

CrossRef DOI of original article:

The Argumentation Theory in Kalam in Maverannahr and Usage of its Practice Techniques in Discussions on the Websites of Uzbekistan

Gulchekhra Tulemetova¹

¹ International Islamic Academy of Uzbekistan,

Received: 1 January 1970 Accepted: 1 January 1970 Published: 1 January 1970

Abstract

The article is dedicated to the historical prerequisites for the formation of the theory of argumentation in the works of representatives of the Kalam schools in Maverannahr in the 9th to 13th centuries. It is especially important to study the legacy of the Maturidian and Asharian Kalam when it comes to solving modern issues of argumentation and verification and conducting a religious examination in Uzbekistan, which began a new stage in its history.

Index terms—

1 Introduction

The policy of today's Uzbekistan is associated with large-scale reforms, primarily in science and education. The practical objective is associated with the creation of an effective mechanism that revives the intellectual environment in the country and with the development of a methodology aimed at encouraging the population to reason. Purposeful activities in this direction can increase the intellectual and technological potential of the country.

Internet discussions on theological issues of Islam in modern Uzbekistan have shown a lack of knowledge in the field of theory and practice of argumentation, as well as tolerance to a different point of view and ethics of scientific discussions. In this regard, the revival of the medieval Kalam methodology, combined with the observance of the rules of the theory of argumentation and ethical norms of scientific discussion, is an important educational factor in religious policy.

The intellectual heritage of the Kalam XI-XIII centuries provides rich material for improving the methodology of scientific analysis of religious texts. This is especially true at the present time, when extremist and international terrorist organizations, hiding behind religious dogmas, continue to spread radical views and violence in society, inciting youth to violence, loss of national identity, cultural, educational, moral and family values. All this creates conditions for the involvement of citizens in the ranks of extremist and terrorist organizations. In this regard, an important task is to conduct a comprehensive analysis of the state of interethnic and interfaith relations in the country, develop a forecast of the prospects for the development of the situation and measures to reduce and eliminate the risks, challenges and threats of extremism and terrorism. (National strategy of the Republic of Uzbekistan on countering extremism and terrorism for 2021-2026. Decree of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated July 1, 2021 No. PQ-6255). The latter is directly related to the task of conducting a religious examination of materials of religious content. Especially texts, audio and video materials of sites that publish materials of religious content. An appeal to the experience of Kalam in the analysis of religious texts can provide rich methodological material for religious scholars and all those interested in theoretical problems of Islamic theology (feces) and practical issues of Islamic law (fiqh).

Discussion of urgent social issues of Islam on websites in recent years has caused a number of problems associated with 1) issues of religious dogma, 2) with the nature of public discussions and debates (the level of ethics, scientific nature and consistency), 3) conducting a religious examination of sites that publish materials on a religious topic in the .uz national domain zone. It is obvious that science, the media and Muslim communities

are in critical need of expert opinions from religious scholars, objective information and religious research on many practical and theoretical issues of Islam. In this regard, it is advisable to investigate the prehistory of the formation of the foundations of the argumentation theory, which is rooted in the medieval Kalam, to analyze the types of open discussions of the 11th-13th centuries and their modern forms of expression. This will enable religious experts to understand the line of reasoning and arguments of the ideologists of religious organizations, assess the consistency of conclusions, identify contradictions in judgments, formulate methodological principles for organizing and conducting a comprehensive (linguistic, psychological, ethical) extrajudicial religious examination of relevant materials.

In this article, using the example of the study of the argumentation theory in the writings of the most prominent representatives of the Kalam (mutakallim) and his associates, the answers to questions: 1) How did the mutakallims of Maverannahr in the 11th-13th centuries convince listeners and readers of the rectitude of their ideas? 2) How can this knowledge be useful today? 3) Can the intellectual heritage of Kalam outreach help Uzbekistan in innovative activities to increase the intellectual and technological potential of the country? II.

