

1 The Opportunity Cost of Public Expenditure of Kaduna State: 2 A Case of Free Feeding Policy in Public Primary Schools

3 Vahyala Adamu Tari¹

4 ¹ Nigeria Police Academy

5 *Received: 6 December 2015 Accepted: 31 December 2015 Published: 15 January 2016*

6

7 **Abstract**

8 This paper focuses on the opportunity cost of school feeding policy introduced by Kaduna
9 State Governemnt. Kaduna State Public Primary School like any other States suffers huge set
10 back in terms of Teachers welfare, infrastructural facilities, Teachers training and development,
11 Teachers motivation among others. It is on this basis that the study critiqued government
12 choice of feeding pupils against addressing key fundamental issues confronting the core
13 objectives of educational institutions like primary schools in the State. The research solely
14 relay on secondary sources of data while Victor Vroom's expectancy theory of motivation was
15 adopted as a framework of analysis. It was deduced from the reviewed literatures that, free
16 feeding policy is counterproductive as it does not seems to be the immediate needs of Kaduna
17 State Public Primary Schools, neither does it have the capacity to meet the core objectives of
18 the policy. Thus, the paper see the policy as a way to achieve cheap political gain rather than
19 an attempt to improve the educational standard of public Primary Schools in the State. It is
20 in view of the above that the paper recommends to the State government that; Teachers
21 welfare, training and development, infrastructural development should be the centre piece of
22 Kaduna State education policy in Public Primary Schools.

23

24 **Index terms**— education, expenditure, feeding, opportunity cost, policy and school.

25 **1 Introduction**

26 ducation, according to Sen cited in Elijah and Frederick (2015) the only way to build a nation is to provide quality
27 and adequate educational infrastructure for its youth. It is through education that lives and people are shaped
28 to become future political leaders, scientists, economists, artists and thinkers. Education in its general sense is a
29 form learning in which knowledge, skills, and habits of a group of people are transferred from one generation to
30 the next through teaching, training, and research.

31 Education particularly basic education makes an important contribution to alleviating human suffering by
32 improving people ability to take advantage of the opportunities that can improve their well-being (Economic
33 Recovery Strategy 20-03-2007 in Ministry of ??ducation, 2008). This initiative can easily be struck by poverty.
34 Active participation in education by the children from families struck b y abject poverty is affected especially of
35 the family cannot afford to provide food to the children.

36 It is in view of the above that Governor Mallam Nasiru El-Rufa'I listed when the flagged it off at the Aliyu
37 Makama Local Government Education Authority (LEA) Primary School, Barnawa were quite impressive. He
38 said, the policy is aimed at boosting pupil's nutrition and health and encourage school attendance so that every
39 child can have nice years of free, decent basic education no matter the income level of their parent. He further
40 posited that the policy will also create 17,000 jobs for caterers plus thousands of their assistants; save a lot of
41 time and money for parents; boost demand for food iteams; empower women food vendors; import new skills;
42 established higher standards of hygiene and provide extra income to thousands ??Mahmud, 2016).

5 D) PUBLIC POLICY

43 No doubt, the School Feeding Policy (SFP) can be used to address temporary hunger to make a huge
44 contribution in the improvement in attendance and school achievement especially for children who do not have
45 anything to eat before going to school, result to difficulty in concentrating and performing aptitude tasks. The
46 long term objective of the SFP according to ??hatete, Pendo and Oyabi (2013) is to assist in the promotion
47 of Universal Primary Education to the socio-economically disadvantaged and nutritionally vulnerable children
48 especially girls in pre-primary and primary schools in targeted areas. The short term objectives are to increase
49 enrolment, prevent dropout, stabilized attendance and assist primary schools to improve the attention span and
50 ultimately the learning capacity of students by relieving short term hunger.

51 However, the opportunity cost of SFP in Kaduna state to a very large extent is unjustifiable considering the
52 state and nature of primary schools and the general educational sector in the state. The primary schools in
53 Kaduna is largely characterized by poor infrastructure; poor teachers welfare(where in some cases state owe 6-8
54 months salaries of teachers),absence of learning facilities and instructional aides, poor training and development
55 schemes of teachers among others. It is in view of this that, the paper seeks to investigate why Kaduna state
56 opted for school feeding against the other II.

