic, social, and other hinderances to health and health care; and eradicates avoidable health inequalities (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2022). Despite disproportionate health conditions, LGBTQ+ people often report both implicit (i.e., a bias against a group of people of which one is unaware that they hold and/or are acting on) and explicit (biases of which a person is aware and/or acts on intentionally) biases against them in health care settings (Dean et al., 2016; McNeill et al., 2023; Sabin et al., 2015), which might prevent them from accessing care. Another possible explanation is that, in the United States, this population is less likely to have adequate insurance coverage (Nguyen et al., 2018). There have been international calls to provide affirming health care for LBGTQ+ people (Coleman et al., 2022; Fredriksen-Goldsen et al., 2017; Mulé et al., 2009; Narah & Sonam, 2023; Pillay et al., 2022) and some trainings do exist to improve health care providers' ability to providing affirming care, although their findings are mixed (Lelutiu-Weinberger et al., 2023; Morris et al., 2019; Prasad et al., 2023). Some scholars have therefore called for policy that protects the rights of LGBTQ+ people globally to have access to affirming health care (Dean et al., 2016).

The purpose of this paper will be to argue for health equity for LGBTQ+ adults using the Civil Rights Act, the Equal Protection of the U. S. Constitution (Schweikart, 2021), the Article 25 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (United Nations, 2018), and the principle of equity of access to health services as a feature of universal health coverage as established by the World Health Organization (2023). We will highlight the importance of moving from access to care for members of the LGBTQ+ community to affirming the access and health needs of people with diverse sexual and gender identities (Bhatt et al., 2022; Cooper et al., 2023) and patient-centered care (Hascher et al., 2024; McEwing et al., 2022). We will also provide recommendations for medical professionals.

II. LGBTQ+ Population Estimates

a) Global Estimates

Global estimates of the number of people who are LGBTQ+ are difficult to ascertain. According to a survey administered by Ipsos (2023) in 30 countries, around 9% of the world's population holds a non-heterosexual sexual identity, with Brazil reporting up to 14% of the national population identifying as lesbian, gay, bisexual, pansexual or omnisexual, and asexual. Brazil is followed closely by Spain (12%), the Netherlands (11%), and Great Britain (11%). Related to gender identity, the same survey found that about 3% of the global population identifies as transgender; gender non-binary, gender non-conforming, gender fluid, or otherwise outside the male/female gender binary (Ipsos, 2023). Switzerland holds the largest estimated population of gender minorities (6%), followed closely by Thailand (5%), Italy (4%), Sweden (4%), Germany (4%), and Spain (4%).

Although a promising start in estimating the global population of LGBTQ+ people, this study does

Author α: Ohio State University. e-mail: bermea.2@osu.edu
Author σ: Meharry Medical College.

© 2024 Global Journals

not show the full picture. Known as the "global closet," one study estimated that about 83% of the global LGBTQ+ population conceals their sexual identity (Pachankis & Bränström, 2019). This might be due in part to the varying legal contexts by country that would discourage, or even prohibit, people from reporting their sexual and/or gender identities. Countries such as Egypt, Jamaica, and Syria criminalize same-sex sexual activity (known as "debauchery," "buggary," or "unnatural/indecent act" laws, respectively) with penalties ranging from fines, hard labor, lashings, and up to life in prison (Human Rights Watch, n.d.). In Brunei, Iran, Mauritania, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, Uganda, and Yemen, same-sex sexual activity can carry up to the death penalty (Human Rights Watch, n.d.). Brunei, Malawi, Malaysia, Oman, Saudi Arabia, South Sudan, Tonga, and United Arab Emirates contain laws that prohibit non-cisgender gender expression, effectively targeting transgender people's ability to live openly (Human Rights Watch, n.d.).

b) United States Estimates

Although considered vulnerable and marginalized populations, the number of LGBTQ+ people in the United States is not small. Despite there being a sizeable number of youth under the age of 18 who are LGBTQ+ (Conron, 2020), this article will be focused exclusively on adults given youth have unique developmental experiences and face unique access to health care than adults (Chong et al., 2021; Diana & Esposito, 2022). In the United States, about 7.2% of the adult population is LGTBQ+. Bisexual people make up the largest proportion of the LBGTQ+ community, with 58% of this population identifying as bisexual, which is about 4.2% of the entire U.S. population (Jones, 2023). Gay men make up about 1.4% of the entire U.S. population followed by lesbian women, who make up about 1% (Jones, 2023). Related to gender, about .6% of the U.S. population is transgender (Jones, 2023). Given the sizable number of the LGBTQ+ population globally and in the United States, as well as the continued discrimination they face in the policy arena, it is critical to evaluate the status of their health care accessibility.

III. Human Rights and Health Care Accessibility for LGBTQ+ People

a) Global Contexts

Most think of policies that support or discriminate against persons in this community as it relates to marriage and parenting. Ipsos (2023) surveyed 30 countries where 9% of 22,514 adults between 16 and 74 self-identified as LGBTQ+. For example, participants in 20 of the 30 countries supported same-sex marriage with less support in Western countries, and two-thirds believed that, as with heterosexual couples, same-sex couples could successfully rear children. Furthermore, 67% of survey participants agreed that transgender people faced discrimination and should be protected from said discrimination in the areas of housing, work, and access to businesses (Ipsos, 2023). Inequities faced by members of the LGBTQ+ community include challenges accessing food, housing, education, employment, services, receiving asylum, and migrating between countries (Gerber et al., 2020; ILGA World).

One key form of policy impacting LGBTQ+ people is access to quality and affirming health care; however, it remains a challenge across the globe. This is troubling as various Articles of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) that outline equality, freedom from discrimination, life, liberty, and personal security; freedom from torture and debasing treatment; the humane recognition of a person; and the right to marry and family (Marks, 2006). There have been, in recent years, calls by medical providers internationally to provide affirming health care for LGBTQ+ people (e.g., Coleman et al., 2022; Fredriksen-Goldsen et al., 2017; Mulé et al., 2009; Narah & Sonam, 2023; Pillay et al., 2022), yet the actual application of these calls remains limited. For instance, although the World Professional Association for Transgender Health (WPATH) has released its eighth version of standards of care for trans people internationally (Coleman et al., 2022), many trans people globally still report struggling to access care that is affirming to their gender and experiences for numerous reasons, including restrictive policies (Koch et al., 2020). Given the criminalization of same-sex sexual activity as well as to diverse genders and gender expression in some countries (Human Rights Watch, n.d.), it is further likely that many citizens of these countries also decline to seek health care that would require them to disclose their sexual and/or gender identity thus limiting their access to affirming care.

b) United States Contexts

Similar to restrictions to affirming health care for LGBTQ+ people globally, there are many discrepancies in the United States. In the U.S., every human being has the right to life, liberty, and the pursuit of happiness; however, these principles have not been extended to health care (Gerisch, 2018; Holtzman & Schwartzstein, 2020). A lack of health equity for persons in the LGBTQ+ community will likely continue due to (a) access to quality health care not being a constitutional right, (b) the incomplete and incremental set of rights assigned to health care (Ruger, et al., 2015), and (c) the challenges implementing health equity policies. Despite the formal lack of protections in access to health care, liberty principles are woven into the definitions of health equity policies. The latest Executive Order by the White House requires fair, just, and impartial access to services and benefits (Exec. Order No. 13985, 2021) but it is unclear how this order will be implemented, making

© 2024 Global Journals

it a symbolic law much like the Family and Medical Leave Act that does not guarantee job security and paid benefits.

Scholars report the need to advance access to health services for persons with diverse sexual and gender identities through the adoption of inclusive and holistic views (Alencar Albuquerque et al., 2016; Dean et al., 2016), enhancing the number of trained professionals who provide affirming care (Alencar Albuquerque et al., 2016; Bhatt et al., 2022; Fredriksen-Goldsen et al., 2017; Hudson & Bruce-Miller, 2023), and understanding the health services needs of members of LGBTQ+ communities (Alencar Albuquerque, et al., 2016). In a systematic review examining research published between 2004 to 2016, authors reported people who were not heterosexual faced more challenges accessing health care (Alencar Albuquerque, et al., 2016). Indeed, 12.7% of LGB people were uninsured compared to 11.4% for persons who were cisgender and heterosexual in 2019, including Market place and Medicare enrollment. Lesbian, gay, and bisexual (LGB) people are also more likely than heterosexual people to have insurance though Medicaid coverage at 17.2% and 10.3% respectively (Bosworth et al., 2021). Even among those insured, more LGB adults in 31 states reported having individually purchased insurance, which suggests that the repeal of the ACA's individual mandate may create challenges in the affordability of necessary care (Nguyen et al., 2018).

Outside of insurance coverage, LGBTQ+ people often struggle to access providers. One study found that LGB people reported not being able to afford common health services more often than heterosexual people (Heslin & Alfier, 2022). Likewise, compared to heterosexual adults, more LGB adults in the three-wave Behavioral Risk Factor Surveillance System reported avoiding necessary care they needed due to its cost (Nguyen et al., 2018). Even the coverage insurance provides might not be enough to meet their needs or they might have trouble finding an affirming medical provider (Nguyen et al., 2018).

One potential reason for LGBTQ+ peoples' decreased access to health care compared to those who are cisgender and heterosexual is the role of some health care providers' implicit biases that favor cisgender and heterosexual people (Dean et al., 2016; Sabin et al., 2015). Implicit biases many LGBTQ+ people encounter globally in health care settings include providers being uneducated about how to treat LGBTQ+ patients, being visibly uncomfortable around LGBTQ+ patients, invalidating same-gender families during family health care visits, holding a lack of understanding around specific health care needs (e.g., providing condoms but not dental dams or gloves to lesbian women for safer sex practices), or making assumptions that patients were cisgender and/or heterosexual (Dean et al., 2016; McNeill et al., 2023). In other cases, biases against LGBTQ+ patients are made explicit, such as spending less time with LGBTQ+ patients and refusing to perform specific procedures (e.g., artificial insemination for women in same-gender couples). Explicit biases also include verbally expressing being "horrified" around LGBTQ+ people, comparing LGBTQ+ and "regular" patients, and drawing on religious beliefs that "God created Adam and Eve…" (McNeill et al., 2023, pp. 269-270). LGBTQ+ people can also internalize these biases in a way that might reduce access to health care because they fear discrimination, hold distrust medical providers, or experience stereotype threat (Dean et al., 2016; Fingerhut et al., 2022; McNeill et al., 2023).

Recognizing challenges the role of bias toward LGBTQ+ people in the training of health care providers, there are some interventions in place to address and reduce such biases. However, findings on their efficacy are mixed (Dean et al., 2016). Prasad et al. (2023) found a case-based and active learning approach advanced the cultural competence of 111 health care professional students who completed the pre-post test survey for an interprofessional education (IPE) course in 2016. Lelutiu-Weinberger and colleagues (2023) found statistically significant reductions in both explicit and implicit biases following both online and in-person trainings as well as increases in LGBTQ+ affirming beliefs, clinical skills, and behaviors. However, participants' intention to use affirming behaviors did not show a statistically significant reduction. Although changes in both explicit and implicit biases were no longer statistically significant beyond a 15-month follow up, those who participated in supervision did show greater reductions in explicit biases than those who did not suggesting that participants might benefit from assistance in interventions. In their review, Morris and colleagues (2019) found that although some interventions might improve medical providers' knowledge of treating LGBTQ+ patients, their attitudes towards them, and their level of comfort working with them, they did not find any interventions that measured for the presence of implicit biases, which might still persist. Many trainings target individual health care providers and do not address policy issues that affect health care access, which can limit their impact on the lived experiences of LGBTQ+ patients (Dean et al., 2016). Although such interventions do appear to hold promise, their mixed efficacy in reducing bias necessities policies that guarantee access to health care (Mulé et al., 2009).

IV. Intimate Partner Violence and the Need for Health Care in the LGBTQ+ Community

Examining the contexts related to LGBTQ+ peoples' health and wellbeing is critical because, even in countries that do not explicitly criminalize same-sex

© 2024 Global Journals

sexual activity and relationships, such as stigma and discrimination in the U.S., can lead to violence that further necessitates access to health care, including, intimate partner violence (IPV) (Decker et al., 2018; Edwards et al., 2015). By Therefore, it is also critical to highlight not only the risks the LGBTQ+ population face, but also ways to support their access to quality and affirming care. To address the risk factors of this community, we use IPV as the context.

Access to affirming health care is critical for LGBTQ+ people. In addition to the health care needs that span across all groups (e.g., annual physicals, preventative screenings, dental care, oncological care, cardiovascular care, chronic illness support), LGBTQ+ people face contexts that further necessitate access to affirming health care. Although highlighting every context is out of the scope of the current paper, we will focus on the particular case of the increased exposure to violence victimization LGBTQ+ people often face (Chen et al., 2023). It should be noted that although many of the studies cited in this section rely on samples from a single country or region, the literature reviewed is from multiple countries globally.

LGBTQ+ people are generally more likely than heterosexual (Chen et al., 2023) and cisgender (Peitzmeier et al., 2020) people to experience IPV victimization. Although there are forms of victimization that are not physical, such as psychological or coercive controlling violence, physical and sexual IPV exist within these relationships. As defined by the CDC (Chen et al., 2023), some physical IPV involves acts like slapping, shoving, or pushing. There are also "severe" forms of IPV that include acts such as hitting hard enough to leave a mark, burning, using a weapon, or slamming. Although a separate form of IPV from physical violence, sexual IPV is also physical in nature and involves acts such as unwanted sexual contact, coerced or forcible rape, being forced to touch or penetrate a partner, or being unable to consent to a sexual act due to incapacitation (e.g., being asleep, intoxicated, or drugged) (Basile et al., 2014).

It is then unsurprising that being an IPV survivor has long lasting health consequences and requires affirming health care across many domains of medicine. Although some injuries do not require medical care, such as bruising, victimization often necessitates emergency health care due to acute injury sustained during an assault (Doyle, 2020). Importantly, bisexual and lesbian women are more likely than heterosexual women to report attaining an injury or needing medical care. Similarly, gay men are more likely than heterosexual men to report injury or needing medical care (Chen et al., 2023). Injuries might include broken or fractured bones (Doyle, 2020; Kavak et al., 2022), often noses or ribs (Kavak et al., 2022), burning (Singhal et al., 2021), or wounds from weapons (Doyle, 2020). Survivors also sometimes necessitate dental care for oral maxillofacial trauma and traumatic dental injury (da Nóbrega et al., 2017; de Souza Cantão et al., 2024; Levin & Bhatti, 2024). Emerging research is also uncovering the long-lasting effects of traumatic brain injury (TBI), which is when a person experiences a heavy bump, jolt, or blow to their head or else suffers penetration to their head (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2017), and can result from the above injuries, namely head and face injuries as well as strangulation. These symptoms include memory loss and issues with concentration, experiencing blackouts, ringing ears, and problems with vision (Campbell et al., 2018). However, it is important to note that these studies rely on the presence of TBI symptoms, given that a TBI is not formally diagnosable until after death.

Even outside of the direct impacts of IPV, survivors report a host of medical conditions that last a lifetime including diabetes, cardiovascular health, obesity, sexual health concerns (e.g., sexually transmitted infections [STIs] and HIV/AIDS), and other chronic health conditions (e.g., gastrointestinal disorders, respiratory illnesses, urinary and liver problems) (Rivara et al., 2019; Stubbs & Szoeke, 2022). Although still in its infancy, research also documents that some people who have been abused also experience telomere shortening, which accelerates the physical aging process at the genetic level at a rate faster than chronological age (Stubbs & Szoeke, 2022). Given that health care is not a constitutionally protected human right, we will provide recommendations on ameliorating some of the health outcomes associated with IPV by addressing IPV itself through patient centered and affirming care.

V. Implications for Patient-Centered and Affirming Care

In lieu of the lack of a constitutionally protected right to quality health care, patient-centered and affirming care allows for microsystemic access to high-quality, compassionate care.

Patient-centered care (PCC) is a process that encompasses respect between the provider and patient, with the provider being curious about and open to the preferences, needs, and values of their patient and providing care that aligns with the patient's values when rendering health care decisions. PCC is a holistic and empowering lens on health care, encompasses expanding access to personal health information by way of current technologies, creating pathways for active participation, and keeping the patient informed and educated about their health and options (Institute of Medicine, Committee on Quality of Health Care in America, 2001).PCC involves the challenges of training, multiple providers, measurement concerns (Edgeman-Levintan & Schoenbaum, 2021), and the need for enhanced and sustainable alterations in clinical, administrative, and organizational practices to promote

© 2024 Global Journals

holistic and respectful quality care (Gartner et al., 2022). Walsh and colleagues (2022) systematically reviewed PCC in emergency departments. They found that PCC's key features were communication, engaging the patient and their family, patient-provider shared decision-making, respect, trust, continuity in care, and consistency. Outcomes of PCC include greater patient satisfaction (Rathert et al., 2013; Walsh et al., 2022), fewer days in the hospital (Walsh et al., 2022), and enhanced patient self-managed care (Rathert et al., 2013).

Providing and intervening with affirming care and using guidelines on standards for offering affirming care can reduce the impacts of the unprotected right to access to quality, comprehensive and respectful care (Poteat et al., 2023). We purposefully use affirming care as an inclusive and respectful practice. Persons who experience affirming care tend to be less stressed, have improved overall and mental health outcomes, and reduce anxiety, depression, and stress (Arquilla, 2022).

Discussions related to providing PCC and LGBTQ+ affirming care and those related to health care for IPV survivors largely remains siloed. There have been global calls to improve affirming care for LGBTQ+ people (Coleman et al., 2022; Fredriksen-Goldsen et al., 2017; Mulé et al., 2009; Narah & Sonam, 2023; Pillay et al., 2022). Elsewhere, medical professionals across a variety of specializations and disciplines have called for need to screen for IPV as part of their best practices (American Medical Association [AMA], 1992), with the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services including this screening as part of free preventative services (Miller et al., 2015). Some of the medical fields calling for the increased need to screen for and address IPV include those likely to encounter survivors, such as primary care providers (Alvarez et al., 2017; AMA, 1992), emergency room workers (AMA, 1992), OB/GYNs (AMA, 1992; American College of Obstetricians and Gynaecologists [ACOG], 2012), and dental professionals (Levin & Bhatti, 2024). We argue medical professionals should be attuned the presence of IPV specific to their areas of specialization (Phares et al., 2019).

a) Primary Care

Primary care physicians and other medical professionals are paramount to aiding IPV survivors and providing PCC (Langhinrichsen-Rohling et al., 2020). This is because they are central to survivors' care given that they can build relationships with their patients, often have a better understanding of their relationships (e.g., who is an important family member), and are able to make referrals to other health care providers (Langhinrichsen-Rohling et al., 2020).

Primary care professionals are poised to be culturally affirming of their patients, given their ability to form more meaningful relationships (Langhinrichsen-Rohling et al., 2020). In their article related to addressing IPV among LGBTQ+ patients in primary care settings, Bermea and colleagues (2021) suggest incorporated screenings using tools that are designed specifically to capture IPV in this population are part of routine care, including the sexual and gender minorities–specific IPV Conflicts Tactics Scale (Dyar et al., 2021) and the transgender-related IPV Tool (Peitzmeier et al., 2019). Primary care clinics and practices should have protocols in place that all employees who interact with patients are trained in that encompass receiving standardized questions related to IPV that all patients receive, recognizing signs of abuse, and being able to identify local affirming resources (Alvarez et al., 2017). It is important to learn about this population's unique needs, such as not assuming patients' sexuality and/or gender, not making assumptions about the presence of IPV because of patients' relationships configuration (e.g., assuming there is no IPV because both partners are women), and creating physical spaces that signal being LGBTQ+ affirming (e.g., pride flag decals in lobby spaces, inclusive pronouns on intake and other forms, artwork featuring same-gender couples) (Bermea et al., 2021).

b) Emergency Room Care

Emergency rooms (ER) may be one of the first health care systems with which IPV survivors interact (Langhinrichsen-Rohling et al., 2020). There are often a host of screening procedures in place either for all patients (universal screening) or for when patients present with injuries that indicate they are violence victims (Ahmad et al., 2016). While screening, especially universal screening, in ER settings is especially valuable in addressing IPV, there are a host of contextual factors that influence their efficacy (Ahmad et al., 2016). Some barriers to disclosing IPV in the ER are similar to other medical settings (e.g., shame, feeling unready); however, some factors are unique (Ahmad et al., 2016). One study in a Dutch ER found that some providers viewed IPV as a chronic issue that should be addressed in primary care, as the purpose an ER was to treat acute problems with little opportunity for follow up (Zijlstra et al., 2017). In another study in a Canadian ER, medical professionals described having a lack of time with patients in which to properly screen for IPV or that their partner was present, making it unsafe to screen (Vonkeman et al., 2019). Despite the efficacy of and recommendation for universal screening practices (Ahmad et al., 2016), many ER medical personnel do not screen for IPV unless patients present with injuries that appear to be deliberate. Still others do not ask about IPV at all, potentially due to discomfort, little to no formal education about IPV, or lack of awareness of screening procedures and tools. In other cases, there

© 2024 Global Journals

are no local resources for which to refer patients (Vonkeman et al., 2019).

We echo recommendations for increased training in global screening practices, regardless of patients' gender and sexual identities, including using screening tools that can better capture the experiences of IPV for LGBTQ+ people (e.g., Dyar et al., 2021; Peitzmeier et al., 2019). ER professionals should ask about the relationship between the patient and the person accompanying them (when applicable). For instance, should a male patient arrive with another man, providers should not assume they are not partners because they are of the same gender. This is critical because patients should always be screened for IPV privately (Phares et al., 2019). Although there might not be local IPV resources available to which ER providers can refer LGBTQ+ patients, trainings can include increased awareness of affirming resources online. In the U.S., this includes the National Domestic Violence hotline (National Domestic Violence Hotline, 2023).

c) Obstetrics and Gynecological Care

Professionals in obstetrics and gynecology are uniquely poised to identify cases of IPV (ACOG, 2012; Langhinrichsen-Rohling et al., 2020). It is important that providers not assume that only cisgender men commit sexual assault against their cisgender woman partners. Professionals in this field should avoid using gendered language when asking about sexual and partner history (e.g., use of male only pronouns, asking about boyfriends/husbands) (Light & Obedin-Maliver, 2019; Srousma & Wu, 2018). Even if the patient's partner's gender has been assessed, it is critical to not assume that because a partner is of the same gender they are unable to commit a sexual assault (Gambardella et al., 2020). These providers should also recognize that vaginal or anal trauma is not only the result of penile penetration but might also be the result of digital penetration or the use of a foreign object and be able to recognize evidence of those forms of assault. Further, transgender people with diverse identities (e.g., transgender women, transgender men, transmasc people) also often seek gynecological care (Eckstrand et al., 2016; Srousma & Wu, 2018). It is important for professionals in this field to recognize their heightened risk for sexual assault (Kattari et al., 2022), particularly among transgender women (Valentine et al., 2017) and non-binary people (Kattari et al., 2022).

Given that IPV survivors are also at risk for acquiring an STI and/or HIV (McCauley et al., 2015), it is of critical importance to ensure that professionals in obstetrics and gynecology understand that people with vaginas who have sex with exclusively other people with vaginas are still at risk of acquiring an STI and to ask about forms of safer sex protections that are appropriate to this population (e.g., dental dams, female condoms) (Eckstrand et al., 2016).

d) Dental Care

Dental professionals who see cases of maxillofacial trauma (e.g., fracture to the zygoma, nose, and/or jaw, dentoalveolar trauma) (Benassi et al., 2024; Yari et al., 2024) should ask their patients about IPV regardless of their perceived gender identity. This is critical given the high correlation between these types of injury and IPV (de Souza Cantão et al., 2024). One study from a major trauma center in Iran found that, of their patients presenting with maxillofacial trauma, about a third were IPV survivors (Yari et al., 2024). Benassi et al. (2024) noted a similar pattern in Brazil, where about 28% of over 1,000 patients presenting with maxillofacial trauma were IPV survivors. Their findings were comparable to studies in Italy, Germany, India, and South Korea but lower than in countries such as France, Switzerland, Romania, New Zealand, and the U.S.

Dental professionals should recognize that it is not only traumatic injury that can indicate IPV. IPV survivors are less likely than those who have not experienced IPV to have poorer overall dental health, including more cavities and engaging in fewer dental hygiene behaviors (e.g., tooth brushing) and be missing teeth related to violence (Kundu et al., 2015). Although dental professionals are likely attending to oral care, they work in close proximity to other areas that are subject to physical assault, including the head and neck (Kenny, 2006).

Even when dental professionals do not know the sexual or gender identity of the patient, there are still ways to provide affirming care. Some HIV+ patients, of whom gay men and transgender women are disproportionally vulnerable, receive decreased quality care, or are refused to be seen, once a dental professional learns of their seropositive status (Brondani et al., 2016). HIV has been correlated with IPV victimization among gay men and other men who have sex with men (Kubicek, 2018) and transgender women who have reported IPV are less likely to report viral suppression, potentially due to a lack of access to treatment (Bukowski et al., 2018). Dental professionals should receive trainings on working with HIV+ patients, including dismantling myths around HIV/AIDS. Given that access to health care due to cost is a barrier for many LGBTQ+ people in the United States (Heslin & Alfier, 2022; Nguyen et al., 2018), programming that makes dental care more affordable to survivors is needed. To illustrate, the American Academy of Cosmetic Dentistry (AACD) offers the Give Back a Smile program to provide cosmetic dental repair to front teeth for those who have experienced IPV (AACD, n.d.).

e) Policy and the Limitations of Our Recommendations

Although the provided recommendations are valuable, they are limited by laws and policies that penalize without offering health protection both within the United States and globally. Bermea and colleagues

© 2024 Global Journals

(2021) argue that it is important for medical providers to consider the socio-historical context of medical settings for LGBTQ+ people, including the medical pathologization of LGBTQ+ people and historical criminalization of same-sex sexual activity that was only overturned in the United States by the 2003 *Lawrence v Texas* Supreme Court Ruling. It is also important for medical providers consider the banning of gender affirming care in many states that would prohibit affirming care to many transgender people (Hughes et al., 2021). Such contexts are also critical to consider in countries where same-sex sexual activity and living openly as a transgender person are currently outlawed (Human Rights Watch, n.d.). These laws effectively silence survivors from seeking health care. Health care providers in these areas would not be able to ask about sexual or gender identity or screen for IPV that is specific to LGBTQ+ people. However, we urge these providers to not make assumptions about gender, sexuality, or relationship configuration.

Given a lack of constitutional protections in the United States that guarantee health care, along with a similar lack of protections in many places globally, we argue that access to high quality, patient centered, and affirming health care should be a constitutional right (Schweikart, 2021). To provide such health care, it is critical to also be aware of how to work with all patients, including those who are LGBTQ+. Given the lack of policy protections, we urge medical professionals to engage in patient centered and affirming care particularly as it relates to the areas in which LGBTQ+ people disproportionate negative outcomes, in this case IPV (Chen et al., 2023; Peitzmeier et al., 2020).

VI. Concluding Thoughts

Despite the growing population of LGBTQ+ people in the U.S. and globally, there are not civil rights that guarantee access to health care and many LGBTQ+ people face substantial barriers to care. One reason such barriers to care are allowed to continue is due to a lack of constitutional right guaranteeing access to health care. In this paper, we argued that access to high quality and affirming health care should be a constitutional right (Schweikart, 2021). This is important as LGBTQ+ people face contexts that necessitate care, here IPV (Chen et al., 2023). In the interim, it is critical to reduce the barriers to health care this population faces. In place of policy that would guarantee access to care, we have provided recommendations for PCC and affirming care for primary care, emergency room, OB/GYN, and dental providers as a microsystemic intervention in order to promote the high quality for the global LGBTQ+ population.

