

1 A Cultural Approach to Gender Equality and Public Health in 2 Ireland and Sweden

3 Felicia Garcia

4 Received: 14 December 2013 Accepted: 2 January 2014 Published: 15 January 2014

5

6 **Abstract**

7 This article is a discussion on the anthropological endeavour of understanding health and
8 ill-health as they are structured through culture and social organisation. Three themes can be
9 distinguished as; demographic specifics in health studies, ethnographic analysis and
10 comparative studies which, I argue are some beneficial if not necessary approaches in the
11 study of life- and health patterns among vulnerable groups in society.

12

13 **Index terms**— cultural diagnosis, public health, gender equality, masculinity, suicide, contrastive studies.

14 **1 Introduction**

15 The following arguments are based on the fieldwork I did in Ireland between 2008 and 2012 which resulted in my
16 PhD thesis, "Coping and Suicide Amongst 'the Lads': Expectations of masculinity in posttraditional Ireland"
17 (Garcia 2013). This work taught me the value of ethnography and 'indigenous theorising' (to be explained
18 hereafter) in developing a fruitful analysis when studying the lives of others. Finally, it has taught me that social
19 organisation and cultural codes really do make themselves known once you contrast one context to another. That
20 is, that when social organisation revealed through ethnography becomes 'cultural difference', a clear contrast, it
21 becomes visible. In what follows I will outline the approaches that I believe are necessary to better understand
22 the link between gender, culture and public health. I will also account for the conclusions I have made in my
23 own fieldwork by adopting these approaches.

24 In March 2012, towards the end of my four-year field study amongst young Irish lads in Cork I organised a
25 symposium where I invited Irish researchers to Maynooth to speak with me on "Ethnographic Approaches to
26 Suicide in Ireland". Ireland still belonged to the group of countries referred to as the P.I.G. countries (Portugal,
27 Ireland, Greece) -the countries worse affected by the economic recession. A devastating effect of the recession
28 in Ireland was a surging trend of young male suicides sweeping the nation. A curious thing was however, that
29 not even the economic downturn could explain the very slight increase in an already large gender ratio in Irish
30 suicide. When I arrived in Ireland the gender ratio in suicide was at a steady 4:1, meaning that for every female
31 suicide, four men killed themselves ??NOSP 2009). By 2011 the gender ratio had risen to 5:1 ??Samaritans
32 2013:32) and amongst 20-24 year-olds the gender ratio exceeded 7:1. National averages in suicide statistics and
33 classic sociological models like Durkheim's 'anomie' (for full discussion see Garcia 2013) were unable to explain
34 the culturally specific expectations of masculinity that led to ill-health and suicide among young Irish men.

35 I had arrived in Ireland in March of 2008 to do a field study about cultural resistance and Irish lad culture
36 for Uppsala University, Sweden. It was not until the spring of 2009 that reports started coming in regularly
37 from different parts of my local community in Cork about young men that had either been found hanging or
38 drowned. Many of them had known one another and devastating communities now left one funeral after another
39 wondering 'who was going to be next'. The most obvious or perhaps easiest explanation for this dramatic rise was
40 the economic downturn and the fact that it was traditional 'male jobs' within the building and manufacturing
41 sectors that were the worst affected. The fact that Irish men were already much more vulnerable to suicide than
42 Irish women and, the reason why men were coping far less with life's stressors and difficulties than women, was
43 still difficult to explain. Or was it?

44 My approach in analysing suicide was to look at life and by asking "what explanatory relations are there
45 between forms of social life and individual acts of abandoning it?" ??Taylor 1982:12) More importantly, I never

3 DEMOGRAPHIC SPECIFICS

46 set out to answer the overall and impossible question why do people kill themselves. Instead I wanted to be able
47 to explain why some groups in a specific society or community were more prone to do so than others.

48 2 II.

49 3 Demographic Specifics

50 In 1972 Dr. Peter Sainsbury published a study on The Social Relations of Suicide where he examined suicide
51 trends in various Western cultures between 1901 and 1961. Sainsbury found that from the beginning of the last
52 century suicide among the elderly was high (especially among elderly men but also on the increase in elderly
53 women) and lower in the younger populations.