57 2 Conceptual Clarification a) Opportunity Cost

58 Opportunity cost is the cost of an alternative that must be forgone in order to pursue a certain action. Put
59 another way, the benefit you could have received by taking an alternative action. Example within the context of
60 the subject matter if a government decides to constructs roads, the opportunity cost is the alternative projects
61 that might have been carried out instead (electricity supply, Hospital facilities, workers welfare etc).In both cases,
62 a choice between two options must be made .It would be an easy decision if you knew the end outcome; however,
63 the risk that you could achieve greater 'benefit 'with another option is the opportunity cost ??Daniel, 2015).

64 In microeconomic theory, the opportunity cost of a choice is the value of the best alternative forgone,
65 where a choice need to be made between several mutually exclusive alternatives when one alternative is chosen
66 .Opportunity cost is a key concept in economics, and has been described as expressing "the basic relationship
67 between scarcity and choice".

68 3 b) Public Expenditure

69 Public expenditure refers to government expenditure, that is, government spending. It is incurred by central,
70 state and local governments of a country. According to Supriya (2011) public expenditure can be defined as,'
71 the expenditure incurred by public authorities like Federal, State and Local Governments to satisfy the collective
72 social wants of the people. He further maintain that, in developing countries, public expenditure policy not
73 only accelerates economic growth and promote employment opportunities but also plays a useful role in reducing
74 poverty and inequalities in income distribution.

75 4 c) School Feeding

76 School feeding is a targeted social safety net that provide both educational and health benefits to the more
77 vulnerable children, thereby increasing enrolment rate, reducing absenteeism and improving security at the
78 household level (Meryers, Sampson, Weizman, Rogers et al cited in Elijah and Frederick (2015). The idea of free
79 meal in primary schools arrives from the fact that, hunger is one of the most pervasive and damaging phenomena
80 for millions of children today. Ithas far reaching effects on development of both individuals and nations. School
81 feeding is a special arrangement made in school to provide children with food to supplement what they may have
82 eaten at home to help them remain in school as a measure to reduce temporary hunger while in school ??Khatete,
83 Pendo, and Oyabi, 2013).

84 Hunger according to Elijah and Frederrick (2015) negatively affects the brain development of children and
85 impedes their chances of educational success later on. They further argued that, hunger, poverty and poor
86 education are interdependent when children are hungry, chances that they would attend school are limited and
87 without education, their chances of breaking the poverty trap are significantly reduced. Amira (2014) categories
88 School meal in to two: i. In-school meals Children are fed breakfast, lunch or both in school. Meals can be
89 prepared at the school, in the community or be delivered from centralized kitchens. Some programs provide
90 complete meals; others provide high energy biscuits or snacks.

91 ii. Take-home ratios Entire families receive food provided their children attend school regularly. Like
92 conditional cash transfers, the ratios' value compensates for the costs of sending the child to school. For
93 particularly vulnerable students, such as girls or orphans, in-school meals can be combined with take -home
94 ratios for greater impact.

95 5 d) Public Policy

96 Public policy like other social science concept has no universally accepted definition. There are as many definitions
97 as there are scholars in the field. In an attempt to do justice to the meaning of public policy, it is imperative
98 to visualize many definitions and assesses their point of departure and convergences. According to Chowdhury,
99 (2005) a recurrent problem in the social sciences is that many terms, such as "development and policy "have
100 multiple meanings and depends on who is using the term and in what context as to its meaning. Among the

101 many competing definitions of "public policy "some are very complex, while others are quite simple. Despite
102 their variations, they all agree on a certain key aspect.

103 According to Harris cited in Sambo et al (2005) public policy consists of the goals and assumptions that underlie
104 what government does, a kind of guide for government action. He went further to argue that government are
105 limited by scarce resources and by the ability to do everything at once. Consequently, policy making means that
106 government, must make choice, that is decide to do one thing rather than another or to do a little of this and a
107 lot of that. Dlakwa (2009) asserts that public policy consists of all the likes and dislikes of government that are
108 put together in the form of statutes or codified into law. He further stressed that, the passage of these likes and
109 dislikes into law inevitably segregates them from other issues that government feels compelled or not compelled
110 to act upon informally or unofficial.

