

Nature, Freedom and Pedagogy-A Comparative Analysis of Rousseau and Tagore

Dr. Ayanita Banerjee

Received: 5 February 2021 Accepted: 28 February 2021 Published: 15 March 2021

Abstract

Naturalism, the philosophy of Nature which subordinates mind and spirit to matter denies belief in the Supernatural and the Spiritual. While Idealism idolizes the 'Mind' or the 'Self', Naturalism emphasizes 'matter' and the physical world. Unlike the Idealists' claim substantiating that "God alone is the true agreement of concept [Begriff] and reality [Realität]; all finite [endlichen] things involve some untruth [Unwahrheit], they have a concept and an existence [Existenz] which are incommensurable" 1, the Naturalists say that the ultimate reality is 'matter' which manifests itself in the form of 'Nature'. According to this philosophy 'the material world' or 'the physical world' or 'Nature' is the only real world that can be comprehended through human senses and unfurled through scientific investigations. 'Atom', 'Empty' space and 'Motion' are the three postulates on the basis of which the entire Nature and the phenomena of the Universe can be explained. As Ernest Hocking writes

Index terms—

naturalism, the philosophy of Nature which subordinates mind and spirit to matter denies belief in the Supernatural and the Spiritual. While Idealism idolizes the 'Mind' or the 'Self', Naturalism emphasizes 'matter' and the physical world. Unlike the Idealists' claim substantiating that "God alone is the true agreement of concept [Begriff] and reality [Realität]; all finite [endlichen] things involve some untruth [Unwahrheit], they have a concept and an existence [Existenz] which are incommensurable" 2 Naturalism denies the existence of anything beyond nature, behind nature and other than nature such as supernatural or other-worldly. If they are asked what causes nature? their answer is Nature is the total system of causes.

, the Naturalists say that the ultimate reality is 'matter' which manifests itself in the form of 'Nature'. According to this philosophy 'the material world' or 'the physical world' or 'Nature' is the only real world that can be comprehended through human senses and unfurled through scientific investigations. 'Atom', 'Empty' space and 'Motion' are the three postulates on the basis of which the entire Nature and the phenomena of the Universe can be explained. As Ernest Hocking writes: 3 Naturalism refutes illusory concepts like 'insight', 'intuition', 'divine inspiration' 'revelation', 'strength of prayer', 'power of soul' misleading the human mind. Experiences, imagination, thinking, reasoning are the processes of mental activity that can be studied through senses They do not consider human knowledge as something transcendental or spiritual, but as something empirical and experimental. The physical world is 'objective'; 'factual' and 'primary'; the natural laws are sufficient to explain the reality. Naturalists 1 Wordsworth, William. Intro. The Complete Poetical Works of William Wordsworth. By John Morley. London: Macmillan & Co., 1888. Poem -24. Print. 2 Hegel, G.W.F. Encyclopaedia of the Philosophical Sciences. Trans. Humphrey Palmer. London: OUP, 1971 Vol-1, Note-2:24. Print. ?? Hocking, William Ernest. Types of Philosophy .New-York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1959. 25. Print. believe that both Reality and Nature are identical and beyond Nature there is no reality. To authenticate the Theory of Reality we need to concentrate first on the Naturalist's Theory of Knowledge. Francis Bacon initially advocated that by viewing Nature in its virgin form and by accumulating observations one by one, man builds up the knowledge of the world. This acquired knowledge is more dependable and useful than knowledge deduced from generalities., Hobbes, in this regard propounded his postulations on the 'sense impression' or 'phantasm developed through human-nature interaction:

The Object, or Something flowing from it, pre-eth the outermost part of the Organ, and that Pre-ure is communicated to the innermost Parts of the Organ; where, by the Reaction of the Organ, causing a Pre-ure outwards contrary to the Pressure of the Object inwards, there is made up a Phantasm or Image: which is the Sensation itself. Naturalism, is not a modern philosophy with its inception traced back to the earliest history of Western Philosophy. Philosophy in the West, was supposed to have initiated with 'wonder.' Man wondered about the phenomenon of his existence. An attempt was made to search the residual permanent substance that underlies all changes in the environment. Thales of Miletus, the Father of Western Philosophy in the 6th century stated that water is the single common substance within Nature. Likewise, Anaximander and Anaximenes in It is this photographic reconstruction of sensation according to which objects yield replica of themselves in the mind of the onlooker.

