

1 Using the Nine-Consciousness Concept of Vijñ?nav?da in Moral  
2 Judgment

3 Jen-Sheng, Liao<sup>1</sup> and Wen-Cheng, Huang<sup>2</sup>

4 <sup>1</sup> Feng-Chia University/ Providence University

5 *Received: 14 December 2017 Accepted: 1 January 2018 Published: 15 January 2018*

---

7 **Abstract**

8 Amalavijñ?na has often been interpreted as an attempt to forge links between Yogacara and  
9 Tath?gatagarbha thought—that is, to synthesize the two major strands of Chinese Mahayana  
10 Buddhist doctrine (Mahayana and Vijñ?nav?da). In this article, amalavijñ?na is used to build  
11 a nine-consciousness model that relates to an understanding of consciousness itself from the  
12 Vijñ?nav?da perspective. The nineconsciousness model comprises the first five consciousnesses  
13 (seeing, hearing, smell, taste, and bodily sensation), the conscious mind, the manas, the  
14 ?layavijñ?na, and the amalavijñ?na. Herein it will be explained how the nine-consciousness  
15 model can increase our understanding of ethical decision-making and develop a perspective  
16 that can facilitate enlightenment. The nine-consciousness model can distinguish judgment from  
17 moral judgment, explain the intuition source, integrate cognitive and emotional influences,  
18 interpret the reasons of moral failure and postulate how emotions and cognition work together.

---

20 **Index terms**— amalavijñ?na, consciousness, ethical decision, manas, vijñ?nav?da.

21 **1 Introduction a) Background**

22 The Shiba kong lun (????, or Treatise on Eighteen [Kinds of] Emptiness) states: Question: ?given that there is  
23 no impurity by essential nature, there should also be no purity by essential nature. How can it be ascertained  
24 that the dharma-realm is neither pure nor impure? Answer: Amalavijñ?na is the aboriginal pure mind. It is only  
25 because it is tainted by adventitious dirt that we speak of it as impure; because of adventitious dirt, we establish  
26 that it is impure. his means that if people have neither impure nor pure selves, how can they judge what is evil  
27 or good in the universe? The answer is that people have amalavijñ?na to discern right from wrong and good  
28 from evil.

29 Vijñ?nav?da is a mainstream school of Chinese Mah?y?na Buddhism (Kaag 2012). According to the Concise  
30 Oxford Dictionary of World Religion, Vijñ?nav?da is an alternative name for the Yog?c?ra school. The name  
31 Vijñ?nav?da emphasizes its adherents' interest in the workings of consciousness (vijñ?na) and its role in creating  
32 the experience of sa?s?ra. In the Vijñ?nav?da tradition, conceptual knowledge appears at the level of mental  
33 consciousness (the sixth consciousness), which is determined by the manas (the seventh consciousness). The  
34 manas is seen as a process of subliminal thought that organizes data from the six consciousnesses into the  
35 experience of a meaningful world (Harvey, 2013). It is the basis for both correct judgments and misperceptions  
36 of reality ??Harvey, 2013, p. 131). Because the manas obscures a person's true nature with the ego or "I"  
37 (Clark, 2011), it is responsible for the errors perpetrated by the individual self (Nedu, 2015). Such errors also  
38 characterize any form of conceptual knowledge that appears at the level of mental consciousness. Thus, the  
39 theory accounting for the conditioning of decision-making finds that it stems from two factors. On the one hand,  
40 decision-making is conditioned by the manas of individuality; on the other hand, it is conditioned by the seeds  
41 existing within the ?layavijñ?na (the eighth consciousness) (Nedu, 2015). The ethical decision-making (EDM)  
42 process has been widely discussed by practitioners using various approaches, such as the rationalist and the  
43 intuition frameworks (Haidt, 2001;Jones, 1991;Rest, 1986;Sonenshein, 2007). However, theoretical and empirical

## 6 B) QUESTION REGARDING THE RATIONALIST APPROACH

---

44 studies are presently being conducted without an understanding of or interest in metaphysics and philosophy  
45 (Williams & Gantt, 2009). The absence of a well-developed theoretical methodological foundation has given rise  
46 to various challenges within this field, such as the lack of a standardized research method that enables scholars to  
47 present consistent findings ??Pan & Spark, 2012) and the inability to account for complex neurocognitive-affective  
48 variables (Schwartz, 2016).

### 49 2 b) Objectives

50 *Vijñ?nav?da* originated in India and developed in a Chinese cultural context that produced and explored many  
51 practices of consciousness through the systematic training of attention. In contrast, the dominant methods  
52 of investigating the mind in Western cognitive science have emphasized observation of the Because much of  
53 the understanding and practice of ethics in the psychology of perception and action arose from dialogue with  
54 Buddhist traditions (Finnigan, 2011; Harvey, 2000), we lay the groundwork for EDM cognitive science by using  
55 the psychology framework of the *Vijñ?nav?da* school-the Nine Consciousnesses-as a lens to examine contemporary  
56 cognitive science conceptions of consciousness. At the same time, understanding the conceptual frameworks of  
57 the Buddhist teachings can help scientists refine the theoretical frameworks they bring to research on meditation  
58 and consciousness.

59 Our aim, however, is not to give an historical account of what these concepts meant at any point in the  
60 development of Buddhist thought, and we make no claim that anyone in the Buddhist tradition, early or late,  
61 actually understood this model in the way we suggest. Furthermore, we do not treat these battles as occurring  
62 within a different Buddhist school, but rather focus only on the central, basic accounts of the *Vijñ?nav?da*.

### 63 3 c) Contribution to the field

64 This nine-consciousness model is explored here as a potential theoretical resource that can guide insight,  
65 knowledge, and enlightenment. This article shows how the nine-consciousness model can increase our  
66 understanding of EDM and develop a perspective that can facilitate enlightenment. When due consideration  
67 is made for the action and intention that happen in the mind, however, it is clear that these investigations  
68 represent the transformation of consciousness into wisdom.

## 69 4 II.

### 70 5 Literature Review a) Types of ethics and moral judgment

71 Several types of ethics have been defended by philosophers and theologians, including utilitarian ethics, virtue  
72 ethics, and value ethics (Barbour, 2014). Utilitarian Ethics asserts that decisions are judged entirely by their  
73 consequences, not by intentions, motives, rights, or duties. One such criterion is the principle of "the greatest  
74 good to the greatest number," maximizing the total good. Virtue Ethics has been influential in considering  
75 ethics within a family, church, synagogue, or community. Character education occurs within particular religious  
76 or secular traditions. Value Ethics is a broad goal sought in individual and social life. Values can be defended on  
77 either religious or secular grounds and then applied as shared criteria in policy choices. Value can be individual  
78 values (food and health, meaningful work, personal fulfillment), social values (social justice, participatory freedom,  
79 economic development), or environmental values (resource sustainability, environmental protection, respect for  
80 all forms of life (Barbour, 1993; Barbour, , 2014)).