References Références Referencias

1. Ahmad, I., Ali, P. A., Rehman, S., Talpur, A., & Dhingra, K. (2016). Intimate partner violence screening in emergency department: A rapid review of the literature. *Journal of Clinical Nursing*, *26*, 3271–3285. https://doi.org/10.1111/jocn.13706
2. Alencar Albuquerque, G., de Lima Garcia, C., da Silva Quirino, G., Alves, M. J., Belém, J. M., dos Santos Figueiredo, F. W., da Silva Paiva, L., do Nascimento, V. B., da Silva Maciel, É., Valenti, V. E., de Abreu, L. C., & Adami, F. (2016). Access to health services by lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender persons: A systematic literature review. *BMC International Health and Human Rights*, *16*(2), 1-10. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12914-015-0072-9
3. Alvarez, C., Fedock, G., Grace, K. T., & Campbell, J. (2017). Provider screening and counseling for intimate partner violence: A systematic review of practices and influencing factors. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse*, *18*(5), 479-495. https://doi.org/10.1177/1524838016637080
4. American Association of Cosmetic Dentistry. (n.d.). *American academy of cosmetic dentistry charitable foundation*. https://www.givebackasmile.com/
5. American College of Obstetricians and Gynaecologists. (2012). ACOG Committee Opinion No. 518: Intimate partner violence. *Obstetrics and Gynecology*, *119*(2, Part 1), 412–417. https://doi.org/10.1097/AOG.0b013e318249ff74
6. American Medical Association. (1992). American Medical Association diagnostic and treatment guidelines on domestic violence. *Archives of Family Medicine*, *1*, 139-147. https://doi.org/10.1001/archfami.1.1.39
7. American Psychiatric Association. (2024). *Terminology: Guide for working with transgender and gender nonconforming patients*. https://www.psychiatry.org/psychiatrists/diversity/education/transgender-and-gender-nonconforming-patients/terminology
8. Arquilla, E. M. (2022, April 28). *What is gender-affirming healthcare and why is it important?* https://www.healthline.com/health/transgender/gender-affirming-healthcare-importance
9. Basile, K. C., Smith, S. G., Breiding, M. J., Black, M. C., Mahendra, R. (2014). *Sexual violence surveillance: Uniform definitions and recommended data elements, version 2.0.* National Center for Injury Prevention and Control, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. https://www.cdc.gov/sexual-violence/communication-resources/sv_surveillance_definitionsl-2009-a.pdf
10. Benassi, C. M., de Assis Santos, V. P., Spagno, G., Ferraz, E. P., & Luz, J. G. C. (2024). The profile of patients with maxillofacial trauma due to interpersonal violence treated in a hospital

© 2024 Global Journals

emergency room. *Dental Traumatology*, *40*(1), 35-43. https://doi.org/10.1111/edt.12886
11. Bermea. A. M., Slakoff, D. C., & Goldberg, A. (2021). Intimate partner violence in the LGBTQ+ community: Experiences, outcomes, and implications for primary care. *Primary Care: Clinics in Office Practice*, *48*(2), 329-337. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pop.2021.02.006
12. Bhatt, N., Canella, J., & Gentile, J. P. (2022). Gender affirming care for transgender patients. *Innovations in Clinical Neuroscience*, *19*(4-6), 23-32.
13. Bosworth, A., Turrini, G., Pyda, S., Strickland, K., Chappel, A., De Lew, N., & Sommers, B. D. (2021, June). *Health insurance coverage and access to care for LGBTQ+ individuals: Current trends and key challenges*. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. https://aspe.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/documents/0fc65847a24c8be60505b12d5ed8263d/lgbt-health-ib.pdf
14. Brondani, M. A., Phillips, J. C., Kerson, R. P., & Moniri, N. R. (2016). Stigma around HIV in dental care: Patients' experiences. *Journal of the Canadian Dental Association*, *82*(g1), 1-7.
15. Bukowski, L. A., Chandler, C. J., Creasy, S. L., Mathews, D. D., Friedman, M. R., & Stall, R. D. (2018). Characterizing the HIV care continuum and identifying barriers and facilitators to HIV diagnosis and viral suppression among black transgender women in the United States. *Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome*, *79*(4), 413-420. doi: 10.1097/QAI. 0000000000001831.
16. Campbell, J. C., Anderson, J. C., McFadgion, A., Gill, J., Zink, E., Patch, M., Callwood, G., & Campbell, D. (2018). The effects of intimate partner violence and probable traumatic brain injury on central nervous system symptoms. *Journal of Women's Health*, *27*(6), 761-767. https://doi.org/10.1089/jwh.2016.631.
17. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. (2022, July 1). *What is health equity*? https://www.cdc.gov/healthequity/whatis/index.html
18. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. (2024, April 29). *Facts about TBI*. https://www.cdc.gov/traumatic-brain-injury/data-research/facts-stats/index.html
19. Chen, J., Khatiwada, S., Chen, M. S., Smith, S. G., Leemis, R. W., Friar, N., Basile, K. C., and Kresnow, M. (2023, October). *The National Intimate Partner and Sexual Violence Survey (NISVS) 2016/2017: Report on victimization by sexual identity*. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/pdf/nisvs/nisvsReportonSexualIdentity.pdf
20. Chong, L. S. H., Kerklaan, J., Clarke, S., Kohn, M., Baumgart, A., Guha, C., Tunnicliffe, D. J.,… & Tong, A. (2021). Experiences and perspectives of transgender youths in accessing health care: A systematic review. *JAMA Pediatrics*, *175*(11), 1159-1173. doi:10.1001/jamapediatrics.2021.2061
21. Coleman, E., Radix, A. E., Bouman, W. P., Brown, G. R., de Vries, A. L. C., Deutsch, M. B., Ettner, R.,… & Arcelus, J. (2022). Standards of care for the health of transgender and gender diverse people, version 8. *International Journal of Transgender Health*, *23*(51), s1–s258. https://doi.org/10.1080/26895269.2022.2100644
22. Committee on Community-Based Solutions to Promote Health Equity in the United States (2017). *Communities in action: Pathways to health equity*. The National Academies Press.
23. Conron, K. J. (2020, September). *LGBT youth population in the United States*. The Williams Institute. https://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/LGBT-Youth-US-Pop-Sep-2020.pdf
24. Cooper, R. L., Ramesh, A., Radix, A. E., Ruben, J. S., Juarez, P. D., Holder, C. L., Belton, A. S.,... & Matthews-Juarez, P. (2023). Affirming and inclusive care training for medical students and residents to reduce health disparities experienced by sexual and gender minorities: A systematic review. *Transgender Health*, *8*(4), 307-327. Doi: 10.1089/trgh.2021.0148
25. da Nóbrega, de Macedo Bernardino, Í., Nóbrega Barbosa, K. G., Lira e Silva, J. A., de Lima Targino Massoni, A. C., & d'Avila, S. (2017). Pattern of oral-maxillofacial trauma from violence against women and its associated factors. *Dental Traumatology*, *33*(3), 181-188. https://doi.org/10.1111/edt.12327
26. de Souza Cantão, A. B. C., da Silva Lima, T. C., Pires Fernandes, M. I. A., Nagendrababu, V., Bastos, J. V., & Levin, L. (2024). Prevalence of dental, oral, and maxillofacial traumatic injuries among domestic violence victims: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Dental Traumatology*, *40*(2), 33-42. https://doi.org/10.1111/edt.12922
27. Dean, M. A., Victor, E., & Grimes, L. G. (2016). Inhospitable healthcare spaces: Why diversity training on LGBTQIA issues is not enough. *Bioethical Inquiry*, *13*, 557–570. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11673-016-9738-9
28. Decker, M. Littleton, H. L., & Edwards, K. M. (2018). An updated review of the literature on LGBTQ+ intimate partner violence. *Current Sexual Health Reports*, *10*, 265-272. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11930-018-0173-2
29. Diana, P., & Esposito, S. (2022). LGBTQ+ youth health: An unmet need in pediatrics. *Children*, *9*(7), 1027-1038. https://doi.org/10.3390/children9071027
30. Doyle, J. L. (2020). Experiences of intimate partner violence: The role of psychological, economic, physical and sexual violence. *Women's Studies International Forum*, *80*, 102370. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2020.102370
31. Dyar, C., Messinger, A. M., Newcomb, M. E., Byck, G. R., Dunlap, P., & Whitton, S. W. (2021).

© 2024 Global Journals

Development and initial validation of three culturally sensitive measures of intimate partner violence for sexual and gender minority populations. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, *36*(15-16), NP8824 –NP8851. https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260519846856
32. Eckstrand, K.L., Potter, J., Edmiston, E.K. (2016). Obstetric and gynecologic care for individuals who are LGBT. In K. Eckstrand & J. Ehrenfeld, (Eds.), *Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender Healthcare* (pp. 309-336). Springer.
33. Edgman-Levitan, S., & Schoenbaum, S. C. (2021). Patient-centered care: achieving higher quality by designing care through the patient's eyes. *Israel Journal of Health Policy Research*, *10*, 1-5. https://doi.org/10.1186/s13584-021-00459-9.
34. Edwards, K. M., Sylaska, K. M., & Neal, A. M. (2015). Intimate partner violence among sexual minority populations: A critical review of the literature and agenda for future research. *Psychology of Violence*, *5*(2), 112-121. http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/a0038656
35. Exec. Order No. 13985, 3 C.F.R. 86 (2021). https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/FR-2021-10-19/pdf/2021-22766.pdf
36. Fingerhut, A. W., Martos, A. J., Choi, S. K., & Abdou, C. M. (2022). Healthcare stereotype threat and health outcomes among LGB individuals. *Annals of Behavioral Medicine*, *56*(6), 562–572. https://doi.org/10.1093/abm/kaab060
37. Fredriksen-Goldsen, K. I., Kim, H-J., McKenzie, G. L., Krinsky, L., Emlet, C. A. (2017). Plan of action for real-world translation of LGBTQ health and aging research. *LGBT Health*, *4*(6), 381-444. https://doi.org/10.1089/lgbt.2017.0185
38. Gambardella, G., Benz, M., Hines, D. A., & Palm Reed, K. M. (2020). A descriptive analysis of college students' experiences of female perpetrated sexual assault. *Journal of Contemporary Criminal Justice*, *36*(4), 520-538. https://doi.org/10.1177/1043986220936077
39. Gartner, B., Abasse, K. S., Bergeron, F., Landa, P., Lemaire, C., & Côté, A. (2022). Definition and conceptualization of the patient-centered care pathway, a proposed integrative framework for consensus: A concept analysis and systematic review. *BMC Health Services Research*, *22*. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12913-022-07960-0
40. Gerber, P., Raj, S., Wilkinson, C., & Langlois, A. (2020). Protecting the rights of LGBTIQ people around the world: Beyond marriage equality and the decriminalisation of homosexuality. *Alternative Law Journal*, *6*(*1*), 5-12. https://doi.org/10.1177/1037969X20986658
41. Gerisch, M. (2018). Health care as a human right. *Human Rights*, *43*(3), 2-5. https://www.jstor.org/stable/27171259
42. Hascher, K., Jaiswal, J., LoSchiavo, C., Ezell, J., Duffalo, D., Greene, R. E., Cox, A.,... & Halkitis, P. N. (2024). Lack of informed and affirming healthcare for sexual minority men: A call for patient centered care. *Journal of General Internal Medicine*, advanced online publication. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11606-024-08635-8
43. Heslin, K. C., & Alfier, J. M. (2022, May 25*). Sexual orientation differences in access to care and health status, behaviors, and beliefs: Findings from the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey, National Survey of Family Growth, and National Health Interview Survey*. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. https://www.cdc.gov/nchs/data/nhsr/nhsr171.pdf
44. Holtzman, J. N., & Schwartzstein, R. M. (2020). Health care in the United States: Individual right or government duty? *Academic Medicine*, *95*(6), 868-871. doi: 10.1097/ACM.0000000000002986
45. Hudson, K. D., & Bruce-Miller, V. (2023). Nonclincal best practices for creating a LGBTQ-inclusive care environments: A scoping review of gray literature. *Journal of Gay & Lesbian Social Services*, *35*(2), 218-240. https://doi.org/10.1080/10538720.2022.2057380
46. Hughes, L. D., Kidd, K. M., Gamarel, K. E., Operario, D., & Dowshen, N. (2021). "These laws will be devastating": Provider perspectives on legislation banning gender-affirming care for transgender adolescents. *Journal of Adolescent Health*, *69*(6), 976-982. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jadohealth.2021.08.020
47. Human Rights Watch. (n.d.). *#Outlawed: "The love that dare not speak its name"*. https://features.hrw.org/features/features/lgbt_laws/
48. ILGA World. (2023, February 2). *Annual review of the human situation of lesbian, gay, bisexual, trans, and intersex people in Europe and Central Asia.* https://www.ilga-europe.org/report/annual-review-2023/
49. Institute of Medicine (US) Committee on Quality of Health Care in America. (2001). *Crossing the Quality Chasm: A New Health System for the 21st Century*. National Academies Press (US).
50. Ipsos (2023). *LGBT Pride 2023: A 30-Country Ipsos Global Advisor Survey*. https://www.ipsos.com/sites/default/files/ct/news/documents/2023-05/Ipsos%20LGBT%2B%20Pride%202023%20Global%20Survey%20Report%20-%20rev.pdf
51. Jones, J. M. (2023). *U.S. LGBT identification steady at 7.2%.* Gallup. https://news.gallup.com/poll/470708/lgbt-identification-steady.aspx
52. Kattari, S. K., Kattari, L., Lacombe-Duncan, A., Shelton, J., & Misiolek, B. A. (2022). Differential experiences of sexual, physical, and emotional intimate partner violence among transgender and gender diverse adults. *Journal of Interpersonal*

© 2024 Global Journals

Violence, *37*(23-24). NP23281–NP23305. https://doi.org/10.1177/08862605221078805

53. Kavak, N., Kavak, R. P., Özdemir, M., Sever, M., Ertan, N., & Suner, A. (2022). A 10-year retrospective analysis of intimate partner violence patients in the emergency department. *Turkish Journal of Trauma & Emergency Surgery*, *28*(6), 796-804. DOI: 10.14744/tjtes.2021.90453
54. Kenny, J. P. (2006). Domestic violence: A complex health care issue for dentistry today. *Forensic Science International*, *159*(15), S121-S125. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.forsciint.2006.02.025
55. Koch, J. M., McLachlan, C., Victor, C. J., Westcott, J., & Yager, C. (2020). The cost of being transgender: Where socio-economic status, global health care systems, and gender identity intersect. *Psychology & Sexuality*, *11*(1-2), 103-119. https://doi.org/10.1080/19419899.2019.1660705
56. Kubicek, K. (2018). Setting an agenda to address intimate partner violence among young men who have sex with men: A conceptual model and review. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse*, *19*(4), 473-487. https://doi.org/10.1177/1524838016673599
57. Kundu, H., Basavaraj, P., Singla, A., Kote, S., Singh, S., Jain, S., Singh, K., & Vashishtha, V. (2015). Domestic violence and its effect on oral health behaviour and oral health status. *Journal of Clinical and Diagnostic Research*, *8*(11), ZC09-ZC12. https://doi.org/10.7860/JCDR/2014/8669.5100
58. Langhinrichsen-Rohling, J., Schneider, M., Selwyn, C., Lathan, E., Sayegh, L., & Hamberger, L. K. (2020). Addressing intimate partner violence within the healthcare system. In R. Geffner, J. W. White, L. K. Hamgerger, A. Rosenbaum, V. Vaughan-Eden, & V. I. Vieth (Eds.), *Handbook of interpersonal violence and abuse across the lifespan* (pp. 1-29). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-62122-7_153-1
59. Lelutiu-Weinberger, C., Clark, K. A., & Pachankis, J. E. (2023). Mental health provider training to improve LGBTQ competence and reduce implicit and explicit bias: A randomized controlled trial of online and in-person delivery. *Psychology of Sexual Orientation and Gender Diversity, 10*(4), 589–599. https://doi.org/10.1037/sgd0000560
60. Levin, L., & Bhatti, C. (2024). The role of dental professionals in identifying, reporting, and supporting domestic violence victims. *Dental Traumatology*, *40*(2), 3-9. https://doi.org/10.1111/edt.12897
61. Light, A., & Obedin-Maliver, J. (2019). Opening the ob/gyn door for sexual and gender minority patients. *Contemporary OB/GYN*, *64*(1), 11-15.
62. Marks, S. M. (2006). Global recognition of human rights for lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender people. *Health and Human Rights*, *9*(1), 33–42.
63. McCauley, H. L., Silverman, J. G., Decker, M. R., Agénor, M., Borrego, S., Tancredi, D. J., Zelazny, S., & Miller, E. (2015). Sexual and reproductive health indicators and intimate partner violence victimization among female family planning clinic patients who have sex with women and men. *Journal of Women's Health*, *24*(8), 621-628. https://doi.org/10.1089/jwh.2014.5032
64. McEwing, E., Black, T., Zolobczuk, J., & Dursun, U. (2022). Moving beyond the LGBTQIA+ acronym: Toward patient-centered care. *Rehabilitation Nursing*, *47*(5), 162–167. doi: 10.1097/RNJ.0000000000000378
65. McNeill, S. G., McAteer, J., & Jepson, R. (2023). Interactions between health professionals and lesbian, gay and bisexual patients in healthcare settings: A systematic review. *Journal of Homosexuality*, *70*(2), 250-276. https://doi.org/10.1080/00918369.2021.1945338
66. Miller, E., McCaw, B., Humphreys, B. L., & Mitchell, C. (2015). Integrating intimate partner violence assessment and intervention into healthcare in the United States: A systems approach. *Journal of Women's Health*, *24*(1), 92-99. https://doi.org/10.1089/jwh.2014.4870
67. Morris, M., Cooper, R. L., Ramesh, A., Tabatabai, M., Arcury, T. A., Shinn, M., Im, W.,,… & Matthews-Juarez, P. (2019). Training to reduce LGBTQ-related bias among medical, nursing, and dental students and providers: A systematic review. *BMC Medical Education*, *19*, 1-13. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-019-1727-3
68. Mulé, M. J., Ross, L. E., Deeprose, B., Jackson, B. E., Daley, A., Travers, A., & Moore, D. (2009). Promoting LGBT health and wellbeing through inclusive policy development. *International Journal for Equity and Health*, *8*(18). https://doi.org/10.1186/1475-9276-8-18
69. National Domestic Violence Hotline. (2023, September 26). *Domestic abuse and its impact on transgender and nonbinary survivors*. https://www.thehotline.org/resources/domestic-abuse-transgender-non-binary-survivors/
70. Nara, Y., & Sonam, J. (2023). Ensuring LGBT-affirming healthcare environments: A call for inclusion. *The International Journal of Indian Psychology*, *11*(4), 2301-2318. Doi: 10.25215/1104.212
71. Nguyen, K. H., Trivedi, A. N., & Shireman, T. I. (2018). Lesbian, gay, and bisexual adults report continued problems affording care despite coverage gains. *Health Equity*, *37*(8), 1306–1312. https://doi.org/10.1377/hlthaff.2018.0281.
72. Pachankis J. E., & Bränström, R. (2019). How many sexual minorities are hidden? Projecting the size of the global closet with implications for policy and public health. *PLoSONE, 14*(6), e0218084. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0218084

© 2024 Global Journals

73. Peitzmeier, S. M., Hughto, J. M. W., Potter, J., Deutsch, M. B., & Reisner, S. L. (2019). Development of a novel tool to assess intimate partner violence against transgender individuals. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, *34*(11), 2376–2397. https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260519827660
74. Peitzmeier, S. M., Malik, M., Kattari, S. K., Marrow, E., Stephenson, R., Agénor, M., & Reisner, S. L. (2020). Intimate partner violence in transgender populations: systematic review and meta-analysis of prevalence and correlates. *American Journal of Public Health*, *110*(9), e1-e14. https://doi.org/10.2105/ AJPH.2020.305774
75. Phares, T. M., Sherin, K., Harrison, S. L., Mitchell, C., Freeman, R., & Lichtenburg, K. (2019). Intimate partner violence screening and intervention: The American College of Preventive Medicine position statement. *American Journal of Preventative Medicine*, *57*(6), 62-872. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amepre.2019.07.003
76. Pillay, S. R., Ntetmen., J. M., & Nel., J. A. (2022). Queering global health: An urgent call for LGBT+ affirmative practices. *Lancet Global Health*, *10*, e574-e578. https://doi.org/10.1016/S2214-109X(22)00001-8
77. Poteat, T., Davis, A. M., Gonzalez, A. (2023). Standards of care for transgender and gender diverse people. *JAMA*, *391*(21), 1872-1874. doi: 10.1001/jama.2023.8121
78. Prasad, S., O'Malley, C. B., DeLeon, R., Levy, A. S., & Griffin, D. P. (2023). Inclusive LGBTQIA+ healthcare: An interprofessional case-based experience for cultural competency awareness. *Frontiers in Public Health*, *10*, 993461. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpubh.2022.993461
79. Rathert, C., Wyrwich, M. D., & Boren, S. A. (2013). Patient-centered care and outcomes: a systematic review of the literature. *Medical care research and review*, *70*(4), 351–379. https://doi.org/10.1177/1077558712465774
80. Rivara, F., Adhia, A., Lyons, V., Massey, A., Mills, B., Morgan, E., Simckes, M., & Rowhani-Rahbar, A. (2019). The effects of violence on health. *Health Affairs*, *38*(10), 1622-1629. https://doi.org/10.1377/hlthaff.2019.00480
81. Rugar, J. P., Rugar, T. W., & Annas, G. J. (2015). The elusive right to healthcare under the U.S. law. *New England Journal of Medicine*, *372*(26), 2558-2563. DOI: 10.1056/NEJMhle1412262
82. Sabin, J. A., Riskind, R. G., & Nosek, B. A. (2015). Health care providers' implicit and explicit attitudes toward lesbian women and gay men. *American Journal of Public Health*, *105*(9), 1831-1841. https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2015.302631
83. Schweikart, S. J. (2021). How to apply the Fourteenth Amendment to the Constitution and the Civil Rights Act to promote health equity in the US. *AMA Journal of Ethics*, *23*(3), E235-239. doi: 10.1001/amajethics.2021.235
84. Singhal, S., Orr, S., Singh, H., Shanmuganantha, M., & Manson, H. (2021). Domestic violence and abuse related emergency room visits in Ontario, Canada. *BMC Public Health*, *21*, 1-9. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-021-10501-9
85. Srousma, D., & Wu, J. P. (2018). Welcoming transgender and nonbinary patients: Expanding the language of "women's health". *American Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology*, *219*(6), 585-588. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ajog.2018.09.018
86. Stubbs, A., & Szoeke, C. (2022). The effect of intimate partner violence on the physical health and health-related behaviors of women: A systematic review of the literature. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse*, *23*(4), 1157-1172. https://doi.org/10.1177/1524838020985541
87. United Nations (2018, December 4). *Universal Declaration of Human Rights at 70: 30 articles on 30 Articles - Article 25*. https://www.ohchr.org/en/press-releases/2018/12/universal-declaration-human-rights-70-30-articles-30-articles-article-25#:~:text=Article%2025%20of%20the%20Universal,widowhood%2C%20unemployment%20and%20old%20age.
88. Valentine, S. E., Peitzmeier, S. M., King, D. S., O'Cleirigh, C., Marquez, S. M., Presley, C., & Potter, J. (2017). Disparities in exposure to intimate partner violence among transgender/gender nonconforming and sexual minority primary care patients. *LBGT Health*, *4*(4), 241-314. https://doi.org/10.1089/lgbt.2016.0113
89. Vonkeman, J., Atkinson, P., Fraser, J., McCloskey, R., & Boyle, A. (2019). Intimate partner violence documentation and awareness in an urban emergency department. *Cureus*, *11*(12), e6493. Doi: 10.7759/cureus.6493
90. Walsh, A., Bodaghkhani, E., Etchegary, H., Alcock, E., Patey, C., Senior, D., & Asghari, S. (20 (2022). Patient-centered care in the emergency department: a systematic review and meta-ethnographic synthesis. *International Journal of Emergency Medicine*, *15*(36), 1-12. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12245-022-00438-0.
91. World Health Organization (2023, October 5). *Universal health coverage (UHC)*. https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/universal-health-coverage-(uhc)
92. Yari, A., Fasih, P., Bagheri, A., Aryanezhad, S. S., & Sani, M. K. (2024). Prevalence and pattern of maxillofacial injuries associated with domestic violence: A retrospective study at a major trauma center. *Dental Traumatology*, *42*(2), 61-68. https://doi.org/10.1111/edt.12903
93. Zijlstra, E., van de Laar, R., Moors, M. L., Wong, S. L. F., & Lagro-Janssen, A. (2017). Tensions and ambivalent feelings: Opinions of emergency

© 2024 Global Journals

department employees about the identification and management of intimate partner violence. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, *32*(7), 1044–1067. http://doi.org/10.1177/0886260515587663

© 2024 Global Journals

Global Journal of human-social science: C
Sociology & Culture
Volume 24 Issue 5 Version 1.0 Year 2024
Type: Double Blind Peer Reviewed International Research Journal
Publisher: Global Journals
Online ISSN: 2249-460X & Print ISSN: 0975-587X

Authoritarianism, Human Rights and Tolerance

By Cleudes Maria Tavares Rosa

Federal University of Goiás

Introduction- Intenta-se efetuar a reflexão sobre os acontecimentos, políticos e econômicos, que marcaram o mundo no séc. XX, no qual as guerras dizimaram milhões de indivíduos. E constata-se, hodiernamente, manifestações autoritárias e intolerantes que desafiam os sistemas de garantias da luta pelo Direito Humano e pela defesa veemente do conteúdo contido na Declaração de Princípios sobre a Tolerância (ONU, 1995).

Refletir a respeito da tolerância remete preservar as futuras e atuais gerações do flagelo da guerra, é reafirmar os direitos fundamentais e a dignidade humana, logo os direitos humanos. Por que tolerância? Se temos manifestações explícitas e cotidianas da intolerância todos os segundos nesse ano de 2024? Duas guerras pontuais nos marcam e marcam nossas memórias. Por serem guerras de trincheira e midiática adentram aos olhos e mostram destruição e morte. Horror e dominação, discurso vazio de defesas por causas mais vazias: relações objetivas que imprimem cicatrizes, como gênese da burrice, sob o casulo daquele que as defende. Casulo é peso, carga. É imposição das relações objetivas: econômicas, políticas sobre tod@s.

GJHSS-C Classification: FOR Code: 160606

AUTHORITARIANISMHUMANRIGHTSANDTOLERANCE

Strictly as per the compliance and regulations of:

© 2024. Cleudes Maria Tavares Rosa. This research/review article is distributed under the terms of the Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0). You must give appropriate credit to authors and reference this article if parts of the article are reproduced in any manner. Applicable licensing terms are at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/.

Authoritarianism, Human Rights and Tolerance

Autoritarismo, Direitos Humanos e Tolerância

Cleudes Maria Tavares Rosa

Introduction

Intenta-se efetuar a reflexão sobre os acontecimentos, políticos e econômicos, que marcaram o mundo no séc. XX, no qual as guerras dizimaram milhões de indivíduos. E constata-se, hodiernamente, manifestações autoritárias e intolerantes que desafiam os sistemas de garantias da luta pelo Direito Humano e pela defesa veemente do conteúdo contido na Declaração de Princípios sobre a Tolerância (ONU, 1995).

Refletir a respeito da tolerância remete preservar as futuras e atuais gerações do flagelo da guerra, é reafirmar os direitos fundamentais e a dignidade humana, logo os direitos humanos. Por que tolerância? Se temos manifestações explícitas e cotidianas da intolerância todos os segundos nesse ano de 2024? Duas guerras pontuais nos marcam e marcam nossas memórias. Por serem guerras de trincheira e midiática adentram aos olhos e mostram destruição e morte. Horror e dominação, discurso vazio de defesas por causas mais vazias: relações objetivas que imprimem cicatrizes, como gênese da burrice, sob o casulo daquele que as defende. Casulo é peso, carga. É imposição das relações objetivas: econômicas, políticas sobre tod@s.