Naturalists, thoroughly de-cry their faith in spiritual values. On the contrary, they believe that values can only be re-sacralized in proportion to the harmonizing life with Nature, bestowing peace of mind and goodness of soul. In other words, the summum bonum or the 'highest good' for the Naturalists defines the most abiding and refined pleasure. The Naturalists earnestly believe that by living in accordance to Nature is the best form for the 'interpretation and inspiration of life' echoing their unified motto 'Follow Nature'.

alliance with Thales explained Reality in terms of one substance found in Nature. For Anaximenes it was air, but for Anaximander it was some un-named underlying substances which constituted the essence of Reality. Likewise in ancient India there were some famous philosophers of Naturalism such as Charvak and Brihaspati who were considered the inceptors of Indian Naturalism. However, in Medieval period no significant Naturalists prospered since religion had a wide influence upon thinkers. During the latter part of the 17th C and the beginning of the 18th C lifeless formalism prevailed in religion, literature, education, thought, action and morals. The societal norms degenerated and oppressive influence of monarchs, absolutism in politics and authority of the church tortured the people. There was rampant outspread of hypocrisy, cynical skepticism and displeasure. Artificialities reigned supreme. Revolt movements such as Reformation, Realism, Puritanism and Pietism sprang up challenging the authority of dogma and absolutism in social and religious life. In midst of this dark and deplorable social and political state of life philosophers like Rousseau, Voltaire and Montesque took up leadership to fight against all sorts of absolutism in government, artificial social constitutions, economic and educational conditions. In protest they started the Naturalistic Movement. Rousseau was the pioneer of the campaign. In the opening section of his Social Contract, rebelling against formalism and artificiality of the French society Rousseau stated that "Man is born-free, and everywhere he is in chains." His belief as stated in the Foxley translation quotes that "Everything is good as it comes from the hands of the Maker of the world but degenerates once it gets into the hands of man." He wanted to replace and rejuvenate the old, traditional and artificial civilization by a natural civilization. He protested "against all established systems that have become stereotyped and always plead [ed] for greater simplicity seeking to banish sophistication by sweeping paraphernalia." According to Bayles, Rousseau preached natural life and his Naturalistic Philosophy aimed at protecting man from "his artificial-made surroundings-science and civilization." Instead of an educated man being guided by societal norms Rousseau, Jean-Jacques. Basic Political Writings. Trans. Donald A. Cress. Indianapolis: Hackett, 1987. 141. Print. Rousseau, Jean-Jacques. *Emile or on Education* by Jean-Jacques Rousseau. Trans. Barbare Foxley. New York: E. P. Dutton & Co., 1911. 57, Rousseau desired for a child to have no other guide than his own reason so that "his innate tendencies would have the opportunity to grow and unfold in accordance with his own nature." Pounds stated that "Rousseau emphasized the necessity for the child to be free to develop according to his own natural impulses." Nature would have them children before they are men. If we try to invert this order we shall produce a forced fruit, immature and flavorless fruit which will be rotten before it is ripe; we shall have young doctors and old children.

In the Foxley translation of *Emile* we find a plea for the rights of children to be children, not miniature adults: "What is to be thought of the cruel education sacrifices the present to an uncertain future, and burdens a child with all sorts of restrictions and begins to make him miserable, in order to prepare him for some far-off happiness which he may never enjoy."

Rousseau assigned the job of protector to education, but believed that in order to be suited for this task education has to be radically different from that of his generation.