54 "Further studies were undertaken to test the hypothesis that in later life men and women, in their different
55 ways, have come to lack a useful function in our society: Their occupational and domestic responsibilities are
56 diminished and consequently their lives have lost purpose and meaning." ??Sainsbury 1972:189) By the late 1960's
57 there had been a definite increase of suicide among young men which suggested that the vulnerability of specific
58 age and gender groups also varied over time as social conditions changed. Sainsbury conducted contrastive studies
59 in countries were culturally, the elderly were revered and social status was gained with age (in this case China and
60 Nigerian tribal communities). He found that the trends were indeed reversed, that it was the younger age groups,
61 rather than the elderly that showed higher numbers of suicide. ??Sainsbury 1972:189-90) I soon discovered in
62 my own research that there were vast discrepancies between the ethnographic experience, 'ear-to-the-ground
63 reporting' and national statistical data. National averages did not reflect the local, social realities where gender,
64 ethnicity, class, age, and sexuality, structured suicidal tendencies within a specific population. For instance,
65 the charity Console has stated that the "national rate of 11 deaths per 100,000 of the population masked some
66 "alarming" regional data. When analysed by region, the suicide rate in Limerick city was 26.6 per 100,000, while
67 it was 25.6 in Cork city". (The Irish Times 01-06-2013)

68 Statistics and averages are but starting points for analysing the vulnerabilities of specific groups in society.
69 For Sainsbury it was important to know how suicide figures varied between age groups and over time. Cultural
70 contrast and social organisation also revealed how peoples' social roles and functions diminished or advanced
71 with age. Coping and Suicide Amongst the Lads drew attention to the downsides of being young and being male
72 in Ireland. I discussed how youth, especially those on lower or uncertain incomes, were at a disadvantage socially
73 and economically. I accounted for some of the most relevant changes to the traditional Irish family structure
74 and how adolescence now extended into adulthood delaying autonomous, individuated living. Socioeconomic
75 circumstances brought on by the Irish property bubble made independent living arrangements, which has become
76 an important marker for adulthood, extremely difficult. The only viable options left to the young working class
77 and often jobless men was to stay in the family home (often into their thirties), move in with a partner to half the
78 rent (although most of the lads were single) or, move in with other lads in a similar situation. This house-sharing
79 setting provided the lads with a limited support system and through ceremonial drinking sessions -the distraction
80 and oblivion sought in times of boredom and distress.

81 Long term participant observation and in-depth analysis revealed how stereotypical dichotomies in the Irish
82 gender order had become inverted. Public concerns now centred on exaggerated masculinities and the reactionary
83 ethos that made young men 'weak', 'vulnerable', inherently 'immature' and too mentally frail to mind others,
84 themselves and their general well-being. An expected lack of responsibility, accountability and undervalued
85 contribution, and, an increasing focus on young men's "inability" were having devastating implications for the
86 emotional and personal development of young lads as they tried to build social standing and dignity on these
87 very markers of adulthood and an autonomous self. Discourses of male immaturity and low expectations of men's
88 contribution to society left many young men locked in an impossible situation, isolated and undervalued with
89 few coping mechanisms to rely on.

90 One of the researchers who spoke at the symposium in Maynooth in 2012 was Mary Rose Walker, a social worker
91 who had taken it upon herself to do the first national count of suicides among the Irish Traveller community.
92 Walker showed that suicide among Irish Travellers was on average three times higher than the national average
93 due to marginalisation, discrimination and 'minority stress'. Also, the rules and boundaries for masculinity as it
94 is played out in the Traveller community is an even more rigorous structure than the gender segregation within
95 the settled population in Ireland and, not surprisingly: "the male suicide rate is 91%, over nine times as common
96 as female suicide" ??Walker 2008:xi).

97 Two contributors to the special edition of the Irish Journal of Anthropology dedicated to the "Ethnographic
98 Approaches"-conference were Dr. Paula Maycock and Dr. Audrey Bryan.