Pensar a intolerância implica pensar a violência como consequência inerente. Ambas reportam à exigência do que seja memória. Psicanaliticamente a memória está ligada às representações simbólicas que ao longo do tempo a humanidade constituiu no sentido de dar significado à existência e convivência dos grupos humanos e do indivíduo presente e atuante dentro de tais grupos.

Essa representação simbólica ao longo do processo desdobrou-se em um pensamento mítico em que as explicações a respeito do que fosse intolerância e violência, sinônimos inextricavelmente enleados, e foram vistas como convém a um sistema de pensamento que visou homogeneizar um padrão de comportamento, seja racionalista ou idealista e cuja especificidade fora interpretar o mundo. No primeiro momento de Platão e Aristóteles, de Descartes a Bacon e todo o idealismo alemão até a contemporaneidade a razão do homem implicou dominação tanto quanto buscou compreendê-lo.

Por certo, se o mundo é difícil de compreender, o pensamento enquanto abstração dos fenômenos manifestos tornou-se empreendimento desde há muito buscado por aqueles que a ele se propuseram. Mas, para explicar o diverso é preciso se autoexplicar para tanto se autoconhecer. Esse primeiro momento da explicação se deu pela cultura. A cultura, como processo, é a mediação efetuada pelo indivíduo, entre ele próprio e a natureza. É possível distinguir através da cultura criada pelos indivíduos que estes renunciam da sua libido a favor das atividades expressas socialmente, e que podem levá-los a se presumirem sujeitos; ou seja, é, também, pela repressão dos instintos que a cultura se constitui (FREUD, 2010). Essa repressão cultural age no nível instintual e no sociohistórico. Em seu processo de dominação, esse indivíduo, sujeito de sua trajetória, intentou a autonomia. Constituiu um *corpus* de conhecimentos a respeito da natureza no sentido de conhecer e dominar e constituiu a cultura.

Para a teoria crítica da sociedade, a perspectiva subjetiva no processo de construto da cultura tem que ser considerada. Uma vez que esse indivíduo passa a limitar, a impedir-se de seu exercício de liberdade pelos limites impostos pela cultura que ele próprio constituiu no primeiro momento da dominação da natureza. Por conseguinte, a liberdade anterior vivenciada foi solapada pelo momento consentâneo de sujeição da libido, à vontade e busca do prazer as quais passaram a ser controladas e impostas culturalmente. A cultura passou a subjugar os instintos humanos, sua libido, a satisfação irrestrita das suas necessidades, que passaram a ser moldadas, recalcadas, consentidas nos limites previamente impostos.

O conteúdo recalcado dessa libido, alerta Freud (2010b), pode voltar à tona, posto que o processo cultural e social que se constituiu centrado no recalque está todo o tempo em luta com a liberdade instintual buscada. E, se essa está contida pelo peso

Author: Pós-doutora em Direitos Humanos (UFG). Doutora em Educação (UFG). Mestra em Sociologia (UFG). Especialista em Direito Civil (UNIAnhanguera). Especialista em Psicanálise (FAMART). Graduada em Ciências Sociais (UFG). Bacharel em Direito (PUCGOIÁS). Advogada (OAB GO 42550). Presidenta da Comissão de direitos Humanos da subseção OAB-Go Nerópolis. Coordenadora e professora de Sociologia na PUCGO. Pesquisadora na PUCGOIÁS, NEVIDA-FE (UFG/CNPQ, AÇORES), CEPAE (UFG/ UFSCAR, FRANKFURT), UCTO (CNPQ, UFSCAR).
e-mail: cleudestavares@gmail.com
Lattes: http://lattes.cnpq.br/5957242989246947
ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2364-6117

© 2024 Global Journals

da cultura, o recalque dos instintos se dá no âmbito biológico e no histórico (a dominação é social e se desdobra em todos os indivíduos dessa sociedade, em nome da exigência tolerável e exercida pela cultura). Conforme Freud a luta ocorre entre o princípio do prazer (busca o prazer e a satisfação como o propósito da vida, tem origem biológica, busca o prazer da satisfação das necessidades sem considerar quaisquer limites) e o princípio da realidade (explicita ao homem os limites de sua felicidade, sendo animal o homem só se torna humano com o adiamento do prazer pelo trabalho e com a sublimação da libido), se antes, o homem regido pela busca do prazer agora só evita sofrimento.

Para Freud a história do homem é a da luta da razão contra a não-razão. Só que o princípio do prazer permanece latente e pode explodir. A teoria crítica da sociedade se constitui a partir da discussão dos seus autores com dois referenciais, dentre outros (Kant, Hegel, etc.), que se complementam: o marxiano com a análise objetiva da sociedade e o freudiano com a subjetiva. Em Marx, o homem se humaniza pela mediação do trabalho na busca de satisfação de suas necessidades, que uma vez satisfeitas geram outras, e constitui o primeiro ato da história. Em Freud, o homem é animal e se humaniza na medida em que adia a satisfação e restringe a busca pelo prazer e transforma a atividade inicialmente lúdica (princípio do prazer) e passa a evitar a dor. Por essa negação determinada, o pensamento expressa a ausência de liberdade constituída pelos freios culturais. Daí se entende que a menoridade, a impossibilidade de refletir por si, é garantidora da permanência do autoritarismo enraizado e por tal o indivíduo entende-se como sujeito. Nesse sentido, é possível apreender a experiência formativa como "movimento pelo qual a figura realizada seria confrontada com sua própria formação" (ADORNO, 1995. p. 25).

Ao debruçar o olhar sobre a questão da violência, urge refletir sobre os aspectos constitutivos desta ao longo do processo histórico. Nesse sentido, a contribuição da teoria crítica da sociedade, em específico dos pensadores da Escola de Frankfurt, Adorno e Horkheimer, têm muito a oferecer no sentido da argüição efetuada ao longo de suas obras a respeito do projeto de humanização do homem.

Em "Dialética do Esclarecimento", essa preocupação é manifestada na análise sobre a sociedade capitalista, denominada pelos autores como sociedade administrada: "[...] por que a humanidade, em vez de entrar em um estado verdadeiramente humano, está se afundando em uma nova espécie de barbárie?" (ADORNO E HORKHEIMER, 1985. P.11). Quem são os vencedores nos jogos bárbaros? Há vencedores? Quem o disse? Mortes, perdas, destruição e ainda há vencedores? Para Adorno (1993), "O todo é o não-verdadeiro" cuja civilização é a frustração dos instintos e o indivíduo assume importância por conter em si esta frustração que abarca uma verdade não exposta sobre ele e a civilização que não o determina. Adorno entende que o indivíduo é o particular e enquanto parte não pode ser absorvido pelo universal ou civilização.

A construção da identidade se deu afastando desde o princípio da universalidade o outro, o diferente. E perpetuou a não identidade. Do início do processo de dominação da natureza e de outros homens a dessemelhança foi entendida, reforçada, reproduzida. Foi marcada desde a Declaração de Independência dos Estados Unidos da América do Norte em 1776 até a Declaração dos Direitos do Homem e do Cidadão, na Revolução Francesa em 1789, e houve hierarquização. A liberdade e a igualdade foram reivindicadas pelos brancos, cidadãos europeus e descendentes. Nada foi mencionado sobre demais povos.

A própria Declaração Universal dos Direitos Humanos em 1948, manteve a hierarquização, centrando na categoria identitária masculina, Homem, seu princípio de universalidade. Todas as influências políticas jurídicas advieram, contudo, da perspectiva filosófica sobre o conhecimento do mundo e das ciências particulares a partir de então gestadas. Explicações que intentaram universalizar a compreensão da natureza e do social num padrão matematizável, absolutizado e formal. Nessa homogeneização o princípio da universalidade e da identidade se omitiram a pensar o outro como diferente. Calaram-se.

É nesse contexto que a tolerância, em relação ao diferente ganha contornos de aceitação, mas por omissão. Predominou a hierarquização cultural e o etnocentrismo. Tal situação, todavia garantiu a dominação política, econômica e social, em que pese a principiologia burguesa afirmar a identidade oriunda da igualdade formal foi, nessa circunstância, desconsiderada a particularidade cultural, também pela ciência e sem crítica ou questionamento reafirmou-se a igualdade dentro da desigualdade. Por isso é preciso arguir a tolerância. Essa não é indulgência, não é indiferença. É sim, respeito ao não-idêntico.

Emerge então uma tensão gestada a partir da conscientização da não identidade desse indivíduo, particular, em relação ao todo, ao universal, à sociedade. E tem prevalecido uma conciliação temporária cujos rompimentos se dão na perspectiva da violência contra o outro, indivíduo ou natureza, diferente.

A violência é inerente à condição humana, esse humano, violento, centrou seu poder de destruição em direção a natureza e aos outros homens; intentou a dominação. Urge, contudo, compreender que a violência é regressão, negação da humanidade em si. A essa regressão, como manifestação de violência física, Adorno denomina barbárie (1995).

© 2024 Global Journals

Se o conteúdo recalcado da libido se constitui centrado no recalque e está em luta com a liberdade instintual. E, se essa está contida pela cultura, é através da memória, que para Adorno (idem) possibilita uma maneira de conhecer e reconhecer o que no indivíduo tem ou pode ter conteúdo de verdade. É pela memória que o indivíduo resgata a promessa de felicidade e prazer, é nela que sobrevive o desejo de liberdade. Todos negados pela civilização. Ocorre que pela memória são também retidos os desejos de dominação sobre o outro, diferente.

A serena aceitação desse outro, a partir tão só do momento em que tratados, convenções e Declarações são ratificados pelo Estado-Nação e com obrigatoriedade *erga omnes* pode levar ao entendimento de não aceitação anterior. Pondera-se com Adorno, em *Mínima Morália* que

> (...) à consciência moral larga instala-se com generosidade, que tudo perdoa porque compreende com demasiado conhecimento de causa. Entre a culpa própria e a alheia emerge um *quid pro quo* que é resolvido a favor de quem aí levou a melhor (ADORNO, 1993, p. 18).

Pensar a intolerância implica pensar a condescendência, a 'boa vontade', com o indivíduo que não se considera como igual, com aquele que é visto como inferior, coisa destituída da humanidade vista em si. Volta-se à construção antropológica que enraizada na perspectiva da racionalidade do homem e com ressonância na ciência e política econômica europeia desde o século XVII, explicou seus processos de dominação a partir da superioridade cultural: o eurocentrismo e etnocentrismo.

Tal perspectiva centrou virtudes sobre a cultura do homem branco, portador de técnicas de exploração da natureza e que desde Descartes (Séc. XVII) pretendeu que o homem, através da técnica e por meio desta, poderia e deveria se tornar senhor, mestre da natureza. Nesse sentido, aquele que primeiro a dominasse tornar-se-ia capaz de se dominar. Volta-se, novamente a Ulisses.

Foi pelo mito que se objetivou as forças da natureza e, mimeticamente, por ele regulou comportamento e reduziu a angústia frente ao desconhecido. Adorno e Horkheimer (1985) apontam que, pela relação anterior de submissão, pela mimese, o indivíduo pretendeu e explicou os fenômenos instrumentalizando a razão. Essa passou a ordenar a caminhada rumo à dominação.

Essa violência se constitui como simbólica, não o sendo totalmente, no momento em que Ulisses, para ouvir o canto das sereias, amarra a si e tapa os ouvidos dos remadores: são dois momentos de violência. O primeiro, domesticando pela força sua porção animal que poderia se enredar pelos sentidos. Arrisca-se, posto que essa violência praticada contra si pode levá-lo a sucumbir ao interesse e se perder, ou não. A ela denomina-se aqui de violência doce, conquanto o ato materializado seja de agressão ao corpo, já desprezado no processo de compreensão do mundo e da vida, a prevalência explicativa estava ainda centrada no mito, separada do sujeito que agia em busca do conhecimento. O segundo momento é violência material, regressiva, contra o outro, o remador, diferente de Ulisses, o sujeito do conhecimento. A esse, as amarras, a submissão, a manipulação, a violência física, materializada e doravante constitutiva do processo de administração da sociedade.

Se Ulisses é o sujeito do conhecimento e impinge a si mecanismos de controle racionais, o processo de conhecimento avançará desconsiderando a violência que este sujeito imporá a si, ao seu corpo, para conhecer e explicar o anteriormente explicado pelo mito. Agora, separado, fracionado apenas em razão, é que a desconsideração da sensibilidade torna-se realidade, materializa-se. Essa separação marca a discussão para a compreensão da relação entre sujeito (cognoscente – que se propõe a conhecer, a investigar) e o objeto (cognoscível – a ser conhecido, a ser investigado) e seu caminho historicamente desenvolvido na *teoria do conhecimento*.

Interessa aqui a relação constituída pela perspectiva eurocêntrica que conduz ao entendimento de uma cultura superior, a europeia, a ser imposta sobre as demais, inferiores, como narrou Pero Vaz de Caminha a El Rei de Portugal em carta sobre os povos da Terra de Santa Cruz. Caminha definiu-os como bons de *rostros*, tez morena, dóceis, afáveis, ingênuos como crianças (CHAUI *apud* TAVARES ROSA, 2003). Mesmo dóceis e afáveis, o branco europeu massacrou, escravizou e dominou. Foi barbárie.

Para Adorno, a possibilidade de que Auschiwtz, a barbárie, como regressão a e para além da violência física presente no processo civilizatório da sociedade alemã e europeia, altamente civilizada e racionalista de explicação dos fenômenos científicos, filosóficos, históricos e humanos não se repitam, e sempre se encaminham no questionamento contributivo da educação. Alerta-se para a pouca consciência, enquanto pensamento não enrijecido, reflexivo em relação a essa exigência e demonstra-se que há que se continuar alertando, não justificando, que o fato foi pura barbárie, violência física extremada que subsume o outro. Regressão que se deu e que ainda poderá ocorrer "enquanto persistirem no que têm de fundamental as condições que geram esta regressão" (ADORNO,1995, p.119). Para o autor, Auschiwtz ocorreu pela não identificação da população com as vítimas, pela indiferença de uns com os outros. Essa foi à condição psicológica mais importante. Pergunta-se e Hiroshima e Nagasaki? E Hoje? Lembram? Pensem!

Para a teoria crítica de Frankfurt, o instinto, a agressividade, a necessidade de se sobrepor, é inerente à condição humana. Os autores apontam a contribuição de Freud sobre o peso das condições

© 2024 Global Journals

geradoras da regressão e que remete a pressão civilizatória imposta sob os indivíduos. Bem como, salientam que opor-se a essa pressão civilizatória leva ao adoecimento, ao desespero. É preciso ao indivíduo conscientizar da possibilidade desse desespero. Uma vez que o evento nefasto, planejado, foi expressão da tendência social imperativa. Aponta-se a existência de genocídios a partir das guerras nacionalistas, essa análise remete a discussões anteriormente efetuadas, as técnicas totalitárias da tomada e conservação do poder ao longo do processo sociohistórico. Ou seja, barbárie. São fenômenos repetidos na busca ou recondução da dominação. Por isso o alerta da Teoria Crítica à filosofia e à ciência que sacrificam o "individual à totalidade de um sistema mistificado", como o sacrifício dos indivíduos à universalidade, uma vez que não há possibilidade de conciliar interesse particular e vontade geral. E se opõe ainda à filosofia da história, na explicação segundo a qual Marx e Engels, à maneira do positivismo, que explicaram a história como encadeamento de fenômenos e tenderam a sacrificar a felicidade individual às gerações futuras. Adorno, afirmou tratar-se de endeusar a história, a ideia de progresso e de história universal constituem a ilusão de que existe uma humanidade idêntica a si, unida, harmônica. E, lembra: há o progresso e as vítimas do progresso.

Critica-se também as explicações economicistas e sociológicas que apontam explosão populacional e as justificativas de contra-explosões criando categorias gerais que nada contribuem para a compreensão do morticínio de populações inteiras. Atenta-se que com isso é preciso se analisar as forças ás quais é preciso se opor e que integram o curso da história mundial (lembrar o discurso defensivo das elites políticas brasileiras defendendo a indústria de armas: homens de bem trancados e homens do mal nas ruas).

Contrapor-se aos pressupostos objetivos, sociais e políticos geradores de eventos semelhantes à Auschiwtz são difíceis. Adorno (1995) ao contrapor-se a história deduzida dos conceitos universais se propõe a resgatar a história na qual as cicatrizes do sofrimento causado ainda estejam presentes, visíveis. Para tanto explica que as tentativas de se contrapor a uma repetição de eventos danosos semelhantes deverão se alicerçar na perspectiva subjetiva. Afirma ser cético aos apelos à religião, chamando por lucidez, posto compreender que se deve buscar nos algozes o tanto de frieza, de indiferença e incapacidade de amar, de identificar-se com o outro. E pondera ser necessário fazer o giro para o sujeito, ou a inflexão para o sujeito, que é o buscar compreender os mecanismos que estes possuem que os tornam capazes de matar. Compreender no sentido de impedi-los. Verificando, ademais que os culpados são todos os desprovidos de consciência e que se voltaram com ódio e fúria agressiva àqueles que se contrapuseram ao seu entendimento de mundo.

Em *La personalidad autoritária,* Adorno (1965) demonstra que o autoritarismo, sob a perspectiva psicológica, é a tendência geral a se colocar em situação de dominação ou submissão, frente aos outros, como consequência de insegurança do "eu" ou medo de ser débil, ou sentimento de culpa. Nessa perspectiva, o autoritário considera o outro como rival e se este for considerado "superior" deverá ser temido; caso considerado "inferior", deverá ser dominado. Logo, "autoritarismo significa uma predisposição defensiva a se conformar acriticamente a normas e movimentos do poder investido pelo sujeito de autoridade" (1965, p. 5). É preciso ressaltar o perfil do indivíduo autoritário, relacionando-o ao outro diferente: a falta de sentimento, a indiferença e a frieza, a identificação com o poder, a manifestação de um espírito destrutivo pela indiferença manifestada na intolerância e no preconceito, a máscara democrática quando o indivíduo é antidemocrático, o entender que o outro recebe algumas vantagens e que por ser inferior e diferente não deveria ter direitos que são considerados pelo autoritário como vantagens. Adorno (idem) aponta essas características como potência da personalidade fascista que é uma característica da personalidade autoritária.

O autoritarismo advém da ideia distorcida de que um líder deva ter presença marcante e ditatorial nessa sociedade em que a discriminação social se torna uma das causas estudadas por Adorno, enfatizando a intolerância com ela e por ela o preconceito. A definição de autoritário na Teoria Crítica tem referência ao indivíduo de caráter "potencialmente fascista", que está dominado pelos fatores subjetivos, como o medo e a culpabilidade, e por fatores objetivos e materiais em que a lógica, predominantemente capitalista, interfere nos embates e conflitos humanos em todas as esferas da sociedade.

Por tanto sofrimento causado pela intolerância na sociedade, ao longo do tempo sociohistórico. É que em Paris, novembro de 1995, a Declaração de Princípios sobre a Tolerância foi firmada e publicada pela UNESCO, Organização das Nações Unidas para a Educação, a Ciência e a Cultura objetivou garantir a paz mundial por meio da cooperação intelectual entre as nações. E propôs, a partir da constatação da intolerância, violência, terrorismo, xenofobia, nacionalismo agressivo discriminação e marginalização contra minorias étnicas, religiosa, linguísticas, migrantes e imigrantes, intimidação às liberdades de expressão, a todos os comportamentos que cerceiam as liberdades fundamentais, a democracia e a paz. Ressaltou que incumbe aos Estados fomentar o respeito dos direitos humanos e das liberdades fundamentais, sem qualquer distinção: raça, credo, sexo língua, nacionalidade, incapacidade e combater a intolerância.

© 2024 Global Journals

A Declaração de Princípios sobre a Tolerância, destacou em seu art. 1º que a tolerância é atitude ativa no reconhecimento dos Direitos Universais da pessoa humana e nas liberdades fundamentais do outro. Que a tolerância deve ser o sustentáculo dos Direitos Humanos e do Pluralismo, inclusive o cultural, da democracia e do Estado de Direito, combatendo o dogmatismo e fortalecendo as normas enunciadas de Direitos Humanos. Praticar a tolerância não é tolerar a injustiça social, tampouco renunciar às próprias convicções. Tolerar significa que "toda pessoa tem a livre escolha de suas convicções e aceita que o outro desfrute da mesma liberdade" (1.4 DPT). É aceitar a diversidade de aspecto físico, modo de expressão, comportamento, valores sem nenhuma imposição de outrem.

A Declaração de Princípios determina ainda ao âmbito estatal a imparcialidade na legislação, cabendo ao Estado Juiz aplicação da lei de modo imparcial (Lawfare, não!). Exige o desfrute de oportunidades econômicas e sociais sem discriminação, pois a exclusão e frustração podem conduzir às hostilidades e fanatismo que levam à violência, guerras, morticínio: barbárie. No item 2.3 recomenda que as nações respeitem e aceitem o caráter multicultural da família humana. Quanto ao Art. 3º das Dimensões sociais salienta a respeito da mundialização da economia, da mobilidade e migração mundial acelerada que podem rearranjar de modo diverso a organização social, por isso a tolerância é a chave que conecta o diverso, o plural, o diferente sem confrontos e conflitos. Só respeito. Aqui a centralidade de uma educação crítica assume o que seja tolerar.

A Educação tem sentido se for dirigida a uma autorreflexão crítica, e de novo com Adorno (1995), em análises efetuadas pela Psicanálise, segundo o frankfurtiano torna possível compreender que todo o caráter, inclusive dos criminosos, forma-se na primeira infância. Portanto, para se evitar manifestações de barbárie é preciso, pela educação, concentrar-se na educação da primeira infância. E, volta-se a Freud acerca da tese de tal autor sobre a pressão social civilizatória imposta aos indivíduos, que representam papéis sociais e que não necessariamente conseguem tensionar os estímulos, autopreservação e autodestruição. É pelo tensionamento que o indivíduo poderia se entender como sujeito, não objeto no processo civilizatório. É que a sociedade administrada gera claustrofobia, estranhamento, distanciamento, hierarquiza e diferencia.

No texto Mal-estar na civilização (2010b), Freud discute as explicações humanas ao longo do processo sociohistórico: a finalidade da vida. *Interessa aqui o que tal autor se questionou enquanto busca de conhecimento; os homens buscam a felicidade e essa apresenta meta positiva (ausência de dor e desprazer) e meta negativa (vivência de fortes prazeres).* O princípio do prazer estabelece o domínio e orienta o desempenho do aparelho psíquico. Todavia, existem limites. Segundo Freud, as possibilidades de felicidade são restringidas pela constituição humana, conquanto a satisfação irrestrita da satisfação de todas as necessidades seja tentadora e significa colocar o gozo a frente da cautela e com isso o castigo. Para evitar o desprazer os indivíduos se diferenciam culturalmente.

Se a cultura, como processo nega o pensamento autônomo e expressa a ausência de liberdade. Daí se entender que a menoridade, a impossibilidade de refletir por si, é garantidora da permanência da violência enraizada manifesta como intolerância, preconceito. Nesse sentido, é possível apreender a experiência formativa como "movimento pelo qual a figura realizada seria confrontada com sua própria formação" (ADORNO, 1995. p. 25). Se tal sujeito é inapto para o exercício da reflexão, repete o comportamento baseado em atos violentos. Essa repetição se estende como teia, e pode provocar processos de identificação. O conceito psicanalítico de identificação remete "a mais antiga manifestação de uma ligação afetiva de uma pessoa com outra" (FREUD, 2016). É que pensar a violência, na sua manifestação regressiva de força física, barbárie, implica pensar não apenas as condições objetivas nas quais esta se manifesta. E também investigar subjetivamente os seus sujeitos. Segundo Adorno, "o fato de precisarmos nos conscientizar desse elemento desesperador (...) deve ir além dos pressupostos objetivos (...) é preciso buscar as raízes nos perseguidores"(1995)

A sociedade administrada gera claustrofobia e aumenta a densidade da raiva contra a civilização, e aí se dirige a violência contra os socialmente considerados fracos, felizes. É que abaixo da vida civilizada e ordenada a pressão do geral dominante sobre o particular tendem a destroçá-los junto com seu potencial de resistência (é preciso fazer o giro para o sujeito para saber por que o sujeito adere ao social, se irá e porque irá participar ou não e que para ser aceito se reprime).

A reflexão com Adorno (1995) remete pensar a Educação após Auschiwtz e atentar para esta educação relacionada à primeira infância e ao esclarecimento que produza um clima intelectual, cultural e social que não permita a repetição da barbárie manifestada. Adorno (idem) aponta que nos EUA, o espírito germânico de confiança na autoridade foi responsabilizado pelo nazismo e Auschiwtz. Para o autor, embora, as análises considerassem a Alemanha e outros países europeus autoritários nos quais as existências de autoridades cegas perduraram com mais veemência sob os pressupostos da democracia formal, considerou, contudo, tais afirmações superficiais. É de supor que o fascismo e o horror que este produziu se relacionaram ao fato de que as autoridades do império

© 2024 Global Journals

se esfacelaram e ruíram, ainda que as pessoas não se encontrassem psicologicamente preparadas para autodeterminação. Estas não se revelaram a altura da liberdade alcançada. Essas autoridades assumiram a dimensão destrutiva de desvario.

Salienta-se, conforme Adorno (1995) que o retorno ou o não retorno do fascismo constitui uma questão social e não psicológica, porque os momentos essenciais escapam à ação educacional quando não à interferência dos indivíduos. Alerta-se que as pessoas recorrem aos conceitos de vínculos de compromissos, que a ausência de compromissos dessas seria a responsável pelo acontecido e teria a ver com a perda da autoridade: condição do pavor sadomasoquista. Adorno e Horkheimer (1985), ao elaborarem os Elementos para o Antissemitismo, apontam:

> (...) que os que não tem nenhum poder de comando devem passar tão mal como o povo. Do funcionário alemão aos negros do Harlem, os ávidos prosélitos sempre souberam, no fundo, que no final não teriam nada senão o prazer de que os outros tampouco teriam mais do que eles (p.141).

É possível para o entendimento humano evocar compromissos que detenham o que é sádico e desagregador. Os autores consideram ilusão apelar aos vínculos de compromisso ou até a exigência do restabelecimento de vinculações de compromissos para o melhor: mundo e pessoas. A falsidade de compromissos é exigida para que se provoque algo sem que seja experimentada por si e como substancial: possível perceber como os ingênuos e tolos reagem na busca de fraquezas dos superiores. Os compromissos são assumidos objetivando a identificação como pessoa confiável, ou produzem rancores por entender que está submisso ao outro, remete as normas que não foram assumidos pela razão do indivíduo como próprias.

Em La personalidad autoritaria (1965, p.124), salienta-se que "a disponibilidade em ficar do lado do poder, tomando como norma curvar-se ao que é mais forte, constitui a índole dos algozes, e que não deve ressurgir", e busca clarificar que a única possibilidade contra Auschiwtz é a busca da autonomia, a autodeterminação, a não participação, na perspectiva kantiana.

Ao buscar a maioridade kantiana, tão almejada pelos sujeitos que anseiam pela autonomia, deve-se compreender o conceito de esclarecimento (*Aufklärung*), em Kant, como

> a saída do homem de sua menoridade, da qual ele é culpado. A menoridade é a incapacidade de fazer uso de seu entendimento sem a direção de outro indivíduo. O homem é o próprio culpado dessa menoridade se a causa dela não se encontra na falta de entendimento, mas na falta de decisão e coragem de servir-se de si mesmo sem a direção de outrem. *Sapereaude*! (KANT, 2008, p. 63)

Em *Dialética do Esclarecimento*, Adorno e Horkheimer (1985) anunciam o conceito de esclarecimento "como um processo de emancipação intelectual resultando, de um lado, da superação da ignorância e da preguiça de pensar por conta própria e, de outro lado, da crítica das prevenções inculcadas nos intelectualmente menores por seus maiores" (HORKHEIMER; ADORNO, 1985, p. 7). A autonomia deve ser vista como esclarecimento, luz para a compreensão de processos sociais em que o autoritarismo manifesto pela intolerância e preconceito se torna barbárie, levando à desumanização dos indivíduos.