Jean-Jacques Rousseau preferring to take the risk of presenting himself as a 'man of paradoxes' rather than remaining a 'man of prejudices' confronted the historians of educational thought with a considerable paradox. In the 18th century Rousseau launched a bitter offensive against all traditional forms of formal education practically killed by the oppressive weight of tradition, stern discipline and colourless pages of dry curriculum. Rousseau pleaded that

The educational institutions were regarded as the instruments of a vast process of manipulation designed to entrench the power of the strongest. Rousseau violently reacted against this system of education that produced men of cold reason and made learning machines of children. The indictment contained within him continued to influence the thinking of the Western thinkers' right from the beginning. The work that indisputably had the deepest and most lasting impact on teaching methods is his *Emile*. In the words of Pestalozzi, the book had been a focal point of development in both the Old and the New Worlds in matters of education. The book was written in total "Dependence on things being non-moral is not prejudicial to freedom and engenders novices: dependence on men being capricious engenders them all. The only cure for this evil society would be to put

the law in place of the individual, and to arm the general will with a real power that made it superior to every individual will." 10 Ibid. 82. Print. ??1 Pounds, Ralph L. *The Development of Education in Western Culture*. New-York: Appleton-Century-Crafts, 1968. 176. Print. 12 Rousseau, Jean-Jacques. ?mile by Jean Jacques Rousseau. Trans. Barbare Foxley New York: E. P. Dutton & Co., 1911. 54. Print. The stroke of Rousseau's originality perceived education as the new form of a world seeking to cast man in a new-mould, driven by his immediate interests and neither by instruction or formal education. Freedom and necessity, heart and head, the individual and the state, knowledge and experience, each of the terms of the antinomy finds sustenance in this work. It is here that with *Èmile* as the starting point, the major current constituting the history of the modern pedagogical movement begins. *Emile*, the paradigmatic child of nature's education, is from his earliest days and as far as possible exercised in self-sufficiency. He is independent from others and can learn what is immediately around him without being disturbed. "Rousseau's belief in Nature and the right of the child to grow untrammelled by society" 15 the spirit of Rousseau may have been interpreted variously over the years, but certainly ?mile has had an incalculable impact on education. foreshadowed his focus on the three axes designated by the triad-Heart, Head and Hand. He emphasized on the continuation of immediate learning by the natural interests of the child and not by the offerings of situations. Braun commenting on Rousseau's impact on education states that 16 Educational thoughts of Tagore combine many elements found in Rousseau. Tagore was much acquainted with Rousseau's educational philosophy, as on March 4, 1921, he gave a talk about his school at the Jean-Jacques Institute in Geneva which was "perhaps a graceful, albeit indirect, way of paying tribute to the great Genevan world citizen."

In the move towards greater freedom and development of creative individuality, Rousseau's doctrine undoubtedly created a deep-rooted impact. His educational theory prophesied the earnest need of Nature to take its natural course and protect the child from the well-meaning adults and the vices of the society. 17 ??ew-York: Appleton-Century Co., 1936. 214. Print. 15 Rousseau, Jean-Jacques. ?mile by Jean Jacques Rousseau. Trans. Barbare Foxley New York: E. P. Dutton & Co., 1911. 43 Rousseau, who was a political and social philosopher had a poetic way of viewing Man and Nature and their 'intimate kinship'. Tagore had much in common with Rousseau on this aspect, as both of them considered Nature as a great friend, an ornate philosopher and a traditional guide. Nature's love was a common feeling shared by both Tagore and Rousseau, and both of them excelled in the profundity of their communion with it and its application in the field of education.

Rousseau stated that the "progress of education is bound to the order of nature and not to the will of education." 18 Apart from Nature there is no need for educational will 19 i.e., the intentions of educators that define the future of the child. Nature is timeless, thus "education can happen without a framework of future, provided that the ways of education will not contradict nature. ??0 Only this will grant that education does not "agir au hazard" 21 -acting by chance. Educational will is not only too weak; it is too corrupt to be really put into nature's route. ??2 Education is not habituation; the only habit a child should fall into is the habit of not accepting habits. ??3 He explains that the child should form no habits so as to "[p]repare him early for the enjoyment of liberty and the exercise of his powers. ??4 Rousseau granted that the self-development of the child is driven by "immediate interests" ??5 "natural interests" 28 Education [for Rousseau] must conform to nature, and must be a means of not preparing for citizenship in any particular government, much less for an occupation, but of developing manhood and fitting for the duties of human life. fascinated him and his followers' thoroughly. He contends that a child can attain his freedom and independence of thought through Naturalistic Education. The child-grown-man with his developed reason learns to heed his natural inclinations and ignore the ills of society. As one scholar puts it: 29 children are the lovers of dust-their body and mind thirst for sunlight and air as flowers do. Their active subconscious mind, like the tree, has the power to gather food from surrounding atmosphere.