99 Their study "Supporting LGBT Lives" (2009) investigated the damaging health-effects homophobic bullying
100 had on lesbian, gay, bisexual and transsexual lives in Ireland. They had found that over a third of those aged 25
101 or under had thought seriously about ending their lives and that this was linked to how they had been treated
102 based on their sexuality. ??Maycock et.al. 2009) It was also clear from the testimonies provided by the lads and
103 their female peers in my study that it was these same structures of gender segregation, gender appropriateness
104 and homophobic bullying in all spheres of the lads' lives -regardless of their sexuality -that resulted in stifled
105 coping mechanisms, ill-health and suicide. These ethnographic accounts all suggest that when it comes to the

106 contributing factors to suicide we must not, as the Irish Health Research Board so oddly suggested, "remain in
107 the dark" (Walsh 2008).

108 Limitations and opportunities for men and women's life and health patterns are structured through social and
109 cultural context. The motto within anthropology is to make the exotic familiar and make the familiar exotic.
110 Comparative studies reveal society's underlying structures, cultural codes, references and values. While Walker
111 (2008), Maycock and Bryan (2009) focused on a cultural minority (ethnicity) and sexuality, the main theme in
112 my study was gender and how cultural expectations of masculinity dictated the lad's behaviour and impacted
113 on their health. The underlying question in 'Coping and Suicide Amongst the Lads' was this: Would increased
114 gender equality lead to a convergence of health outcomes for men and women? This was a question that had
115 already been put forward by Karolinska Institutet in Sweden (Backhans, Lundberg and Månsdotter, 2007). I
116 asked further in my research: Would it lead to a convergence in young people's development of life skills and
117 coping mechanisms and would it lessen young men's vulnerability to selfdestructive behaviours and suicide in
118 Ireland?

119 It is of enormous importance that we understand how ideas about gender equality are rooted in traditional
120 expectations of femininity and masculinity and how this is given expression within different groups in society.
121 The definition of gender equality I use in this text is borrowed from Swedish research which suggests that gender
122 equality is: "more or less similarity between women and men in every sphere of human life, including the private
123 sphere." ??Backans et.al. 2007 ??Backans et.al. :1893)) Women's advancement into spheres and social roles
124 previously occupied by men, so called one-sided roll expansion, is not gender equality and has proven to have
125 negative health effects on both women and men. ??Månsdotter et.al. 2009:7) My main concern is the manner in
126 which male role expansion -gender equality reached through men's and women's equitable shares of public and
127 domestic life -affects public health-that is, the health of men, women and children! What makes the comparison
128 between Ireland and Sweden particularly enlightening is that Sweden is world-leading in issues of welfare, gender
129 equality and particularly male role expansion, while men and women in Ireland are segregated into separate
130 living-and health patterns from a very early age and by strict social codes.

131 The gender gap in suicide in Sweden is lower than in Ireland and lands at approximately 1:2-2.5 which means
132 that more than twice as many men than women die by suicide (Socialstyrelsen 2011). Suicide numbers in the
133 general Swedish population have decreased since the 1970's into the last decade. The exception to this decrease
134 is seen among the younger age groups where in more recent years a slight increase has been noted, particularly
135 among young women who are often seen to be the biggest sufferers of post-modernity, flexible service sector work,
136 conflicting gender roles and overburdening workloads. ??Socialstyrelsen 2009:9) It should also be noted that the
137 over-proportionate suicidality among Swedish men is represented in the older age groups. Suicides in Sweden
138 are 40 per cent more common among men over 65 than among the younger male age brackets and three times
139 higher than among women. "Younger and middle aged men have seen a significant decline in deaths caused by
140 accidents and suicide, particularly during the 1990s." (Statistiska Centralbyrån 2011)

141 From a limited knowledge base on the everyday experience of Swedish men and their roll expansion in Swedish
142 society evidence suggest that male role expansion does benefit both men and women. That is to say that "equality
143 which also includes family life can benefit women by reducing stress parallel to the men who also benefit by their
144 role expansion" ??Månsdotter et.al. 2009:21 my translation). One conclusion was for example that "more equal
145 parenting associates with reduced gender differences in hazardous drinking." (2009:22 my translation) Many useful
146 differences in social organisation between these two very different contexts suggest that the expected roles of men
147 and gender equality translate into different possibilities; life styles and health outcomes. For instance, in Sweden,
148 parental leave consists of 480 days to be divided between parents as they see fit. An equal share of parental leave
149 between the custodians is rewarded with an 'equality bonus'. Irish fathers have no days to take out under Irish
150 law and can only take out the mother's 26 week paid maternity leave if she dies within 40 days of the birth of
151 the child (Garcia 2013).