111 On a similar note, Frderich (1963) also assert that public policy is a proposed course of a government

112 **6 e) Theoretical framework**

113 This research will be anchored on Vroom's expectancy theory of motivation advanced by Victor H. Vroom
114 (1964).According to this theory, the intensity of the tendency to perform in a particular manner is dependent on
115 the intensity of an expectation that the performance will be followed by a definite outcome and on the appeal
116 of the outcome to the individual. The relevance of this theory lies from the fact that, every employee in an
117 organization has pre-determined goals to attain in a time frame. It is the possibilities of attaining his targets or
118 goals that determine the level of his inputs or motivation in a work place. In a case where an employee dictates
119 his inability to meet up with his basic goals, the worker is subsequently de-motivated.

120 According to Sapru (2013) expectancy theory focuses on performance variables. The theory argues that
121 a person's motivation towards an action would be determined by the expectation towards an action would
122 be determined by the expectation that the effort would culminate in a success. Expectancy is the perceived
123 probability of satisfying a particular need of an individual based on past experience. In a more practical terms,
124 expectancy theory says that employees will be motivated to exert a high level of effort when they believe that
125 effort will lead to a good performance appraisal, that a good appraisal will lead to organizational rewards such
126 as a bonus, a salary increase, or a promotion; and that the rewards will satisfy the employees personal goals.
127 The chain goes like this; individual effort-individual performance-organizational reward-personal goals.

128 In this case many lot of teachers 'in primary schools in Zaria and Sabon Gari local government see the
129 performance-reward relationship (performance outcome)in their job as being weak .The reason is that an
130 organization may reward a lot of things besides just performance. For example, the free meal scheme have
131 a short term positive impact on the pupils' and the great expectation of having a meal in school is a significant
132 motivation to the pupils 'and a plus to government or the educational sector in terms of enrolment, retention
133 and completion.

134 It is in relation to this that this paper has observed that most employers tend to ignore workers' needs in their
135 effort to achieve cheap political points or effort to produce more at lower cost per unit. This may be possible in
136 the short run, but in the long run, there are adverse effects leading to grievances, frustration, and higher rate
137 of labour turn-over which in the final analysis may not be in the interest of the employer. It is in view of this
138 that Victor Vroom's expectancy theory has to be recognized and enforced.

139 According to Ngu (2014) the expectancy theory implies that workers come to the organization with certain
140 basic expectations or needs which they strive to achieve, and the more they achieve them, the more they are
141 motivated to work and increase the output which in the final analysis leads to the achievement and maximization
142 of the employer's objectives. It was the expectation of the research study that, the Kaduna State government
143 would have considered making teacher comfortable and the learning environment conducive for learning before
144 introducing the feeding program. Such would have gone a long way to revive the past glory of teachers and the
145 long time retrogressive status of primary education in Kaduna State.

146 **7 f) Review of Literature**

147 According to the UN World Food Program, in developing countries almost 60 million children go to school
148 hungry every day, about 40% of them are in Africa. In the poorest countries, school feeding policy is emerging
149 as a common social safety net response to the crisis. In 2008, 20 governments looked to school feeding programs
150 as a safety net response to protect the poorest. The UN World Food Program assisted some 22 million children
151 with school feeding in 70 countries, and the World Bank Group launched a Global Food Crisis Response to the
152 food and fuel crisis, including by scaling up school feeding program (WFP Report, 2010).

153 School meal program help in reducing the risk of school withdrawal, low attendance; poor concentration and
154 improve the school child performance; however, Amira (2014) posited that major differences exist in the provision,
155 composition, effective application and stability throughout school systems and in accordance to the economic
156 status of different countries. According to Oyefede cited in Isa et al (2012), there are as many types of programs
157 as there are countries, but they can be classified into two main groups based on their modalities:

158 ? In-school feeding, where children are fed in the school which can be divided into two categories namely;
159 a) program that provides meals b) Program that provides high energy biscuits or Snacks.

160 ? Take home rations where families are given food if their children attend school.

7 F) REVIEW OF LITERATURE

161 All public schools in Unite Kingdom offer school launches everyday of the week, where approximately 45% of
162 primary and secondary school pupils are provided with meal for children nowadays more than food provided at
163 school (Michele and Jonathan 2009).in addition, school meals are part of a means -tested program; such that
164 18% of the pupil population from less privileged backgrounds is eligible to receive school meals for free ??Amira,
165 2014).