2 The Kalam

The historical prerequisites for the development of the theory and practice of argumentation were the differences in the views of various madhhabs on issues of fiqh (Islamic law). Their polemics among themselves and with representatives of other denominations often escalated into philosophical discussions. This is due to the fact that, in addition to the Quran of a common source and basis, when solving legal issues, various madhhabs also apply the Sunnah, the prescriptions of religious authorities, the opinion of the religious community, local customs and morals (urf, adat) and etc. Thus, the decisions of the faqihs of different madhhabs inevitably differed, which led to the formation of different trends and groups (firqa) in Islam. In addition, the coexistence of various religious schools, the development of new religious doctrines within the Arab civilization also served as a factor prompting heated discussions. All this together led to the formation among the Muslim theologians-Mu'tazilites of the 8th-9th centuries of a special discipline called kalam (ilm al-kalam) (Tulemetova and Hasanbayev 2021: 181-82; 196-197).

The 9th century is considered the heyday of the Mu'tazilite Kalam, its ideas spread in the 12th-13th centuries in Maverannahr. Rationalistic attitudes and a number of theological and philosophical constructions of Mutazilism became the property of the later Kalam directions -Asharism and Maturidism. Depending on the methodology used and the direction of argumentation, kalam is divided into rational (aql), based mainly on the arguments of reason, and narrative (naql), referring mainly to the Quran, hadith and other primary sources. The Mutazilites ("isolated", "separated") tried to interpret the Muslim doctrine in a rational spirit, asserted the priority of reason over blind faith, called to doubt the truth of something until the opposite was proved. (Prozorov Sergey 1991: 175-176). Shamsuddin al-Samarkandi was a prominent Turkic-Islamic mutakallim who lived in Maverannahr at the end of the 13th century and in the first quarter of the 14th century. He was one of those Muslim thinkers who argued that the Prophet Muhammad was proclaimed in previous scriptures. In particular, he pointed to the evidence for this in the Bible. His constructive criticism has been instrumental in understanding and interpreting the ideas of numerous thinkers, from Greek to Islamic philosophers and theologians (Tanr?bilir, Tar?k and Herguener, Esra 2020).

For clarity, let us compare the main method of proof in kalam (ilzam, tas'i?) and its use in the practice of Sh. Samarkandi (tas'i? al-burhan is a proof of an argument; tas'i? al-illa is a proof of a reason). And also, al-Bukhari's method of proving the authenticity of hadiths -tas'i? al-naql -proof of what was heard or written down, quotes.

Ilzam in the language of modern argumentation theory is a dialectical dialogue. An experienced mutakallim asks questions in such a way that the responding opponent is at a dead end and he has to agree. But often opponents violate or do not know the rules of logic, use tricks like heuristics or sophistry, argue endlessly. Samarkandi logically believed that the debate should be finite, because the relation of the argument (dalil) to the proved -(madlul) -is the relation of cause (illa) to effect (malul). Otherwise, the proof process will be endless. This idea of Samarkandi made him a pioneer in the argumentation theory (Karabela 2010: 133-134).

Unlike the exact sciences, where everything is rational, in matters of religion, the discussion also affects the feelings, values, moral convictions of opponents. Therefore, the dispute often turns into polemics. Mjadala (i.e., active jadal, controversy) -a dispute for the sake of a dispute, in order to defeat the enemy. Polemics give a win in the dispute, but do not lead to the best solution to the issue. Munazaraconstructive, benevolent discussion, discussion, the definition of tavazhuh is acceptable to it. This ambiguous term kalama in this context means the belief of the opponent; focusing on the process of proof, on arguments, on the observance of the rules of logic.

As mentioned before, al-Bukhari, during the verification of hadiths for authenticity in the 9th century, effectively used the method of verification -tashih alnaql, referred to verbal and written evidence. Verification is the process of confirming the truth of an action, event, item or its quality after verification.

Verification is especially valuable in theology, where the question of truth is most urgent. According to the degree of truthfulness of hadiths, al-Bukhari ranked them: true; the good, the weak, the wrong.