152 The conclusion made from this is that research must be dedicated to subjective experiences of everyday life.
153 To repeat Sainsbury's argument once more, one has to look at when in people's lives they get most out of
154 living; when needs are best met, what roles are available to people and, the personal fulfilment that makes life
155 meaningful. By this I mean that we must identify both health-promoting and unfavourable social structures that
156 bear important effects on people's quality of life. Suicide statistics, other mortalities and health issues measured
157 in national and cross-national averages can, kept at arm's length, tell us something about where we need to
158 gather more information and take a closer look. Absolute suicide rates are not the primary indicator of suicidal
159 trends. In fact, suicides are only the point of departure from which to investigate the copings, health patterns,
160 and suicidalities among particular demographics. Put in this way: the fact that people that find themselves
161 in unfavourable social structures that has a damaging effect on their quality of life bare worse and have higher
162 mortality statistics than those that do not, seems rather uncontroversial or even banal.

163 4 IV.

164 5 Ethnographic Analysis

165 So what research methods must we use to gather information on the subjective experience of everyday life?
166 Methodology -the possibilities and limitations to our research methods-are bound by the same cultural structures

167 that we study. Looking back at my own experience, I had not made it easy on myself by choosing suicide as a
168 topic to be evaluated on the basis of and amongst a group of young lads whose cultural codes did not allow them
169 to discuss a sensitive and to them uncomfortable issue like male vulnerabilities to suicide. Before 1993 when
170 suicide was decriminalised in Ireland it was more stigmatised than it is today. However, it was not too long ago
171 when those who died from suicide could not be buried in consecrated ground. Some Irish studies have also shown
172 that many open ended deaths, especially those that occur on the road and especially those of men can be read as
173 a cover up of intent where the individual has tried to make it look like a road traffic accident to spare the family
174 the stigma of a suicide ??Connolly et.al. 1995).

175 The difficulty I faced talking to the lads should not be simplified as a 'male thing' although it is certainly a
176 gender issue. By that I mean that ideas about masculinity vary culturally and are therefore not a universal or
177 essential male characteristic. The young women who participated in 'Coping and Suicide' were interviewed either
178 alone over a cup of tea or in groups where conversation and debate lasted over hours accompanied by wine and
179 snacks. Compared to the relatively lengthy interviews with the girls, a different social setting was required when
180 engaging with the lads. I had to interview all the young men individually and anonymously because of their own
181 admitted concerns about being exposed, mainly to their own friends. In a previous masculinity-study conducted
182 in a barrio in Caracas about Venezuelan malandros, or 'gangsters' (Garcia 2006) I was able to interview the
183 young men in groups. The male participants were very eager to declare their views not only to me but to the
184 other participants in the group, both male and female. For them, gang violence and the kind of apathy and
185 depression that come out of it was very much a political issue. There were no inhibitions when it came to sharing
186 personal narratives of stress, sadness and loss, violence and trauma. In many cases these group sessions were
187 both intimate and emotional with men openly crying and hugging. 1 As it were, there was only one medium so
188 valued within Irish lad culture that enabled me, an outsider, to talk to young lads about masculinity, emotions
189 and men's particular vulnerabilities suicide. 'The drink', which must be understood as a cultural practice, had
190 the properties for the intimate bonding that was required. Alcohol plays a large part in 'doing masculinity'
191 because it also allows for displays of affection, intimacy, sharing and emotionality, aspects that in this cultural
192 setting are inappropriate and openly ridiculed among Irish men. Alcohol is so much part of the cultural fabric
193 that it must be engaged in order to 'enter the field'. Put bluntly, the study had not been possible without the
194 drink. The properties of 'the drink' as a social lubricant serves me as an ethnographer whose analysis is about
195 and depends on the very same social fabric that operates in my field of study.