81 Ethical decision-making is defined as the evaluation of events, persons, or acts, according to the laws, obligatory  
82 virtues, and cultural norms that constitute the standards of the larger community (Haidt, 2001; Jones, 1991).  
83 Therefore, if one's judgment conflicts with or violates laws, virtues, or cultural norms, one would be said to  
84 making an immoral judgment. The paper will use the terms "ethical" and "moral" and "moral judgment" and  
85 "ethical decision-making" interchangeably.

86 There have been three general moral-judgment models in previous research: (a) rationalist-based; (b) non-  
87 rationalist-based; and (c) the integrated approach. Although rationalist approaches have tended to include a belief  
88 that intuition or emotion could play a role in EDM, they do not consider moral intuition to be a determination of  
89 moral judgment (Schwartz 2016). Nonrationalist approaches, on the other hand, do accept that moral intuition  
90 influences moral judgment (Haidt, 2001). Integrated approaches assert that there is a concurrent interaction  
91 between intuition (impulse) and reason (reflection) when making moral judgments (Schwartz, 2016).

### 92 6 b) Question regarding the rationalist approach

93 There has been experimental work on the rationalist approach, such as that of Kohlberg (1971) on cognitive moral  
94 development and that of Rest and Johns on the four distinct process components and moral intensity ??John,  
95 1991; Rest, 1986). Rest's four processes included moral awareness, judgment, intent, and behavior. Many recent  
96 many research efforts have focused on the relationship between moral judgment (i.e., judgments of moral and  
97 unethical acts), moral intention (i.e., the intention to do something that is moral or that is unethical), and moral  
98 actions (i.e., moral or immoral behavior).

99 While Singhapakdi, Rao, and Vitell (1996) and Singhapakdi, Vitell, and Kraft (1996) found that moral  
100 awareness was correlated with moral judgment, Valentine and Fleischman (2003) did not find such a correlation.

101 Similarly, Fleischman and Valentine (2003) found that awareness was related to decision outcomes, and in a  
102 second paper they found little evidence of such a relationship (Fleischman and Valentine, 2003). Empirical  
103 findings also link moral judgment to moral intentions (Barnett, 2001). Wagner and Sanders (2001) linked moral  
104 intention with moral behavior.

105 As indicated by these research results, moral awareness may lead to moral decisions or it may not. Thus, one  
106 can wonder, is there any metaphysical reason to explain why the results of these empirical studies have been  
107 mixed? c) Question regarding the non-rationalist approach After decades of rationalist dominance under the  
108 auspices of a cognitivist paradigm (Kohlberg, 1971), moral psychology has undergone an emotional turn (Sauer,  
109 2012). Studies on mental disorder and brain lesions suggest that emotions are critically necessary for moral  
110 judgment (Blair, Mitchell, and Blair, 2005; ??oenigs et al., 2007). Evidence from neuroimaging suggests that  
111 an important part of moral cognition is shaped by automatic emotional reactions (Greene et al., 2001; Greene et  
112 al., 2004; Singer, 2005; Sauer, 2012). On top of that, recent studies have shown that we arrive at moral verdicts  
113 based on quick, often emotionally charged intuitions, rather than through controlled reasoning and conscious  
114 deliberation (Haidt, 2001; Uhlmann et al., 2009).

115 Emotional and intuitive processes are the kind of subsets of automatic processes. Empirically minded  
116 philosophers have thus taken the aforementioned findings to support a broadly sentimental account of moral  
117 judgment and cognition, and to provide the building blocks of an empirical refutation of rationalist models of  
118 moral judgment (Nichols, 2004; Prinz, 2007). These philosophers argue that moral judgments are not based on  
119 critical reflection and the proper weighing of reasons, but on uncontrolled, emotionally charged states of intuitive  
120 (dis)approval. One question raised here is about what specific emotion(s) can induce moral or immoral judgment.

## 121 **7 d) Question regarding the dual-process model**

122 It is now becoming increasingly popular to understand decision-making in terms of a dual-process model of  
123 cognition ??Kahneman, 2003). Proponents of this model hold that judgment and behavior are based on two  
124 mental subsystems (often referred to as Systems I and II) that are different in at least four important respects  
125 and work upon entirely different principles (for an overview, see Evans, 2003Evans, , 2008)). System I processes  
126 are said to be evolutionarily old (age), operate quickly and effortlessly (speed), their workings remain un-or  
127 pre-conscious (accessibility), and they process information holistically and often emotionally rapid (mode of  
128 function) as opposed to the evolutionarily recent, controlled, effortful, conscious, and analytical step-by-step  
129 reasoning characteristic of System II.

130 However, which of the two systems is responsible for moral judgment? Do these two systems work sequentially  
131 and distinctly, or at the same time?

## 132 **8 e) Proposing a New Model**

133 It seems that to a surprising extent, judgment formation and action are based on processes that remain largely  
134 unconscious ??Wilson, 2002; Dijksterhuis, 2006). People often do not have access to what really drives their  
135 behavior ??Wegner, 2002; Sie, 2009), and do not know what triggers a certain judgment or behavioral response  
136 (Nisbett and ??ilson, 1977, 1978; Langer, Blank, and Chanowitz, 1978). However, the link between some  
137 individual factors, such as the philosophical orientation of a person and moral judgment, has been more conclusive.  
138 Idealism was found to influence ethical judgment (Davis, Johnson, and Ohmer, 1998; Elias, 2002; ??im, 2003). We  
139 propose the nineconsciousness model of Buddhist Vijñ?navada to provide a deeper explanation of the complex  
140 press of moral judgment.

141 The middle era of Mahayanist Buddhism, which took place from about the third to the fifth century BC,  
142 was a period when another ancient Buddhist psychology, known as Vijñ?navada (consciousness-only doctrine  
143 Buddhism), gained popularity. The concept of alayavijñ?na and amalavijñ?na in this type of Buddhist teaching  
144 is often compared to the idea of the unconscious in psychoanalysis (Kato, 2016). If we have a clearer idea of the  
145 conscious processes that can enable us to make ethical judgements, we can better prepare ourselves as individuals  
146 and can better work with others to develop our collective ethical expertise. Therefore, from the perspective of  
147 contemplation, we argue that the nine-consciousness model should be applied to current EDM theory.