Verification of hadiths involved analyzing the content of the hadith text (content analysis), then interrogating the chain of hadith transmitters (isnad). Only then followed the proven informative part -the main text (matn). al-Bukhari followed the main principle of verification, he compared the result with the requirements for a reliable

hadith, in many respects he himself developed its high standards. To be credible, al-Bukhari studied in detail the lives of all people in the chain of Hadith transmitters. Thus, al-Bukhari used a method verifying details called fact-checking. This modern term characterizes the ethical aspect of the test result: honesty, impartiality.

The wide spread and authority of Sahih al-Bukhari practically led him to canonization, as the second source after the Holy Quran. Along with other numerous factors, the appearance of such a detailed Volume XXII Issue IX Version I 46 () multivolume work was the reason for disagreements in the application of the opinion of the religious community (ijmo), local customs, law (urf, adat). The Mutakallim made extensive use of reasonable arguments and logical reasoning in public debate. This brought them closer to the philosophers. The weakness of verification, as a method of verifying the truth in Islamic theology, lies in the fact that, being rational, it does not take into account religious dogmas (aqidah). Therefore, along with the principle of verification in religious philosophy, the principle of falsification (i.e., refutability) is used. Mutakallims were characterized by the use of the method of proof from the contradiction (ilzam). The opponent agrees with the thesis of mutakallim, and he draws a conclusion undesirable for the opponent, or absurd. A typical example: "Do you claim that there is no God? Can you prove that there is no God? No? Therefore, this concept is quite acceptable for study along with rational ones".

The like-minded Imam Bukhari and the bright representative of Kalam -Muhammad Abu Mansur al-Maturidi (870-944 yy.), using the principle of falsification, published a series of "Denials" refuting the arguments of the mu'tazilites. Being a very erudite and experienced lawyer, Maturidi virally used the methods of falsification in evidence and possessed well-deserved authority (Tulemetova and Gulomova 2020: 88).

Based on the background formation of different schools, groups (firqa) in Islam, the first direction in Arab-Muslim philosophy began to form -kalam. In the Middle Ages, the term kalam was used in a broad sense, in the meaning of any philosophizing on a religious topic. In a narrow sense, it is the justification of the foundations of Islam in a rational way (aql). This brings the Mutakallim closer to philosophers and differs from the Salafis, who mainly used canonical precepts (naql) as evidence. According to the Mutakallims, truly believing Muslims are those who tested themselves by doubting the dogmas of faith and accepted those provisions, the truth of which their own reason confirms. Since almost all the thinkers of Maverannahr were Muslims, the large-scale practice of argumentation stimulated the development of science and the promotion of new ideas in the exact sciences (al-Khorezmi, Biruni, Fergani), in medicine (Ibn Sina), in Islamic philosophy (al-Farabi), etc.

The great representative of Islamic philosophy, Ibn Sina brought the rationalistic ideas of the Mutakallims, Aristotelianism, Neoplatonism and Pharabism closer to the Islamic doctrine with the help of simple rules of logic. Realizing that the search for truth is a formal process that does not depend on the will of a person, the scientist was a principled supporter of honesty and objectivity in science. al-Maturidi, as an experienced mutakallim, skillfully used argumentation in a series of "Refutations" against the Mutazillites. Mutakallims like al-Ashari and al-Maturidi have presented their thoughts in their respective works about the cosmological argument to rationally prove the existence of God. These Greek philosophers and Muslim theologians reflect on the universe to prove that its existence proves the existence of its creator who is different from the created universe.

3 III.

4 The Analysis

A content analysis of religious materials posted on official websites in the national domain zone in 2018-2021 indicate that some bloggers and religious ideologists in Uzbekistan widely use the techniques of kalam adab al-bahth. But not always consistently and logically, as a result of which they come to false conclusions that can lead to tragic consequences. For example, arguing that reading some surahs is enough to fight COVID-19. The material studied indicates that there are not enough professional religious scholars in the country to examine a huge active range of audio and video materials on websites. For this reason, you can find posts on them with unreasonable arguments, false conclusions. In November 2019, the Charter of the Committee on Religious Affairs in Uzbekistan was updated. It named among the urgent tasks the verification and implementation of the religious expert examination of religious products produced in the country or imported from abroad.

