

Cognitive Bias as a Framework for Analysis of Multimedia Music Reviews (Cases of Pitchfork, Brooklyn Vegan, AllMusic)

Pavel Kataev¹

¹ Perm State University

Received: 12 December 2019 Accepted: 3 January 2020 Published: 15 January 2020

Abstract

Today, a human being drowns into global, uninterrupted and overweighted streams of information in the network society so we often make decisions irrationally as affected by cognitive biases. However, some genres and formats of modern journalism can use cognitive distortions (heuristics in other words) as a base for that kind of creativity which is acceptable and even necessary in some ways. The article is devoted to the detection of suggestive effects of multimedia music reviews in the focus of heuristics. As a conclusion, a cognitive bias in a media text of this type is regarded as a mean of suggestive expressiveness, not suggestive misinformation.

Index terms— heuristic, music review, cognitive bias, suggestiveness, network society.

1 Introduction

Modern society is affected by total communication. People around the world are involved in endless, transnational and overwhelmed streams of information. However, a smartphone screen brings a person not just unprecedented opportunities but also frustration (Lovink, 2019).

In 1962 Marshall McLuhan predicted the loss of cognitive control in digital civilization, what he calls 'Marcony Galaxy'. McLuhan warned: 'Unless aware of this dynamic, we shall at once move into a phase of panic terrors, exactly befitting a small world of tribal drums, total interdependence, and superimposed coexistence.' (McLuhan, 2017).

Today the utopia of the network society is more and more often sided by the dystopia like in the Black Mirror TV series. What Manuel Castells supposed to be the global 'culture of protocols of communication <?> developed on the basis of common belief in the power of networking and of the synergy obtained by giving to others and receiving to others' (Castells, 2005, p. 40), is not far from turning to 'the anti-social future, the loneliness of the isolated man in the connected crowd', as Andrew Keen described that (Keen, 2012, p. 13).

Curiously, perplexity caused by the overabundance of free content is quite like confusion caused by lack of information -a person experiences the same troubled decision-making, not enough supported by reliable facts and logical interconnections.

In this way, the mass communication space is getting saturated by myths and rational form of cognition is getting replaced by irrational one. Not surprisingly, in recent years scholars have focused on phenomena such as fake news, post-truth politics, internet propaganda, etc.

2 II.

3 METHODOLOGY

What method is appropriate for considering the effects of mass media in this new environment? We have found an answer in the theory of cognitive biases (or heuristics). This area of social sciences has developed on foundations of Amos Tversky, Daniel Kahneman, Aaron Beck, David Burns's works as well as data of psychotherapy practice and

social experiments. Today this framework seems productive at least due to numerous examples -both laboratory and everyday ones.

The genre of multimedia music reviews is the object of our research. The problem of the audience's irrational cognition is reflected in this material with relatively soft effects. While fakes in political journalism inevitably lead to destructive and manipulative influence, a music review justifiably appeals to irrational thinking. The genre itself, traditions of opinion journalism and functionally reasoned emotional impact give the green light to this strategy.

This impact, or in other words suggestion, is the subject matter of the research: multimedia music reviews are exposed to the context of readers' irrational cognition reasoned by heuristics. The leading method is the analysis of selected media texts including identification and classification of cognitive biases they contain. The analysis has the foundation of appropriate and theoretically significant concepts adopted to the research tasks.

4 III. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

As for the first stage, we've selected the main points of these concepts to define principal categories and necessary relations.

So, we follow Tversky and Kahneman who defined heuristics as 'principles which reduce the complex tasks of assessing probabilities and predicting values to simpler judgmental operations [which are] quite useful, but sometimes <?> lead to severe and systematic errors' (Tversky, Kahneman, 1974 ?? p. 1124).

As Russian scholars Elmira Kashapova and Marina Ryzhkova noted, the source of heuristics is 'evolutionally developed mental behavior of a human being' ??Kashapova, Ryzhkova, 2015, p. 17-18). Biases are justified physiologically in some regards as they tend to minimize our energy and time resources due to cognitive stereotypes.

Although the psychologists defines the heuristics in similar ways, they take different attitudes to the systematization of this phenomenon. As Alexei Popov and Alexander Vikhman mentioned, there's still no unified classification of cognitive biases because of differences in aims and methods the scholars take (Popov, Vikhman, 2014, p. 8). Beck, Burns, Stanovich, Toplak and West are among those who suggested original concepts (West, Toplak, Stanovich, 2008).

So we've taken the Jonathan Baron as a basis of our own method. This classification has heuristics divided into principal types and sub-types:

1. Attention: a) Availability, attention to here and now, easy and compatible; b) Heuristics based on imperfect correlations; c) Focus on one attribute with unawareness to others; 2. Motivated bias -myside bias and wishful thinking; 3. Psychophysical distortions.

Baron names heuristics in these divisions and gives a normative model and explanation for each bias so the whole classification seems reasonable enough and might be used as a relevant instrument for those suggestive characteristics of music reviews we focus on ??Baron, 2008, p. 56).