## 148 **9 III.**

### 149 **10 Understanding the Nine Consciousnesses a) Mind dharmas 150 vs. dharmas that interact with the mind**

151 In Buddhism, the six roots, six dusts and six consciousnesses (see Table 1) are very important parts of  
152 Buddhist cognitive philosophy (Chen and Lin, 2002). After adding the seventh consciousness (manas), the eighth  
153 consciousness (alayavijñ?na), and the ninth consciousness (amalavijñ?na), these nine consciousnesses form a  
154 well-constructed cognitive model (Chen et al., 2002).

155 Yogacara posits 100 dharmas, which can be divided into five categories. According to Shastra on the Door  
156 to Understanding the Hundred Dharmas (??????), all dharmas may be generally grouped into five categories:  
157 1. mind dharmas; 2. mind co-arising dharmas; 3. form dharmas; 4. mind non-coarising dharmas; and 5.  
158 unconditioned dharmas. They are in this sequence because the first are supreme, the second interact with the

## 14 E) THE EIGHTH CONSCIOUSNESS

---

159 first, the third are the shadows manifest by the previous two, the fourth are the positions in which the previous  
160 three are not found, and the last are revealed by the previous four. We mainly manipulate "mind dharma" (1)  
161 and "mind co-arising dharmas" (2) to construct the nine-consciousness model.

162 The first category, mind dharmas, is eight consciousnesses, which will be addressed later. The second category,  
163 mind co-arising dharmas, includes 51 dharmas. These 51 dharmas are further divided into six sub-categories:  
164 (1) the five universally interactive; (2) the five particular states; (3) the 11 wholesome; (4) the six fundamental  
165 afflictions; (5) the 20 derivative afflictions; and (6) the four unfixed (see Table 2).

### 166 11 b) The first five consciousnesses

167 The first five consciousnesses comprise the visual, auditory, olfactory, gustatory and tactile senses. These senses  
168 arise from the perceived division of the eighth consciousness. They can appear in any order or all at once,  
169 depending on the situation; for instance, an illness or shock can stop their operation. The first five consciousnesses  
170 interact with the 31 "mind co-arising dharmas" (see Table 2) and work in conjunction with the sixth consciousness,  
171 which processes their input to construct a mental picture of reality.

172 After perceptions from the first five consciousnesses are assimilated in the sixth consciousness, they are  
173 introduced into the seventh consciousness, which transfers them into the eighth as though the latter were a real  
174 "self." This continual process plants more karmic seeds in the eighth consciousness. None of the five perceptual  
175 consciousnesses contain the potential for making moral distinctions (Zim, 1995).

### 176 12 c) The sixth consciousness

177 Cognition and perception take place in the sixth consciousness (the mental consciousness), which has three moral  
178 natures (wholesome, unwholesome, and indeterminate). The sixth consciousness interacts with all 51 mind co-  
179 arising dharmas (Table 2). When the activity of the sixth consciousness is wholesome, it is accompanied by  
180 11 wholesome dharmas; when its activity is unwholesome, the vexations arise in conjunction with it. Because  
181 the basic vexations (i.e., greed, anger, stupidity, arrogance, doubt, and improper views) are always involved  
182 in the sixth consciousness, it colors incoming sense data and interprets it as we desire (Clark, 2011). The  
183 sixth consciousness distinguishes between good and evil and makes moral determinations about the input of the  
184 preceding five consciousnesses.

### 185 13 d) The Seventh Consciousness

186 The seventh consciousness (manas) coordinates the thoughts and information received from the first six  
187 consciousnesses and is capable of reflecting, considering, and making judgements (Clark, 2011). It is important  
188 to note that the seventh consciousness obscures a person's true nature with the ego, or "I." This ego is not a  
189 real entity, but only a perishable element of the equally perishable act of cognition (Tola & Dragonetti, 2005). It  
190 represents a constant process of selection and choice of what is best for the self (Clark, 2008). Buddhists see the ego  
191 itself as the problem or obstacle in the path to enlightenment. Thus, it is also known as the defiling/transmitter  
192 consciousness because of the illusions it promotes. It defiles the first six consciousnesses by obscuring them with  
193 its concept of self, and defiles the eighth consciousness by attributing to it the characteristics of a real self that  
194 exists in space and time (Zim, 1995).

195 Manas was seen by the Yogacaras as a process of subliminal thought that organizes data from the first six  
196 consciousnesses into the experience of a meaningful world. It contains the basis both for correct judgments  
197 and for misperception of reality, and for both skillful and unskillful karma, which are generated by volitions  
198 accompanying the six consciousnesses. Manas and the six consciousnesses represent only the surface of the mind;  
199 they are devoid of purposive activity and only indistinctly aware of objects, being an underlying unconscious  
200 level of mind known as ?layavijñ?na, the "storehouse consciousness."

### 201 14 e) The eighth consciousness

202 The eighth consciousness (?layavijñ?na) is the storehouse consciousness that is the basis of the seven preceding  
203 aspects of mind. The eighth consciousness is known as the repository of impressions, because from it arises all  
204 our ideas of self, ego, and their respective functions in the external world. The eighth consciousness is beyond  
205 the dualisms of subject and object or existence and non-existence (Tripitaka Master Xuanzang, 1998), and so  
206 it has no purposive activity and is unaware of objects. Because it does not make distinctions and is neither  
207 good nor bad, the eighth consciousness is said to have a state of equanimity. The eighth consciousness is the  
208 karmic storehouse that contains the seeds generated by our unenlightened actions. Although it does not create  
209 karma, the ?layavijñ?na functions as the subject of retribution for past intended deeds. Among the great flood  
210 of seeds in the ?layavijñ?na, these impregnating seeds are especially favorable potentials of wisdom in the stream  
211 of dharmas. These seeds form clusters that augment those already in our dharma stream and produce insight.  
212 The impregnating seeds are called the seeds of the dharmakaya, the true body of the Buddha (Clark, 2008).