166 The USA has been serving breakfast to school children across the nation since the pilot program began in
167 1966.Today,the School Breakfast Program (SBP),a federal and state reimbursement program for each breakfast
168 served that meet federal requirements, has provided breakfast for more than 8.5 million children nationwide
169 (Levinger,1992, cited in Amira, 2014).

170 The Kenya school feeding program started in 1980 for most urban schools and by 1995 a national policy
171 articulated that school meal are compulsory in all primary schools in Kenya. In 2003 both the WFP and the
172 Ministry of Education collaborated in an effective program aiming at expansion and refinement of the food
173 program in rural schools in particular (Langinger, cited in Amira2014).

174 India also said to have a long tradition of school feeding program, largly by the state government with some
175 external assistance. India Supreme Court directed the state governments to introduce school feeding program in
176 all government and government assisted primary schools. This was the result of a petition from the People Union
177 for Liberties large coalition of organizations and individuals that led to the Right to food campaign (Akandi
178 and Alayande, 2011). In Brazil, the school feeding program is in the country's constitution, and is part of the
179 government's Zero Hungry Program (ZHP),covering nearly 37 million children each year, the program is among
180 the largest in the world. Its implementation are managed by the disbursement of the financial recourses for school
181 meals in each municipality (Akanbi and Alayande, cited in Khalid and Sherif, 2012).

182 The Nigeria government is yet to make school feeding a national policy despite the obvious hunger and
183 nutritional deficiencies among pupils in primary school. Even though, school feeding might not necessarily be the
184 immediate focus of government in Nigeria base on the nature and character of educational sector especially in
185 primary schools in both urban and rural areas. It is amazing that most of the state own primary schools are in a
186 state of decadence, with poor teachers' welfare and incessant industrial conflict as a result of teachers neglect by
187 the government. Thus, many parents and stakeholders in the educational concern of Nigeria see school feeding
188 policy as couunter productive, as teachers who constitute the engine room are not motivated to take the job as a
189 vocation.

190 The unique system of free meal in primary school introduced by Governor Mallam Nasiru El-Rufai is a good
191 model for other states with exception of Osun state were the policy have been consistent for sometime. However,
192 and in spite of the lunches provided have to meet one third of the pupil's daily nutritional requirements, school
193 meal services in Zaria and Sabon Gari Local Government Areas of Kaduna State do not always have a good
194 reputation among pupils, parents, teachers or the communities stakeholders. The most common complaints are
195 long queues, cramped, late arrival of the meal, lack of dinning Hall, overcrowded dinning areas. It is in relation
196 to this that the paper agrees with Amira (2014) were he argued that, an unfriendly eating environment has a
197 major consequences of eating behaviour ,including an increase in plate waste overcrowded and noisy lunch rooms.

198 The Kaduna state feeding policy most immediate purpose appears to boost school enrolment. In this goal it
199 has already succeeded, probably beyond expectations. Governor El-Rufa'i said since the program started, pupil's
200 enrolment in Kaduna Public Schools has jumped by 64% to 1.8 million. There could be a small problem with the
201 feeding timing. DailyTrust on Saturday's reporter found that the food vendors arrived at the school at 8:30 am
202 and serve the pupils when they came out on break at 9:00an to 10:00am.The reporters also said the pupils were
203 more eager to talk about food than about school curriculum. The suspicion is that many of them go to school
204 just for the food (Mahmud,2016).It has equally reported by Vanguard (15 th March, 2016) that Kaduna State
205 Government, yesterday, expressed concern over the desertion of schools by primary pupils after taking the free
206 meal offered them. The pupils have developed the habit of leaving school immediately after the free meal under
207 the guise of going to drink water. Commissioner for Education, Science and Technology, Dr.Shehu Adamu, told
208 newsmen in Kaduna that government was disturbed by this situation. It is further argued that, the boost in
209 school attendance quickly raises the question; are other facilities in place to accommodate such an astronomical
210 boost in enrolment with in such a short time? Number of classrooms, numbers of teachers, teachres' quality
211 and welfare; furniture and teaching aids were already in short supply, not only in Kaduna State but all over the
212 country (Daily Trust, 2016). On weekly basis, school feeding policy cost around 300 million which is around the
213 cost educating children in some developing countries. When compared with deworming, free school uniform or
214 teachers incentives, feeding program may not be the most cost effective way for policymakers to raise enrolment.
215 But when viewed as a social transfer-as another way to help poor families feed their children and get them to
216 school, feeding program can be very useful. Drawing a lesson from the foregoing discussion, it can be deduced
217 that the SFP introduced by the Kaduna State Government is a mere politics on the psyche of the masses hiding
218 under the guise of improving education quality in the state. Boosting education need should take a holistic
219 approach taking its root from the budget proposal to a level of implementation. This argument is in consistent
220 with Jideofor (2016) who argued that: Promoting education and health: The ??auchi ??016) says "?The issue of
221 feeding school children by the State government is a misplacement of periority; the continuity of the policy is not
222 certain because they will not have the political will to sustain the feeding is not the way to make children come
223 to school, when you attract children with food ,when the food is no longer there, they will run away from school.