196 There is an intimacy gained from mutual and regular binging-occasions that would otherwise have taking
197 considerable time, like growing up together, to achieve. I spent four years with 'the lads'. For two of these years
198 we also shared a house. This enabled me to better understand how the everyday workings of gender segregation
199 and 'gender-appropriateness' affected the lads' lives. Trust was gained in the pubs, at house parties and the
200 parties held in our front room. My conclusions were developed through my interviews with the lads and by
201 observing their strategic coping strategies, ceremonial drinking, social surveillance and the ridicule facing anyone
202 who stepped out of the boundaries of appropriate male behaviour.

203 The most effective coping mechanisms as acknowledged by the lads themselves (addressing and sharing personal
204 problems) were labelled 'gay', meaning feminine. This meant that even when the lads said that the most important
205 way to deal with angst and depression was to 'talk to someone' they were afraid that if they did, they would be
206 ridiculed and called 'gayboy', 'homo', 'queer'. One of the lads explained it when I handed him an information
207 pamphlet from one of Cork's suicide prevention groups. On the front page there was a picture of two male hands
208 gripping each other with the text "Reach Out". He took one quick look at the pamphlet and said immediately:
209 "Great! That's just what I need. So the lads can mock me to death!!" In the same way, boys also developed
210 anti-school attitudes and unhealthy drinking habits and affirmed their masculinity by recklessness and bravado.
211 These rules were directed towards and amongst young lads and did not apply to girls who had no male identity
212 that would be questioned and ridiculed when adopting more responsible and healthier practices. This meant that
213 girls and boys from the same background and many times the same families had come to develop different levels
214 of maturity, health patterns, coping skills, and different attitudes towards education.

215 V.

216 6 Indigenous Theorising

217 Unlike theoretical contributions made in other studies I did not collect life biographies or suicide narratives. None
218 of the participants were asked if they had considered taking their own life nor were they asked to speculate on their
219 friends', relatives' or acquaintances' specific suicides. I do recognise the many benefits of so called 'psychological
220 autopsy studies' where retrospective information is retrieved by survived relations. Instead I adopted a cultural
221 perspective. I see this type of interrogation into local knowledge and even local analyses as an indigenous cultural
222 diagnosis. In my interviews the participants reflected on the rigid gender order in their local context to shed some
223 light upon, not individual reasons behind suicides, but the causes behind the many cases of young male suicide
224 in their own communities. The thesis addressed suicide as a sociological problem. This problem was addressed
225 through anthropological methods, local enquiry and local knowledge. The discussion was then carefully balanced
226 between the abstract theoretical models used within social theory and suicide research in Ireland, and the actual
227 realities presented by my informants, -'the lads' and 'the girls'. Some participants had of course experienced
228 suicidal thoughts, some have also attempted suicide and all of my informants knew several friends and many

229 times family members who had died by suicide. Although none of the participants were asked about specific
230 cases or their personal stories, it was on the basis of these experiences that they reflected on the increasing suicide
231 rates among young working class men in their own communities.

232 This type of analysis comes from the idea that structural explanations are best provided by those who actually
233 live within those structures. My informants did not try to reconstruct the potential reasons behind their lost
234 friends' suicides. Instead they described the eerie atmosphere in the community and how the local soccer teams
235 had to take down their goal posts after every match after a number of young men have hung themselves by these
236 goal posts after dark. They were adamant that there was something to do with 'masculinity' and how lads were
237 unable to talk and unable to cope. As the lads and their female peers attempted to answer and reflect upon the
238 link between locally held expectations of gender and suicide, the focal point -the linking key-was coping; wellbeing
239 and quality of life. Throughout my fieldwork my most dedicated participants became not only informants, but
240 co-analysts. Suicide had become an urgent matter even to those lads who found it most difficult to address the
241 emotional issues of masculinity, vulnerability and suicide. It was in the end worth their while to try their best
242 to reflect on the difficulties facing them as young lads also when it involved their own fears, angst and sorrows.
243 Bit by bit we were able to reveal the constraints, taboos and strict behavioural rules that dictated over the lads'
244 drinking behaviours, emotional seclusion, and ultimately suicide.

245 7 VI.