---

## 213 15 f) The ninth consciousness

214 Paramartha's (??, 499-569) notion of consciousness, *amalavijñ?na*, occupies an important place in the common  
215 understanding of the development of East Asian Buddhist thought. In particular, it is frequently linked to  
216 claims about the "sinification," or "making Chinese," of Buddhist ideas. It has also often been interpreted as  
217 an attempt to forge links between Yogacara and Tath?gatagarbha thought—that is, to bring about a synthesis  
218 between these two major strands of Mahayana Buddhist doctrine (Radich, 2008). The term *amalavijñ?na*, in its  
219 original meaning, is "consciousness without taint." Yet, some modern scholars observe that Param?rtha tends,  
220 whether in its translation or commentaries, to interpret the connotation of *amalavijñ?na* as containing some of  
221 the qualities of Tath?gatagarbha or being Tath?gatagarbha itself. Shi (2011) tried to analyze the conception of  
222 *amalavijñ?na* according to Param?rtha's translations as well as the commentaries. He found, in works such as  
223 *Jueding zang lun* (????), *Zhuanshi lun* (???), and *San wuxing lun* (????), that the conception of *amalavijñ?na*  
224 contains the meaning of "conversion of the basis" (??rayapar?v?tti) and the idea of "the nonconceptual awareness"  
225 (*nirvikalpajñ?na*), which means consciousness and its objects are all vanished. The term also encompasses  
226 the meaning of a fundamentally pure mind (prak?tivi?uddhacitta) in the *Shiba kong lun* (????). According  
227 to these texts, Shi (2011) thought that Param?rtha, based on the doctrine of the *Yog?c?ra*, translated the  
228 "conversion of the basis" as *amalavijñ?na* to mean the state of non-conceptual awareness when consciousness and  
229 its objects are all absent. In the *Shiba kong lun*, Param?rtha explained the emptiness (??ynat?) by referring to  
230 *amalavijñ?na* as "fundamentally pure mind." In terms of the historical development of Buddhist texts, the usage  
231 of emptiness, explained as the idea of "the light and purity of the mind's nature" in the *Prajñ?p?ramit?* S?tra,  
232 is no different from the thought of the *Yog?c?ra* school. Shi (2011) thus concluded that Param?rtha's use of the  
233 term *amalavijñ?na* is similar to the thought of the *Yog?c?ra* school on this point.

## 234 16 g) Five aggregates

235 Buddhist psychology has a very long history. Its beginnings date back to the classification of the mind as the five  
236 aggregates laid down by Gautama Buddha about 2,500 years ago. Since at least the era of sectional (Abhidharma)  
237 Buddhism, this ancient Buddhist psychology has been the subject of professional study by monks, and it is still  
238 learned and practiced today, primarily in Theravada Buddhism (Kato, 2016).

239 The five aggregates (skandhas) are as follows: i) *rupa* (form or matter); ii) *vedana* (sensation or feeling);  
240 iii) *samjna* (perception); xi) *samskara* (mental formation or volition); and x) *vijnana* (consciousness) (Harvey,  
241 2000;Boisvert, 1995). *Vedana* can be seen as the first of the five consciousnesses; *samjna* as the sixth consciousness;  
242 *samskara* as the seventh consciousness, and *vijnana* as the eighth consciousness (Chen and Lin, 2002).

## 243 17 IV. The Nine-Consciousness Model of edm a) Input process: 244 From the first five consciousnesses to the eighth consciousness 245

246 The first five consciousnesses—those of the eye, ear, nose, tongue, and body—are posited on the basis of valid  
247 straightforward cognition solely by means of faculties of the bodily senses (Figure 1) (Zim, 1995). These five  
248 consciousnesses always arise together with the sixth consciousness. The sixth consciousness distinguishes all  
249 incoming data, using advanced analysis, induction, and other mental operations, based on the mental objects  
250 reflected by the states of the five sense objects. Because the sixth consciousness possesses the mental function of  
251 wisdom, it reduces sentient beings to a state of confusion. The sixth consciousness is then fed into the seventh  
252 consciousness (manas) together with all its sense data (Clark, 2008).

253 The seventh consciousness is constantly making judgments while clinging to the attributes of the eighth  
254 consciousness as its inner self. The eighth consciousness is the origin of all dharmas; being nonimpeded and  
255 morally neutral, it stores all good, bad, and neutral karmic seeds. It receives the karma of each sentient being  
256 (Fan & Chou ,2016).

## 257 18 b) Output processes i. Output processes: From the eighth 258 to the first five consciousnesses

259 The seventh consciousness is constantly evaluating, discriminating, and making judgments while clinging to the  
260 attributes of the eighth consciousness as its inner self. Conceptual knowledge and actiondirection manifests  
261 in the sixth consciousness, which is determined by the seventh consciousness. Finally, physical action follows  
262 the demands of the mental consciousness. ii. Karma and the dharmas ? Karma. Karma is the result of our  
263 intentional actions.

264 The consequences of these actions remain as seeds planted in the eighth consciousness. These seeds germinate  
265 over time and generate more seeds. The karmic process has three stages: 1) becoming deluded in the sixth  
266 consciousness, whose actions lead to activity and therefore to karma; 2) creating karma and planting seeds in  
267 the eighth consciousness (see Figure 1)—the ongoing cycle life, death, and rebirth draws the eighth consciousness  
268 back into the six levels of existence; and 3) finally undergoing retribution as the germination of the karmic seeds  
269 (Tripitaka Master Xuanzang, 1998).

### 270 19 ? Dharmas.

271 Dharmas are basic interdependent patterns of lived experience within the overall flux of reality. Each dharma is  
272 a mental construct with a specific process that consists of a stream of momentary events. Dharmas arise as a  
273 consequence of our attachment to an illusory reality, and interact with all eight consciousnesses. According to the  
274 Great Vehicle Hundred Dharmas (??????), there are six fundamental afflictions (e.g., greed, anger, etc.) and 20  
275 derivative afflictions (e.g., deceit, jealousy, torpor, lack of shame, etc.) that interact with and affect consciousness  
276 (Zim, 1995). Afflictions can be seen as emotions. Table 2 above lists each consciousness and its related afflictions.  
277 iii.

278 The delusion source of each consciousness "Delusion" is defined by Webster's Dictionary as "a false conception  
279 and persistent belief unconquerable by reason in something that has no existence in fact." Haidt defined  
280 "rationalist delusion in ethics" as "the belief in a reliable faculty of reasoning, capable of operating effectively  
281 and impartially even when self interest, reputational concerns, and intergroup conflict pull toward a particular  
282 conclusion" (2012, p867). The Shurangama Sutra (??ç¶?) explains the delusions that give rise to each  
283 consciousness:

284 ? The illusion source for eighth consciousness is upside-down minutely subtle thinking. The Shurangama  
285 Sutra stated: If you do not open and unite your six sense faculties so that they function interchangeably, this  
286 false thinking will never cease. That's why your seeing, hearing, awareness, and knowing are presently strung  
287 together by subtle habits, so that within the profound clarity, existence and nonexistence are both unreal. This  
288 is the fifth kind of upside-down, minutely subtle thinking."