The love of beauty and colour which Tagore entertained was an inborn instinct in his native being. Drawing upon his own experiences he argued that education should seek to develop sensitivity in a child through a direct experience of Nature when her/his consciousness is at its freshest level. Tagore stated that: 30 children are to be allowed to run and play about and satisfy their curiosity in nature. Insoluble problems are created if [we] try to confine them inside, keep them still or hamper their play. 31 real education does not consist, in merely, acquainting oneself with ancient or modern books. It consists in the habits which one knowingly or unknowingly imbibes from the atmosphere, one's surroundings and the company one keeps.

He therefore recognizes early childhood education as the most critical time for developing empathy and the ability to connect with one's surroundings. Dr. Weir, a well-known British educationalist wrote in *The Pall Mall Gazette* that: 32 education comes from nature, from men or from things. The inner growth of our organs and faculties is the education of nature, the use we learn to make of our growth is the education of men, what we gain by our experience of our surroundings is the education of things.

Rousseau in ?mile has said: Education for Rousseau comes from three sources: "from nature, from men or from things." 36 These three sources must "coincide and lead to a common goal" 37 if the individual is to become welleducated. Not all of the sources educate man in the same manner. Education from Nature acts independently of man's action. Rousseau contends that since man cannot control Nature, the latter should determine the course of the other two in cultivating children. Thus, he justifies Naturalism as a guide to education. The essence of his teaching recifies "education as a process of natural growth that has influenced most theorizing upon the educational ideology since his time." ??8 The child is best prepared for life as an adult by experiencing in childhood what has meaning to him as a child; and further, the child has a right to enjoy his childhood. Because

he is a growing animal who must develop so as to live successfully, in the grown up world, nothing should be done to interfere with growth and everything should be done to further the full and freedevelopment of his body and his mind.

In 1915, Dewey stated that Rousseau's theory of "natural growth" was read with the eyes of protagonists of child-centered education: 39 Like Rousseau, Tagore's fascination for Nature was deeply rooted in his poetic heart and it was circumscribed positively in the field of education. Nature's love was a common feeling with Tagore and Nature, present in ample, diverse and beautiful measure takes charge of human children and nourishes them in their all-round development. In his Reminiscences, Tagore writes

The acquired knowledge "does not merely give us information but makes our life in harmony with all existence." 34 Thus while Weir makes "atmosphere" the source of education, Rousseau and Tagore emphasize the mutual relation nurtured between education and Nature. The educational ideology based on the Natural phenomenon aiming to explore the co-relation between education and especially the natural features of the place in question is termed as the Green Education. Evidently education and Nature are inseparably related to each other. Every human being acquires knowledge through the various experiences of "nature." Even mere passive observation of Nature imparts us with a kind of 'informal learning.' The emotional attachment and commitment to a place thus influence a "person's experience and shape his personhood, inspiring him to live and prosper ecologically." ??5 Rousseau, but Tagore excelled him in the profundity with its application in the field of education. He envisaged a type of education through 'stimulating atmosphere' breathed in an intellectual attempt, saturated with wisdom and values. Education, for Tagore was not a material to be poured into the mind of the child from without, but a continuous growth of the inner self: "the conscious process of filling but the subconscious process of absorption." 40 even if they learnt nothing, they would have had ample time for play, climbing trees, diving into ponds, plucking and tearing flowers, perpetuating thousand and one mischief on Mother Nature. In this they obtain the nourishment of the body, happiness of the mind and the satisfaction of the natural impulses of childhood.