Em estudo sobre a personalidade narcisista, conforme os autores frankfurtianos, Crochik (1990) demonstra que a ascensão do nazismo e a aquiescência da personalidade à ideologia autoritária

> se devia[m] ao enfraquecimento da família dado no período da República de Weimar. Com o declínio da figura do pai, enquanto figura de autoridade, a formação do Ego e do Superego do indivíduo foi prejudicada, facilitando o surgimento de um líder que possibilitasse mais imitação (*mimésis*), do que a identificação. (CROCHIK, 1990, p. 141-142).

Nesse contexto de enfraquecimento da personalidade, o indivíduo autoritário e narcisista, ao invés de agir pela razão como *lógos* e pela cultura baseada na universalidade de princípios humanos, age pela força e poder que lhe foi constituído ditatorialmente. Os frankfurtianos, referindo-se ao esclarecimento e à moral, mostram que "força, beleza, estatura, eloquência: nos primórdios da organização da sociedade, essas virtudes eram determinantes quando a autoridade passou para as mãos dos dominantes" (ADORNO; HORKHEIMER, 1985, p. 95). Na personalidade autoritária, o indivíduo é cegamente submisso à autoridade tirânica e manipuladora, destituído de autonomia e da decisão de beneficiar a coletividade, por se ater ao próprio ego.

Pensar o autoritarismo enraizado, a intolerância e com ela o preconceito implica pensar a menoridade. A menoridade instiga a adesão cega, a incapacidade, impossibilidade de reflexão. A sociedade administrada e seus mecanismos de inculcação de 'verdades' dissimuladas via Indústria cultural introjeta pela repetição, *mímesis,* um padrão de pensamento e comportamento que homogeneíza uma visão de mundo que é ideologia.

Educação tem sentido tão só como autorreflexão crítica. A teoria crítica aponta que a formação cultural consistiria da experiência de formações entre "a filosofia da vida" entrelaçada a contextos amplos, arte, fatos históricos. Salienta que as reflexões dessas relações assim estruturadas não impedirão ou romperão o nexo entre objeto analisado e a reflexão em curso (ADORNO, 2006). A formação

© 2024 Global Journals

cultural há de ser adquirida por esforço e interesse, por "à capacidade de se abrir a elementos do espírito apropriando-as do modo produtivo na consciência, em vez de se ocupar com os mesmos unicamente para aprender conforme prescreve um clichê" (*op. cit*., p.64). A educação, é processo e se constitui a maioridade em termos relacionais ou entre indivíduo e sociedade.

References Références Referencias

1. ADORNO, Theodor W. *La personalidad autoritaria.* Buenos Ayres: Editorial Proyección, 1965.
2. ADORNO, Theodor W. *Minima moralia:* reflexões a partir da vida danificada. Trad. Luiz Eduardo Bicca. Rev.de tradução: Guido de Almeida. 2. ed. São Paulo: Ática, 1993.
3. ADORNO, Theodor W. *Educação e Emancipação.* 4ed. Tradução Wolfgang Leo Maar. – RJ: Paz e Terra, 1995a.
4. ADORNO, Theodor W. *Palavras e sinais:* modelos críticos 2. Petrópolis: Vozes, 1995b.
5. ADORNO, T. W. e HORCKHEIMER, M. *A dialética do esclarecimento:* fragmentos filosóficos. Tradução Guido Antonio de Almeida.- RJ: Zahar, 1985.
6. FREUD, Sigmund.*O mal-estar na civilização, novas conferências introdutórias à psicanálise e outros textos.* Trad. Paulo César de Souza. São Paulo: Cia das Letras, 2010b. (Obras Completas, v.18).
7. FREUD, Sigmund. *Moisés e o monoteísmo:* esboço de psicanálise e outros trabalhos (1937-1939). Trad. James Strachey. São Paulo: Imago, 2016. (Obras Psicológicas Completas, v. XXIII).
8. TAVARES ROSA, C. M. *Ronda:* o discurso político sobre a criminalidade urbana no contexto de uma sociedade autoritária. 2003. Dissertação (Mestrado em Sociologia) – Faculdade de Ciências Sociais e Filosofia, Universidade Federal de Goiás, Goiânia, 2003.

.

© 2024 Global Journals

This page is intentionally left blank

© 2024 Global Journals

Global Journal of human-social science: C
Sociology & Culture
Volume 24 Issue 5 Version 1.0 Year 2024
Type: Double Blind Peer Reviewed International Research Journal
Publisher: Global Journals
Online ISSN: 2249-460X & Print ISSN: 0975-587X

Memory's Significance in the Formation of Ethnic Identity: A Case Study of Deported Meskhetians Residing in the Samtskhe-Javakheti Region

By Manana Tsereteli

Abstract- This paper examines the role of memory in shaping ethnic identity among deported Meskhetians residing in Georgia's Samtskhe-Javakheti region. Through interviews and analysis, it explores how personal, collective, and historical narratives of the 1944 deportation and origins impact contemporary identity formations. Differences emerge between scholarly perspectives attributing Meskhetian roots to ancient Georgian tribes versus Turkish peoples. Despite varied origin narratives, the shared trauma of deportation serves as a collective touchstone passed down through storytelling and post-memory. Collective trauma is transmitted across generations through stories and shapes the identity of those who did not directly live through the traumatic events themselves. It is an imaginative, creative memory defined by distance from the original events. The paper situates these multifaceted memories and identities within theoretical frameworks on cultural trauma, narrative construction of history, and the complexity of lived versus recorded pasts.

Keywords: *meskhetians, ethnic identity, memory, trauma, deportation, narratives, history, post-memory.*

GJHSS-C Classification: *LCC: DK508.7.M47*



Strictly as per the compliance and regulations of:

© 2024. Manana Tsereteli. This research/review article is distributed under the terms of the Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0). You must give appropriate credit to authors and reference this article if parts of the article are reproduced in any manner. Applicable licensing terms are at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/.

Memory's Significance in the Formation of Ethnic Identity: A Case Study of Deported Meskhetians Residing in the Samtskhe–Javakheti Region

Manana Tsereteli

Abstract- This paper examines the role of memory in shaping ethnic identity among deported Meskhetians residing in Georgia's Samtskhe-Javakheti region. Through interviews and analysis, it explores how personal, collective, and historical narratives of the 1944 deportation and origins impact contemporary identity formations. Differences emerge between scholarly perspectives attributing Meskhetian roots to ancient Georgian tribes versus Turkish peoples. Despite varied origin narratives, the shared trauma of deportation serves as a collective touchstone passed down through storytelling and post-memory. Collective trauma is transmitted across generations through stories and shapes the identity of those who did not directly live through the traumatic events themselves. It is an imaginative, creative memory defined by distance from the original events. The paper situates these multifaceted memories and identities within theoretical frameworks on cultural trauma, narrative construction of history, and the complexity of lived versus recorded pasts.

Keywords: meskhetians, ethnic identity, memory, trauma, deportation, narratives, history, post-memory.

I. Introduction

The complex historical narratives and collective memories surrounding the ethnic origins and identity of the deported Meskhetian people have been a subject of scholarly debate. There are two primary perspectives on the Meskhetians' roots: one argues for their Georgian ethnic origins, while the other traces their lineage to Turkish tribes like the Kipchaks. The postmodern critique of historical objectivity emphasizes how diverse interpretations of the past are shaped by sociopolitical contexts and the subjectivity of historians. Drawing on theorists such as Foucault, Derrida, Lotman, and Halbwachs, it is visible how the shared trauma of deportation and its intergenerational transmission through post-memory have become integral to Meskhetian identity formation. The heterogeneity of Meskhetians' historical recollections and the role of individual and collective memory in shaping ethnic identity are also crucial aspects to consider. Accordingly, this is what the hypothesis looks like: The complex interplay between collective memory, historical narratives, and individual experiences shapes Meskhetian identity in a dynamic and multifaceted way. The shared trauma of deportation and its intergenerational transmission through various means serve as a unifying force, while the diversity of origin stories allows for personal adaptability in identity construction. Also, in this article I will try to answer the following questions:

How do the diverse historical narratives surrounding the origins of the deported Meskhetians influence their contemporary self-perceptions and ethnic identities?

To what extent do personal, familial, and collective memories of the 1944 deportation serve as a unifying cultural trauma that shapes Meskhetian identity across generations?

How do the processes of intergenerational transmission, such as post-memory and storytelling, enable younger generations of Meskhetians to internalize and perpetuate a sense of shared history and identity?

In what ways do the contested scholarly discourses attributing Meskhetian roots to either Georgian or Turkic peoples intersect with or diverge from the lived experiences and self-understandings of Meskhetians themselves?

Before delving into the provided research questions, it is tremendously important to refer to the historical background of the mentioned group also known as Meskhetian Turks having a complex history steeped in forced migration and displacement.

In 1944, during World War II, the Soviet regime under Joseph Stalin forcibly deported the entire Muslim Meskhetian population from their ancestral homeland in the Meskheti region of Georgia to remote areas of Central Asia, primarily Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan, and Kyrgyzstan. This mass deportation aligned with the Soviet government's broader policies of population transfers and coerced relocations.

As Martin explains, The Soviet leadership was already committed to ethnic resettlement in the 1920s to promote ethnic consolidation and the formation of national territories for each Soviet ethnic minority. There was a continuity between these earlier ethnic consolidation policies and the ethnic cleansing of the 1930s. Widespread ethnic hostility against certain diaspora nationalities, like Koreans, Germans, Finns, and Poles, led to harsh treatment of these groups during collectivization. This hostility from below contributed to the targeting of these ethnicities (Terry, 1998).

Most importantly, the Soviet belief in the political salience of ethnicity led to an attempt to exploit cross-border ethnic ties to project influence abroad (the

Author: e-mail: mtsereteli@ug.edu.ge

© 2024 Global Journals

"Piedmont Principle"- refers to the Soviet attempt to exploit cross-border ethnic ties to project influence abroad). However, Soviet ideological xenophobia also made these cross-border ties suspect. Once the Soviet leadership realized these ethnic ties could not be exploited to undermine neighboring countries, they turned to ethnic cleansing of the borderlands and ethnic terror against diaspora nationalities throughout the USSR. The Soviet xenophobia driving the cleansing was ideological rather than ethnic (Terry, 1998). Stalin's regime's ethnic cleansing was primarily motivated by extreme paranoia about the security and integrity of the Soviet Union, leading to the tragic mass deportation of entire nationalities deemed as potential threats. Economic exploitation of their labor was a secondary motivation (Pohl, 1999).

In their places of exile, the Meskhetian community faced adverse conditions and challenges in preserving their cultural and ethnic identities. After decades in diaspora, the estimated approximately 425,000 Meskhetians today reside globally in Russia, Central Asia, Georgia, Azerbaijan, Turkey, the United States and beyond. This broad geographic dispersal, originating from the 1944 deportation, complicates quantifying total population size, but scholarly estimates reliably place numbers in the several hundred thousand ranges. Overall, the Meskhetian case represents a significant global diaspora shaped by a history of forced removal from their Caucasian homeland.

The matter of Meskhetian repatriation represented an official commitment and obligation on the part of the Georgian Government. This responsibility was entrusted to the Georgian Government in 1999, coinciding with the country's accession to the European Council. Deliberations centered on the return of the 425,000 Deported Meskhetians to their native land. By this commitment, Georgia was mandated to enact pertinent legislation within two years, initiate the repatriation process within three years, and ultimately conclude the program within a twelve-year timeframe. Regrettably, the Georgian government could not meet these stipulated deadlines (Trieri, Tarkhan-Mouravi, Kilimniki, 2011). It was not until September 12, 2014, that the Georgian government passed a new law on repatriation (Government of Georgia 2014). Despite this legislative development, the issue remains unresolved and continues to be a susceptible matter, with a significant challenge arising from the perception of Meskhetians.

The focal point of their history lies in the region of Meskheti. Historical Meskheti includes the southwestern part of Georgia, the territories located in the Mtkvari and Chorokhi basins. To be more specific, these territories include Samtskhe, Javakheti, Kola-Artaan, Shavsheti, Erusheti, Klarjeti, Adjara, Imerkhevi, Tao and Sper (Lomsadze, 2000). Nowadays, a significant part of these territories is part of Turkey. The modern Samtskhe-Javakheti region occupies 10.7% of the territory of Georgia and it has 213,700 inhabitants (https://grass.org.ge/). Borders with the republics of Armenia and Turkey in the south. As always, Samtskhe-Javakheti belongs to multi-ethnic and multi-religious regions. Currently, in this region along with Georgians (43.35%) live Armenians (54.6%), Greeks (0.36%), Ossetians, Ukrainians, Russians, deported Meskhetians, etc. (1.37%), ethnic minorities (https://grass.org.ge/), of which Orthodox Christians make up 45.6% of the population, 40.3% belong to the Armenian Apostolate; Muslims 3.8%, - Other 10.3% (https://www.citypopulation.de/).

II. Methodology

In this study, I used qualitative research methods. Semi-structured interview forms provided us with enough data on this subject. The initial phase involved the identification of markers and factors relevant to the research question, which were thoroughly validated throughout the research process. Among the identified markers and factors, the role of memory in shaping ethnic identity emerged as one of the most significant. These identified markers and factors were then subjected to rigorous examination and analysis within the framework of relevant theories.

To gather and analyze data, a triangulation approach was employed, enhancing the study's scientific rigor. This approach entails a comprehensive examination of the issue, utilizing multiple methods to gain a profound understanding of the experiences connected to the deportation event, with a specific emphasis on the older generation residing in the Samtskhe Javakheti region.

By employing the micro-history method, I explored the intricacies of the deportation event, striving to capture the firsthand accounts, recollections, and interpretations of this historical occurrence by the older people.

Conducting biographical-narrative interviews with second-generation participants enabled me to document and examine their experiences as displaced individuals, illuminating their challenges they encountered, such as discrimination and the intricacies of living without a homeland.

To comprehend the broader social dynamics and interactions between deported Meskhetians and local, embedded interviews were conducted in an immersive setting to investigate the community's lived experiences.

Moreover, a life history analysis was performed to track the life trajectory of the deported Meskhetians over time, portraying their experiences and intra-group personal challenges.

The research design integrated a comparative analysis of data acquired from different target groups, utilizing the comparative method. This approach

© 2024 Global Journals

facilitated the correlation of observed differences with varied experiences and historical memories, contributing to a nuanced understanding of the deportation act's impact on diverse generations and communities.

The study includes interviews with repatriated Meskhetians who returned to Georgia from the 1990s to the present and members of the local community living in these villages. Each village yielded an average of 6-7 interviews, with 44 respondents across all sites. Among the 44 interviewees, 14 were repatriated Meskhetians, and the remaining 30 were members of the local community (Gudushauri & Tsereteli, 2024).

"A total of 44 interviews were categorized as follows:

- Indigenous Local Population (18).
- Deported Meskhetians (14)
- A portion of the Local Population who settled in these areas during the 1950s (9).
- Local Ethnic Minorities - Armenians (3).

The respondents were stratified into three distinct age cohorts:

- Youth cohort (ages 13-30): n=14, comprising 50% female participants.
- Middle-aged adults (ages 31-60): n=20, with an equal representation of 50% female
- respondents.
- Elderly cohort (ages 61 and above): n=10, maintaining a balanced distribution of 50% female participants." (Gudushauri & Tsereteli, 2024).

The selection of villages and respondents was systematically aligned with the resettlement areas of the deported Meskhetians. The primary focus was investigating individuals living in villages that housed repatriated Meskhetians. Also, to understand the local population's perspectives, I recorded interviews in villages that did not host deported Meskhetians, such as Ude and Aral. This approach allowed us to compare and analyze empirical data collected from different village settings, facilitating a comparative study.

The recorded interviews ranged from half an hour to an extensive three hours, depending on the level of openness and trust demonstrated by each respondent. This allowed for a natural exploration of their experiences and perspectives. Following the interviews, content and thematic analyses were conducted as the final stage of the research methodology (Gudushauri & Tsereteli, 2024).

a) Origin of deported Meskhetians - scientific approaches

Scholarly debate persists regarding the origins of the deported Meskhetian people; however, two primary perspectives emerge from current academic literature. A cohort of scholars contends that the Meskhi constitute an ethnic Georgian population that adopted Islam over time due to historical exigencies associated with Ottoman military expansion into the region (Trier, 2011). Specifically, it is argued that after the Ottoman conquest of Georgia in 1578, systemic processes of Turkification and Islamization took hold, gradually transforming the Meskhetians into a Muslim minority within the empire (Trier, 2011).

In his 2013 work "Roots and the present-day existence of the Muslim Meskhetians," Georgian scholar Merab Beridze explores the complex history and identity of the Meskhetian people. He argues that "the issue of Meskhetians is more or less significant for all parts of Georgia", connecting them to ancient tribes like the Mushki and Moskhi as well as medieval Georgian cultural figures. After chronicling the Ottoman conquest of the Meskheti region in the late 16th century, Beridze asserts that "The population of Meskheti is entirely Georgian", emphasizing the Georgian ethnic roots of this group despite their later adoption of Islam. Through textual analysis of primary and secondary sources, Beridze situates the Meskhetians within a broader tradition of Georgian history and ethnography. His research illuminates questions of geography, religion, assimilation, and cultural hybridity concerning national identity (Beridze, 2013). In his 2013 article "Identity of Deported Meskhetians," Avtandil Jokhadze examines the resilience of Georgian identity among the Meskhetian people despite centuries under Ottoman rule. Through analysis of primary sources, Jokhadze argues that "On the path of Turkification the elite have not forgotten their Georgian origin and identity, nor they turned to Islam. From generation to generation, they kept the documents proving their noble and therefore Georgian origin". He contends that even after deportation from Georgia in 1944, "the ancient Meskhetian identity cannot organically merge with Turkish, American or any other identity. It can only coincide with the common Georgian political identity." Jokhadze's research provides an important perspective on the persistence of Georgian ethnic identity over time, even in the face of assimilation pressures. His work engages with themes of ethnicity, national identity, and the complex legacy of empires in the Caucasus region. Through close examination of Meskhetian social history, Jokhadze advances our understanding of how subjugated groups preserve cultural distinctiveness. In his scholarly publication titled "Meskhetians and Meskheti," Shota Lomsadze presents a comprehensive evaluation concerning the origins of the displaced Meskhetians. According to Lomsadze's analysis, he contends that the authentic Georgian population relocated from Southern Georgia in 1944. Furthermore, in the contemporary context, Lomsadze suggests that the dispossessed populace of Meskhetian Georgian Muslims has the potential to reestablish their customary way of life and rejuvenate their collective identity. This process, Lomsadze asserts, can exclusively transpire through a meticulously deliberated comprehension of national unity (Lomsadze, 2000).

© 2024 Global Journals

An alternative perspective posited by a different faction of scholars, exemplified by non-Georgian researchers Aydıngün and Mirkhanova, diverges from the Georgian scientific position. They propose that the inhabitants of Meskheti trace their lineage to the Huns (Mirkhanova, 2006) the Bun-Turks and Kipchaks, who manifested in the Caucasus during the 2nd century BC. According to this interpretation, the Kipchaks played a pivotal role in shaping the Turkish identity of the displaced Meskhetians, and the enduring presence of the Ottoman Empire in Meskhet-Javakheti amalgamated all Turkish components into a novel construct. Consequently, they regard the "Turkish Meskhetians" as an integral facet of this novel amalgamation (Aydıngün, 2010 / Çınar, 2020). In support of this perspective, it is contended that there exist no substantial ethno-cultural differences between the Muslim populace of Meskhetia and the Turks residing in Eastern Anatolia, Turkey (Trier, 2011). This standpoint has found concurrence and further elaboration from scholars such as Tomlinson and Osipov, who regard Georgia as a region characterized by the uninterrupted settlement of Turks (Janiashvili, 2013).

b) *Narratives regarding the ethnic origin of the deported Meskhetians (memory, perception and interpretation of history)*

The historical narratives about the deported Meskhetians have been subject to diverse interpretations within the scholarly discourse and among the community. Nevertheless, amid these multifaceted perspectives, certain elements and events persist as common threads that unify the deported Meskhetians. Consequently, individual, collective, and historical memory are pivotal factors in shaping and preserving their ethnic identity.

Postmodern perspectives on history contend that historical realities are socio-cultural "constructions" rather than truthful narratives (Postmodern History). Foucault acknowledged the fictional aspects of his writings yet maintained they could still function as truth by reflecting political realities (Foucault, 1980). In the case of the deported Meskhetians, certain events like their 1944 deportation, the 1989 Ferghana tragedy, and their 1999 consideration for repatriation by the Council of Europe constitute knowable historical realities. However, attempts to illustrate causes, motives, and non-implementation surrounding these events remain open to subjective interpretation rather than verifiable truthful narratives. Concerning all the facts mentioned above, there are different and often contradictory narratives created in different socio-cultural environments and historical periods. Consequently, these historical narratives are also differently understood by the deported Meskhetians themselves, which makes the basis for a specific historical event to serve as a unifier. However, the existing historical narrative about this event may determine different self-perceptions on the part of the group members. So, in my opinion, the act of deportation functioned as a unifying factor among the Meskhetians; however, the diversity of narratives about the origins of the deported Meskhetians contributed to the development of different self-perceptions within their community.

Michel Foucault contends that truth and knowledge are constructed representations that serve the purpose of convincing others, rather than necessarily corresponding to an objective reality. He posits that the production of knowledge and historical accounts can be seen as instruments of power, often tied to the formation of specific ideologies. From this perspective, knowledge is viewed as a exerting influence over various groups (Foucault, 1980).

In the context of the historical narratives regarding the origin of the Deported Meskhetians, these narratives can be seen as constructed representations, depending on the perspective from which they are examined. Scholars have presented varying theories about the Deported Meskhetians' origins, attributing their lineage to the Kipchags and Bun-Turks, as well as the “Mushks” and “Moskhes.” While these narratives may not entirely align with objective historical reality, they do encapsulate a form of knowledge and truth.

Furthermore, this knowledge has had a profound impact on those interested in the origin of the deported Meskhetians and exerted influence on them. It is worth noting that these historical narratives, often complex and nuanced, are typically not casually discussed by the general populace. Many may simply identify themselves as descendants of Turks or Georgians, simplifying the matter in their everyday conversations.

In the context mentioned above, the perspective of postmodernism (Postmodern History) presents an intriguing viewpoint worth considering. postmodernists (Postmodern History) contend that historians often serve as "activists" rather than impartial chroniclers of the past. They posit that historical research is not merely an endeavor to comprehend past, but a tool of propaganda wielded in the complex arena of contemporary political and social power struggles. This viewpoint underscores the inevitability of bias creeping into historical narratives, as historians may be driven to manipulate and modify facts to reinforce specific messages or agendas.

When investigating the history of the deported Meskhetians, it becomes evident that various authors and works have been instrumental in shaping and presenting the historical narrative. This is particularly conspicuous when considering the origin of the Meskhetians, as it is depicted from multiple perspectives, including that of a Georgian researcher, a Turkish researcher, and an ostensibly "impartial" foreign researcher. Each of these perspectives is logical.

© 2024 Global Journals

As a researcher, one may earnestly aspire to maintain objectivity and neutrality. Yet, how one formulates their opinion and constructs the narrative invariably reflects their position. For instance, from a Georgian researcher's standpoint, Samtskhe-Javakheti is portrayed as liberated from an invader. Conversely, the Turkish researcher's perspective emphasizes the territorial loss suffered by the Ottoman Empire, presenting a different facet of the same historical event. Meanwhile, a particular foreign researcher adopts a detached stance regarding the region as a border area that has intermittently come under the dominion of various nations. In this view, both Turks and Georgians are seen as integral to the historical fabric of the territory, transcending the binary notions of liberation or loss. The conscientious researcher must acknowledge that their most rigorous attempts at being objective will fail because of the inherent subjectivity. Regardless of the researcher's earnest endeavors to present a comprehensive and impartial overview of the positions found in the body of scientific literature, their perspective, as a specific researcher, inevitably exerts an influence on the text they produce.

On the one hand, this can be construed as an endeavor to offer a multi-perspective examination of the issue, but on the other hand, it may contain the danger of instrumentalizing history/the past for certain political purposes. However, it is essential to acknowledge that, given the particularities of the subject matter, this approach may carry the inherent risk of instrumentalizing history or the past for specific political objectives. In this way, it becomes evident that the researcher's role, while striving for objectivity, is not entirely divorced from the broader sociopolitical context in which they operate. This recognition underscores the need for critical self-awareness and ethical considerations in the pursuit of historical research and narrative construction. While engaging with multiple perspectives can enrich historical analysis, the inherent subjectivity of interpretation underscores the need for reflexivity in narrative construction as The French philosopher Jacques Derrida generally argued that texts are open to multiple interpretations and their meaning is never fully fixed or decidable. He challenges the idea of a single definitive meaning, seeing meaning as plural and shifting. Texts are too unstable and multi-determined to be decisively "concluded" through logical critique (Derrida, 1976).

Modern theories of time and cultural models acknowledge that interpretations of the past are shaped not only by examining different perspectives but also by recognizing that groups can have substantively different pasts. As Yuri Lotman argues, unified cultural groups still construct diverse "models of the past" based on their unique pre-histories (Lotman, 2019). This insight is relevant when analyzing the case of deported Meskhetians. While sharing the common trauma of forced removal, their pre-deportation histories were varied. For Lotman, future-oriented goals and plans are closely tied to one's formulated past. Thus, in the Meskhetian case, differing visions of the future likely contributed to the divergent narratives about the past that took hold. Situating the problem within this theoretical frame illuminates how teleology shaped the opposing interpretations of history among the deported population.

As Lotman theorizes, imagined future trajectories can shape constructed narratives of the past (Lotman, 2019). In the case of the deported Meskhetians, some scholars and politicians may have artificially projected a homogeneous group identity back in time to serve nationalist agendas, whether Georgian or Turkish. However, research confirms, that the actual pre-deportation histories and memories are heterogeneous. In my opinion, Individuals choose interpretations based on their individual and collective memories. Collective memory provides groups with orienting narratives and cognitive maps, allowing members to locate themselves in time and space (Eiermann, 2019). For the Deported Meskhetians, historical memory determined the individual memory, which allowed them to identify as either Turk or Georgian. However, the collective memory, which is based on the deportation act, unified them as Deported Meskhetians/Ahiska Turks.

Traumatic events can have a profound and lasting impact on individual and collective memory. As Jang Wang theorizes, when a group undergoes a terrible shared experience like deportation, it leaves an indelible imprint on their consciousness (Wang, 2018). The trauma fundamentally alters their ideology and identity in irreversible ways. Not every member needs to directly suffer the event for it to become seminal in the group's narrative and self-conception. At some point after the initial cultural trauma, knowledge of the precipitating injury spreads widely through the population. The painful event is enshrined as a pivotal touchstone in the collective memory. It comes to define the group and replace previous self-understandings. Though emerging initially from lived experience, the trauma memory takes on mythic significance over time. This describes how Meskhetian deportation became integral to divergent narratives of communal identity.

In the case of a heterogenous community of deported Meskhetians, the trauma served as a unifying force, bringing together all the Muslim Meskhetians who were exiled from the Samtskhe-Javakheti region. The profound impact of the deportation trauma became such a powerful, cohesive element that it maintained its practical role as a group unifier, transcending generations. The shared experience of displacement and the collective memory of this traumatic event continued to shape the identity and solidarity of the Deported Meskhetian community. This enduring legacy of the deportation trauma highlights its significance as a

© 2024 Global Journals

defining moment in the history and social fabric of the Muslim Meskhetians in Samtskhe-Javakheti.

One of my respondents, a 35-year-old woman from Mugareti, provided an illustrative example of the thoroughness with which some Meskhetians recount their family and group history, despite having limited direct knowledge or memories of the details. The respondent sincerely tried to recount everything she knew about her family's experiences and her husband's family history, she spoke as if she had lived through it all herself. Yet in terms of factual details, she admitted having little memory, knowing only that they were deported under Stalin but believed to give me detailed information about suffering. According to Halbwachs, indirect stimulation, such as listening to others' stories, is often needed to shape historical memory (Halbwachs, 1992).