289 ? The illusion source for the seventh consciousness is subtle and hidden. The Shurangama Sutra stated:

290 The metabolic processes never stop; they progress through subtle changes: your nails and hair grow, your  
291 energy wanes, and your skin becomes wrinkled. These processes continue day and night, and yet you never wake  
292 up to them.-Your formations skandha continues in thought after thought without cease. It is the fourth kind of  
293 false thinking, which is subtle and hidden.

294 ? The illusion source for the sixth consciousness is interconnectedness. The Shurangama Sutra stated: ? When  
295 you are awake, your mind thinks. When you are asleep, you dream. Thus, your thinking is stirred to perceive  
296 false situations. This is the third kind of false thinking, which is characterized by interconnectedness.

297 ? The illusion for the first five consciousnesses is clarity. The Shurangama Sutra stated: ? Due to that cause,  
298 feelings arise and affect your body, so that at present you pursue pleasant feelings and are repelled by unpleasant  
299 feelings. These two kinds of feelings that compel you are brought about by the second kind of false thinking,  
300 which is characterized by illusory clarity. ? The source of the illusion for the first five organs and six dusts  
301 is solidity. The Shurangama Sutra stated: When you think of walking along a precipice, the soles of your feet  
302 tingle. Since the precipice doesn't exist and there isn't any vinegar, how could your mouth water at the mere  
303 mention of vinegar, if it were not the case that your body originated from falseness? Therefore, you should know  
304 that your present physical body is brought about by the first kind of false thinking, which is characterized by  
305 solidity.

306 V.

### 307 20 Implications of the Nine-Consciousness Model for edm a) 308 Judgment and moral judgment

309 The differences between the methodologies used in current theories of EDM versus the nineconsciousness  
310 model can be conceptualized by examining one critical difference: the function of judgment. Current EDM  
311 theories typically emphasize deliberative and analytical judgment (Zhong, 2011), although EDM will either be  
312 consciously available through effortful reasoning or unconsciously generated intuition (Haidt, 2001;Sonenshein,  
313 2007). However, in the nine-consciousness model, the manas is consciously making a judgment (Nedu, 2015). The  
314 manas is the home of all thinking, willing, considering, and judging; it reasons, plans, and evaluates all aspects  
315 of human consciousness (Clark, 2011). Although the manas makes judgments, moral judgments are made by the  
316 amalavijnana because of its purity.

### 317 21 b) Intuition

318 EDM theory describes intuition as a product of the evolutionary development of the human brain (Salvador &  
319 Folger, 2009) or as arising from the experience of practical knowledge (Haidt, 2001). In the nine-consciousness  
320 model, knowledge belonging to the seventh consciousness is a fallacy caused by its innate attachments. Because  
321 the seventh consciousness bases its decisions on relative, defiled knowledge drawn from the discernment, it is built  
322 on false assumptions that impart to it the four fundamental afflictions (greed, anger, doubt, and improper views)  
323 and eight subsidiary afflictions (e.g. laziness, distraction, and lack of faith). Vijñ?nav?da claims that all kind  
324 of experience, including knowledge, is mere ideation, devoid of any objective value. Concept knowledge appears  
325 at the level of the sixth consciousness, which, in its turn, is determined by the seventh consciousness (manas).  
326 Thus, the experiences of the operational consciousnesses are entirely subjective, because they are determined by  
327 the manas.

---

## 328 22 c) Integrating of Cognitive and Emotional Influences

329 Research in the past decade has highlighted the importance of the cognitive and emotional aspects of moral  
330 judgment. Unfortunately, some of the research contributions suggested or implied an either of perspective. The  
331 rationalists argued for the dominance of cognition while the intuitionist argued for the dominance of emotions.

332 When people face a moral dilemma and need to make a moral judgment, the eye collects data and the mental  
333 consciousness analyses the information. The manas deals immediately with all the imported data and makes a  
334 judgment. Mental consciousness then acts, obeying the decision of the manas. The ?layavijñ?na will then possess  
335 all the seeds, gather the karmic maturation, and become the support for other consciousnesses (Nedu, 2015).  
336 Thus, the nineconsciousness model could form the basis for a criticism of current EDM theory as relying over-  
337 much on mental consciousness (i.e., the sixth consciousness). EDM holds that judgment relies on a rationalistic  
338 and deliberative process but suppresses the reactions of the manas or the ?layavijñ?na in making moral decisions.

339 In this study EDM is analyzed as a sequential dual-process model. In such a model, the eight consciousnesses  
340 cooperate very quickly in shaping and regulating moral judgments and decisions. In evaluating moral  
341 consequences, it is important to note that deliberative decision-making does not always lead to negative outcomes.  
342 Rather, it depends on the nature of the manas as well as its inherent and defiled afflictions.

## 343 23 d) Interpreting the reasons of moral failure

344 Prior conceptualization of moral judgment explains moral failures in terms of failures of cognitive capability,  
345 moral awareness, or moral sensitivity. ??onin, Pizzaro, and Beer (2007) argued that the contemporary model of  
346 moral judgment should permit an understanding of moral failures in cases where the individual knew what was  
347 right and wrong but did what was wrong anyway. When such moral failings occur, they are due to what is also  
348 called a failure of will-power, which is linked to emotional processes. The nine-consciousness model enables us to  
349 explore three possible sources of bad moral judgment: delusion, vexation, and karma.

350 ? First, delusion and vexation could identify the decision-maker as a less salient aspect of a situation rather  
351 than being situations that need to be considered by a decision-maker. In such a case, a bad moral decision  
352 would be made because the emotional processes were not sufficiently trained to recognize and respond to the  
353 more salient aspects of a situation. ? Second, good emotions (wholesome dharmas-see Table 2 above) may well  
354 respond to the salient aspect of a situation, but do so in a suppressed manner. In other words, the emotions  
355 respond to the important salient issue in a situation but do so in a "flat" manner. For example, an individual who  
356 has broken the law several times may recognize the potential of being imprisoned as a salient risk, but his or her  
357 attitude concerning the issue might be one of deemphasizing the risk that is associated with a bad moral choice.  
358 ? Similarly, the karma process could be the cause of a bad moral judgment. For example, an individual might  
359 focus primarily on his/her own interests and goals and end up making bad moral judgments. Second, the focus  
360 on the cognitive aspect of a situation could result in the enforcement of moral rules that are disproportionate to  
361 the nature of a crime, its context, and the intent of the wrongdoer. In all these cases, bad moral judgments are  
362 caused by a disruption in the cognitive or emotional processes.