The topic of state religious examination in Uzbekistan is an insufficiently explored area of scientific research. The State Religious Expertise in Uzbekistan is carried out by the Committee on Religious Affairs under the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistana single organization that carries out state-confessional regulation in the country. With the measures initiated in April 2018 by the President of Uzbekistan Sh. Mirziyoyev to radically improve the activities of the religious and educational sphere, as well as the goals and objectives formulated of the Committee of Religious Affairs (CORA), updated in November 2019, the actual objective is to verify and carry out a religious examination of religious products, produced in the country or imported from abroad (press and electronic publications, audio, video tapes, CDs, DVDs and other electronic media, religious materials posted on the Internet).

The Constitution of Uzbekistan, state legal acts, decrees, and the CORA regulations contain fundamental articles on the balance of secularism and religiosity. In particular, the urgent tasks of the Committee on Religious Affairs are: practical implementation of the principle of the secular state of the Republic of Uzbekistan, protection of guarantees of freedom of conscience of citizens and establishment of cooperation with interested organizations; organizing educational events for leaders of religious organizations in order to expand their worldview, deepen

their understanding of the principles of a secular state, the essence of government policy in the field of religion, and ongoing reforms; ensuring the compliance of the content of sermons delivered during the performance of religious rites, the Constitution and laws of the Republic of Uzbekistan and the principles of a secular state. However, the content analysis of the websites of some Muslim organizations indicates the presence of messages with radical religious overtones, misinterpretation of the verses of the Quran, and a lack of information about an important area of Islam -Muslim culture and art. According to the reasonable opinion of the authoritative orientalist Babadjanov, highly educated, specially trained people should work with complex theological texts, especially the Quran. Hence follows the urgent objective of training competent religious scholars for the implementation of religious expertise.

Another urgent task is the inspection of materials distributed through various channels. In the period from 2017 to 2020, the CORA carried out a religious examination, issuing 1611 expert opinions. 75% -concerning literature with religious content, 15%periodicals and only 10% -examination of audio-video materials, which constitute the main content of the websites of religious organizations.

The consistent state policy in the sphere of religion in Uzbekistan, the harmonious combination of secularism and religiosity is evidenced by the nature of the information on the national domain .uz, in the zone of which the official websites of Muslim organizations operate in an interactive mode. For example, the Islam.uz portal, founded in 2003 by Sheikh Muhammad Sadyk Muhammad Yusuf, famous in the Islamic world, widely promotes the true understanding of Islam. In 2016, the Islam.uz portal was modernized, and in 2018 it began to even more meet the needs of students and social network users who want to improve their religious education: to learn lessons, ask questions of interest, read stories, etc. In addition to theoretical issues of Islam and practical issues of ritual practice of Muslims, the updated portal Islam.uz publishes materials in Arabic, Russian, English of a secular nature: mutual respect in family and marriage, etc. portal materials are available in three foreign languages simultaneously.

Competition of religious denominations among themselves and with the state for influence in cyberspace for control over information sources, for outstripping the speed of transmission and acceptance of messages, an increase in the number of subscribers on social networks, in many respects complicates the task of operational religious studies of constantly updated sites (Elbakyan, Religious Expertise in the Light of General Scientific Principles).

Discussions on the socio-philosophical issues of Islam on the websites of Uzbekistan caused the need to improve the quality of the religious examination of materials on a religious topic. In this regard, it is advisable to reveal the prehistory of the formation of the foundations of the argumentation theory in the medieval Kalam and their modern forms, since the discussions were around the same topics. This will raise the level of public discussions to a qualitatively new level, revive the traditions of intellectual history, and determine the methodological principles for organizing and conducting a religious examination of the relevant materials. This is especially true in conditions when humanitarians who are incompetent in matters of Islamic theology take on the role of experts in religious studies and appear on the Internet with their "conclusions" on behalf of the entire Muslim community of Uzbekistan. This task is of particular relevance in the context of a shortage of highly educated experts in religion who have the skills to analyze complex theological texts, especially the Quran. Hence follows the urgent task of training competent religious scholars with the practical skills of a comprehensive examination and knowledge of the argumentation theory.