Real and permanent knowledge infiltrates the mind of a child through his enjoyment of absolute and unrestricted freedom in nature. Tagore attached much importance to the free -development of children in their early formative years. He eloquently advocated their free spontaneous movements and play in joyous natural surroundings: 41 Nature, the source of unparallel inspiration and timeless revelation guides the child with his first lessons of freedom, enthalls him with a sense of immense delight. Freedom nurtured amidst benevolent magnanimity of Nature is highly educative. The process of acquiring knowledge from Nature's bounty is essentially a life of joyful spontaneity for the children. For them "nature is more important than rules and methods, building appliances, class teaching and text-books." ??2 Have not our book, like most of our necessities come in between us and our world??At any rate during the early period of education, children should come to their lesson of truth through natural processes-directly through persons and things.

Further developing the theme of education, Tagore speaks of the desirability of direct experience in Nature which should remain unimpeded by excessive book reading: 43 Thus, the greatest gift of children, he writes is that they are able to come directly to the intimacy of Nature with the freshness of their senses and "they accept it naked and simple and must never lose their communion with it." ??4 Real education should therefore necessarily facilitate the understanding of one's immediate environment, enabling one to live in one's own atmosphere. The objectives of such education are not 40 Taneja, V.R. Educational Thought and Practice. New-Delhi: Sterling Publishers, 1985.6 th Edition.152. 41 Tagore, Rabindranath. Rabindranath Tagore: A Centenary Volume. ??861 ??1961 ??Ed. Sisir Kumar Das. New-Delhi: Sahitya Academy Press, 1961.253-255. Print. 42 Tagore,Rabindranath."A Poet's School" in Visva-Bharati Bulletin. No-9 (1928):18. Print. ??3 Tagore, Rabindranath. "The Teacher" in The Religion of ??an. Boston: Beacon Press, 1931. 178-179. Print. 44 Ibid. 173. Print.

human centered, but more inclusive. It inspires a 'deep ecological' sense of "identification which goes beyond humanity to include the non-human world." ??5 This maturity implies the ability to relate to the immediate environment shedding the nature/culture dichotomy and corresponding values. A person attains full maturity when he/she realizes "self-in-Self" where "Self" stands for "organic wholeness and union with nature." ??6 No one is saved until we are 'all saved', where the phrase 'one' includes not only??an individual human, but all humans-whales, grizzly bears, whole rainforest ecosystems, mountains and rivers, the tiniest microbes in the soil and so on. This process of the full unfolding of the Self can also be summarized by the phrase: 47

The Naturalists base the principles of progressive education mainly on the theory of Human-Nature interaction, for which they have profound reverence. Nature, provides them the interpretation and inspiration of life. It is therefore essential that the education of a child must accord with his environment. Unlike the Idealists propagating that mind is the only source of knowledge, the Naturalists declare that "knowledge is omnipresent in nature and can be comprehended through senses." Senses are the gateways of knowledge, and the importance of their training has been recognized by both Rousseau and Tagore. Modern principles of early childhood education stress the involvement of the child in an activity based curriculum through the apt use of the senses. Rousseau argues that children should "learn through their senses, through investigating and exploring the natural world." Tagore's educational philosophy aiming to promote this ontological realization that all life is interrelated reaffirms the ideology of 'bio-centric equality.' 48

1 Pour mon élève, ou plutôt

If the educators let the child always be himself attending only what touches him immediately, only then they will find the child learning, capable of perceiving, memorizing and even reasoning: juge, il prévoit, il raisonne en tout ce qui se rapporte immédiatement à lui. ??0 whatever makes an impression on the organ of sight, hearing, smell, taste or touch stands in the relation of a seal by which the image of an object is impressed upon the brain.