## 363 24 f) How to make a moral decision

364 As the Shurangama Sutra stated, "you should gain a thorough understanding of the origin of this false thinking  
365 ?. Let them recognize this falseness and naturally give rise to deep disdain for it. Let them know of Nirvana so  
366 that they will not linger in the Triple Realm." In order for amalavijñ?na to show up to judge good or evil, people  
367 should find and gain a thorough understanding of the origin of this illusion. We must recognize this falseness  
368 and naturally acquire a deep disdain for it, causing all those cultivators to know that the falseness of delusional  
369 thinking comes from ourselves. If we clearly understand its source and pattern, we become disgusted with it.

## 370 25 VI.

## 371 26 Limitation and Suggestions

372 To ensure that this ECM is readable and easy to understand, we have based this paper on a basic concept of  
373 the Vijñ?nav?da school and do not explore whole esoteric doctrines. The current contribution of ECM does not  
374 mention how justice and well-being complement responses to human evil that arise from delusion. Furthermore,  
375 this model does not address how decision-makers, who often are not educated in Buddhist training, can acquire  
376 enough knowledge of Buddhist psychology to combine it with the experience and wisdom of their own traditions  
377 in order to be able to exercise moral and spiritual leadership in diminishing human evil and enhancing human  
378 good.

379 The Buddhist five-aggregates model parallels a number of distinctions drawn in cognitive science and therefore  
380 serves as a useful theoretical resource for developing a cross-cultural cognitive science of consciousness. In the  
381 future, combining the eightconsciousness and five-aggregates models can offer both a way to understand more  
382 precisely the roles of attention and consciousness, and to bridge the gap between moral judgment and moral  
383 action.

384 **27 VII.**

385 **28 Conclusion**

386 We conceive of the discussion that we have undertaken here as one tentative step in a larger project of developing a  
387 cross-cultural cognitive science of Buddhist psychology and EDM. One way to build on our discussion would be to  
388 develop a cognitive science perspective on the Buddhist claim that moral judgment counteracts not only knowing  
389 by increasing awareness of presently arising stimuli but also counteracts knowing wrongly by attenuating the  
390 emotional distortions of attention and perception. In particular, building bridges between the nine-consciousness  
391 model and EDM can offer a way to understand more precisely the roles of emotion, illusion, and unconsciousness  
392 in moral judgment. Like the dual-process theory, a recent shift in EDM towards viewing intuition as a valuable  
393 object of scientific investigation (Braboszcz et al., 2010) reveals that the different levels of intuition that should  
394 be clearly separated (i.e., manas, *?layavijñ?na*, Buddha nature) are often confused due to a lack of understanding  
395 of *Vijñ?nav?da*.

396 As was noted in the introduction, these texts allow for multiple interpretations, and the conception of  
397 *Vijñ?nav?da* employed herein may not line up neatly with traditional interpretation thereof ascribed to by the  
398 *Yog?c?ra* school. We suggest that the proposed relation between the nine consciousnesses and moral judgment  
399 be treated as a testable hypothesis. For example, intuition from *amalavijñ?na* is positive correlated with moral  
400 judgment; intuition from *?layavijñ?na* or manas is not positive correlated with moral judgment. Whatever values  
401 our model may present influence its ability to suggest fruitful directions for future work in the crosscultural  
402 cognitive science of consciousness.

403 Considering that the nine-consciousness model comprehensively describes decision processes that take place  
404 in the mind, it not only provides a guideline for moral judgment but is also helpful in instructing and teaching  
405 mindfulness. To sum up, we have highlighted a future decision strategy that weighs both reason and intuition  
406 and stresses the importance of understanding the concept of emptiness and the eight consciousnesses. <sup>1</sup>

---

# 1

|   |   |  |   |  |             |
|---|---|--|---|--|-------------|
|   | Consciousness<br>(six consciousness: from eye to mind)  | Cognitive<br>Physical<br>organs<br>sight to<br>eye to<br>thought)<br>body) | Form<br>(six<br>or-<br>gans:<br>from            | Judgment<br>Dharmas with the Mind  | interactive |
| The first five consciousness<br>(Vedana in the five aggregates) | Eye Consciousness<br>Ear Consciousness<br>Nose<br>Consciousness<br>Tongue<br>Consciousness<br>Body<br>Consciousness | Eyes<br>Ears<br>Nose<br>Consciousness<br>Tongue<br>Consciousness<br>Body   | Sights<br>Sounds<br>Smells<br>Tastes<br>Feeling | Five universal active dharmas; five situation-specific dharmas; 11 wholesome dharmas; three primary vexations (greed, anger, stu     |             |
| Sixth consciousness<br>(Samjna in the five aggregates)          | The Mind<br>Consciousness   | Mind   | Thought   | Judgment<br>All<br>but<br>not<br>al-<br>ways   |             |
| Seventh consciousness<br>(Samskara in the five aggregates)      | Manas   | Mind   | Self-grasping                                   | Continu<br>Five universal active judgment<br>dharmas (discernment, greed, anger, ignorance, false views); eight derivative vexations |             |
| Eighth consciousness<br>(Vijnana in the five aggregates)        | Alayavijnana  | Mind   | Memory  | Continu<br>Five universal active judgment<br>dharmas non-  |             |

Figure 1: Table 1 :

**2**

|  |              | The first five consciousnesses | Sixth consciousness (mental consciousness) | Seventh consciousness (manas) | Eighth consciousness (alayavijñana) |
|--|--------------|--------------------------------|--|-------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| The five universally interactive dharmas | Attention    | o                              | o  | o                             | o                                   |
|  | Contact      | o                              | o  | o                             | o                                   |
|  | Feeling      | o                              | o  | o                             | o                                   |
|  | Conception   | o                              | o  | o                             | o                                   |
|  | Volition     | o                              | o  | o                             | o                                   |
| The five situation-specific dharmas      | Desire       | o                              | o  |                               |                                     |
|  | Resolution   | o                              | o  |                               |                                     |
|  | Recollection | o                              | o  |                               |                                     |
|  | Samadhi      | o                              | o  |                               |                                     |
|  | Discernment  | o                              | o  | o                             |                                     |
| The 11 wholesome dharmas                 | Faith        | o                              | o  |                               |                                     |
|  | Diligence    | o                              | o  |                               |                                     |
|  | Conscience   | o                              | o  |                               |                                     |
|  | Shame        | o                              | o  |                               |                                     |
|  | Non-greed    | o                              | o  |                               |                                     |
| Non-anger                                |              | o                              | o  |                               |                                     |
| Non-ignorance                            |              | o                              | o  |                               |                                     |

Figure 2: Table 2 :

---

407 [Nedu ()] 'A non-referential and non-cognitive theory of truth in Vijñ?nav?da Buddhism'. Ovidiu Nedu . *Revista*  
408 *Hiperborea* 2015. 2 (2) p. .