The theoretical concepts and practical activities of representatives of the Kalam school in Maverannahr in the 11th-13th centuries played an important role in the development of scientific thought, primarily in the field of exact sciences. The genius and outstanding talent of world-famous scientists -Beruni, Khorezmi, Fergani, Ibn Sina, and others could be realized primarily by the favorable conditions of the Eastern Renaissance, the fruitful mutual enrichment of Islamic science and scientific traditions of Uzbekistan in the pre-Islamic period. And also, thanks to the rationalistic views of Kalam representatives, their promotion of the idea of the main role of reason in the process of cognition, a call for scientific creativity against the background of intensive educational activities.

Religious discussions of the last decade on the websites of the national domain of Uzbekistan have exacerbated the problem of tolerance to other points of view during the scientific discussion. Let us consider what factors influence the nature of scientific discussions, the degree of their tolerance, what reasons turn scientific discussion into an endless "dispute for the sake of a dispute" and how representatives of the medieval Kalam dealt with such problems.

Discussions become most acute in the theological and secular interpretation of the issues of Islam. At the same time, secularism is mistakenly understood as atheism, which denies the "divine" in the world, pretending to be scientific in its arguments. Theologians defend the Muslim faith, referring to the authority of the Quran and Sunnah, the absolute truth of religious dogmas. The secular approach is focused on the objectivity, scientific nature and consistency of the study of religion. The application of ethical norms, rules for conducting a discussion and tolerance of other opinions can reduce the tension and potential conflict of Volume XXII Issue IX Version I 48 () discussions. The most important norms include respect and acceptance of various forms of manifestation of a scientist's individuality. This principle is easy to follow, since it applies equally to good breeding. Compliance with the "do not get personal" rule during the discussion can create and maintain an atmosphere of constructive discussion.

The next rule is to reach consensus by nonaggressive methods. The ability to compromise can also be

seen as integral to tolerance. But here it is important to see the line where the compromise ends and the inadmissible concession to fundamental scientific positions begins. Constructive criticism, the use of noncategorical expressions, demonstration of doubt, uncertainty can smooth out the negative consequences of criticism. The use of emotional and evaluative characteristics of opponents' arguments in a discussion is in no way permissible. For example, the parties sometimes call each other's weak arguments "flimsy", illogical argumentation "delirium", and so on. The criteria for the scientific nature of the discussion are: the lack of categoricity in substantiating one's own point of view, the use of expressions such as: "if I am not mistaken", "I think it seems to me", "it would be advisable to check, clarify your thesis, dear ...", "with all due respect to I have to object to your position ...", etc. Constructive dialogue is also hindered by biased "pseudo-religious" studies, which cite dubious, unconfirmed facts. Unfortunately, such "studies" mislead both religious scholars and theologians. (Tulemetova, "Actual questions of scientific discussion").

The rapid development of world science and religious education in Uzbekistan often prompts theologians to provide scientific evidence in favor of religion. These attempts most often lead to negative consequences, since modern domestic theologians have sufficient scientific erudition, logic, and openness to novelty is a great rarity. As a result, website visitors, especially young people, begin to doubt, err on matters of faith, and often take the side of the radicals. The experience of the Central Asian mutakallim can help here, their scientific erudition was famous throughout the Islamic world. Especially the methods of proving the existence of God in Kalam in the context of the attempts of the Islamic theologians-mutakallim to justify the position of the Quran about God as the origin and cause of creation. Particularly, methods of proving the existence of God that were proposed by Kalam in the 10th and 12th centuries. To substantiate the existence of God, the Mutakallim used argumentation dating back to ancient Greek metaphysics, as well as mental procedures based on the texts of the Quran and Sunnah. The latter include: ? references to historical events of the pre-Islamic period of Arabia, described in the Quran and hadith (Quran, Surah 27:15); ? arguments in favor of "innate knowledge", that is, the assertion that it is enough for a thinking person to remember his creation (Quran, Surah 36:78-79); ? arguments in favor of the order that reigns in nature at the will of the almighty and just Creator (Quran, Sura 17:12). The rationalistic Kalam method influenced Islamic traditionalism. This can be seen in the example of the proof of the existence of God by Ibn Taymiyyah (d. 1328), a fakikh of the Hambali madhhab, one of the largest Islamic traditionalist theologians. When substantiating the existence of God, he relied not only on the Quran and Sunnah, but also on the theory of argumentation of Kalam. (Nasyrov "Proofs of the existence of God in medieval Islamic theology (Kalam)": 53).