John Amos Comenius in a translation of the Great Didactic "General Postulates of Teaching and Learning" stated that: 51 Both Rousseau and Tagore reflect ideological resemblance to Comenius's theology. They proclaimed the need of unrestricted freedom to reconstitute the academic curriculum of a child from his environmental situations, and not merely gather knowledge through compartmentalized subjects. Tagore developed a suitable curriculum for his educational plan. He was dissatisfied with the existing curriculum, as he saw it was purely academic and lacked direction to attention to the needs of the child. Like Rousseau, he too thought that the prevailing educational framework dismissed the natural interests, likes and dislikes of the child. It was a mere imposition on the tender brains of the child. Tagore's task was to devise a suitable curriculum for school children by giving it an entirely new orientation. Education must aim at a harmonious coalesce between nature and balance between different subjects of study. Comenius believed that "acquisition of knowledge is essentially based on building understanding of what his senses contact."

Comenius advocated learning through the senses, which we in modern context interpret as learning through experience. The 'activity method' of learning aims at making the child a technician in charge of his own knowledge and training-through-work experiments. To ensure the fulfillment of this requirement courses are to be structured as an educational project that is both explicit and explained to the child. Instructions are to be mediated through the 'necessity of things', beyond the reach of man's will before he is exposed to them.

Tagore's idea of peripatetic education thus bears a reflection to this point. Knowledge acquired in due course will be real and the process of acquiring it will be enlivening. He strongly recommended excursions and tours forming an inseparable part of school curriculum. He suggested that during "frequent excursions and tours the pupils with their senses might observe and learn numerous facts of interests." This galvanizes their spirit of curiosity inspiring them with a feeling of joy in discovery by themselves. Tagore admits that education "divorced from the streams of life and confined within the four walls of the classroom becomes artificial and loses its value." ??4 We find Tagore's ideas concerning multifaceted intelligence, subconscious learning and the need to educate the affective side of the personality supported in the contemporary writings of Howard Gardner's Frames of Mind: The Theory of Multiple Intelligences. The book delineates multifarious levels of intelligence such as verbal, mathematical-logical, spatial, kinesthetic, musical, interpersonal and intrapsychic. Gardner, like Tagore, argues for a holistic learning environment within which children can achieve mastery of skills in a pleasurable manner suited to their own natural progression. In support of Gardner's work, Daniel Goleman in his Emotional Intelligence focuses on the inadequacy of the IQ model to measure overall intelligence and predict successful performance in life. Goleman argues that since emotions are educationally potent in the development of the total personality of an individual, they should be properly guided and suitably trained. The more academic and cognitively oriented subjects are to be added progressively as the child advances. In Tagore's scheme of education, the development of aesthetic senses like poetry, music and arts were given high priority to enhance a child's imagination and to integrate the various aspects of his personality. Tagore therefore advocates an educational curriculum that emphasizes the need for the education of intellect (jnaner siksa). He advocated undertaking free and independent activities like gardening, regional study, laboratory work, drawing, original composition, with cocurricular activities like games, social-service, studentself art. Tagore sought out to work out a system that would give due consideration to the inherent tendencies and potentialities of the child by devising activities that would gradually shape his personality. He considered education as a continuous social process to be linked with the economic and social life of the community. His school resembled a miniature community where sense training, face-to face communion with nature, channelizing of emotions and discovering the spiritual and creative base of the child remained an integral aspect of education. Tagore supported the cause of the total development of a child under the benevolent tutelage of nature. The ideas of respect for the child, dignity of human personality, love and manual work, love of nature, patriotism and brotherhood of men are the coming legacies that Tagore left for us and for the coming generations in the future times. 55 siksa). 56 Such an educational process does not merely give us information but makes our "life in harmony with existence in all its forms, colours, sounds and movements." ??7 In this high-tech world, environment does not get due attention in the academy. Most Western philosophers, except for some environment-oriented ones are highly anthropocentric. Cosmopolitan perspectives have adversely affected the human existence, uprooting the present generation from its environment, particularly natural environment. Tagore was concerned about environment from his early days and created ceremonies to celebrate nature and create ecological awareness. One such ceremony, 'Briksha Ropana', a part of the 'Rain Festival' was introduced in 1928. In the course of the ceremony, Tagore planted trees and encouraged each child to adopt a tree. It was in his words "a ceremony of the replenishing of the treasury of the mother by her spendthrift children." ??8 It is likely that Rabindranath as he living today, would be at the forefront of those trying to save our fragile ecosystem. He would also be writing about the urgency of promoting the educational priorities of creativity, ecological interdependence and survival in our schools. Concerning the environment and the role of science in today's world one feels that Tagore would express the same sentiments as the Canadian environmentalist David Suzuki stating that "education which prepare students for a high-tech

future and competition in a global economy misses the fact that we are completely dependent for survival and the quality of our lives on the integrity of the planetary biosphere that we intent on destroying.”