246 8 More Research

247 Much research is still needed to explore the various links between health and ill-health and other cross-cultural
248 demographics. Last but not least, suicide cannot be understood without the subjective analysis of health and
249 quality of life that is structured by culture and social organisation. Karolinska Institutet and their report by
250 saying that research on the link between gender and public health should be given more attention. It is suggested
251 that future projects "could be studies on how people's opinions and experiences of equality within family and in
252 the workplace affect people's health, and, studies designed to develop and evaluate strategies to facilitate equality
253 of women and men's everyday lives, and ultimately their health and life expectancy " (Månsdotter 2009:25 my
254 translation): "Most people today agree that all people should be allowed to live as long a life as possible with
255 good health, and that the ability to control their own life to apply regardless of gender." (Ibid.) Future research,
256 I suggest, should also include those parts of civic society whose goal is to disentangle the very narrow forms of
257 masculinity that lead to ill-health not only among men but their families, female relations and children. The
258 male feminist movement that operate in Sweden, in Ireland and elsewhere are key components in developing
259 the type of gender equality that greatly benefits public health. Their resonance within the cultures and welfare
260 structures that they represent deserves more attention. For instance: If Sweden is world-leading in the type of
261 gender equality that also involves men (!) and this has proven to have a positive impact on public health -then
262 this is a trend born out of social and cultural structures that have guided thoughts, beliefs, policies and practices
263 into real experiences that we can draw important lessons from.

264 [The Irish Journal of Anthropology] , *The Irish Journal of Anthropology* 15 (2) p. 2012.

265 [Socialstyrelsen and Dödsorsaker ()] , Hälso-Och Sjukvård Socialstyrelsen , Dödsorsaker . 2010 2011.

266 [Walsh and Suicide ()] *Attempted Suicide and Prevention in Ireland and Elsewhere Dublin: Health Research Board*, D Walsh , Suicide . 2008.

267 [Garcia ()] *Coping and Suicide Amongst the Lads: Expectations of masculinity in post-traditional Ireland*, F Garcia . 2013.

270 [Backhans et al. ()] 'Does increased gender equality lead to a convergence of health outcomes for men and women? A study of Swedish municipalities Swedish National Institute of Public Health, Department of Public Health Sciences'. M C Backhans , M Lundberg , A Månsdotter . *Social Science & Medicine* 2007. (64) p. . (Karolinska Institutet)

274 [Taylor ()] *Durkheim and the Study of Suicide*, S Taylor . 1982. MacMillian Press.

275 [Livslängdstabeller för riket och länen ()] *Livslängdstabeller för riket och länen*, 2001-2010. 2011.

276 [Månsdotter and Jämställdhet Och Folkhälsa ()] A Månsdotter , Jämställdhet Och Folkhälsa . *Ett kunskapsunderlag Karolinska Institutets Folkhälsoakademi*, 2009.

277 [Connolly et al. ()] 'Single Road Traffic Deaths -Accident or suicide?'. J Connolly , A Cullen , O Metigue . *Crises* 16, 1995.

280 [Självmord vanligast bland äldre män ()] *Självmord vanligast bland äldre män*, 2009. (Socialstyrelsen Välfärd Nr 4)

282 [Walker ()] *Suicide among the Irish Traveller Community*, M R Walker . 2000-2006. 2008. Wicklow County Council.

284 [Samaritans ()] *Suicide Statistics Report: Data for*, Samaritans . 2009-2011, 2013.

285 [Maycock et al. ()] *Supporting LGBT Lives: A Study Of The Mental Health And Well-Being Of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual And Transgender People The Gay and Lesbian Equality Network (GLEN) and BeLonG to Youth Service*, P Maycock , A Bryan , N Carr , K Kitching . 2009.

288 [The National Office for Suicide Prevention ()] *The National Office for Suicide Prevention*, 2009. (Report)

289 [Sainsbury ()] 'The Social Relations of Suicide -the value of a combined epidemiological and case study approach'. P Sainsbury . *Soc. Sci. & Med* 1972. 6 p. .

291 [Garcia and La ()] *Vida es una Vaina Arrecha -An anthropological approach to gendered selfdestruction in a Venezuelan Barrio unpublished thesis*, F Garcia , La . 2006. Dep. Of Social Anthropology, University of Stockholm