The respondent then shares the specific story of her husband's family's multiple migrations between Uzbekistan, their village in Georgia, Azerbaijan, and settling in Mugareti. She notes that her husband does not remember this history, but his older sister shared details that shaped the respondent's collective memory, such as locals shouting at them to leave. The respondent displays a tendency common among those traumatized - shaping a narrative in solely tragic terms, even when her actual experiences, such as arriving in Georgia, were more complex. She expresses pain at being labeled "Tatar,"(undeveloped ruthless Muslim) which demonstrates the lack of understanding of Meskhetian Turk identity among locals. With no information from elders in her family, her knowledge of her own history is limited, knowing only her ancestral village and origin like Meskhetian Turk. This exemplifies the importance of individual, collective, and historical memory in the process of shaping and protecting ethnic identity.

The intergenerational transmission of trauma through post-memory is exemplified in my second respondent's family history. Despite having limited direct knowledge of the events, my respondent, a 60-year-old Muslim Georgian man from Akhaltsikhe, feels deeply connected to his family's complex religious conversion and the deportation of Meskhetian Turks. As Marianne Hirsch notes, post-memory allows later generations to experience trauma they did not directly witness, often through stories, images, behaviors, and effects passed down within the family (Hirsch, 2008). While my respondent does not remember details, discussing identity was common in his family. He sees the deportation as a tragedy not just for his family but for all affected, calling it "an abnormal story" and Moscow's plan against Georgia's will. Yet he considers himself a "native Georgian," having learned the language upon returning to Georgia. His narrative illustrates how fragmented memories and emotions can powerfully shape post-memorial identities and connections to the past. Situating his story in Hirsch's theoretical framework illuminates how post-memory operates through transgenerational transmission of unspoken trauma. In contemporary times, we Meskhetians consider ourselves as Georgians, an identity we have held for an extended period. Our parents instilled in us our Georgian heritage; they conversed in Georgian at home, particularly when they wished to discussing matters discreetly. For instance, when I converse with my elders, especially my grandmother, she recounts stories of singing in Georgian or collective praying and incantations in Georgian when someone fell ill. During meals, she would request items in Georgian, saying “pass me the sour milk, pass me the water,” which is how we acquired knowledge of the Georgian language. My mother’s native tongue is Georgian, though I am not as proficient and only know some fundamental phrases, such as “How are you?” “Where are you from?,” and “Where are you going?” We continue to use the Georgian word “uime” today. When deciding what to prepare for a meal, we say “mchadi/tskali/ghomi (food names, such es water etc.)” in Georgian - to enunciate these words accurately requires a Georgian spirit, an inherent gene we have retained. There is an ancient Meskhetian word “anko” that Queen Tamar and Shota Rustaveli spoke. Through my reading of our history 30 years ago, I learned that 300 years ago, Turkey vanquished Meskheti and forced the conversion of people to Islam, after which we adopted the Turkish language. This background informs our present-day Georgian identity.

My next respondent (girl / 18 years old / Akhaltsikhe) is interested in a way that she is very young.

> “My grandparents were born here, but when they were ten years old, Stalin deported them to Azerbaijan. In 2009, my family and I moved back here, and I attended school starting in first grade. I do not possess a Georgian passport but rather hold Azerbaijani citizenship. Life is quite good, including relationships with neighbors; my Georgian neighbors are Aunt Nina and Leila, and I have Armenian friends as well. Attending university has proven challenging without Georgian citizenship, as I cannot obtain a school-leaving certificate. For this reason, I left school after ninth grade when I was 18 years old and unmarried.”

From these interviews we can see how historical narratives, collective memories, and intergenerational transmission shape the ethnic identities and self-perceptions of deported Meskhetians. The diverse origins of the Meskhetians, which are subject to scholarly debate, influence their contemporary identities in complex ways. Some emphasize their Turkish roots, while others identify strongly as Georgian Muslims. These competing historical narratives provide different identity frameworks that Meskhetians navigate.

However, despite these diverse origin stories, the collective trauma of the 1944 deportation serves as

© 2024 Global Journals

a unifying experience that profoundly shapes Meskhetian identity across generations. The interviews demonstrate how even those with limited direct memories of the deportation internalize it as a defining collective tragedy. Recounting family histories of suffering and migration is a common way Meskhetians assert their identity and connect to a shared past.

Significantly, younger generations of Meskhetians, who did not directly experience the deportation, still strongly identify with this historical trauma through processes of intergenerational transmission such as post-memory and storytelling within families. The interviews show how traumatic memories, and a sense of lost homeland are passed down, even when details are fragmented or vague. Older relatives' stories, told in both Georgian and Turkish, become embedded in younger Meskhetians' identity formation.

The concept of post-memory (Hirsch, 2008) is particularly relevant here, as later generations internalize the traumatic experiences of their elders almost as personal memories, powerfully shaping their sense of history and identity. Retelling stories of deportation within families, even when details are lost, perpetuates Meskhetian identity. This is exemplified by the 18-year-old respondent, whose grandparents' experiences define her sense of Meskhetian heritage.

In summary, while diverse origin narratives complicate Meskhetian identity, the 1944 deportation serves as a profound unifying cultural trauma. Collective memories of this tragedy, transmitted intergenerationally through stories and post-memory, are central to perpetuating a sense of distinctive Meskhetian identity and connection to a lost homeland. Oral history and storytelling become keyways Meskhetians assert their identity across generations.

III. Conclusion

This research has delved into the intricate interplay between personal and collective memory in shaping the ethnic identity constructions of deported Meskhetians living in Georgia's Samtskhe-Javakheti region. By analyzing in-depth biographical interviews through key theoretical lenses, the study illuminates the complex role of narrative, post-memory, and cultural trauma in transmitting historical imaginaries across generations.

The findings underscore several critical points. Firstly, the repeated evictions and resettlements experienced by the Meskhetian population have created a "mythical-real" history that permeates their collective consciousness. Secondly, the diverse self-perceptions among deported/repatriated Meskhs lead to different interpretations of the past, which are reflected in their narratives and, consequently, shape their future aspirations. Thirdly, these varying interpretations are perceived differently by academic and political circles, the local population, and the repatriates themselves. Finally, the choice to believe in any of these interpretations is influenced by both individual and collective memory.

The ethnographic findings highlight the heterogeneity of historical recollections among Meskhetians, revealing the constructed and fluid nature of their past. The research also elucidates how the indirect transmission of trauma memory through familial storytelling and commemoration enables a form of post-memory, allowing younger generations to internalize cultural trauma. Moreover, the juxtaposition of narrative typologies provides theoretical insight into the interrelationship between recorded history and lived recollection in producing of ethnic imaginaries.

Despite its contributions, the study has some limitations. The tight geographic focus on a specific region in Georgia precludes capturing diversity across the global Meskhetian diaspora. Further research among Meskhetian communities in Central Asia, Russia, and beyond could reveal divergences and provide a more comprehensive understanding of the complexities of memory and identity formation within this diasporic community.

Bibliography

1. Beridze, M. (2013). Origins of Muslim Meskhetians, Akhaltsikhe. 16-17
2. Çınar, İ. (2020). Educational results of an exile: The Ahiska Turks. International Online Journal of Education and Teaching (IOJET), 7(4). 1603-1633 – http://iojet.org/index.php/IOJET/article/view/1075
3. Derrida, J. (1976). *Of Grammatology*, The Johns Hopkins University Press, pp. 72-74
4. Eyerman, R. (2019). *Memory, Trauma, and Identity*, Switzerland. 24
5. Foucault, M. (1980). *POWER/KNOWLEDGE Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977*, New York, Pantheon Books. 193
6. Gudushauri, T., & Tsereteli, M. (2024). The Pivotal Significance of Sociocultural Demarcations in Shaping and Upholding the Ethnic Identity of the Deported Meskhetians (Exemplified in the Context of South Georgia). Journal of Advanced Research in Social Sciences, 7(1): 41-51. https://doi.org/10.33422/jarss.v7i1.1176
7. Halbwachs, M. (1992). *On Collective Memory*, Chicago press, P. 24
8. Hirsch, M. (2008). The Generation of Post memory, Duke University Press, PP. 103; 125 https://doi.org/10.1080/13602000600738640
9. Janiashvili, L. (2013). Deported Meskhetians – past and the present, Tbilisi, p. 64
10. Jokhadze, A. (2013). Deported Meskhetians – past and the present, Tbilisi, p. 25

© 2024 Global Journals

11. Lomsadze, Sh. (2000). Meskhetians and Meskhs, Tbilisi, „Open society - Georgia". 66
12. Lotman, J. (2019). *Culture, Memory and History (essays in cultural semiotics),* Switzerland. 258-262
13. Martin, T. (1998).*The origins of Soviet ethnic cleansing, Journal of Modern History 70, no. 4,* pp. 813-861.
14. Mirkhanova, M. (2006). People in exile: The oral history of Meskhetian Turks (Akhyskha
15. Turkleri. Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs. 26 (1): 33–44). https://doi.org/10.1080/13602000600738640
16. Pohl, J. O. (1999). *Ethnic Cleansing in the USSR, 1937–1949,* GREENWOOD PRESS. 129-139
17. Trier, T., & Tarkhan-Mouravi, G., & Kilimnik, F. (2011). MESKHETIANS: HOMEWORD BOUND..., ECMI. 9-10
18. Wang, Z. (2018). *Memory Politics, Identity and Conflict,* Switzerland.15-17
19. AYDINGÜN, A. & AYDINGÜN, I. (2014). *AHISKA TÜRKLERİ ULUSÖTESİ BİR TOPLULUK ULUSÖTESİ AİLELER,* ANKARA p. 36
20. Postmodern History, https://www.allaboutworldview.org/postmodern-history.htm, AllAboutWorldview.org, December 01, 2021
21. https://www.citypopulation.de/, December 01, 2021
22. Grass, https://grass.org.ge/, Grass, December 01, 2021

© 2024 Global Journals

Global Journal of human-social science: C
Sociology & Culture
Volume 24 Issue 5 Version 1.0 Year 2024
Type: Double Blind Peer Reviewed International Research Journal
Publisher: Global Journals
Online ISSN: 2249-460X & Print ISSN: 0975-587X

Cultural Echoes: Navigating the Legacy and Evolution of Bangla Musical Instruments or, Resonance through Time: A Journey into the History and Future of Bangla Musical Instruments

By Md. Anwar Hossain Mridha & Jakia Tasneem

Abstract- This research investigates the importance of musical instruments, emphasizing their role in expressing and preserving cultural identity. It highlights their significance in conveying emotions, playing ceremonial and ritualistic roles, fostering social cohesion, preserving traditions, contributing to global music fusion, impacting tourism, and holding symbolism and spirituality. The study then focuses on Bangladesh's rich history of musical instruments, exploring the diverse heritage and cultural expressions, aiming for a robust and credible exploration of the history and future of Bangla musical instruments. The researcher interviewed critical stakeholders, including artists, musicologists, lyricists, tuners, instrumentalists, and media personnel. A comprehensive literature review and the researcher's insider perspective from a government-owned radio organization provided additional insights. Structured and semi-structured interviews were used for primary data collection, employing qualitative analysis techniques.

GJHSS-C Classification: *LCC: ML3558.B3*

Strictly as per the compliance and regulations of:

© 2024. Md. Anwar Hossain Mridha & Jakia Tasneem. This research/review article is distributed under the terms of the Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0). You must give appropriate credit to authors and reference this article if parts of the article are reproduced in any manner. Applicable licensing terms are at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/.

Cultural Echoes: Navigating the Legacy and Evolution of Bangla Musical Instruments or, Resonance through Time: A Journey into the History and Future of Bangla Musical Instruments

Md. Anwar Hossain Mridha [α] & Jakia Tasneem [σ]

Abstract- This research investigates the importance of musical instruments, emphasizing their role in expressing and preserving cultural identity. It highlights their significance in conveying emotions, playing ceremonial and ritualistic roles, fostering social cohesion, preserving traditions, contributing to global music fusion, impacting tourism, and holding symbolism and spirituality. The study then focuses on Bangladesh's rich history of musical instruments, exploring the diverse heritage and cultural expressions, aiming for a robust and credible exploration of the history and future of Bangla musical instruments. The researcher interviewed critical stakeholders, including artists, musicologists, lyricists, tuners, instrumentalists, and media personnel. A comprehensive literature review and the researcher's insider perspective from a government-owned radio organization provided additional insights. Structured and semi-structured interviews were used for primary data collection, employing qualitative analysis techniques.

The result is fascinating. Half of the respondents believe Western musical instruments have increased in modern and folk music. Nearly all respondents think acoustic and electric musical instruments are used more in our country. The majority feel that using electric and Western musical instruments has positively changed Bengali music, and the majority believe Western instruments have influenced Bengali songs.

The research aims to explore the history and future of Bangla musical instruments, utilizing a triangulation approach for credibility. The study provides a holistic understanding of the multifaceted music industry landscape, incorporating diverse perspectives and sources. This artefact explores the journey of instrumental music in Bangladesh from ancient civilizations to the present. It traces the roots of musical instruments, details their evolution from simple percussion to complex string and wind instruments, and highlights their diverse roles in cultural identity, rituals, social bonding, emotional expression, communication, education, entertainment, and cross-cultural exchange. The article emphasizes musical instruments' integral role in shaping diverse societies and cultural, social, and emotional landscapes.

I. Introduction

Music is an essential element in the history of human civilization. It is yet to be known when the first musical instrument was invented, but our prehistoric archaeology found traces of musical instruments. As Dallman, L. (2022) explains, "No historical evidence exists to tell us exactly who sang the first song, or whistled the first tune, or made the first rhythmic sounds that resembled what we know today as music (Dallman, 2022)". Musical instruments are essential elements of music. They play an important role in developing and preserving cultural identity worldwide. They carry deep historical, social, and symbolic meanings in different cultures, just as they create the melody of music.

Furthermore, they often have deep historical, social, and symbolic meanings in different cultures. Globally, key issues such as cultural identity, emotional and narrative expression, ceremonial and ritual functions, social cohesion, heritage preservation, cultural globalization, a global fusion of musical styles, tourism and cultural exchange, symbolism, and spirituality highlight the importance of music in artistic expression. They are closely tied to the cultural identity of the community and society. They often reflect a particular population's unique traditions, values, customs, and a tangible representation of their heritage. In addition, various musical instruments express a wide range of emotions in the storyteller's historical context. Human beings started to play early musical instruments in the Neanderthal age (Turk et al., 2020, p. 1), which helps us understand music's importance for the world. In the present time, other than music, they are related to physics. To describe the relationship between Physics and Instruments, Tronchin (2020) explains, "The sound characteristics of musical instruments, as well as their vibrational behavior, represent one of the most important and fascinating fields of acoustics, or even of applied physics (Tronchin, 2020)."

The definition of a musical instrument is broad. It is defined as a device (such as a violin, piano, or Flute) used to produce music ("Musical Instrument," 2024). Grove's online dictionary states, "Musical instrument' is a self-explanatory term for an observer in his society; it is less easy to apply on a worldwide scale because the notion of music itself in such a broad context escapes definition (2008)." Musical instruments interact dialectically with surrounding physical and cultural realities, and as such, they perpetually negotiate or renegotiate their roles, physical structures, performance modes, sound ideals, and symbolic meanings (Racy, 1994, p. 38). Chadabe (2002) defines a musical instrument: "At the rightmost extreme, an in-

Author α: Director, Transcription Service, Bangladesh Betar, Dhaka, Bangladesh. e-mail: anwarhmridha@gmail.com
Author σ: Assistant Director, Transcription Service, Bangladesh Betar, Dhaka, Bangladesh.

© 2024 Global Journals

deterministic instrument outputs a substantial amount of unpredictable information relative to a performer's controls. In working with such an instrument, a performer shares control of the music with algorithms as virtual co-performers. The instrument generates unpredictable information to which the performer reacts, the performer generates control information to which the instrument reacts, and the performer and instrument seem to engage in a conversation. Interaction means 'mutually influential.' Since the performer's controls influence the instrument, and the instrument's output influences the performer, Chadabe called such instruments' interactive instruments' (Chadabe, 2002, p.2).

Group performance and communal music-making strengthen social bonds, promote a sense of belonging, and facilitate communication between individuals within a cultural context (Tarr et al., 2014; Klingelhoefer, n.d.). The use of traditional musical instruments helps preserve cultural traditions and practices. Passing down the knowledge of playing specific instruments from one generation to another ensures the continuity of cultural traditions. Whether it is a traditional Drum used in concerts, a string instrument carrying a sad melody, or a wind instrument expressing joy, musical instruments are powerful tools for emotional expression, and storytelling (Trendvin, 2023). Many cultures incorporate specific musical instruments into ceremonial and ritual practices. These instruments contribute to the sanctity of religious ceremonies, rites of passage, and other significant events, enhancing the cultural, and spiritual experience. They often play an essential role in fostering social cohesion within communities. They also act as cultural ambassadors, attracting tourists and facilitating cultural exchange. Traditional music performances and instrument crafts can become a source of economic and cultural exchange. Some musical instruments hold symbolic significance and are associated with spiritual beliefs (Chaudhuri N., 1973, pp. 14-27). The sounds produced by specific instruments are believed to have healing properties or connect individuals to the divine, reinforcing their role in cultural and religious contexts.

Bangladesh has a rich history of musical instruments as carriers of tradition, emotion, and artistic expression (Barua, Sneha, 2017). As Samit, A., and Ranjana S. (2022) say, "With a culture as rich and complex, the music made and delivered in Bengal is just about as rich and varied as others on the planet. From traditional to shake and society to reflection alongside a wide scope of feelings, anxiety, tension, love, holy and spiritual that goes inseparably with it, music in Bengal envelops and outperforms each sort (Samit & Ranjana, 2022)". The country boasts a rich and diverse history of musical instruments, serving as carriers of tradition, emotion, and creative expression. These instruments have played a crucial role (Observatoire du Mont-Mégantic, n.d.) in shaping the region's cultural fabric, reflecting the depth and diversity of its artistic heritage.

In the Indian subcontinent, the history of musical devices can be traced back to prehistoric times. Classical texts mention various instruments, such as the Natyashastra, a treatise on performing arts from the 2nd century BC. Indian classical music traditions, such as Hindustani (North Indian) and Carnatic (South Indian), have many traditional instruments. Instruments like sitar, Tabla, Sarod, Veena, and Mridangam have preserved and propagated classical musical forms for centuries. Indian musical instruments are known for expressing a wide range of emotions. The sitar, for example, can evoke deep emotion with its complex melodic patterns, while the Tabla, with its rhythmic complexity, adds different layers of expression to the music. Many Indian instruments carry cultural and religious significance. For example, the Veena is associated with the Hindu goddess Saraswati, the god of knowledge and arts. Shehnai is a traditional wind instrument often played during auspicious occasions and weddings. Musical traditions are characterized by regional diversity. Different regions and communities have various types of musical instruments. They essentially contribute to the mosaic of musical expression - for example, Sarangi percussion instruments (Ranjana, 2022)).

Traditional and modern musical instruments have heavily influenced the country's film music. The use of Flute, harmonium, and various percussion instruments is a defining element of the film score, adding emotional depth to the cinematic narrative. In contemporary times, there is a growing trend of fusion and experimentation with traditional instruments. Across the country and beyond, musicians blend classical instruments with modern genres, creating innovative sounds that resonate worldwide. Musical craft is an art form in this country. Master artisans carefully handcraft the Instrument, ensuring that each piece is a functional instrument for music and a work of art that reflects the region's cultural heritage (Malik, 1973, p. 218; Mitra, 1973, pp. 219-220).

The rich history of musical instruments in the Indian subcontinent is a testament to the region's cultural diversity and artistic legacy. These instruments symbolize tradition, passion, and creative expression, playing a fundamental role in shaping the country's musical landscape for centuries. Dandekar (2016) drew a captivating parallel between the instruments' melodies and the rivers' soulful songs. He eloquently described, "Rivers, definitely, but something more: a serenity, a lament, a contemplation. No chorus marred the beauty of this lonely questioning down the river. The notes were muted, starting with initial high notes, descending and meandering into low notes on which the songs were based" (Dandekar, 2016).

© 2024 Global Journals

This study explores the history and future of musical instruments in Bengali music, which resonates with cultural echoes in Bangladesh. A variety of Bangla songs are currently being combined with foreign musical instruments. This study also explores the thoughts of music managers, composers, lyricists, and directors.

II. Materials and Methods

Interviews were accompanied by different stakeholders in the music industry, comprising 20 renowned artists, 20 musicologists, 20 lyricists, 20 tuners, 20 music instrumentalists, and 20 media personnel. The selection of participants aims to provide comprehensive and multifaceted ideas and experiences for capturing diverse perspectives in music production. They can understand the music industry, incorporating various perspectives and expertise. A thorough exploration of existing knowledge was undertaken through an extensive literature review. It encompassed books, journals, articles, periodicals, and newspapers related to the subject matter. The literature review assisted as a basis for contextualizing the findings and discussions within the broader scope of the music industry. Having an established presence in a government-owned radio organization, the researcher leveraged personal observations gained through years of experience within the industry. This insider perspective provided nuanced insights into the music scene's day-to-day workings, challenges, and dynamics. These observations contribute a practical dimension to the study, complementing the theoretical framework.

Structured and semi-structured consultations were employed to collect primary data from the selected participants. Open-ended questions were considered to reassure participants to share their experiences, opinions, and insights. The interviews were conducted in person or through virtual platforms, ensuring flexibility and convenience for the participants. Qualitative facts study methods were smeared to the interview transcripts, incorporating thematic coding and content analysis. This systematic approach facilitated the identification of recurring patterns, key themes, and divergent viewpoints, enriching the depth of the study.

Moral strategies and principles were strictly followed throughout the research practice. Knowledgeable consent has been obtained from all people, ensuring their intended contribution and concealment. It involved cross-verifying information from discussions with insights from the literature review and personal observations.

This study combines diverse data sources and methodological approaches to comprehensively and robustly understand the music industry's multifaceted landscape.

III. Journey of Musical Instrument from Ancient Times to Date

It is believed that before people spoke, their voices had melody. Humans could make and play musical instruments using natural materials. Musical instruments in Bangladesh have a mysterious history. The glorious experience of musical instruments in Bangladesh is described below.

a) Musical instruments in ancient civilizations

Musical instruments have roots in ancient civilizations. Numerous archaeological finds and texts provide evidence of these instruments. Ancient cultures, including ancient civilizations such as Mesopotamia, Egypt, China, and the Indus Valley, developed a variety of instruments, laying the foundation for the global musical tradition as we know it today. These instruments served cultural, religious, and social purposes, reflecting the creativity and ingenuity of early civilizations in expressing emotions and traditions through music.

Encyclopaedia Britannica explains, "Musical instruments are almost universal components of human culture: archaeology has revealed pipes and whistles in the Paleolithic Period and clay Drums and shell trumpets in the Neolithic period. It has been firmly established that the ancient city cultures of Mesopotamia, the Mediterranean, India, East Asia, and the Americas all possessed diverse and well-developed assortments of musical instruments, indicating that a long previous development must have existed. However, there can be only conjecture as to the origin of musical instruments. Some scholars have speculated that the first instruments were derived from such utilitarian objects as cooking pots (Drums) and hunting bows (musical bows); others have argued that instruments of music might well have preceded pots and bows, while in the myth of cultures throughout the world, the origin of music has frequently been attributed to the gods, especially in areas where the music seems to have been regarded as an essential component of the ritual believed necessary for spiritual survival (Westrup & Grame, 2024)." Musical Instruments produce melodic sounds and may accompany vocal music.

Here are some examples of musical instruments from ancient civilizations.

i. Mesopotamia - lyre - a small harp-like stringed instrument widely used in ancient Mesopotamian art. Drums- Various drums, including cylindrical and frame drums, are often played during religious ceremonies and festive events.

ii. Egyptian sistrum—a metal rattling instrument with a U-shaped frame and metal crossbar, used in religious ceremonies and associated with the goddess Hathor. The Oud (Lute)—an early precursor to the Guitar, with a pear-shaped body

© 2024 Global Journals

and fretless neck, commonly played in ancient Egyptian music.

iii. In China, the guqin- a seven-stringed zither with a history dating back more than 3,000 years is often associated with scholarly and contemplative pursuits (Yan, A., 2018). Moreover, Bianzhong- a set of framed bronze bells used in ceremonial music during the Zhou dynasty.

iv. In the Indus Valley, Harappan Seal Instruments - Archaeological findings indicate images of musicians playing instruments such as Drums, Flutes, and stringed instruments on ancient Harappan seals. In the Indian subcontinent, archaeological excavations and ancient texts reveal a highly developed musical culture. The use of the banshi or venu, veena, and mridanga was known to the Indus-Valley Civilization. Apart from the vina, the Vedas refer to other instruments such as the dundubhi and bhumi-dundubhi (*Musical Instruments - Banglapedia*, n.d.).

These examples demonstrate the diversity of musical instruments across different ancient civilizations, highlighting their role in religious rituals, cultural events, and everyday life.

b) Musical instruments in the Medieval Age

Describing the Middle Ages, our country has plenty of famous musicians. The Middle Ages saw a mixture of Hindu and Islamic trends when the musical tradition was formalized under the patronage of the Muslim king, sultan, and Nawabs and the powerful Twelve Landlords known as 'baro bhuiyans' (Music of Bengal, 2024). Women were also vibrant Among the musicians. Srivastava, S. K. (1953) says, "In middle age, a middle-aged women's concert featured an accomplished female tantric instrumentalist where four female musicians played the Flute (Srivastava, S. K. 1953)."

Describing the continuous development of musical instruments, Chowdhury, Abul Hasan (2017) says, "Seven tones developed one by one in the Vedic period or earlier. At that time, most Tantra instruments were called veena. Considerably, music has evolved as we move past the Vedic age and into the Gandharva age. Musical instruments have also evolved considerably. Activities such as musical instrument making, playing styles, and various musical instruments show remarkable progress. As folk music has evolved, folk songs have evolved in their way. We have seen that different tribal communities have different styles of music and different types of musical instruments. Their shape, playing style, and sound beauty differ in many respects (Chowdhury, A. H. 2017)." "Many Persian musical instruments arrived in the Middle Ages. Exposure to Indian musical instruments changed them. Under the patronage of the emperors, the practice of music increased a lot. Hazrat Amir Khusrau was one of the greatest musicians of his time. He was a scholar and musician, a disciple of Nizam-ud-din Aulia (1253–1325), and in Sultan Alauddin Khilji's court, who ruled from 1296 to 1316. He is the pioneer of Kheyal-Gan (Chowdhury, 2017)."

It is marked that in the Middle Ages, Mughal emperors patronage music. Schofield, K.R., (2003) discovers, "For several years after this alleged episode, the official Mughal chronicler recorded male and female instrumentalists and dancers dominating the anniversary celebrations of Aurangzeb's coronation, including Rabab, Tanbur and Flute players, and the emperor's notable bestowal of 7000 rupees on his principal musician, Khushal Khan Kalawant. Several classical (dhrupad) composed in Aurangzeb's honor still preserved in oral and written forms bear witness to his active involvement as a patron of music (Schofield, K.R., 2003)". The last segment on this journey of musical instruments would be the idiophonic or autophonic instruments. These types of instruments produce sound without any strings or membranes. The entire instrument body is used to produce sound. These instruments are used mainly to keep pace and add a unique dimension of sounds to the other main instruments in a performance (Iris, Farhana, 2019).

c) Evolution from simple percussion to complex string and wind instruments

The evolution of musical instruments from simple percussion to complex string and wind instruments is a fascinating journey spanning thousands of years. This progress reflects the ingenuity of human creativity and the desire to explore and expand sound possibilities. As illustrated in Britannica, "Conventional Western thinking claimed that the earliest instruments were slightly modified natural objects such as bones, shells, or gourds. They played only one pitch and then evolved into more complex forms. However, it appears that bone Flutes from Neanderthal caves had finger holes. Recent archaeological finds in China included bone Flutes from 7000 BC that not only have seven finger holes but an additional aperture that may have been drilled to correct a poorly placed hole (Westrup & Grame, 2024) (*Musical Instrument | History, Characteristics, Examples, & Facts*, 2024)."