In the villages, he celebrated the harvest cycle with Hala-Karshana, a festival celebrating the cultivation of the land and a Harvest Ceremony the ‘Nabanna’, welcoming the new rice crop. In conclusion if we pose the question ‘does Rousseau’s theory of “natural education” and Tagore’s ‘educational vision’ has relevance for the ‘modern education’, the answer must be an emphatic ‘yes.’ Both contemporary educators and thinkers equivocally promote Rousseau and Tagore’s concern for developing a Humane Educational Model (my italics) which extends beyond the narrow bounds of fragmentary bookish knowledge, to the opening doors for creative consciousness and mutuality harmonizing with the principle of biocentric to promote the spirit of reconciliation with all aspects of Nature.

2 Works Cited (Primary Sources)

ABBREVIATIONS: E.T. = English translation; A.T. = Another translation; B. = Bengali original. The Bengali calendar month and era have been given whenever a Bengali periodical is referred to, or when such dates are found in books under reference.

3 Bengali Books and Pamphlets

Year

2021

(H) Paris: Gallimard. (O.C.IV/312). Print. “La nature a, pour fortifier le corps et le faire croître, des moyens qu’on ne doit jamais contraire.”
Global le corps et le faire croître, des moyens qu’on ne doit jamais contraire.”
Journal (O.C.IV/282). “La seule habitude qu’on doit laisser prendre à l’ enfant
of est de n’en contracter aucune.” (O.C.IV/282). “Contracter” is taking
Human and accepting. 24 Ibid. 80. Print. 25 Ibid. 358. Print. states that: 26
Social Rousseau, Jean -Jacques. disdain of all educational practices. Stephen
Science Duggan

Figure 1:

34 Tagore, Rabindranath. Personality. Delhi: Macmillan India, 1980.116-117.Print.

35 Selvamony, Nirmal. “Education through the Environment” in Peace Education II 3(1989): 41-44; Madras Christian College Magazine. LV (1988-89): 46-49. Print.

36 Rousseau, Jean-Jacques.

[Note: 37 Ibid.11. Print.38 Dewey, J/Dewey, E. Intro. “Schools of To-Morrow” in *The Middle Works of John Dewey.1899-1924. Vol.8: Essays on Education and Politics. Ed. J. A. Boydston, By S. Hook. Carbondale/Edwardsville: Southern Illinois University Press, 1985. 222. Print. 39 Rousseau, Jean-Jacques. ?mile, Julie and Other Writings. Ed. R. L. Archer. New-York: Barron, 1964. 80.]*

Figure 2:

1 2 3 4

¹Rousseau, Jean-Jacques. ?mile by Jean Jacques Rousseau. Trans. Barbare Foxley New York: E.P. Dutton & Co., 1911.54. Print.

²Nature, Freedom and Pedagogy -A Comparative Analysis of Rousseau and Tagore © 2021 Global Journals

³Ibid.Vol-11:569. Print. 55 Tagore, Rabindranath. “Tapaban” in Siksha. Calcutta: Visva-Bharati University, 1971.96. Print. as well of the senses (indriyer Nature, Freedom and Pedagogy -A Comparative Analysis of Rousseau and Tagore

⁴Nature, Freedom and Pedagogy -A Comparative Analysis of Rousseau and Tagore

Year 2021

52

Volume XXI Issue IV

Version I

(H)

Global Journal of Human Social Science

49 45 Bill, celui de la nature, exercé de bonne heure à se suffire à Luimène autant qu'il est possible, il ne s'accountume point à recourir sans cesse aux autres, encore moins à leur étaler son, grand savoir. En revanche il