224 Government should have concentrated on other areas like training the teachers and getting people supervise the
225 schools..."

226 **8 g) Analyzing the Opportunity Cost**

227 Like any other public primary school teachers in Nigeria, various research exploring Kaduna state teachers
228 working condition shows that, teachers are poorly taken care of and are dissatisfied with their living and working
229 conditions. The key reasons for this are not far fetch:

230 ? Poor salaries and irregular payment of teachers' salaries

231 **9 ? Poor infrastructures**

232 ? Lack of teachers training and development
233 ? Inadequate fringe benefits

234 **10 ? Poor supervision**

235 ? Lack of instructional materials This paper critically observed that these conditions are responsible for low
236 teacher morale and the difficulty in attracting and retaining qualify youths into the teaching profession. It is in
237 line with this, the papercritique the rationale behind Kaduna State government for making sensitive and critical
238 aspect of the primary school educational sector an opportunity cost to Free Feeding Policy. It is observed that
239 according to Mahmud (2016) Kaduna state spend a weekly bill of 300 million on school feeding pregame. This
240 implies that the State government spend about 4 billion every school term. This amount can be channel into one
241 or two of the problems identified above. Additionally, such huge amount can be injected into; renovation and
242 furnishing of primary schools, enhanced teacher training and confort, close monitoring and inspection of schools
243 and teachers, provition of free uniforms, provition of books and working tools, increase in daily spending from
244 #33 to #180 per primary pupil for three meals, free, compulsory basic education for all.

245 The above point of view is in consonance with Iiunor cited in Emmanuel atal (2005) said "training is one tool
246 which management uses to develop the effectiveness of human resources in many organizations. The effective
247 development of human resources of the educational system is one vital contribution to the future, long term
248 growth and survival of education". This call our attention that, the success of educational system in Kaduna
249 state depends mainly on the quality of teachers, and their training because of the explosion brought about by
250 technological innovation.

251 In the same vein, teachers are engine room of any educational system and indeed the nation and whose morale
252 is low is not likely to perform as expected. A hungry teacher cannot be committed neither does it seat and watch
253 pupils eating their meal with a smelling face. Hence, when teachers are not properly motivated, their level of job
254 performance may be low and the core objectives of the school may not be accomplished.

255 In an attempt to establish the relevance of staff motivation Ngu (2014) argued that: Workers motivation as a
256 pre-requisite for human relation. It is an essential ingredient inhuman relation. In fact, it is part and parcel of
257 human relations. It is nevertheless synonymous with human relations because while it is possible to have workers
258 motivation without necessarily embracing the wide spectrum of human relations? Although the achievement of
259 the later does not necessarily mean the achievement of the former; it enhances the chance of attaining good
260 human relations both within and outside the organization, and is therefore worth pursuing. This is so because
261 habitually aggrieved or disgruntled and frustrated workers cannot be expected to present or exhibit a good image
262 of their organization. If anything such workers tend to portray a bad image of their organization.

263 It can be deduced from the above submission that, employee's motivation has a great role to play in enhancing
264 the workers to project the image of institution or organization in a good light while the objectives of the institution
265 is likely to be achieved with maximum impact.

266 **11 III.**

267 Policy Recommendations ? The state government should partner with Parents Teachers Associations (PTA) to
268 come up with measures to restrict pupils from sneaking homes after meals.

269 ? Government attention should not completely swing to huge attendance in schools, rather should also focus
270 on measures to ensure education/school curriculums are treated and updated.