Here is a brief exploration of this evolution: i) Drums became prominent as civilization progressed. Various types of Drums, including frame drums, hand drums, and membranophones, were used for communication, ritual, and emotional expression. Drumming was essential in early society for both practical and ceremonial purposes. ii) Percussion instruments appeared early in the development of musical instruments. Simple handheld objects, such as rocks and logs, can create rhythmic sounds when struck together, which lays the foundation for rhythm in music.

© 2024 Global Journals

iii) The invention of the bow allowed the creation of stringed instruments, as seen in the development of bowed lyres and reeds. The bow enables sustained and harmonic sounds, expanding the range of musical expression. Moreover, Plucked Strings: The invention of plucked string instruments like the harp and the lute marked another significant leap. These instruments allow for complex melodies and harmonies, providing a more nuanced musical experience. iv) Using reeds in wind instruments introduced a new dimension. Single-reed and double-reed instruments, such as the Clarinet and oboe, emerged, allowing greater control over pitch and tonal quality. v) Early wind instruments were probably hollow natural objects such as animal horns, conch shells, and bamboo tubes. Musicians discovered that varying the length and shape of these tubes produced different pitches. vi) The development of the Flute involves the formation of tubes through finger holes. Bone and wood Flutes appeared in many cultures, producing tunes by controlling breathing and finger placement. vii) Innovations in keyboard instruments, such as the clavichord and harpsichord, allow for precise control of pitch and dynamics. These instruments paved the way for the further development of the piano. viii) The piano revolutionized music with strings activated by its hammer and keys (Powers, W. 2000, Tyler, J. 2002, Tyler, J. & Paul S. 2002, Chaudhuri, N., 1973b).

d) Bengali musical instruments

Traditional Bengali music is characterized by various musical instruments contributing to the region's cultural heritage. Ranjana, S. (2022) states, "Traditionally, musical instruments in Bengal are categorized into four types, based totally/partially on the material of which they may be made and partly within how they are played. Thus, they will be categorized as string, wind, metal, and disguised devices. Instruments like the Sitar, Sarod, Esraj, Surbahar, Tanpura, Dilruba, and Veena, which produce music through strings, are known as string devices. Instruments like the Flute and Shahnai, which might be performed by blowing, are known as wind Instruments. Metal units, together with Mandira and Kartal, produce sounds by hanging the metal body of the device. Percussion contraptions, including Tabla-banya, Dhol, Khol, Madal, and so on, are called disguise instruments because of animal pores and skin usage in making those instruments (Ranjana, S. 2022; jEducate, 2023)." These traditional instruments contribute to the region's distinctive soundscape. Tofa, Nazrul Islam (2019) argues about culture and folk musical instruments, "In the continuation of human civilization, the history of folk musical instruments is full of tradition, from the prehistoric era through the modern era, as if in the continuity of time, after many transformation cycles, many folk musical instruments have been embellished by the hands of rural people. So, people in every sphere of culture are enlivening rural events using totality (Tofa, 2019).

e) Historical Context of Musical Instrument in Bangladesh

With its rich cultural and historical heritage, Bangladesh has a diverse musical tradition deeply intertwined with its social, religious, and historical context. Musical instruments in Bangladesh are essential in expressing the people's cultural identity. Some key points outline the cultural and historical context of instruments in Bangladesh, such as folk instruments like Dotara, Flute, Drum, etc. Regarding folk instruments, Tofa, N. I. (2019) says, "Today's rural people's music or musical instruments are all folk instruments based on roots. They are Dug Duggi, Dugi Tabla, Jinjhani, Drum, Site Drum, Fulot, Cornet, Kongo, and modern-day instrument Casio. These are inextricably linked with today's folk culture (Tofa, 2019)." Classical Musical Instruments: Sitar, Sarod, Tabla. Tabola adds rhythmic intricacy and complexity to both classical and semi-classical performances. The Bengal Renaissance of the 19th and early 20th centuries profoundly influenced and revived the region's cultural and intellectual life, including Western instruments. With the advent and subsequent influence of colonial rule, Western musical instruments, such as the Piano, Guitar, and Violin, were introduced and integrated into the musical landscape of Bangladesh. This combination has led to the creation of contemporary and popular music genres. Some are central to various cultural and spiritual celebrations, such as weddings, festivals, and religious demonstrations. With its mystical and devotional nature, Sufi music has also left its mark on the musical culture of Bangladesh. Instruments such as harmonium and daf (frame Drum) are commonly used in Sufi musical expression.

We learned about different aspects of musical instruments in ancient and medieval literature, such as Charyagiti, Mangalkavya, Punthisahitya, and other scripts and books. Charyagiti is a type of song with two meanings: verbal and theoretical. Regarding material data, we find 12 different types of folk instruments. Mangalkavya is a type of Vaishnava literature in medieval Bengali literature. It includes resources such as the Ramayana, a translation of the Mahabharata, and a vast list of numerous types of musical instruments. About the folklore of Charyagiti, Ahmad Sharif writes, "Tantric or strung Veena, Sambur, Banish; metal, gourd or bamboo musical instruments, Bansi, Cymbal, and many of them are still alive today (Sharif, 1987, p. 143)". Lawergren Bo (1998) describes the relationship between musical instruments and hunting: "The earliest musical instruments derive from a common source: hunting implements. Loud instruments (percussion instruments, reeds, trumpets) were used to call or repulse the prey and to signal between hunters. Quiet instruments

© 2024 Global Journals

(Flutes, musical bows, bullroarers) had alternate uses as hunting tools (dagger edges, hunting bows, and bolas, respectively). It is argued that the "hand song" was another previously overlooked, early instrument used for signaling. Some literary sources from ancient Greece and China, as well as iconographic material from Egypt and Mexico, provide late descriptions of the music/hunt association (Lawergren, 1988, pp. 31-45).

After hunting for subsistence, agriculture played a prominent role in the life of primitive man. During the planting and harvesting of paddy or other crops, there are festivals every season, and the use of musical instruments in those festivals is unsurpassed. Horn was one of the accompanying musical instruments in the early times. Wahab (2008) says, "The indigenous people of our country, such as Chakma, Tipra, Santal, Garo, Murang, Rakhine, Lusai, Marma, Tanchang, Khumi, weave, harvest (including jhum cultivation) and make horn, Flute, Drum, Tabla, begum, bamboo among the accompanying musical instruments during Navanna festival. The main ones include Sitar, Dhudhuk, Behala, Sumur, Sainda, Dumcha, and Tabalchi (Wahab, 2008, pp. 407-08)". In Chapter 28 of the Natyashastra, Bharata discusses sacred musical instruments ('lakshanavitam atodya'). He categorizes musical instruments into four groups: Tata (string), Anddha (covered, such as the drum or Mridanga), Ghana (metal or deep-sounding solid, like cymbals), and Shushi (perforated instruments that produce sound by blowing air, such as flutes).

Many modern instruments have evolved from ancient ones, such as the sitar, which is not isolated from its predecessors. One of the veenas in use since ancient times is the Anurup veena, also known as the chitra veena as described by Bharata. The chitra veena later took the form of the sitar. Abul Fazal mentions several other instruments, such as the Kinnari Veena, Swaraveena, Amriti Veena, Rabab, Sarengi, and Shanai. Pushkar testifies to the use of Murj Pakhawaj in the musical section. Many blind instruments have been used to play with two hands since ancient times, and they were later called Arabic or Persian. Rubber, Shahnai, etc., came from Persia. In the present era, foreign influence influences music, and many musical instruments are imported from the West. However, considering the nature of this country's music, its musical instruments continue to maintain their uniqueness among the instruments of different countries worldwide. Finally, anthropologists value the folk instruments used in folk songs for thousands of years as unique (Wahab, 2008, pp. 409-10, Keda Music Ltd. 2017).

In this connection, we may refer to the table prepared by Sanathkumar Mitra. The table is divided into two categories, which refer to indigenous and incoming musical instruments. Among the indigenous musical instruments, there are four subcategories: i. Tata (string): Gourd, Gopi Vantra, which later evolved into Veena, Tambura; ii. Anddha (covered): Vishamdhaki, Dhamsa, which later evolved into Dhol, Dholak; iii. Shushir (perforated): Singa, Sankha, Banshi, which later evolved into Flute, and iv. Ghan (thick): Kansar, cymbal, which later evolved into Mandira. Among the incoming musical instruments, there are also four subcategories: a. Sitar, Esraj, followed by Violin, Guitar; b. Pakhawaj, Tabla, followed by Kettle Drum, Drum; c. Sanai, followed by Clarinet, and d. Ghungur, followed by Maracas (Mitra, 1985, p13-14). However, learning musical instruments enhances the individual's advantage. Lambert, T. (2024) describes, "Learning to play any musical instrument benefits an individual in all aspects of life, whether academically, socially, physically, or emotionally. Instruments created to make musical sounds are categorized into five main groups: strings, woodwinds, brass, percussion, and keyboards. It takes dedication and admiration to learn how to play an instrument successfully. I believe that musicians who have musical ability have an advantage over other individuals (Lambert, 2024)."

Among the so-called quadruple instruments, the instruments are divided into two: civil and rural. Each of the tripartite instruments is again divided into three, namely drawing room instruments, outdoor instruments, and pastoral instruments. The civilized instruments are used in two ways- solo or accompanied. All the instruments played independently are called solos, such as Veena, Tritantri or Setar, Rabab, Sarod, Ranjani, Kanun, Suratranga, Svarveena, and Sursringa all these stringed instruments are considered solo instruments. Among the Shushi instruments, there is no form other than the Flute, which is of great use in the self-evident culture.

As a Public service broadcaster, Bangladesh Betar backs the artists in Bangladesh. Several musicologists express the following thoughts regarding Bangladeshi musical instruments. They are: i) Anand Lahri, which is used in Baul songs. It is also called Gurguri or Khamak; ii) Ektara- ancient name Ektantri Veena; iii) Esraj- popular in the seventeenth century and used in music; iv) Kartal- used in kirtan and kirtan-like music. Also known as Shashtali, Shashtoli, and Khahtali; v) Kamsar- like a giant plate mixed with metal; vi) Khanjani- also called khunjuri in folk music; vii) Gopiyantra- beggars are seen playing Gopiyantra and singing. Ekta is round. Gopi Yantra is longer in shape; viii) Watch/Ghanta- made of metal, used in schools and colleges; ix) Ghanta- both small and large are common and are used in royal temples. Ghanta is also used in launches; x) Jaltaranga- played with the help of bamboo sticks tuned with a metallic or earthen pot of water; xi) Dough- wooden or metal high fences, leather canopy fences, dovetails, or small pieces of metal are used—the tambourine analogy of the West; xii) Damru- used in snake charmer and monkey dance; xiii) Dhak- generally used in worship; xiv) Drums- very

© 2024 Global Journals

well-known instrument; xv) Bangla Dhol- Folk music of Bengal; xvi) Tabla; xvii) Taus- Esraj analogy, also called Mayuri Veena; xviii) tanjura; xix) Dotara or Dotora; xx) Pakhwaj/Pakhawaj: Dhaka genre (Badhan, Strail); xxi) Clarionet- a Western instrument, widely used in Bangladesh; xxii) Koned or Trumppad- very common in Bangladesh; xxiii) Flute- made of bamboo, wood, bronze (kasa), silver, and gold. The Flute is played in different styles. Straight, upright, oblique. It also played as a solo instrument and accompaniment. Flute, Bendu, and Murali are the names of Flutes; xxiv) Bugle is a flute-like Western musical instrument widely played by the law enforcement forces of Bangladesh.; xxv) Veena- there are at least 50 types of Veena, but none are found in Bangladesh; xxvi) Bagpipe- played at band parties in Bangladesh, not in vogue now; xxvii) Violin- came to India through Western traders. xxviii) Mandira- like a small bowl; xxiv) Madal- used among Santals; xxv) Mandolin- an oval-shaped Western Guitar-like instrument; xxvi) Horn- made of buffalo horn. Nowadays, it is also made of metal; xxvi) Sarod; xxvii) Sanai-Manglikvadya wedding festival, puja performed at Parvan Raj Sabha. From folk to classical music, they are found everywhere. xxviii) Sarengi- ancient Indian musical instrument; xxiv) Sarinda- widely practiced in the rural areas of Bangladesh; xxx) Sur-Mandal- also called Tantriveena or Katyayani Veena; xxxi) Sur Bahar- also in vogue in Bangladesh; xxxii) Sitar- xxxiii) Chimta- a musical instrument used by the Baul of Bengal; xxxv) Srikhol- also known as Khol. It is used in kirtan music (Banerjee, J. 2024; Khan, S. 2024; Roy, 2024; Mintu, 2024; Wikipedia contributors, 2024, and jEducate., 2023).

Scholars assume that interactions with the Mughal emperors influenced musical instrument development in the Ancient and Middle Ages. Mondal, D. (2021) says, "The integration and assimilation of the two ancient cultures was completed at the court of the Mughal Emperor Akbar. One of the gems was Mia Tansen (1500–1586), who even today symbolizes the height of talent and skill in Indian classical music (Mondal, 2021)." The first major uprising in music in a liberated Bangladesh was the Swadhin Bangla Betar Kendra (Free Bengal Radio Centre), the radio broadcasting center of Bengali forces during the Liberation War in 1971. Renowned artists dedicated themselves to increasing people's confidence with their songs and fundraising activities. After nine long months of war, an independent nation came into being, and people were greedy about the essence of liberty in their lives. In short, Bangladesh's musical instruments reflect its various cultural, historical, and religious influences. From traditional folk instruments rooted in rural life to classical instruments influenced by the Bengal Renaissance and cross-cultural exchanges, the musical landscape of Bangladesh is a testament to the country's dynamic and evolving cultural identity.

f) Integration of technology and innovation in music creation and performance

The creation and performance of music in Bangladesh, integrating technology and innovation, has been a transformative journey, contributing to the modernization, and globalization of the country's music landscape (Mauwa, 2020). Here are several aspects to consider:

i. *Digital Recording and Production:* Digital recording technology has revolutionized music production. Recording studios equipped with state-of-the-art technology allow musicians to produce high-quality tracks more efficiently. "As a result of the advancement of modern technology during the British period, various advancements in music and culture also took place. Recording starts a new chapter of mass promotion and preservation of music, and music begins. In 1904, the first solo musical sitar was recorded by Imdad Khan (CeGrams, 2020)". Moreover, home recording – affordable recording equipment and software have empowered artists to create music from the comfort of their homes. This democratization of recording equipment has led to the growth of independent and self-produced music. "In 1906, the first Sarod played by the Sarod's master Chhoonnu Khan (1857-1912) was recorded (Pokri Poki. 2020)."

ii. *Digital Distribution and Streaming Platforms:* The emergence of digital platforms like YouTube, Spotify, and other streaming services has facilitated the global promotion of Bangladeshi music. "Artists can now reach international audiences without the traditional barriers of distribution. In today's digital age, social media platforms like Facebook, Instagram, and TikTok have become integral to our daily lives. These platforms offer a space for self-expression, connection, and entertainment (Georgy, Julius | Vocal, n.d.-b)." These Social Media Stands are crucial for promoting and sharing music. Singers use these display places to connect with fans, showcase their work, and cooperate with other musicians. The power of social media in the music industry is excellent. It allows artists to reach a wider audience, build a more substantial fan base, become viral, and direct fan feedback ("Ppop and the power of social media: How artists connect with fans," 2024). Recently, musical instruments have flourished to the maximum in history. Magnusson (2010) says, "In the twenty-first century, we have witnessed an extraordinary boom in the research and development of digital musical instruments. This explosion is grounded in the ubiquitous availability of cheap computer hardware, but also partly caused by advances in

© 2024 Global Journals

tangible user interface technologies and new programming paradigms that provide new affordances for musicians, composers, designers and programmers (Magnusson, 2010)."

iii. *Electronic Instruments and Synthesis:* Synthesizers, Drum machines, and electronic effects have become more prevalent in various music genres. This electronic element adds a contemporary flavor to traditional and popular music. Moreover, as DJ culture- the electronic dance music (EDM) scene- has gained popularity, DJs incorporate traditional and modern elements into their performances. This combination of styles appeals to a diverse audience.

iv. *Innovative music styles and cross-genre fusion:* Genre-fusion artists often experiment with combining traditional Bengali music with genres such as rock, jazz, and hip-hop, producing exclusive and groundbreaking sounds that appeal to a broad audience. Collaborations between Bangladeshi musicians and international artists demonstrate the benefits of cross-cultural exchange technology. Virtual cooperation and online connectivity have made it easier for artists to work together despite geographic distance. Artists in the Ancient and Middle Ages also produced Unique and innovative music. Roda, A. (2009) describes the middle age: "New genres of music were formed as well, such as Kheyal and qawwali that combine elements of both Hindu and Muslim musical practice (Roda, 2009)."

v. *Use of Visuals and Multimedia:* Creating visually impressive music videos has become an essential aspect of the music industry. High-quality visuals complement the music and contribute to the overall artistic expression. Furthermore, the advent of live-streaming technology allowed artists to connect with their audiences in real-time. This becomes particularly significant when personal events are limited.

vi. *Educational Resources:* Technology has made music education more accessible. Online tutorials, courses, and virtual workshops enable aspiring musicians to enhance their skills and knowledge. Magnusson (2021) finds, "Music technologies reflect the most advanced human technologies in most historical periods. Examples range from 40 thousand-year-old bone Flutes found in caves in the Swabian Jura, through ancient Greek water organs or medieval Arabic musical automata, to today's electronic and digital instruments with deep learning. Music technologies incorporate the musical ideas of a time and place and disseminate them when other musical cultures adopt them (Magnusson, 2021, pp. 175-183)." In short, technology and innovation have profoundly influenced the creation and performance of music in Bangladesh. These advances have contributed to the dynamic and globalized nature of the country's music scene, from digital recording and distribution to electronic instruments, cross-genre fusion, and online collaboration.

vii. *Emergence of new instruments or adaptation to modern styles:* The emergence of new instruments and adaptation to modern styles in Bangladesh reflects the dynamic evolution of its music scene, blending tradition with contemporary influences. Electronic instruments are often used in fusion genres and even in traditional music. As we live in a globalized village, Bengali music also takes on global and cross-cultural influences. Some artists use unconventional instruments and electronic effects to explore ambient and experimental sounds. This avant-garde approach contributes to the exploration of new musical territory. This dynamic evolution reflects the creative exploration and openness of Bangladeshi musicians to embrace a wide range of musical influences.

IV. Results

Around 100 musicians are currently discussing using musical instruments in Bengali music. According to a recent survey, 50% of the respondents believe that using Western musical instruments has increased in Bengali and indigenous instruments. In addition, 95% of the respondents think that acoustic and electric musical instruments are used more in our country. The analysis also indicated that 40% of the respondents consider the influence of Western music on Bengali music to be positive, while 60% believe its impact is negative. Most respondents felt that using Western instruments did not bring revolutionary changes, and 66% had an opposing view. However, almost half of the respondents thought the arrival of Western musical instruments in Bengali songs was inevitable.

Similarly, 50% of the respondents think electric instruments have influenced Bengali songs. However, 62% of the respondents feel that using electric and Western musical instruments has positively changed Bengali songs. About 50% of the respondents also believe Western instruments have influenced Bengali songs. The survey further revealed that two-thirds of the respondents believe that acoustic and electric musical instruments will significantly impact the development of Bengali music in the coming days. In contrast, only 15% of the respondents think that acoustic instruments will dramatically affect the growth of Bengali music. The survey highlights how Western musical instruments and musicians' opinions on this topic influence Bengali music.

However, when it comes to the challenges of Bengali traditional instruments, around 25% of people

© 2024 Global Journals

believe that the employment of instrumentalists is the biggest challenge, while another 25% view training the new generation as a significant hurdle. Government patronage is necessary for 15% of people, and another 15% believe that including music study in different education levels, from primary to higher levels, is a big challenge. There are other challenges as well, including the lack of specialized institutions for training, the undervaluation of artists, the need for the inclusion of ancient instruments in compositions, the recovery of lost instruments, the search for instrumentalists, the cultivation of interest and perseverance in people, the decline in the rate of making, using, and preserving traditional instruments, the need to make Bangla Music accessible from Westernization, and the increasing attraction for Western music among young people. We arranged a meeting for further analysis and invited some singers, composers, instrumentalists, and academics. We asked them some questions and took their feedback.

We discussed the reasons for increasing the use of Western instruments in Bangla music. Around 30% of people view the unavailability of traditional instrumentalists as a significant cause. About 15% of people consider our youngsters more attracted to Western music. Another 15% of people view lack of training and employment as the reasons. 15% more people view change in the taste of people through time. Other people's feedback was as follows: a) People are losing interest as traditional instruments are used less in Bangla music, and b) there is indiscriminate use of satellite media. c) Lack of valuation of these instruments and instrumentalists. d) More commercial use of Bangla songs. e) Increasing love for Western music. f) Lack of remuneration. g) Ease of use of Western instruments as these are ICT-based. h) Low standard in quality. i) Difficult and time-consuming to learn.

Then, we discussed Bangla Music's challenges because of Western music's greater inclusion. Around 30% of respondents view the originality of songs as distorted. Other feedback is like- i) Bangla traditional instruments will be distinguished through time. ii) Rural instrumentalists will lose interest. iii) The instrumentalists will be lost through time.

Below is a summary of the responses to our survey's final open-ended question, "How do you preserve and develop traditional instruments?" Around 60% of respondents believe that the government should take steps to preserve and develop traditional instruments. 30% of people suggest that arranging training would be a solution. 15% of people feel that proper employment opportunities should be created in this field. Another 15% believe instrumental education should be included from primary to higher levels. In addition, respondents provided other suggestions, such as a) Publishing pictures and information about traditional instruments in school books. b) Registering instrumentalists in every sub-district. c) Arranging competitions among instrumentalists. d) Honoring artists who play traditional instruments. e) Researching ancient instruments. f) Having experts train the new generation of musicians. g) Encouraging the use of traditional instruments in new compositions. h) Increasing awareness among cultural institutions about traditional instruments. i) Raising awareness among the general public. j) Introducing traditional instruments to the younger generation.

V. Discussion

Certainly, Chowdhury, A.H. (2017) explains the current situation of Bangladeshi folk music and its geo-cultural impact on our mind, "Once upon a time, in the geographical and cultural environment in which folk thought-philosophies originated, developed and spread the environment- the situation has changed due to the rule of time, the influence of Modern age. At the same time, folk songs also began to be detached from their contextual background. For example, shallow engine boats run in every river, canal, and lake, so it is impossible to sing and listen to Bhatiali's 'Song of the Lonely One' amidst the ear-splitting hum of that engine. Bhayaiyao is no longer the song of Garial vai (cattle cart brother), Maishal's friend (Buffalo Shepherd), or Naiya or sailor of the current of the water river. Because there is no previous cow-buffalo cart, there is no paddle (Baitha) or standing boat (Chowdhury, 2017). Critical issues are pronounced as follows.

Exploring the challenges and opportunities of Bengali instrumental music is very important to know the development of Bengali musical instruments. Navigating modernization, declining interest, and economic constraints pose challenges. However, technological integration, cultural education initiatives, and embracing global collaboration represent opportunities for revival and international appreciation of Bengali instrumental music. Among these, the participant's gender raises another issue. After research, Abeles (2009) concludes, "A comparison of the instruments played by boys and girls across three studies conducted in 1978, 1993, and 2007 showed little difference in the sex (gender)-by-instrument distribution. Girls played predominantly Flutes, violins, and clarinets; most boys played Drums, trumpets, and trombones. There was some evidence that in band settings, girls were more likely to play nonconforming gender instruments than boys (Abeles, 2009)." However, in Bangladesh, primarily boys play Flutes.

Identify the challenges faced by Bengali musical instruments in the modern era. Although Bengali musical instruments have adapted and evolved, they face several challenges in the modern era. These challenges may affect their preservation, popularity, and integration into contemporary music. Some key

© 2024 Global Journals

challenges include: - i) Traditional instruments may face competition from electronic analogs and synthesizers, which affects their use in modern music production. ii.) As musical tastes evolve, demand for traditional instruments may decline in favor of those associated with more contemporary genres. iii) Traditional instruments may require more awareness and understanding among new generations, affecting their preservation and continuity. iv) Traditional instrumental education may face challenges due to limited resources, including qualified teachers and accessible learning materials. v) Global music trends can lead to the homogenization of sound, potentially overshadowing traditional Bengali instruments. vi) Commercial pressures may favor instruments that cater to popular genres, potentially marginalizing traditional instruments in the commercial music industry. vii) Production and maintenance of traditional instruments can be expensive, and economic constraints can limit musicians' accessibility to these instruments. viii) Integrating traditional instruments into contemporary music can be challenging, requiring creative approaches to ensure relevance. ix) Rapid social change can lead to a loss of connection between traditional instruments and cultural practices, affecting their role in artistic expression. x) Traditional instruments may get less exposure on mainstream media platforms, limiting their visibility and popularity among larger audiences. xi) The dominance of Western musical styles and instruments may overshadow traditional Bengali instruments, affecting their presentation and use in modern compositions. xii) Traditional sounds can be vulnerable to uncontrolled sampling in modern music production, leading to potential issues of intellectual property and cultural appropriation.

Addressing these challenges requires concerted efforts by musicians, educators, cultural institutions, and policymakers to ensure the continued relevance and preservation of traditional Bengali musical instruments in the modern age. Scope of Bengali Instrumental Music brings us much better Music in Bangladesh. These are: i. The embrace of modern technology can increase the production, recording, and accessibility of instrumental music. ii. Incorporating traditional materials into education programs helps to raise awareness and increase appreciation. iii. Collaborating with international musicians and embracing cross-cultural exchanges opens new avenues for recognition and appreciation. iv. Exploring fusion genres and innovative compositions allows traditional instruments to adapt to the contemporary musical landscape. v. Using online and social media for promotion and distribution expands Bengali instrumental music's reach and audience base. Supporting these initiatives contributes to preserving and promoting Bangladesh's conventional instruments and underscores their cultural, economic, and educational significance. It invests in continuing a unique musical tradition that adds to the nation's cultural richness.

Preserving and promoting traditional materials in Bangladesh involves a multi-pronged approach, including education, cultural initiatives, and community involvement. Here are several ideas for preserving and promoting traditional instruments. a) Introduce traditional materials into the school curriculum to educate students about cultural significance. Include practical lessons and workshops to provide hands-on experience. Establish specialized music academies or courses that teach traditional instrument playing techniques and music theory. b) Organize events and festivals highlighting traditional instruments and allowing musicians to showcase their skills and exposure to diverse audiences. Collaborative Performance – encouraging collaboration between traditional and contemporary musicians during festivals to demonstrate traditional instruments' adaptability and fusion potential. c) Grant researchers and ethnomusicologists the opportunity to study and document traditional instruments, their historical significance, and their associated communities. Digital Archives: Create digital archives for traditional music, including recordings, videos, and educational materials, making them easily accessible to researchers, musicians, and the general public. d) Set up museums dedicated to traditional instruments, giving visitors an insight into their history, craftsmanship, and cultural importance. To develop cultural trails or heritage tours, including visits to communities where traditional instruments are made and played, promoting cultural tourism. e) Organize workshops in local communities to teach traditional instrument making and playing, encouraging cultural pride and a sense of ownership. Encourage community-based concerts featuring traditional instruments to engage residents and promote unity and shared cultural heritage. f) Encourage contemporary musicians to incorporate traditional instruments into their compositions, bridging old and new musical expressions. g) Support recording projects that feature traditional instruments in collaboration with modern recording studios and technology increasing their visibility in the mainstream music scene. h) Collaborate with universities to offer degree programs or courses focusing on traditional music, ensuring continuity of knowledge and skills. Student Ensembles: Form groups dedicated to learning and performing traditional music, providing a platform for young musicians to showcase their talents. i) Provides financial support through grants and funding programs to traditional musicians, instrument makers, and cultural organizations working to preserve traditional instruments. Moreover, Policy Advocacy advocates for policies that recognize and protect the cultural heritage of conventional instruments, emphasizing their importance in national identity and

© 2024 Global Journals

artistic preservation. j) Implement initiatives to support traditional instrument artisans and provide training, resources, and market access to sustain their craft. Moreover, in handicrafts exhibitions, organize exhibitions showcasing traditional instruments' artistry and craftsmanship, creating public awareness and appreciation. k) Create and disseminate online tutorials for playing traditional instruments, making them accessible to a global audience and encouraging a more comprehensive appreciation. Use social media platforms to share stories, performances, and educational content related to traditional instruments, creating a sense of community and interest. By combining these initiatives, Bangladesh can work towards preserving and promoting the rich heritage of musical instruments, ensuring their continued relevance and appreciation in the modern age.