Necessary to mention, we consider suggestiveness as irrational (unlike persuasion) influence on a recipient of information. As the ability or quality of 'reminding you of something or making you think about something' (Oxford Dictionaries), suggestiveness affects one's mind apart of one's will ??Shelestyuk, 2008, p. 171). That's more about inspiring something rather than proving something.

The space of mass communication is full of numerous distinctly suggestive texts, especially in the spheres of ad, PR, and propaganda. Journalism, particularly music reviews, is suggestive enough too.

Generally, a review is 'a report in a newspaper or magazine, or on the internet, television or radio, in which somebody gives their opinion of a book, play, film, product, etc.' (Oxford Dictionaries) So, giving the opinion is the genre's essence and evaluation semantics is in the term's core ??Nabiyeva, 2017, p. 15).

The review is still the central analytical genre of music journalism, and it's productive enough to generate new meanings. In a text of this genre, images underlying a music composition are exposed to verbalization and interpretation by an author. Art gets caught and framed with a journalist's view and then becomes subjectively reflected. Multimedia content (music tracks, photo, video, visual design, etc.) created or selected by an author or editor is expected not only to illustrate but to sharpen and enforce personal interpretation.

Although, the review has various functions: to inform the audience about new music, to promote or criticize it, to educate and entertain a listener, to reason the reviewer's opinion with historical and cultural background -the evaluation is still its leading communicative strategy while suggestiveness is this strategy's key intention.

Suggestiveness gets enough power in a music review. Although a professional journalist has to ground his/her opinion on real facts and credits as well as relatively impartial social, political and cultural context, what makes a review subjective anyway is the abstract nature of a sound image, evaluation strategy and textual expressiveness.

So, the multimedia music review has to and does implement suggestiveness transmitting an author's ideas and images about music to readers. What helps reveal this effect is the theory of heuristics (cognitive biases) that has comprehensive empirical reasoning and especially relevant to the modern digital media that often make us think and behave irrationally.

This theoretical framework needs practical tryon so we've considered some real reviews through the lens of cognitive biases. We've selected multimedia publications in Russian and English in various formats trying to embrace the area of the up-to-date music journalism with truly diverse check points.

In this article, we present the case study of the following publications: Necessary to note, in these cases,

we appeal to the framework of cognitive distortions not as deviations but as expressive means. We consider heuristics as part and parcel of distinctly human and, in this regard, inevitably irrational worldview, social and cultural existence. So we've analyzed the reviews looking for not disadvantages but examples of enacting natural psychological triggers. It can work out either partly (Table 1) or in full-scale (Table 3).

IV.

5 CONCLUSION

The analysis of multimedia music reviews in the framework of cognitive biases could be a part of a more complex analysis. Besides, this method could be extrapolated to the texts of other genres and formats including ones that don't belong to professional journalism. From the one side, a heuristic can be a mean of suggestive expressiveness in a music review and, from another one, a mean of suggestive misinformation in fake news.

6 Volume XX Issue VIII Version I

7 (A)

Anyway, 'tribal' confusion of a person in the network society with its swift streams of information causes cognitive irrationality and must be relieved (or at least diagnosed) with mindset rationality -due to the reflection in social sciences or personal media hygienics.

1

Position of Analysis		Explanation	
Object of reviewing General idea of an object Cognitive biases	Attention	availability, attention to here now, and compatible; heuristics based on imperfect correlations focus on one attribute with unawareness to others	-
		Arvo Pärt's Magnificat and Stabat Mater performed by Le Nuove Musica Koestveld (Brilliant, 2019)	-
		'This is a very Pärt satisfying recording on its own terms, highly recommended'	-
		on	-
Motivated biases		illusory correlation: Le Nuove Musica ensemble is a follower of Hilliard Ensemble (assumption of direct creative inheritance)	-
Psychophysical distortions			-

Figure 1: Table 1 :

2

		31
		Volume XX Issue VIII
		Version I
		(A)
		Explanation
Position of		
Analysis		
Object of	Glitterer's album 'Looking Through the Shades' (ANTI, 2019)	
reviewing		
General idea	Punk sound is 'what makes Glitterer stand out from your average indie pop record'.	
of an object		
Cognitive bi-		
ases		
Attention	availability,	-
	attention to	
	here and	
	now, easy	
	and	
	compatible;	
	heuristics	
	based	hindsight bias: consider-
		ing Title Fight's work as
		more significant than
		on its member's debut solo
		album released later
	imperfect	
	correlations	
	focus on one	-
	attribute with	
	unawareness	
	to others	

Figure 2: Table 2 :