271 ? Kaduna State Government should change the psyche that makes pupils think school as a means to an end,
272 rather an end in itself.

273 IV.

274 **12 Conclusion**

275 The proponents of school feeding policy claim that providing food in schools would ostensibly attract less privilege
276 children to schools, improves their attendance and reduced drop-outs. However, drawing a lesson from the content
277 analysis of literatures, the paper sees the school feeding program as mere chasing shadows or an attempt to gain



Figure 1:

[Note: s within a given environment providing obstacles and opportunities which the policy was proposed to utilized and overcome in an effort to reach a goal or realize in objective or purpose. Jenkins and Anderson cited inDlakwa (2009) conceptualisations of public]

Figure 2:

Figure 3: ?

278 cheap political point at the expense of the obvious challenges confronting primary school educational sector in
279 Kaduna state.¹

-
- 280 It was deduced from the research that; government own primary schools teachers' salaries, which characterized
281 by poor welfare scheme, poor training and development, poor instructional aid and infrastructures among others.
282 It is thus, the position of this paper that; in as much as Feeding Policy is timely and necessary considering the
283 level of low enrolment pupils especially the girl-child in schools, hunger and poverty across the nation, making it
284 a topmost priority at the expense of the fundamentals is counter -productive.
- 285 [Sambo et al. ()] , A Sambo , S B Bitrus , U (Garba . 2005. Essentials of Public Administration. Kano. Flash
286 Printer Ltd.
- 287 [Khatete and Pendo ()] , I W Khatete , S Pendo . 2013. (et al)
- 288 [Emmanuel and Gbadegesin ()] , O A Emmanuel , M A Gbadegesin . 2015.
- 289 [Amira (2004)] 'A review of progress of school meal programs in the globe'. Y B Amira . *Sky Journal of food
290 science* 2004. December. 3 (6) .
- 291 [Sapru ()] *Administrative Theories and Management Thought (3 rd Edition)* Delhi, PHI Learning Private Ltd,
292 R Sapru . 2013.
- 293 [Dlakwa ()] *Concept and Models in Public Policy formulation and analysis*, H Dlakwa . 2009. Kaduna: Pyla-Mak
294 Service Ltd.
- 295 [Daniel ()] K Daniel . *What is opportunity cost and why does it matter*. Wikipedia, the free encyclopaedia, 2016.
- 296 [Elijah and Frederick ()] 'Effect of the National School Feeding Programme on Pupil's Enrolment, Attendance
297 and Retention: A case study of Nyoglo of the Savelugu-Nantong Municipality'. Y Elijah , D Frederick . *Ghana.
298 British Journal of Education* 2015. (Society and Behavioural Service)
- 299 [Chowdhury (2005)] 'Elites and Policy Making: A case of Chittagong Hill Tract Accord Making in Bangladesh'.
300 N Chowdhury . *Asian Affairs* 2005. July-September, 2005. 27 p. .
- 301 [National guidelines for school meal planning and implementation. Abuja: Federal Ministry of Education ()]
302 *National guidelines for school meal planning and implementation*. Abuja: Federal Ministry of Education,
303 2007. (Federal Ministry of Education)
- 304 [Ngu ()] *Personnel Management in Nigeria: Principles and Practice*. Zaria, S M Ngu . 2014. Ahmadu Bello
305 University Press.
- 306 [Supriya ()] *Public Expenditure: Meaning, importance, classification and other details*. Wikipedia, the free
307 encyclopaedia, G Supriya . 2011.
- 308 [Isa et al. ()] 'School Feeding Program in Nigeria: A vehicle for Nourishment of Pupils'. An online'. Y Isa , M G
309 Ahmed , Khalid . *Journal of the African Educational Research Network* 2012. 12 (2) .
- 310 [School Input Factors and Teacher Effectiveness in Some Local Government Areas of Lagos State Nigeria. International Journal of
311 'School Input Factors and Teacher Effectiveness in Some Local Government Areas of Lagos State'. *Nigeria.*
312 *International Journal of Education Science* 8 (3) p. .
- 313 [State of school feeding worldwide: World Food Programme ()] *State of school feeding worldwide: World Food
314 Proramme*, 2013. Rome: WFP. (World Food Programme (WFP))