409 [AD 596-664). 'Verses delineating the eight consciousnesses A Monthly Journal of Orthodox Buddhism ()] 'AD  
410 596-664). 'Verses delineating the eight consciousnesses'. *A Monthly Journal of Orthodox Buddhism* 1998. p.  
411 336. (Ronald. Epstein, trans in 1986)

412 [Fan et al. ()] *An analysis of the characters in Xiyou Ji through the lens of Yogacara Buddhism*, Fan , Huann-Ming  
413 Wei-Hsuan , Chou . 10.1109/ICAMSE.2016.7840282. 2016. IEEE. p. .

414 [Greene et al. ()] 'An FMRI investigation of emotional engagement in moral judgment'. Joshua D Greene , R  
415 Brian Sommerville , Leigh E Nystrom , John M Darley , Jonathan D Cohen . *Science* 2001. 293 p. .

416 [Zim ()] 'Basic ideas of Yogacara Buddhism: A paper prepared for Philosophy 772'. Robert Zim . <http://online.sfsu.edu/rone/Buddhism/Yogacara/basicideas.htm> *Yogacara Buddhism* 1995. San Francisco State University web site

417 [Monin et al. ()] *Beer Deciding versus reacting: Conceptions of*, Monin , David A Benoît , Jennifer S Pizarro .  
418 2018.

419 [Ellertson et al. ()] 'Behavioral ethics: A critique and a proposal'. Frogley Ellertson , Marc-Charles & Ingerson  
420 , Richard Williams . *Journal of Business Ethics* 2016. 138 (1) .

421 [Blair et al. ()] James Blair , Derek Mitchell , Karina Blair . *The psychopath: Emotion and the brain*, (Oxford)  
422 2005. Blackwell.

423 [Boisvert ()] Mathieu Boisvert . *The Five Aggregates Understanding Theravada Psychology and Soteriology*,  
424 (Ontario) 1995. Wilfrid Laurier University Press.

425 [Salvador and Folger ()] 'Business ethics and the brain'. Rommel Salvador , Robert G Folger . *Business Ethics*  
426 *Quarterly* 2009. 19 (1) p. .

427 [Davis ()] 'China, the Confucian ideal, and the European Age of Enlightenment'. Walter W Davis . *Journal of*  
428 *the History of Ideas* 1983. 44 (4) p. .

429 [Bowker ()] *Concise Oxford Dictionary of World Religion*, John Bowker . 2003. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

430 [Wagner and Sanders ()] 'Considerations in moral decision making and software piracy'. Suzanne C Wagner , G  
431 Lawrence Sanders . *Journal of Business Ethics* 2001. 29 (1-2) p. .

432 [Elias ()] 'Determinants of earnings management ethics among accountants'. Rafik Z Elias . *Journal of Business*  
433 *Ethics* 2002. 40 (1) p. .

434 [Barnett ()] 'Dimensions of moral intensity and moral decision making: An empirical study'. Tim Barnett .  
435 *Journal of Applied Social Psychology* 2001. 31 (5) p. .

436 [Evans and St ()] 'Dual-processing accounts of reasoning, judgment, and social cognition'. Jonathan Evans , B  
437 T St . *Annual Review of Psychology* 2008. 59 p. .

438 [Sauer ()] 'Educated intuition, automaticity and rationality in moral judgment'. Hanno Sauer . *Philosophical*  
439 *Explorations* 2012. 12 (3) p. .

440 [Jones ()] 'Ethical decision making by individuals in organizations: An issue contingent model'. Thomas M Jones  
441 . *Academy of Management Review* 1991. 16 (2) p. .

441 [Schwartz ()] 'Ethical decision-making theory: An integrated approach'. Mark S Schwartz . 10.1007/S10551-015-  
442 2886-8. *Journal of Business Ethics* 2016. 139 (4) p. .

443 [Singer ()] 'Ethics and intuitions'. Peter Singer . *The Journal of Ethics* 2005. 9 (3-4) p. .

444 [Barbour ()] *Ethics in an age of technology: Gifford lectures*, Ian G Barbour . 1989-1991. 1993. San Francisco;  
445 San Francisco: Harper. 2.

446 [Williams and Gantt ()] *Felt moral obligation and the moral judgment-moral action gap: An alternative*  
447 *ontological starting point*. Paper presented at the 35th Conference of the Association for Moral Education,  
448 Richard N Williams , Edwin E Gantt . July 2-4, 2009. Utrecht.

449 [Harvey ()] Peter Harvey . *An introduction to Buddhist ethics*, (Cambridge) 2000. Cambridge University Press.

450 [Harvey ()] Peter Harvey . *An introduction to Buddhism: Teaching, history and practices*, 2013. Cambridge  
451 University Press.

452 [Finnigan ()] 'How can a Buddha come to act? The possibility of a Buddhist account of ethical agency'. Bronwyn  
453 Finnigan . *Philosophy East and West* 2011. 61 (1) p. .

454 [Evans and St ()] 'In two minds: Dual-process accounts of reasoning'. Jonathan Evans , B T St . *Trends in*  
455 *Cognitive Science* 2003. 7 (10) p. .

456 [Davis et al. ()] 'Issue-contingent effects on ethical decision making: A cross-cultural comparison'. Mark A Davis  
457 , Douglas G Nancy Brown Johnson , Ohmer . *Journal of Business Ethics* 1998. 17 (4) p. .

461 [Braboszcz et al. ()] 'Meditation and Neuroscience: from basic research to clinical practice'. Claire Braboszcz ,  
 462 Stephanie Hahusseau , Arnaud Delorme . *Integrative Clinical Psychology, Psychiatry and Behavioral Medicine: Perspectives, Practices and Research*, R Carlstedt (ed.) (New York) 2010. Springer Publishing.