The crisis of theology in the second half of the 10th century in Samarkand, which came as a result of the struggle of the Samanids against the Karmats in particular and all dissent in general, dealt a blow to the intellectual environment of Maverannahr. Under the slogan of "struggle against karmatism" the conformist theologians dealt with their ideological opponents, the government -with the opposition. As a result, by the end of the Samanid rule, all dissenting theologians were repressed by the authorities. Only the Hanafis from the "Ahl as-Sunna wa-l-Jamaa" remained. Loyalty to the political system, state, loyalty become the main requirements in assessing the statements, ideas, activities of the theologian. The Caliph's successor and prominent Samarkand theologian Myhammad u6n Myca al-Miti ranked the most principled dissenting Karmats in the category of "kafir murtadd" and demanded the death penalty for them.

The revival of Maturidia under the Karakhanids (999-1212) is associated with the socio-political and scientific activities in Samarkand of three fakikhs from the Nasaf region: Muhammad al-Pazdavi an-Nasafi (om. In Byxape in 1100); ero 6rat al-shaykh al-imam az-zahid Abd al-Karim al-Pazdawi an-Nasafi (d. in Kesh in 482/1089) u A6y-l-Myun Maymun ibn Muhammad al-Makhuli an-Nasafi (d. in 508/1115 r.). They inherited the scientific traditions of theologians' of southern Sogd and brought them to the Samarkand environment. (Ashirbek Muminov" Early period in the evolution of the Maturidite doctrine": 89-90).

Such a broad erudition of the Kalam representatives and their followers is largely due to the nature of the curricula of the wide network of madrasahs in the X-XIII centuries on the territory of Maverannahr. In addition to knowledge of the basic theological disciplines, a prerequisite for admission to madrasah was knowledge of philosophical and exact sciences -philosophy, logic, rhetoric (balagat), handasa (geometry, drawing), hisab (arithmetic, algebra), astronomy (hayat). The curriculum included many interdisciplinary subjects such as lexicography (lugat), syntax (nahv), history (tarix), geography. The system of religious education of this type contributed to the high-quality training of not only experts in the Quran, hadith, Islamic law in Central Asia, but also representatives of many humanitarian and exact sciences. Ashirbek Muminov, in the course of a comparative study of the Central Asian and Ottoman systems of religious education, revealed the enormous influence of the scientific traditions of Central Asia on the formation and development of Ottoman madrasahs. There were 500 of them under Sultan Muhammad Fatih (1451-1481). Adjusting the curricula of religious institutions in Uzbekistan, including in them, in addition to theological, also secular natural-scientific disciplines, the development of a special course on the basics of the theory of argumentation in Kalam, can significantly increase the intellectual potential of domestic Islamic studies, help educate sane youth, in ideological work on religious education and prevention radicalization of religion, to enrich the methods of conducting religious examination through the use of mental procedures based on the texts of the Quran and Sunnah.

IV.

5 Conclusions

Religious heritage of the medieval Kalam schools in the 11th-13th centuries in Maverannahr made an important contribution to the development of Islamic civilization. The most prominent representative was our great, but not enough studied in Uzbekistan -Shamsiddin Samarkandi. His importance is especially important in the formation of rationalistic methods of the theory of argumentation, as well as in the practice of referring to the arguments of reason to prove the truth of facts and statements, that is, during verification. It is advisable to study his experience and, taking into account local conditions, apply when conducting a religious inspection. As a result, the methodological base for expert opinions of religious scholars will be replenished, as well as the ways of educating young people for creative, innovative thinking.