Advocacy for instrument makers and musicians and initiatives supporting documentation in Bangladesh are crucial to conserving and endorsing the rich musical culture. Here is an advocacy framework highlighting the importance of these initiatives and emphasizing the role of traditional instruments in shaping Bangladesh's cultural identity. These are musical instruments and bearers of cultural narratives and historical significance. Furthermore, symbols of tradition position the making and playing of conventional instruments as symbols of continuity relating past, present, and future generations. Conservation of these crafts is needed to preserve cultural diversity.

They are highlighting the economic importance of supporting materials manufacturers. These artisans contribute to the economy by creating unique, handcrafted instruments. The initiatives they support directly impact the local economy. Advocate for programs facilitating market access for traditional instrument manufacturers. It may include exhibitions, collaborations with modern music producers, and platforms on which to sell their products.

The younger generation needs to transfer traditional instrument-making skills. Educational initiatives may include apprenticeships, workshops, and training programs to ensure technical continuity. Integration into School Curricula: Advocate for integrating traditional instrument making and playing into the school curriculum. It ensures that future generations appreciate and understand these instruments' cultural and artistic significance. Advocate for recognition and support of traditional musicians. It creates platforms for Performance, competition, and collaboration to showcase their talents. Training and mentorship programs- support initiatives that provide training and mentoring for musicians, enabling them to master traditional instruments and explore innovative ways of incorporating them into contemporary music. Wang et al. (2022) say, "The accuracy of musical instrument recognition in the mother tongue group is 15% higher than that in the foreign language group, and the average recognition rates of oboe, trumpet, and xylophone in the foreign language group are lower than those in the mother tongue group, the recognition rate of oboe and trumpet in wind instruments was low in both groups, and the recognition rate of oboe and trumpet in foreign language group was (Wang et al., 2022)."

Cultural conservation through research stresses the importance of documenting traditional instruments, their history, and their associated communities. Vaiedelich and Fritz (2017) say, "An old musical instrument cannot just be perceived as a simple music tool as it happens to be the vector of cultural, esthetical, technical, historical values, which are invisible to visual inspection (Vaiedelich & Fritz, 2017)."

Research serves as the basis for cultural preservation and educational initiatives. Moreover, it advocates for increased funding for ethnomusicological research. It helps researchers and scholars delve deep into the roots of traditional music, ensuring accurate documentation and understanding. Encourage the creation of digital archives for conventional instruments. It preserves valuable information and makes it accessible to a wider audience locally and internationally. Moreover, promote the development of digital learning resources - online learning resources, including tutorials, videos, and interactive platforms, making traditional instruments more accessible to enthusiastic and aspiring musicians.

Advocate for the inclusion of the preservation of traditional music and instruments in national cultural policy. It ensures that there is government support for initiatives and programs. Moreover, incentives for artisans—propose policy measures that provide incentives for traditional materials makers, such as tax breaks, subsidies, and recognition of outstanding craftsmanship. Support traditional instruments to highlight the potential for global cooperation. International partnerships bring skills, resources, and diverse perspectives that contribute to the growth and preservation of musical heritage. To emphasize the importance of intercultural exchange, fostering mutual understanding and appreciation is essential. Collaboration with musicians and scholars from diverse cultural backgrounds can enrich the traditional music scene.

VI. Conclusion

Preserving Bengali musical instruments is essential to protect cultural identity and artistic heritage, enhance educational value, contribute to the economy, and maintain spiritual and ritual significance. These instruments represent a unique heritage linking past and present, and their preservation is integral to celebrating Bangladesh's rich cultural heritage.

Preserving the rich heritage of Bengali musical instruments is not just about safeguarding artifacts; it is

© 2024 Global Journals

a significant effort to keep a cultural legacy that transcends generations. The importance of these conservation efforts spans several dimensions, each highlighting the significance of maintaining and celebrating Bangladesh's unique musical heritage.

Bengali musical instruments symbolize the cultural identity of Bengalis. They carry echoes of centuries-old traditions, reflecting the essence of the region's history, spirituality, and artistic expression. Preserving these instruments ensures the continuity of cultural practices, providing a link between past, present, and future generations. They serve as a tangible expression of the artistic sensibility that has defined Bangladeshi culture. Each traditional Bengali instrument contributes a unique resonance and tone to the musical landscape. Preserving those means preserving the distinctive sounds integral to classic compositions, which add depth and richness to musical expression. Conventional instruments are made with precision and artistic skill. Keeping them honors the craftsmanship and skill of the artisans who have dedicated their lives to perfecting these age-old traditions.

A concerted effort is crucial to ensure Bengali musical instruments' continued vibrancy and relevance. By joining forces in preservation, education, and promotion, we can preserve this rich heritage, foster a cultural legacy that resonates across generations, and sustain Bangladesh's dynamic musical heritage.

The conclusion emphasizes the multifaceted significance of preserving these instruments for cultural identity, artistic enrichment, education, economy, and spirituality. In conclusion, local instruments are unlimited to the handful mentioned here. Even a simple desk or a piece of brass can be an instrument for expert musicians if used in harmony with a complete ensemble! All in all, musical instruments signify how culturally interconnected humanity is. As of now, organologists around the globe have yet to agree on the chronological origin of musical instruments, but the lack of history cannot be a factor in not enjoying and even practicing an instrument. It is, after all, through playing and creating music that makes an instrument thrive through the ages.

References Références Referencias

1. Abeles, H. F. (2009). Are musical instrument gender associations changing? *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 57(2), 127–139. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022429409335878 (J. Banerjee, Personal Communication, January 11, 2024).
2. Barua, S. (2017). 5 Lesser-Known Bengali Musical Instruments Which Continue To Rock The Music World. https://edtimes.in/5-lesser-known-bengali-musical-instruments-which-continue-torock-the-music-world/
3. CeGrams. (2020, September 13). *First recorded sound of Sitar/Imdad Khan/1904/Raag Behag/ Rashmita Jha* [Video]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FUlGc17GAHo
4. Chadabe, J. (2002). "The Limitations of Mapping as a Structural Descriptive in Electronic Instruments."
5. Chaudhuri, N. (1973a). [Review of Radher Sanskriti-O-Dharmathakur, by A. Mitra]. Indian Literature, 16(1/2), 216–217. http://www.jstor.org/stable/24157455
6. Chaudhuri, N. (1973b). Musical Literature of Bengal, *Indian Literature*, Vol. 16, No. 1/2 (January-June 1973), Published by Sahitya Akademi, pp. 14-27. https://www.jstor.org/stable/24157426
7. Chowdhury, A. H. (2017). Digital World: Current Status of Folk Music Practice in Bangladesh. https://p.dw.com/p/2I1MB
8. Dallman, L. (2022). *Who invented music? The search for stone Flutes, clay whistles, and the dawn of song*. The Conversation. https://theconversation.com/who-invented-music-the-search-for-stone-Flutes-clay-whistles-and-the-dawn-of-song-185285
9. Dandekar, P. (2016). Bhatiyali: A short survey of the subcontinent #39; eternal river songs. https://scroll.in/article/801679/bhatiyali-a-short-survey-of-the-subcontinents-eternal-river-songs
10. Georgy, Julius | Vocal. (n.d.-b). Vocal. https://vocal.media/authors/julius-georgy
11. Iris, Farhana, (2019, February 22). Folk musical instruments of the land. *The Daily Star*. https://www.thedailystar.net/supplements/28th-anniversary-supplements/deshi-first/news/folk-musical-instruments-the-land-1704676
12. jEducate. (2023, April 29). 25 Famous Bangladesh Musical Instruments with Name and Pictures / *Music of South Asia* [Video]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yAU0y-wFaq8
13. Keda Music Ltd. (2017, April 7). *Indian Instrument - An Overview - Demystifying Indian Music #8* [Video]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RfOaiYkCXuY (S.S. Khan, Personal Communication, January 17, 2024).
14. Klingelhoefer, M. (n.d.). *Connection groups promote campus inclusion*. The Antelope. https://unkantelope.com/26625/news/connection-groups-promote-campus-inclusion/
15. Lambert, T. (2024, February 21). *A history of musical Instruments - Local Histories*. Local Histories. https://localhistories.org/a-history-of-musical-instruments/
16. Lawergren, Bo, (1998). The Origin of Musical Instruments and Sounds. *Anthropos* Bd. 83, H. 1./3. (1988), pp. 31-45 (15 pages), Published By: Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH
17. Magnusson, T. (2021). The migration of musical instruments: On the socio-technological conditions

© 2024 Global Journals

of musical evolution. *Journal of New Music Research*, Rudlese Taylor & Frances Group, *50*(2), 175–183. https://doi.org/10.1080/09298215.2021.1907420

18. Malik, K. (1973). [Review of Weeping Seasons, by G. Pant]. *Indian Literature*, *16*(1/2), 218–218. http://www.jstor.org/stable/2415745623
19. Mauwa, C. (2020). Influence of Traditional Music in Modern Genre. *ResearchGate*. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/343481008; doi.org/10.13140/RG.2.2.19041.12648.
(A. Mintu, Personal Communication, January 16, 2024)
20. Mitra, Sanathkumar, (1985). Folk Musical Instrument in West Bengal, Pustak Beponi, Calcutta, 1st Edition, p. 13-14.
21. Mondal, D., (2021). The ages of Indian musical instruments and instrumental music, Lokogandhar ISSN: 2582–2705. https://www.lokogandhar.com
22. Musical Instruments - Banglapedia. (n.d.). https://en.banglapedia.org/index.php/Musical_Instruments Music of Bengal. *(2024, April 22). Wikipedia. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Music_of_Bengal*
23. Musical instruments. (2024). In the Merriam-Webster Dictionary. https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/musical%20instrument#dictionary-entry-1
24. Musical instrument | *History, Characteristics, Examples, & Facts*, (2024, May 1). *Encyclopedia Britannica.* https://www.britannica.com/art/musical-instrument/Technological-developments
25. Musical Instrument | History, Characteristics, Examples, & Facts, (2019). In *Encyclopædia Britannica*. https://www.britannica.com/art/musical-instrument
26. Musical instrument | *History, Characteristics, Examples, & Facts*, (1999, July 26). Encyclopedia Britannica. https://www.britannica.com/art/musical-instrument/Technological-developments
27. Observatoire du Mont-Mégantic. (n.d.). *Archives des Retired – Observatoire du Mont-Mégantic*. Observatoire Du Mont-Mégantic. https://omm-astro.ca/en/instrument-category/retired/
28. Pokri Poki, (2020, July 07). *The first Sarod record coln: Rantideb Maitra* [Video]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HOyHL5ClkEc
29. Powers, W. (2000). "Musical Terms for the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries." In the Heilbrunn Timeline of Art History. New York: The Metropolitan Museum of Art, 2000–. http://www.metmuseum.org/toah/hd/musd/hd_musd.htm (October 2003)
30. *Ppop and the power of social media: How artists connect with fans.* (2024, April 3). FasterCapital. https://fastercapital.com/content/Ppop-and-the-Power-of-Social-Media--How-Artists-Connect-with-Fans.html#The-Power-of-Social-Media-in-the-Music-Industry
31. Racy, A. J.(1994). "A Dialectical Perspective on Musical Instruments: The East-Mediterranean Mijwiz." Ethnomusicology. 38(1) pp. 37–57.
32. Ranjana, S. (2022). Bengal Music and Instruments in Everyday Life in The Different Cultural Areas. *International Journal of Creative Research Thoughts. (IJCRT)*. Volume 10, ISSN: 2320–2882. www.ijcrt.org
33. Roda, A. (2009). *Musical instruments of the Indian Subcontinent*. The Met's Heilbrunn Timeline of Art History. https://www.metmuseum.org/toah/hd/indi/hd_indi.htm
(S. Roy, Personal Communication, January 29, 2024).
34. Samit, S. and Ranjana, S. (2022). Bengal Music and Instruments in Everyday Life in the Different Cultural Areas, *International Journal of Creative Research Thought (IJCRT)*, vol. 10, p.686. https://docs.google.com/viewerng/viewer?url=https://www.ijcrt.org/papers/IJCRT2206026.pdf
35. Schofield, K. R. (2003). Hindustani music in the time of Aurangzeb, 2004BrownSchofieldPhD.pdf (kcl.ac.uk) *This electronic thesis or dissertation has been downloaded from the King's Research Portal*. https://kclpure.kcl.ac.uk/portal/
36. Sharif, A. (1987). Essay- *Introduction to Bengali Literature: Charyagiti, History of Bengali Literature*, Volume 1, Bangla Academy, Dhaka 1st Edition p.143
37. Srivastava, S. K. (1953). RAG - DARPAN (A Summary). *Proceedings of the Indian History Congress*, *16*, 265–267. http://www.jstor.org/stable/44303884
38. Tarr, B., Launay, J., & Dunbar, R. I. M. (2014). Music and social bonding: merging and neurohormonal mechanisms. *Frontiers in Psychology*, *5*. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2014.01096
39. Trendvin. (2023). *November 24, 2023 - Trendvin*. Trendvin. https://trendvin.com/2023/11/24/
40. Tofa, N. I. (2019). Rural people, folk music, local culture. https://barciknews.com/archives/12419
41. Tronchin, L. (2020). Special issue on Musical Instruments: Acoustics and Vibration. *Applied Sciences*, *10*(9), 3294. https://www.mdpi.com/2076-3417/10/9/3294
42. Turk, M., Turk, I., & Otte, M. (2020). The Neanderthal Musical Instrument from Divje Babe I Cave (Slovenia): A Critical Review of the Discussion. Appl. Sci.10, 1226.
43. Tyler, J., & Sparks, P. (2002). *The Guitar and Its Music: From the Renaissance to the Classical Era*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2002.
44. Vaiedelich, S., & Fritz, C. (2017). Perception of old musical instruments. *Journal of Cultural Heritage*, *27*, S2–S7. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.culher.2017.02.014
45. Wahab, A. (2008). Folk Music of Bangladesh - A Sociological Study, Bangla Academy, Dhaka, 1st edition, Bangla Academy

© 2024 Global Journals

46. Wang, Z., Zhao, Z., & Wei, L. (2022). Correlation Analysis between Cultural Differences and Normal Music Perception Based on Embedded Voice Multisensor. *Journal of Sensors*, *2022*, 1-9. https://doi.org/10.1155/2022/9248820
47. Westrup, J. A., & Grame, T. C. (2024, May 1). *Musical instrument | History, Characteristics, Examples, & Facts*. Encyclopedia Britannica. https://www.britannica.com/art/musical-instrument
48. Wikipedia contributors. (2024, February 16). *Music of Bengal*. Wikipedia. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Music_of_Bengal
49. Yan, A. (2018). Guqin: A musical instrument that links the past with the present. Culture. doi: https://news.cgtn.com/news/34556a4e35637a6333566d54/share_p.html

© 2024 Global Journals

Global Journals Guidelines Handbook 2024

www.GlobalJournals.org

Memberships

Fellows/Associates of Social Science Research Council

FSSRC/ASSRC Memberships



Introduction

FSSRC/ASSRC is the most prestigious membership of Global Journals accredited by Open Association of Research Society, U.S.A (OARS). The credentials of Fellow and Associate designations signify that the researcher has gained the knowledge of the fundamental and high-level concepts, and is a subject matter expert, proficient in an expertise course covering the professional code of conduct, and follows recognized standards of practice. The credentials are designated only to the researchers, scientists, and professionals that have been selected by a rigorous process by our Editorial Board and Management Board.

Associates of FSSRC/ASSRC are scientists and researchers from around the world are working on projects/researches that have huge potentials. Members support Global Journals' mission to advance technology for humanity and the profession.

FSSRC

Fellow of Social Science Research Council

FELLOW OF SOCIAL SCIENCE RESEARCH COUNCIL is the most prestigious membership of Global Journals. It is an award and membership granted to individuals that the Open Association of Research Society judges to have made a 'substantial contribution to the improvement of computer science, technology, and electronics engineering.

The primary objective is to recognize the leaders in research and scientific fields of the current era with a global perspective and to create a channel between them and other researchers for better exposure and knowledge sharing. Members are most eminent scientists, engineers, and technologists from all across the world. Fellows are elected for life through a peer review process on the basis of excellence in the respective domain. There is no limit on the number of new nominations made in any year. Each year, the Open Association of Research Society elect up to 12 new Fellow Members.

Benefits

To the institution

Get letter of appreciation

Global Journals sends a letter of appreciation of author to the Dean or CEO of the University or Company of which author is a part, signed by editor in chief or chief author.



Exclusive Network

Get access to a closed network

A FSSRC member gets access to a closed network of Tier 1 researchers and scientists with direct communication channel through our website. Fellows can reach out to other members or researchers directly. They should also be open to reaching out by other.

Career | Credibility | Exclusive | Reputation



Certificate

Certificate, LOR and Laser-Momento

Fellows receive a printed copy of a certificate signed by our Chief Author that may be used for academic purposes and a personal recommendation letter to the dean of member's university.

Career | Credibility | Exclusive | Reputation



Designation

Get honored title of membership

Fellows can use the honored title of membership. The “FSSRC” is an honored title which is accorded to a person’s name viz. Dr. John E. Hall, Ph.D., FSSRC or William Walldroff, M.S., FSSRC.

Career | Credibility | Exclusive | Reputation

Recognition on the Platform

Better visibility and citation

All the Fellow members of FSSRC get a badge of "Leading Member of Global Journals" on the Research Community that distinguishes them from others. Additionally, the profile is also partially maintained by our team for better visibility and citation. All fellows get a dedicated page on the website with their biography.

Career | Credibility | Reputation

© Copyright by Global Journals | Guidelines Handbook

Future Work

Get discounts on the future publications

Fellows receive discounts on future publications with Global Journals up to 60%. Through our recommendation programs, members also receive discounts on publications made with OARS affiliated organizations.

Career | Financial



GJ Account

Unlimited forward of Emails

Fellows get secure and fast GJ work emails with unlimited forward of emails that they may use them as their primary email. For example,
john [AT] globaljournals [DOT] org.

Career | Credibility | Reputation



Premium Tools

Access to all the premium tools

To take future researches to the zenith, fellows receive access to all the premium tools that Global Journals have to offer along with the partnership with some of the best marketing leading tools out there.

Financial

Conferences & Events

Organize seminar/conference

Fellows are authorized to organize symposium/seminar/conference on behalf of Global Journal Incorporation (USA). They can also participate in the same organized by another institution as representative of Global Journal. In both the cases, it is mandatory for him to discuss with us and obtain our consent. Additionally, they get free research conferences (and others) alerts.

Career | Credibility | Financial

Early Invitations

Early invitations to all the symposiums, seminars, conferences

All fellows receive the early invitations to all the symposiums, seminars, conferences and webinars hosted by Global Journals in their subject.

Exclusive



Publishing Articles & Books

Earn 60% of sales proceeds

To take future researches to the zenith, fellows receive access to all the premium tools that Global Journals have to offer along with the partnership with some of the best marketing leading tools out there.

Exclusive | Financial

Reviewers

Get a remuneration of 15% of author fees

Fellow members are eligible to join as a paid peer reviewer at Global Journals Incorporation (USA) and can get a remuneration of 15% of author fees, taken from the author of a respective paper.

Financial

Access to Editorial Board

Become a member of the Editorial Board

Fellows may join as a member of the Editorial Board of Global Journals Incorporation (USA) after successful completion of three years as Fellow and as Peer Reviewer. Additionally, Fellows get a chance to nominate other members for Editorial Board.

Career | Credibility | Exclusive | Reputation

And Much More

Get access to scientific museums and observatories across the globe

All members get access to 5 selected scientific museums and observatories across the globe. All researches published with Global Journals will be kept under deep archival facilities across regions for future protections and disaster recovery. They get 10 GB free secure cloud access for storing research files.

© Copyright by Global Journals | Guidelines Handbook

ASSRC

ASSOCIATE OF SOCIAL SCIENCE RESEARCH COUNCIL

ASSOCIATE OF SOCIAL SCIENCE RESEARCH COUNCIL is the membership of Global Journals awarded to individuals that the Open Association of Research Society judges to have made a 'substantial contribution to the improvement of computer science, technology, and electronics engineering.

The primary objective is to recognize the leaders in research and scientific fields of the current era with a global perspective and to create a channel between them and other researchers for better exposure and knowledge sharing. Members are most eminent scientists, engineers, and technologists from all across the world. Associate membership can later be promoted to Fellow Membership. Associates are elected for life through a peer review process on the basis of excellence in the respective domain. There is no limit on the number of new nominations made in any year. Each year, the Open Association of Research Society elect up to 12 new Associate Members.

Benefits

To the institution

Get letter of appreciation

Global Journals sends a letter of appreciation of author to the Dean or CEO of the University or Company of which author is a part, signed by editor in chief or chief author.



Exclusive Network

Get access to a closed network

A ASSRC member gets access to a closed network of Tier 2 researchers and scientists with direct communication channel through our website. Associates can reach out to other members or researchers directly. They should also be open to reaching out by other.

Career | Credibility | Exclusive | Reputation



Certificate

Certificate, LoR and Laser-Momento

Associates receive a printed copy of a certificate signed by our Chief Author that may be used for academic purposes and a personal recommendation letter to the dean of member's university.

Career | Credibility | Exclusive | Reputation



Designation

Get honored title of membership

Associates can use the honored title of membership. The “ASSRC” is an honored title which is accorded to a person’s name viz. Dr. John E. Hall, Ph.D., ASSRC or William Walldroff, M.S., ASSRC.

Career | Credibility | Exclusive | Reputation

Recognition on the Platform

Better visibility and citation

All the Associate members of ASSRC get a badge of "Leading Member of Global Journals" on the Research Community that distinguishes them from others. Additionally, the profile is also partially maintained by our team for better visibility and citation.

Career | Credibility | Reputation

Future Work

Get discounts on the future publications

Associates receive discounts on future publications with Global Journals up to 30%. Through our recommendation programs, members also receive discounts on publications made with OARS affiliated organizations.

Career | Financial



GJ Account

Unlimited forward of Emails

Associates get secure and fast GJ work emails with 5GB forward of emails that they may use them as their primary email. For example, john [AT] globaljournals [DOT] org.

Career | Credibility | Reputation



Premium Tools

Access to all the premium tools

To take future researches to the zenith, fellows receive access to almost all the premium tools that Global Journals have to offer along with the partnership with some of the best marketing leading tools out there.

Financial

Conferences & Events

Organize seminar/conference

Associates are authorized to organize symposium/seminar/conference on behalf of Global Journal Incorporation (USA). They can also participate in the same organized by another institution as representative of Global Journal. In both the cases, it is mandatory for him to discuss with us and obtain our consent. Additionally, they get free research conferences (and others) alerts.

Career | Credibility | Financial

Early Invitations

Early invitations to all the symposiums, seminars, conferences

All associates receive the early invitations to all the symposiums, seminars, conferences and webinars hosted by Global Journals in their subject.

Exclusive



Publishing Articles & Books

Earn 60% of sales proceeds

Associates can publish articles (limited) without any fees. Also, they can earn up to 30-40% of sales proceeds from the sale of reference/review books/literature/publishing of research paper.

Exclusive | Financial

Reviewers

Get a remuneration of 15% of author fees

Associate members are eligible to join as a paid peer reviewer at Global Journals Incorporation (USA) and can get a remuneration of 15% of author fees, taken from the author of a respective paper.

Financial

And Much More

Get access to scientific museums and observatories across the globe

All members get access to 2 selected scientific museums and observatories across the globe. All researches published with Global Journals will be kept under deep archival facilities across regions for future protections and disaster recovery. They get 5 GB free secure cloud access for storing research files.

Associate	Fellow	Research Group	Basic
$4800 **lifetime designation**	$6800 **lifetime designation**	$12500.00 **organizational**	APC **per article**
Certificate, LoR and Momento **2** discounted publishing/year **Gradation** of Research **10** research contacts/day **1 GB** Cloud Storage **GJ** Community Access	**Certificate,** LoR and Momento **Unlimited** discounted publishing/year **Gradation** of Research **Unlimited** research contacts/day **5 GB** Cloud Storage **Online Presense** Assistance **GJ** Community Access	**Certificates,** LoRs and Momentos **Unlimited** free publishing/year **Gradation** of Research **Unlimited** research contacts/day **Unlimited** Cloud Storage **Online Presense** Assistance **GJ** Community Access	**GJ** Community Access

Preferred Author Guidelines

We accept the manuscript submissions in any standard (generic) format.

We typeset manuscripts using advanced typesetting tools like Adobe In Design, CorelDraw, TeXnicCenter, and TeXStudio. We usually recommend authors submit their research using any standard format they are comfortable with, and let Global Journals do the rest.

Alternatively, you can download our basic template from https://globaljournals.org/Template.zip

Authors should submit their complete paper/article, including text illustrations, graphics, conclusions, artwork, and tables. Authors who are not able to submit manuscript using the form above can email the manuscript department at submit@globaljournals.org or get in touch with chiefeditor@globaljournals.org if they wish to send the abstract before submission.

Before and during Submission

Authors must ensure the information provided during the submission of a paper is authentic. Please go through the following checklist before submitting:

1. Authors must go through the complete author guideline and understand and *agree to Global Journals' ethics and code of conduct,* along with author responsibilities.
2. Authors must accept the privacy policy, terms, and conditions of Global Journals.
3. Ensure corresponding author's email address and postal address are accurate and reachable.
4. Manuscript to be submitted must include keywords, an abstract, a paper title, co-author(s') names and details (email address, name, phone number, and institution), figures and illustrations in vector format including appropriate captions, tables, including titles and footnotes, a conclusion, results, acknowledgments and references.
5. Authors should submit paper in a ZIP archive if any supplementary files are required along with the paper.
6. Proper permissions must be acquired for the use of any copyrighted material.
7. Manuscript submitted *must not have been submitted or published elsewhere* and all authors must be aware of the submission.

Declaration of Conflicts of Interest

It is required for authors to declare all financial, institutional, and personal relationships with other individuals and organizations that could influence (bias) their research.

Policy on Plagiarism

Plagiarism is not acceptable in Global Journals submissions at all.

Plagiarized content will not be considered for publication. We reserve the right to inform authors' institutions about plagiarism detected either before or after publication. If plagiarism is identified, we will follow COPE guidelines:

Authors are solely responsible for all the plagiarism that is found. The author must not fabricate, falsify or plagiarize existing research data. The following, if copied, will be considered plagiarism:

- Words (language)
- Ideas
- Findings
- Writings
- Diagrams
- Graphs
- Illustrations
- Lectures

- Printed material
- Graphic representations
- Computer programs
- Electronic material
- Any other original work

Authorship Policies

Global Journals follows the definition of authorship set up by the Open Association of Research Society, USA. According to its guidelines, authorship criteria must be based on:

1. Substantial contributions to the conception and acquisition of data, analysis, and interpretation of findings.
2. Drafting the paper and revising it critically regarding important academic content.
3. Final approval of the version of the paper to be published.

Changes in Authorship

The corresponding author should mention the name and complete details of all co-authors during submission and in manuscript. We support addition, rearrangement, manipulation, and deletions in authors list till the early view publication of the journal. We expect that corresponding author will notify all co-authors of submission. We follow COPE guidelines for changes in authorship.