3

Position of Analysis	Explanation
Object of reviewing	Billie Eilish's album 'Where We All Go Asleep, Where Do We Go?' (Darkroom / Interscope, 2019)
General idea of an object	'The debut album from the meteoric pop star lives in a world of its own: gothic, bass-heavy, at turns daring and quite beautiful.'
Cognitive biases	
Attention availability,	asymmetric dominance: arguing direct adoption and ignoring alternative
attention to here and now, easy and compatible heuristics based on imperfect correlations	variants ('Lana Del Rey-indebted crooning')
focus on one attribute with unawareness to others	-
Motivated biases	prominence effect: arbitrary selection of the artist's 'most self-aware lines on the record'
	biased assimilation: the combination of various signs in one portrait and, consequently, considering all of them as typically of teenagers ('a lawless young female singer sporting baggy, androgynous clothes <?> casts her bored, listless eyes upward instead of batting them at the camera'); belief overkill: generalization of teenagers' tastes in one sentence ('ask any teenager in America as they wait patiently for the rest of the world to catch up to their consummate taste in pop music');
	selective exposure: absolutization of two arbitrarily selected tendencies ('all teen angst is both fiercely sincere and an affect of being only partially informed')
	framing effect for gains and losses: the number of followers as the direct
Psychophysical distortions	evidence of success ('an obscenely famous pop star -the kind with 15 million Instagram followers, sold-out shows?')

Figure 3: Table 3 :

-
- 119 [Allmusic] , Allmusic . [https://www.allmusic.com/album/arvo-p%C3%](https://www.allmusic.com/album/arvo-p%C3%A4rt-magnificat-stabat-mater-mw0003258798)
120 [A4rt-magnificat-stabat-mater-mw0003258798](https://www.allmusic.com/album/arvo-p%C3%A4rt-magnificat-stabat-mater-mw0003258798)
- 121 [Oxford Advanced American Dictionary] , [https://www.oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com/](https://www.oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com/definition/american_english/suggestive)
122 [definition/american_english/suggestive](https://www.oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com/definition/american_english/suggestive) *Oxford Advanced American Dictionary*
- 123 [Kashapova and Ryzhkova ()] , E R Kashapova , M V Ryzhkova . 2015.
- 124 [Manheim et al. ()] , J Manheim , Krijn Le Nuove Musiche , Koestveld . 2019. Arvo Pärt: Stabat Mater.
- 125 [AndersonS ()] *Billie Eilish. Where We All Fall Asleep, Where Do We Go? Pitchfork*, AndersonS . 2019.
- 126 [Cognitive biases and their impact on the behavior of an individual] *Cognitive biases and their impact on the*
127 *behavior of an individual*, Tomsk State University Journal of Economics
- 128 [Popov et al. ()] ‘Cognitive Biases in Decision-Making as Scientific Problem and Applied Technique’. A Popov ,
129 Yu , A A Vikhman . *Bulletin of the South Ural State University. Ser.: Psychology* 2014.
- 130 [Keen ()] *Digital Vertigo*, A Keen . 2012. New York: St Martin’s Press.
- 131 [Yakovleva ()] ‘Experimental economics. A critical review’. T Yakovleva . *Issues of Economics* 1995. 7.
- 132 [West et al. ()] ‘Heuristics and Biases as Measures of Critical Thinking: Associations with Cognitive Ability and
133 Thinking Dispositions’. R F West , M E Toplak , K E Stanovich . *Journal of Educational Psychology* 2008.
134 100 p. 4.
- 135 [Tversky and Kahneman ()] *Judgment under uncertainty. Heuristics and biases*, A Tversky , D Kahneman . 1974.
136 p. 185.
- 137 [Lovink ()] G Lovink . *Critical history of the Internet. Moscow*, 2019. Ad Marginem Press. (garish Museum)
- 138 [Sacher ()] *Notable Releases of the Week (7/12)*, A Sacher . [http://www.brooklynvegan.com/](http://www.brooklynvegan.com/wear-your-wounds-torche-big-krit-glitterer-reviews/)
139 [wear-your-wounds-torche-big-krit-glitterer-reviews/](http://www.brooklynvegan.com/wear-your-wounds-torche-big-krit-glitterer-reviews/) 2019. (Brooklyn Vegan)
- 140 [Oxford Advanced Learner’s Dictionary] *Oxford Advanced Learner’s Dictionary*, [https://www.](https://www.oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com/definition/english/review_1)
141 [oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com/definition/english/review_1](https://www.oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com/definition/english/review_1)
- 142 [Shelestyuk ()] *Text categories of argumentation, suggestion and imperativeness as the reflection of ways to affect*
143 *verbally*, E V Shelestyuk . 2008. Chelyabinsk University Herald. N 30
- 144 [Mcluhan ()] *The Gutenberg Galaxy: The Making of Typographic Man*, M Mcluhan . 2017. Google Books.
- 145 [Castells ()] *The Network Society: A Cross-cultural Perspective*, M Castells . 2005. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.
- 146 [Nabiyeva ()] *The Review as a Publicistic Genre. The Monograph*, Ye A Nabiyeva . 2017. Moscow: FLINTA:
147 Nauka.
- 148 [Baron ()] *Thinking and Deciding*, J Baron . 2008. Cambridge University Press. (4th ed)