The media also needs knowledge in the field of religious studies in order to be able to impartially report on events in which religious conflicts are possible. Religious and government institutions that need to conduct a new dialogue at all levels of society need support. Scientific research on topical issues in cyber-Islam is as necessary as general information on the history of Islamic debate in order to be able to classify current events.

Maintaining a high standard of medieval traditions of argumentation, along with improving modern methods, serves to improve the quality of scientific products, trust in its truth, recognition of fake information, and prevent the dissemination of information that offends the religious feelings of Muslims, non-Muslims and secular people.

The inclusion of secular natural science disciplines in the curricula of religious institutions in Uzbekistan, special courses on the theory of argumentation in Kalam will help educate sane youth, strengthen ideological work on religious education and prevention of radicalization of religion, and enrich the methods of conducting religious expertise.

We do not assert that the appeal to the Kalam experience is the only effective method of argumentation for use in the process of religious studies. But among the many intellectual methods developed by science to date, it is worthy of study and application.¹

¹The Argumentation Theory in Kalam in Maverannahr and Usage of its Practice Techniques in Discussions on the Websites of Uzbekistan

-
- 316 [Kader (2020)] , 10.18317/kaderdergi.810849. <https://doi.org/10.18317/kaderdergi.810849> Kader
317 Aral?k 2020. 18 (2) p. .
- 318 [Gulchakhra ()] *Actual questions of scientific discussion tolerance (based on religious studies of Uzbekistan*
319 *universities)*, Tulemetova Gulchakhra . 2014.
- 320 [Sergey ()] *Islam: an encyclopedic dictionary. Science, Main Editorial Office of Oriental Literature & JV "House*
321 *of Biruni*, Prozorov Sergey . 1991.
- 322 [Tulemetova (2020)] *Issues of verification of scientific texts in the works of Islamic theologians and philosophers*
323 *from Bukhara in VIII-XII centuries*, Gulomova Tulemetova . [https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/](https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/bukhara-capital-islamic-culture-international-forum-tulemetova)
324 [bukhara-capital-islamic-culture-international-forum-tulemetova](https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/bukhara-capital-islamic-culture-international-forum-tulemetova) May 29, 2020.
- 325 [Tanr?bilir and Herguener] *Proof of the Prophethood of the Prophet Muhammad in the Context of the Bible in*
326 *Shamsuddin Al-Samarqandi*, Tar?k Tanr?bilir , Esra Herguener .
- 327 [Nasyrov ()] 'Proofs of the existence of God in medieval Islamic theol-
328 ogy (Kalam'. Ilshat Nasyrov . [https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/](https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/dokazatelstva-suschestvovaniya-boga-v-islamskoy-teologii-kalam)
329 [dokazatelstva-suschestvovaniya-boga-v-islamskoy-teologii-kalam](https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/dokazatelstva-suschestvovaniya-boga-v-islamskoy-teologii-kalam) *Journal of PSTGU*
330 2017. 2017. p. 53.
- 331 [Ekaterina (2015)] *Religious Expertise in the Light of General Scientific Principles. Religious Expertise: Russian*
332 *Experience*, Elbakyan Ekaterina . [https://www.sova-center.ru/religion/publications/2015/](https://www.sova-center.ru/religion/publications/2015/11/d33340)
333 [11/d33340](https://www.sova-center.ru/religion/publications/2015/11/d33340) November 30, 2015.
- 334 [Karabela Mehmet ()] *The development of dialectic and argumentation theory in post-classical Islamic intellectual*
335 *history*, Kadri Karabela Mehmet . <https://philarchive.org/archive/KARTD0v1-PDF> 2010. Institute
336 of Islamic Studies McGill University (date of the application: 04.04.2021)
- 337 [Ashirbek ()] 'The early period in evolution of the Maturidi doctrine'. Muminov Ashirbek . *Bulletin Religious*
338 *Studies Series* 2017. 2015. 2017. 1 (1) p. . Al-Farabi Kazakh National University
- 339 [Tulemetova and Hasanbayev ()] G T Tulemetova , O M Hasanbayev . *Religious studies: textbook. Tashkent*
340 *"Innonatsiya-ziyo*, 2021.