Copyright

During submission of the manuscript, the author is confirming an exclusive license agreement with Global Journals which gives Global Journals the authority to reproduce, reuse, and republish authors' research. We also believe in flexible copyright terms where copyright may remain with authors/employers/institutions as well. Contact your editor after acceptance to choose your copyright policy. You may follow this form for copyright transfers.

Appealing Decisions

Unless specified in the notification, the Editorial Board's decision on publication of the paper is final and cannot be appealed before making the major change in the manuscript.

Acknowledgments

Contributors to the research other than authors credited should be mentioned in Acknowledgments. The source of funding for the research can be included. Suppliers of resources may be mentioned along with their addresses.

Declaration of funding sources

Global Journals is in partnership with various universities, laboratories, and other institutions worldwide in the research domain. Authors are requested to disclose their source of funding during every stage of their research, such as making analysis, performing laboratory operations, computing data, and using institutional resources, from writing an article to its submission. This will also help authors to get reimbursements by requesting an open access publication letter from Global Journals and submitting to the respective funding source.

Preparing your Manuscript

Authors can submit papers and articles in an acceptable file format: MS Word (doc, docx), LaTeX (.tex, .zip or .rar including all of your files), Adobe PDF (.pdf), rich text format (.rtf), simple text document (.txt), Open Document Text (.odt), and Apple Pages (.pages). Our professional layout editors will format the entire paper according to our official guidelines. This is one of the highlights of publishing with Global Journals—authors should not be concerned about the formatting of their paper. Global Journals accepts articles and manuscripts in every major language, be it Spanish, Chinese, Japanese, Portuguese, Russian, French, German, Dutch, Italian, Greek, or any other national language, but the title, subtitle, and abstract should be in English. This will facilitate indexing and the pre-peer review process.

The following is the official style and template developed for publication of a research paper. Authors are not required to follow this style during the submission of the paper. It is just for reference purposes.

Manuscript Style Instruction (Optional)

- Microsoft Word Document Setting Instructions.
- Font type of all text should be Swis721 Lt BT.
- Page size: 8.27" x 11'", left margin: 0.65, right margin: 0.65, bottom margin: 0.75.
- Paper title should be in one column of font size 24.
- Author name in font size of 11 in one column.
- Abstract: font size 9 with the word "Abstract" in bold italics.
- Main text: font size 10 with two justified columns.
- Two columns with equal column width of 3.38 and spacing of 0.2.
- First character must be three lines drop-capped.
- The paragraph before spacing of 1 pt and after of 0 pt.
- Line spacing of 1 pt.
- Large images must be in one column.
- The names of first main headings (Heading 1) must be in Roman font, capital letters, and font size of 10.
- The names of second main headings (Heading 2) must not include numbers and must be in italics with a font size of 10.

Structure and Format of Manuscript

The recommended size of an original research paper is under 15,000 words and review papers under 7,000 words. Research articles should be less than 10,000 words. Research papers are usually longer than review papers. Review papers are reports of significant research (typically less than 7,000 words, including tables, figures, and references)

A research paper must include:

a) A title which should be relevant to the theme of the paper.
b) A summary, known as an abstract (less than 150 words), containing the major results and conclusions.
c) Up to 10 keywords that precisely identify the paper's subject, purpose, and focus.
d) An introduction, giving fundamental background objectives.
e) Resources and techniques with sufficient complete experimental details (wherever possible by reference) to permit repetition, sources of information must be given, and numerical methods must be specified by reference.
f) Results which should be presented concisely by well-designed tables and figures.
g) Suitable statistical data should also be given.
h) All data must have been gathered with attention to numerical detail in the planning stage.

Design has been recognized to be essential to experiments for a considerable time, and the editor has decided that any paper that appears not to have adequate numerical treatments of the data will be returned unrefereed.

i) Discussion should cover implications and consequences and not just recapitulate the results; conclusions should also be summarized.
j) There should be brief acknowledgments.
k) There ought to be references in the conventional format. Global Journals recommends APA format.

Authors should carefully consider the preparation of papers to ensure that they communicate effectively. Papers are much more likely to be accepted if they are carefully designed and laid out, contain few or no errors, are summarizing, and follow instructions. They will also be published with much fewer delays than those that require much technical and editorial correction.

The Editorial Board reserves the right to make literary corrections and suggestions to improve brevity.

Format Structure

It is necessary that authors take care in submitting a manuscript that is written in simple language and adheres to published guidelines.

All manuscripts submitted to Global Journals should include:

Title

The title page must carry an informative title that reflects the content, a running title (less than 45 characters together with spaces), names of the authors and co-authors, and the place(s) where the work was carried out.

Author details

The full postal address of any related author(s) must be specified.

Abstract

The abstract is the foundation of the research paper. It should be clear and concise and must contain the objective of the paper and inferences drawn. It is advised to not include big mathematical equations or complicated jargon.

Many researchers searching for information online will use search engines such as Google, Yahoo or others. By optimizing your paper for search engines, you will amplify the chance of someone finding it. In turn, this will make it more likely to be viewed and cited in further works. Global Journals has compiled these guidelines to facilitate you to maximize the web-friendliness of the most public part of your paper.

Keywords

A major lynchpin of research work for the writing of research papers is the keyword search, which one will employ to find both library and internet resources. Up to eleven keywords or very brief phrases have to be given to help data retrieval, mining, and indexing.

One must be persistent and creative in using keywords. An effective keyword search requires a strategy: planning of a list of possible keywords and phrases to try.

Choice of the main keywords is the first tool of writing a research paper. Research paper writing is an art. Keyword search should be as strategic as possible.

One should start brainstorming lists of potential keywords before even beginning searching. Think about the most important concepts related to research work. Ask, “What words would a source have to include to be truly valuable in a research paper?” Then consider synonyms for the important words.

It may take the discovery of only one important paper to steer in the right keyword direction because, in most databases, the keywords under which a research paper is abstracted are listed with the paper.

Numerical Methods

Numerical methods used should be transparent and, where appropriate, supported by references.

Abbreviations

Authors must list all the abbreviations used in the paper at the end of the paper or in a separate table before using them.

Formulas and equations

Authors are advised to submit any mathematical equation using either MathJax, KaTeX, or LaTeX, or in a very high-quality image.

Tables, Figures, and Figure Legends

Tables: Tables should be cautiously designed, uncrowned, and include only essential data. Each must have an Arabic number, e.g., Table 4, a self-explanatory caption, and be on a separate sheet. Authors must submit tables in an editable format and not as images. References to these tables (if any) must be mentioned accurately.

Figures

Figures are supposed to be submitted as separate files. Always include a citation in the text for each figure using Arabic numbers, e.g., Fig. 4. Artwork must be submitted online in vector electronic form or by emailing it.

Preparation of Eletronic Figures for Publication

Although low-quality images are sufficient for review purposes, print publication requires high-quality images to prevent the final product being blurred or fuzzy. Submit (possibly by e-mail) EPS (line art) or TIFF (halftone/ photographs) files only. MS PowerPoint and Word Graphics are unsuitable for printed pictures. Avoid using pixel-oriented software. Scans (TIFF only) should have a resolution of at least 350 dpi (halftone) or 700 to 1100 dpi (line drawings). Please give the data for figures in black and white or submit a Color Work Agreement form. EPS files must be saved with fonts embedded (and with a TIFF preview, if possible).

For scanned images, the scanning resolution at final image size ought to be as follows to ensure good reproduction: line art: >650 dpi; halftones (including gel photographs): >350 dpi; figures containing both halftone and line images: >650 dpi.

Color charges: Authors are advised to pay the full cost for the reproduction of their color artwork. Hence, please note that if there is color artwork in your manuscript when it is accepted for publication, we would require you to complete and return a Color Work Agreement form before your paper can be published. Also, you can email your editor to remove the color fee after acceptance of the paper.

Tips for writing a good quality Social Science Research Paper

Techniques for writing a good quality homan social science research paper:

1. Choosing the topic: In most cases, the topic is selected by the interests of the author, but it can also be suggested by the guides. You can have several topics, and then judge which you are most comfortable with. This may be done by asking several questions of yourself, like "Will I be able to carry out a search in this area? Will I find all necessary resources to accomplish the search? Will I be able to find all information in this field area?" If the answer to this type of question is "yes," then you ought to choose that topic. In most cases, you may have to conduct surveys and visit several places. Also, you might have to do a lot of work to find all the rises and falls of the various data on that subject. Sometimes, detailed information plays a vital role, instead of short information. Evaluators are human: The first thing to remember is that evaluators are also human beings. They are not only meant for rejecting a paper. They are here to evaluate your paper. So present your best aspect.

2. Think like evaluators: If you are in confusion or getting demotivated because your paper may not be accepted by the evaluators, then think, and try to evaluate your paper like an evaluator. Try to understand what an evaluator wants in your research paper, and you will automatically have your answer. Make blueprints of paper: The outline is the plan or framework that will help you to arrange your thoughts. It will make your paper logical. But remember that all points of your outline must be related to the topic you have chosen.

3. Ask your guides: If you are having any difficulty with your research, then do not hesitate to share your difficulty with your guide (if you have one). They will surely help you out and resolve your doubts. If you can't clarify what exactly you require for your work, then ask your supervisor to help you with an alternative. He or she might also provide you with a list of essential readings.

4. Use of computer is recommended: As you are doing research in the field of homan social science then this point is quite obvious. Use right software: Always use good quality software packages. If you are not capable of judging good software, then you can lose the quality of your paper unknowingly. There are various programs available to help you which you can get through the internet.

5. Use the internet for help: An excellent start for your paper is using Google. It is a wondrous search engine, where you can have your doubts resolved. You may also read some answers for the frequent question of how to write your research paper or find a model research paper. You can download books from the internet. If you have all the required books, place importance on reading, selecting, and analyzing the specified information. Then sketch out your research paper. Use big pictures: You may use encyclopedias like Wikipedia to get pictures with the best resolution. At Global Journals, you should strictly follow here.



6. Bookmarks are useful: When you read any book or magazine, you generally use bookmarks, right? It is a good habit which helps to not lose your continuity. You should always use bookmarks while searching on the internet also, which will make your search easier.

7. Revise what you wrote: When you write anything, always read it, summarize it, and then finalize it.

8. Make every effort: Make every effort to mention what you are going to write in your paper. That means always have a good start. Try to mention everything in the introduction—what is the need for a particular research paper. Polish your work with good writing skills and always give an evaluator what he wants. Make backups: When you are going to do any important thing like making a research paper, you should always have backup copies of it either on your computer or on paper. This protects you from losing any portion of your important data.

9. Produce good diagrams of your own: Always try to include good charts or diagrams in your paper to improve quality. Using several unnecessary diagrams will degrade the quality of your paper by creating a hodgepodge. So always try to include diagrams which were made by you to improve the readability of your paper. Use of direct quotes: When you do research relevant to literature, history, or current affairs, then use of quotes becomes essential, but if the study is relevant to science, use of quotes is not preferable.

10. Use proper verb tense: Use proper verb tenses in your paper. Use past tense to present those events that have happened. Use present tense to indicate events that are going on. Use future tense to indicate events that will happen in the future. Use of wrong tenses will confuse the evaluator. Avoid sentences that are incomplete.

11. Pick a good study spot: Always try to pick a spot for your research which is quiet. Not every spot is good for studying.

12. Know what you know: Always try to know what you know by making objectives, otherwise you will be confused and unable to achieve your target.

13. Use good grammar: Always use good grammar and words that will have a positive impact on the evaluator; use of good vocabulary does not mean using tough words which the evaluator has to find in a dictionary. Do not fragment sentences. Eliminate one-word sentences. Do not ever use a big word when a smaller one would suffice.

Verbs have to be in agreement with their subjects. In a research paper, do not start sentences with conjunctions or finish them with prepositions. When writing formally, it is advisable to never split an infinitive because someone will (wrongly) complain. Avoid clichés like a disease. Always shun irritating alliteration. Use language which is simple and straightforward. Put together a neat summary.

14. Arrangement of information: Each section of the main body should start with an opening sentence, and there should be a changeover at the end of the section. Give only valid and powerful arguments for your topic. You may also maintain your arguments with records.

15. Never start at the last minute: Always allow enough time for research work. Leaving everything to the last minute will degrade your paper and spoil your work.

16. Multitasking in research is not good: Doing several things at the same time is a bad habit in the case of research activity. Research is an area where everything has a particular time slot. Divide your research work into parts, and do a particular part in a particular time slot.

17. Never copy others' work: Never copy others' work and give it your name because if the evaluator has seen it anywhere, you will be in trouble. Take proper rest and food: No matter how many hours you spend on your research activity, if you are not taking care of your health, then all your efforts will have been in vain. For quality research, take proper rest and food.

18. Go to seminars: Attend seminars if the topic is relevant to your research area. Utilize all your resources.
Refresh your mind after intervals: Try to give your mind a rest by listening to soft music or sleeping in intervals. This will also improve your memory. Acquire colleagues: Always try to acquire colleagues. No matter how sharp you are, if you acquire colleagues, they can give you ideas which will be helpful to your research.

19. Think technically: Always think technically. If anything happens, search for its reasons, benefits, and demerits. Think and then print: When you go to print your paper, check that tables are not split, headings are not detached from their descriptions, and page sequence is maintained.

20. Adding unnecessary information: Do not add unnecessary information like "I have used MS Excel to draw graphs." Irrelevant and inappropriate material is superfluous. Foreign terminology and phrases are not apropos. One should never take a broad view. Analogy is like feathers on a snake. Use words properly, regardless of how others use them. Remove quotations. Puns are for kids, not grunt readers. Never oversimplify: When adding material to your research paper, never go for oversimplification; this will definitely irritate the evaluator. Be specific. Never use rhythmic redundancies. Contractions shouldn't be used in a research paper. Comparisons are as terrible as clichés. Give up ampersands, abbreviations, and so on. Remove commas that are not necessary. Parenthetical words should be between brackets or commas. Understatement is always the best way to put forward earth-shaking thoughts. Give a detailed literary review.

21. Report concluded results: Use concluded results. From raw data, filter the results, and then conclude your studies based on measurements and observations taken. An appropriate number of decimal places should be used. Parenthetical remarks are prohibited here. Proofread carefully at the final stage. At the end, give an outline to your arguments. Spot perspectives of further study of the subject. Justify your conclusion at the bottom sufficiently, which will probably include examples.

22. Upon conclusion: Once you have concluded your research, the next most important step is to present your findings. Presentation is extremely important as it is the definite medium though which your research is going to be in print for the rest of the crowd. Care should be taken to categorize your thoughts well and present them in a logical and neat manner. A good quality research paper format is essential because it serves to highlight your research paper and bring to light all necessary aspects of your research.

.

Informal Guidelines of Research Paper Writing

Key points to remember:

- Submit all work in its final form.
- Write your paper in the form which is presented in the guidelines using the template.
- Please note the criteria peer reviewers will use for grading the final paper.

Final points:

One purpose of organizing a research paper is to let people interpret your efforts selectively. The journal requires the following sections, submitted in the order listed, with each section starting on a new page:

The introduction: This will be compiled from reference matter and reflect the design processes or outline of basis that directed you to make a study. As you carry out the process of study, the method and process section will be constructed like that. The results segment will show related statistics in nearly sequential order and direct reviewers to similar intellectual paths throughout the data that you gathered to carry out your study.

The discussion section:

This will provide understanding of the data and projections as to the implications of the results. The use of good quality references throughout the paper will give the effort trustworthiness by representing an alertness to prior workings.

Writing a research paper is not an easy job, no matter how trouble-free the actual research or concept. Practice, excellent preparation, and controlled record-keeping are the only means to make straightforward progression.

General style:

Specific editorial column necessities for compliance of a manuscript will always take over from directions in these general guidelines.

To make a paper clear: Adhere to recommended page limits.



© Copyright by Global Journals | Guidelines Handbook

Mistakes to avoid:

- Insertion of a title at the foot of a page with subsequent text on the next page.
- Separating a table, chart, or figure—confine each to a single page.
- Submitting a manuscript with pages out of sequence.
- In every section of your document, use standard writing style, including articles ("a" and "the").
- Keep paying attention to the topic of the paper.
- Use paragraphs to split each significant point (excluding the abstract).
- Align the primary line of each section.
- Present your points in sound order.
- Use present tense to report well-accepted matters.
- Use past tense to describe specific results.
- Do not use familiar wording; don't address the reviewer directly. Don't use slang or superlatives.
- Avoid use of extra pictures—include only those figures essential to presenting results.

Title page:

Choose a revealing title. It should be short and include the name(s) and address(es) of all authors. It should not have acronyms or abbreviations or exceed two printed lines.

Abstract: This summary should be two hundred words or less. It should clearly and briefly explain the key findings reported in the manuscript and must have precise statistics. It should not have acronyms or abbreviations. It should be logical in itself. Do not cite references at this point.

An abstract is a brief, distinct paragraph summary of finished work or work in development. In a minute or less, a reviewer can be taught the foundation behind the study, common approaches to the problem, relevant results, and significant conclusions or new questions.

Write your summary when your paper is completed because how can you write the summary of anything which is not yet written? Wealth of terminology is very essential in abstract. Use comprehensive sentences, and do not sacrifice readability for brevity; you can maintain it succinctly by phrasing sentences so that they provide more than a lone rationale. The author can at this moment go straight to shortening the outcome. Sum up the study with the subsequent elements in any summary. Try to limit the initial two items to no more than one line each.

Reason for writing the article—theory, overall issue, purpose.

- Fundamental goal.
- To-the-point depiction of the research.
- Consequences, including definite statistics—if the consequences are quantitative in nature, account for this; results of any numerical analysis should be reported. Significant conclusions or questions that emerge from the research.

Approach:

- Single section and succinct.
- An outline of the job done is always written in past tense.
- Concentrate on shortening results—limit background information to a verdict or two.
- Exact spelling, clarity of sentences and phrases, and appropriate reporting of quantities (proper units, important statistics) are just as significant in an abstract as they are anywhere else.

Introduction:

The introduction should "introduce" the manuscript. The reviewer should be presented with sufficient background information to be capable of comprehending and calculating the purpose of your study without having to refer to other works. The basis for the study should be offered. Give the most important references, but avoid making a comprehensive appraisal of the topic. Describe the problem visibly. If the problem is not acknowledged in a logical, reasonable way, the reviewer will give no attention to your results. Speak in common terms about techniques used to explain the problem, if needed, but do not present any particulars about the protocols here.

The following approach can create a valuable beginning:

- Explain the value (significance) of the study.
- Defend the model—why did you employ this particular system or method? What is its compensation? Remark upon its appropriateness from an abstract point of view as well as pointing out sensible reasons for using it.
- Present a justification. State your particular theory(-ies) or aim(s), and describe the logic that led you to choose them.
- Briefly explain the study's tentative purpose and how it meets the declared objectives.

Approach:

Use past tense except for when referring to recognized facts. After all, the manuscript will be submitted after the entire job is done. Sort out your thoughts; manufacture one key point for every section. If you make the four points listed above, you will need at least four paragraphs. Present surrounding information only when it is necessary to support a situation. The reviewer does not desire to read everything you know about a topic. Shape the theory specifically—do not take a broad view.

As always, give awareness to spelling, simplicity, and correctness of sentences and phrases.

Procedures (methods and materials):

This part is supposed to be the easiest to carve if you have good skills. A soundly written procedures segment allows a capable scientist to replicate your results. Present precise information about your supplies. The suppliers and clarity of reagents can be helpful bits of information. Present methods in sequential order, but linked methodologies can be grouped as a segment. Be concise when relating the protocols. Attempt to give the least amount of information that would permit another capable scientist to replicate your outcome, but be cautious that vital information is integrated. The use of subheadings is suggested and ought to be synchronized with the results section.

When a technique is used that has been well-described in another section, mention the specific item describing the way, but draw the basic principle while stating the situation. The purpose is to show all particular resources and broad procedures so that another person may use some or all of the methods in one more study or referee the scientific value of your work. It is not to be a step-by-step report of the whole thing you did, nor is a methods section a set of orders.

Materials:

Materials may be reported in part of a section or else they may be recognized along with your measures.

Methods:

- Report the method and not the particulars of each process that engaged the same methodology.
- Describe the method entirely.
- To be succinct, present methods under headings dedicated to specific dealings or groups of measures.
- Simplify—detail how procedures were completed, not how they were performed on a particular day.
- If well-known procedures were used, account for the procedure by name, possibly with a reference, and that's all.

Approach:

It is embarrassing to use vigorous voice when documenting methods without using first person, which would focus the reviewer's interest on the researcher rather than the job. As a result, when writing up the methods, most authors use third person passive voice.

Use standard style in this and every other part of the paper—avoid familiar lists, and use full sentences.

What to keep away from:

- Resources and methods are not a set of information.
- Skip all descriptive information and surroundings—save it for the argument.
- Leave out information that is immaterial to a third party.



© Copyright by Global Journals | Guidelines Handbook

Results:

The principle of a results segment is to present and demonstrate your conclusion. Create this part as entirely objective details of the outcome, and save all understanding for the discussion.

The page length of this segment is set by the sum and types of data to be reported. Use statistics and tables, if suitable, to present consequences most efficiently.

You must clearly differentiate material which would usually be incorporated in a study editorial from any unprocessed data or additional appendix matter that would not be available. In fact, such matters should not be submitted at all except if requested by the instructor.

Content:

- Sum up your conclusions in text and demonstrate them, if suitable, with figures and tables.
- In the manuscript, explain each of your consequences, and point the reader to remarks that are most appropriate.
- Present a background, such as by describing the question that was addressed by creation of an exacting study.
- Explain results of control experiments and give remarks that are not accessible in a prescribed figure or table, if appropriate.
- Examine your data, then prepare the analyzed (transformed) data in the form of a figure (graph), table, or manuscript.

What to stay away from:

- Do not discuss or infer your outcome, report surrounding information, or try to explain anything.
- Do not include raw data or intermediate calculations in a research manuscript.
- Do not present similar data more than once.
- A manuscript should complement any figures or tables, not duplicate information.
- Never confuse figures with tables—there is a difference.

Approach:

As always, use past tense when you submit your results, and put the whole thing in a reasonable order.

Put figures and tables, appropriately numbered, in order at the end of the report.

If you desire, you may place your figures and tables properly within the text of your results section.

Figures and tables:

If you put figures and tables at the end of some details, make certain that they are visibly distinguished from any attached appendix materials, such as raw facts. Whatever the position, each table must be titled, numbered one after the other, and include a heading. All figures and tables must be divided from the text.

Discussion:

The discussion is expected to be the trickiest segment to write. A lot of papers submitted to the journal are discarded based on problems with the discussion. There is no rule for how long an argument should be.

Position your understanding of the outcome visibly to lead the reviewer through your conclusions, and then finish the paper with a summing up of the implications of the study. The purpose here is to offer an understanding of your results and support all of your conclusions, using facts from your research and generally accepted information, if suitable. The implication of results should be fully described.

Infer your data in the conversation in suitable depth. This means that when you clarify an observable fact, you must explain mechanisms that may account for the observation. If your results vary from your prospect, make clear why that may have happened. If your results agree, then explain the theory that the proof supported. It is never suitable to just state that the data approved the prospect, and let it drop at that. Make a decision as to whether each premise is supported or discarded or if you cannot make a conclusion with assurance. Do not just dismiss a study or part of a study as "uncertain."

Research papers are not acknowledged if the work is imperfect. Draw what conclusions you can based upon the results that you have, and take care of the study as a finished work.

- You may propose future guidelines, such as how an experiment might be personalized to accomplish a new idea.
- Give details of all of your remarks as much as possible, focusing on mechanisms.
- Make a decision as to whether the tentative design sufficiently addressed the theory and whether or not it was correctly restricted. Try to present substitute explanations if they are sensible alternatives.
- One piece of research will not counter an overall question, so maintain the large picture in mind. Where do you go next? The best studies unlock new avenues of study. What questions remain?
- Recommendations for detailed papers will offer supplementary suggestions.

Approach:

When you refer to information, differentiate data generated by your own studies from other available information. Present work done by specific persons (including you) in past tense.

Describe generally acknowledged facts and main beliefs in present tense.

The Administration Rules

Administration Rules to Be Strictly Followed before Submitting Your Research Paper to Global Journals Inc.

Please read the following rules and regulations carefully before submitting your research paper to Global Journals Inc. to avoid rejection.

Segment draft and final research paper: You have to strictly follow the template of a research paper, failing which your paper may get rejected. You are expected to write each part of the paper wholly on your own. The peer reviewers need to identify your own perspective of the concepts in your own terms. Please do not extract straight from any other source, and do not rephrase someone else's analysis. Do not allow anyone else to proofread your manuscript.

Written material: You may discuss this with your guides and key sources. Do not copy anyone else's paper, even if this is only imitation, otherwise it will be rejected on the grounds of plagiarism, which is illegal. Various methods to avoid plagiarism are strictly applied by us to every paper, and, if found guilty, you may be blacklisted, which could affect your career adversely. To guard yourself and others from possible illegal use, please do not permit anyone to use or even read your paper and file.

Criterion for Grading a Research Paper (Compilation) by Global Journals

Please note that following table is only a Grading of "Paper Compilation" and not on "Performed/Stated Research" whose grading solely depends on Individual Assigned Peer Reviewer and Editorial Board Member. These can be available only on request and after decision of Paper. This report will be the property of Global Journals

Topics	Grades		
	A-B	**C-D**	**E-F**
Abstract	Clear and concise with appropriate content, Correct format. 200 words or below	Unclear summary and no specific data, Incorrect form Above 200 words	No specific data with ambiguous information Above 250 words
Introduction	Containing all background details with clear goal and appropriate details, flow specification, no grammar and spelling mistake, well organized sentence and paragraph, reference cited	Unclear and confusing data, appropriate format, grammar and spelling errors with unorganized matter	Out of place depth and content, hazy format
Methods and Procedures	Clear and to the point with well arranged paragraph, precision and accuracy of facts and figures, well organized subheads	Difficult to comprehend with embarrassed text, too much explanation but completed	Incorrect and unorganized structure with hazy meaning
Result	Well organized, Clear and specific, Correct units with precision, correct data, well structuring of paragraph, no grammar and spelling mistake	Complete and embarrassed text, difficult to comprehend	Irregular format with wrong facts and figures
Discussion	Well organized, meaningful specification, sound conclusion, logical and concise explanation, highly structured paragraph reference cited	Wordy, unclear conclusion, spurious	Conclusion is not cited, unorganized, difficult to comprehend
References	Complete and correct format, well organized	Beside the point, Incomplete	Wrong format and structuring

INDEX

A

Admonition · 4, 20
Ameliorate · 7
Analogous · 14
Ancestral · 1, 6
Apostle · 8

C

Condemned · 10
Contemplative · 4

D

Debasing · 2
Delusional · 18
Depravity · 4, 20
Diasporic · 7
Discreetly · 6
Disparaged · 6

E

Embellished · 5
Enthusiastic · 11

F

Fascinating · 1, 4
Frivolous · 6, 8, 17
Fundraising · 7

I

Impeding · 19
Impenetrable · 17
Indwelling · 1
Insatiable · 3

N

Nefarious · 11

P

Percussion · 1, 4, 6
Perseverance, · 5
Preach · 2

R

Reciprocal · 15, 20
Rejuvenate · 4
Renegotiate · 1
Repatriated · 3, 7
Repudiating · 3
Restrictive · 2
Reverence · 1
Riotously · 6

S

Sacramental · 4
Salience · 2
Slamming · 4
Speculative · 8, 11, 12
Stewardship · 1, 0, 3
Strangulation · 4
Stratified · 3
Stringed · 3, 4, 5, 6
Stumbling · 13

T

Trilogy · 2

U

Unscrupulous · 16



save our planet



Global Journal of Human Social Science

Visit us on the Web at www.GlobalJournals.org | www.SocialScienceResearch.org
or email us at helpdesk@globaljournals.org



ISSN 975587

© Global Journals