464 [Berzin ()] 'Mind and mental Factors: The fifty-one types of subsidiary awareness'. A Berzin . *The Berzin Archives*, (Berlin) 2006.

466 [Sie ()] 'Moral agency, conscious control, and deliberative awareness'. Maureen Sie . *Inquiry* 2009. 52 (5) p. .

467 [Singhapakdi et al. ()] 'Moral decision making: An investigation of services marketing professionals'. Anusorn  
 468 Singhapakdi , C P Rao , Scott J Vitell . *Journal of Business Ethics* 1996. 15 (6) p. .

469 [Singhapakdi et al. ()] 'Moral intensity and ethical decision-making of marketing professionals'. Singhapakdi ,  
 470 Scott J Anusorn , Kenneth L Vitell , Kraft . *Journal of Business Research* 1996. 36 p. .

471 [Valentine and Fleischman ()] 'Moral reasoning in an equitable relief innocent spouse context'. Sean Valentine ,  
 472 Gary Fleischman . *Journal of Business Ethics* 2003. 45 (4) p. .

473 [Dijksterhuis ()] 'On the benefits of thinking unconsciously: Unconscious thought can increase post-choice  
 474 satisfaction'. A Dijksterhuis . *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology* 2006. 42 p. .

475 [Shi and Hau ()] 'On the conception of amalavijñ?na according to Param?rtha'. Dow Shi , Hau . *Chung-Hwa  
 476 Buddhist Studies* 2011. 12 p. .

477 [Tola and Dragonetti ()] 'Philosophy of mind in the Yogacara Buddhist idealistic school'. Fernando Tola , Carmen  
 478 Dragonetti . 10.1177/0957154X05059213. *History of Psychiatry* 2005. 16 (4) p. .

479 [Pan and Sparks ()] 'Predictors, consequence, and measurement of ethical judgments: Review and meta-analysis'.  
 480 Yue Pan , John R Sparks . *Journal of Business Research* 2012. 65 (1) p. .

481 [Fleischman and Valentine ()] 'Professionals' tax liability and moral evaluations in an equitable relief innocent  
 482 spouse case'. Gary Fleischman , Sean Valentine . *Journal of Business Ethics* 2003. 42 p. .

483 [Rest ()] James R Rest . *Moral development: Advances in research and theory*, (New York) 1986. Praeger.

484 [Nichols ()] *Sentimental rules: On the natural foundations of moral judgment*, Shaun Nichols . 2004. New York:  
 485 Oxford University Press.

486 [Kohlberg ()] 'Stages of moral development as a basis for moral education'. Lawrence Kohlberg . *Moral education: Interdisciplinary approaches*, C M Beck, B S Crittenden, & E V Sullivan (ed.) (Toronto) 1971. University of  
 487 Toronto Press. p. .

489 [Nisbett and Wilson ()] 'Telling more than we can know: Verbal reports on mental process'. Richard E Nisbett  
 490 , Timothy D Wilson . *Psychological Review* 1977. 84 (3) p. .

491 [Radich ()] 'The Doctrine of Amalavijnana in Paramartha (499-569) and later authors to approximately 800'.  
 492 Michael Radich . *C.E. Zinbun* 2008. 41 p. .

493 [Clark ()] *The eighth consciousness of the Yogacara: From a talk given at the Buddhist society summer school, Middle Way*, Judith Clark . 2008. 83 p. .

495 [Prinz ()] *The emotional construction of morals*, Jesse Prinz . 2007. New York: Oxford University Press.

496 [Haidt ()] 'The emotional dog and its rational tail: A social intuitionist approach to moral judgment'. Jonathan  
 497 Haidt . *Psychological Review* 2001. 108 (4) p. .

498 [Zhong ()] 'The ethical dangers of deliberative decision making'. Chen-Bo Zhong . *Administrative Science Quarterly* 2011. 56 (1) p. .

500 [Langer et al. ()] 'The mindlessness of ostensibly thoughtful action: The role of "placebic" information in  
 501 interpersonal interaction'. Ellen J Langer , Arthur Blank , Benzion Chanowitz . *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 1978. 36 (6) p. .

503 [Uhlmann and Luis ()] 'The motivated use of moral principles'. Eric Uhlmann , Luis . *Judgment and Decision Making* 2009. 4 (6) p. .

505 [Greene et al. ()] 'The neural bases of cognitive conflict and control in moral judgment'. Joshua D Greene , E  
 506 Leigh , Andrew D Nystrom , John M Engell , Jonathan D Darley , Cohen . *Neuron* 2004. 44 (2) p. .

507 [Kato ()] 'The relationship between the psychology of religion and Buddhist psychology'. Hiroki Kato . *The Japanese Psychological Association* 2016. 58 p. .

509 [Sonenshein ()] 'The role of construction, intuition, and justification in responding to ethical issues at work: The  
 510 sensemaking-intuition model'. Scott Sonenshein . *Academy of Management Review* 2007. 32 (4) p. .

511 [Clark ()] *The seeds of awakening: From a talk about the Yogachara, also known as the Vijñ?navada (the school that teaches knowing) given at the Buddhist Society Summer School, Middle Way*, Judith Clark . 2011. 86 p. .

513 [Chen ()] 'To find the acceptable definitions on the six roots, dusts and consciousnesses between Buddhism and  
 514 scientific philosophy'. Chia-Chern Chen , Lin , Due-Jane . *Buddhism and Science* 2002. 3 (1) p. .

---

515 [Using the Nine-Consciousness Concept of Vijñ?nav?da in Moral Judgment moral judgment and the reason-affect debate Review  
516 'Using the Nine-Consciousness Concept of Vijñ?nav?da in Moral Judgment moral judgment and the reason-  
517 affect debate'. *Review of General Psychology* 2007. 11 (2) p. .

518 [Webster's third new international dictionary ()] *Webster's third new international dictionary*, 1986. Encyclope-  
519 dia Britannica Inc.

520 [Kaag et al. ()] 'William James's reading of Chinese Buddhism'. John J Kaag , Emptiness , Transcendence .  
521 10.1111/j.1540-6253.2012.01716. .x 29. Kahneman, Daniel, *A perspective on judgment and choice: Mapping*  
522 *bounded rationality*, 2012. 2003. 39 p. . (American Psychologist)

523 [Barbour ()] 'Zygon's dual mission'. Ian G Barbour . *Zygon* 2014. 49 (1) p. .