Figure 3:

Figure 4:

Figure 5:

311 ? Patha-Sanchay. 1319 [1912]
 312 . Essays and stories.
 313 1 Brajendranth Seal wrote?. "As far as I know; this is the first book of its kind published in Bengali. It has
 314 followed the right principle-men like Otto, Ollendrof and Saner, who have written books of language teaching,
 315 have succeeded by following this method to some extent. Bengali will remain forever in debt to your creative
 316 genius; you have acted as a pioneer also in the matter of teaching English?" [translated] *Books marked with an
 317 asterisk include some prose pieces by other writers.
 318 ? Vichitra Path.* [1915]. Essays and stories. , pp. 4-7, 25 -8, 60-2, 85-8, Examination Papers, 1906 and 1907,
 319 Bengali,
 320 [’asantosher] , Karan ’asantosher .
 321 [Jachai and Vidyasamavaya] , Vidyar Jachai , ’; ’ Vidyasamavaya .
 322 [Siksha ()] , ? Siksha . 1908. p. 1315. (Second enlarged edn, 1342. New edn. I, 1351.Contents 1351 edn. I)
 323 [? ’acharyer Abhibhasan and Visva-Bharati ()] , ’ ? ’acharyer Abhibhasan , Visva-Bharati . 1926.
 324 [Milan (ed.) (1921)] *A Paper read at a meeting held in Calcutta. Reprinted from Pravasi, Asvin 1328, ? ’sikshar*
 325 *Milan . I. E.T (ed.) November 1921. (The Union of Cultures’, The Modern Review)*
 326 [? ’dharmasikhsa et al. (1912)] ‘A Paper read at the Theistic Conference, Calcutta, 1911. Reprinted from
 327 Tattabodhini Patrika, Magh 1318. Reprinted Sanchaya, Siksha 1351 edn’. ’ ? ’dharmasikhsa , ; Adi Brahmo
 328 Samaj , Calcutta . *The Visva-Bharati Quarterly*, IE (ed.) 1912. October 1923. November 1935. (Notes and
 329 Comments’, The Visva-Bharati Quarterly)
 330 [Rup ()] *An address delivered to students and teachers of the University, ? ’visvavidyalayer Rup . 1933. Calcutta*
 331 *University (Reprinted Siksha 1351 edn. I)*
 332 [’sikshar Svangikaran ()] ‘Asramer Siksha’;’Chhatra Sambhasan’ (E.T. Address at the Annual Convocation’. ; E
 333 ’sikshar Svangikaran . *New Education Fellowship Bulletin* 1937. (1) . Calcutta University (Making Education
 334 Our Own)
 335 [Chairman’s Address, Visva-Bharati Varsika Parisat (1925)] *Chairman’s Address, Visva-Bharati Varsika*
 336 *Parisat, December 1925. Phalgun. p. 1332. (Reprinted from Santiniketan)*
 337 [’avarana and ; ’tapovan’; ’dharmasiksha (1916)] ‘Religious Education’, The Visva-Bharati Quarterly’. ’ ’avarana ,
 338 ’ (e ; ’tapovan’; ’dharmasiksha . *Sikshavidh’; ’Lakshya O Siksha; Strisiksha; ’Sikshar Vahan’ (E.T. ’Medium*
 339 *of Education, October 1923. November 1935. October 1917. April 1916. (The Modern Review)*
 340 [’sikshar Milan (1921)] ‘The Union of Cultures’ The Modern Review’. ; E ’sikshar Milan . *Visvavidyalayer Rup’;*
 341 *’Slkshar Vikiran’ (E.T. ’Diffusion of Education, November 1921. July 1939. (The Modern Review)*
 342 [’sikshar Herpher (1946)] ‘Topsyturny Education’,The Visva-Bharati Quarterly’. ; E ’sikshar Herpher . *Chha-*
 343 *trader Prati Sambhasan’; ’Siksa-Samskar’; ’Siksa-Samasya’; ’Jatiya Vidyalaya, November 1946. January*
 344 *1947.*